File No.	160582		nmittee Item No ard Item No		
	•	EE/BOARD O		SORS	
Commit	tee: Rules Commit	<u>tee</u>	Date _	June 30, 2016	
Board of Supervisors Meeting		ting	Date _		
	Motion Resolution Ordinance Legislative D Budget and L Legislative A Youth Comm Introduction Department// MOU Grant Inform Grant Budge Subcontract Contract/Agr	egislative Analy nalyst Report ission Report Form (for hearin Agency Cover Le ation Form t Budget eement thics Commissi	gs) etter and/or Rep	oort	
OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)					
	Charter Ame	ndment (First Dr	aft)		
Comple Comple	ted by:Derek ted by:	<u>Evans</u>	DateJune 27 Date	7, 2016	

10 11

1213

14

1516

17

18 19

2021

22

2324

25

[Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees]

Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.

Section 1. The Planning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this proposed Charter Amendment comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et seq.). Said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 160582 and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board affirms this determination.

Section 2. Findings.

- (1) A healthy urban forest enhances our quality of life, reduces water, air, and noise pollution, and benefits the climate by removing carbon dioxide from the atmosphere.
- (2) San Francisco has approximately 105,000 street trees planted in sidewalks or medians. Historically, the Department of Public Works maintained about one-third of the City's street trees and property owners maintained about two-thirds of the City's street trees.
- (3) In 2011, the Department of Public Works adopted a Tree Maintenance Transfer Plan to transfer maintenance responsibility for approximately 24,000 street trees to property owners.
- (4) The Tree Maintenance Transfer Plan has raised concerns among property owners who face the unanticipated cost and responsibility of maintaining trees that they did not plant.
 - (5) The Tree Maintenance Transfer Plan has also raised concerns that it will lead to the

degradation of our urban forest because of neglect and improper maintenance of trees.

(6) A comprehensive municipal tree maintenance program that planned a routine maintenance schedule for all street trees would improve the health of the City's urban forest, reduce the City's per-tree maintenance cost by leveraging economies of scale, and reduce the City's potential liability from claims of damage caused by street trees.

Section 3. The Board of Supervisors hereby submits to the qualified voters of the City and County, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016, a proposal to amend the Charter of the City and County by adding Section 16.130, to read as follows:

1

NOTE:

16

18

21

22 23

24

25

Unchanged Charter text and uncodified text are in plain font.

Additions are single-underline italics Times New Roman font. Deletions are strike-through italies Times New Roman font.

Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Charter subsections.

SEC. 16.130. STREET TREE MAINTENANCE.

(a) Definitions. For purposes of this Section 16.130:

"City" shall mean the City and County of San Francisco.

"Maintenance" (and its root "Maintain") shall mean those actions necessary to promote the life, growth, health, or beauty of a Tree. Maintenance includes both routine maintenance and major maintenance. Routine maintenance includes adequate watering to ensure the Tree's growth and sustainability; weed control; removal of Tree-well trash; staking; fertilizing; routine adjustment and timely removal of stakes, ties, Tree guards, and Tree grates; bracing; and Sidewalk repairs related to the Tree's growth or root system. Major maintenance includes structural pruning as necessary to maintain public safety and to sustain the health, safety, and natural growth habit of the Tree; pest and disease-management procedures as needed and in a manner consistent with public health and ecological diversity; and replacement of dead or

damaged Trees. Pruning practices shall be in compliance with International Society of
Arboriculture Best Management Practices and ANSI Pruning Standards, whichever is more
protective of Tree preservation, or any equivalent standard or standards selected by the Director
of the Department of Public Works.

"Planting" shall mean putting or setting into the ground or into a container to grow, and irrigating until self-sufficient.

<u>"Removal" shall mean any intentional or negligent moving, carrying away, elimination, or taking away of part or all of a Tree.</u>

"Sidewalk" shall mean the area between the curbing and the abutting private property lot line, whether paved or unpaved, as legislated by the Board of Supervisors and as reflected in the official maps of the Department of Public Works.

"Street Tree" shall mean any Tree growing within the public right-of-way, including unimproved public streets and Sidewalks, and any Tree growing on land under the jurisdiction of the Department of Public Works. "Street Tree" does not include any other forms of landscaping.

"Tree" shall mean any large perennial plant having a woody trunk(s), branches, and leaves. "Tree" shall also include a palm tree.

(b) City Responsibility to Maintain Street Trees. Beginning on July 1, 2017, and except as otherwise required by supervening law, the City shall be responsible for Maintaining Street Trees, including Street Trees planted both before and after July 1, 2017. The City may not adopt any ordinance making it the duty of owners of lots or portions of lots immediately abutting on, fronting on, or adjacent to any Street Tree to Maintain such Street Tree on or after July 1, 2017. Any such ordinance in existence on July 1, 2017, shall, to the extent it conflicts with this Section 16.130, be void.

1
-

(c) Limitations of Transfer of Responsibility. Nothing in this Section 16.130 shall:

(1) affect the rights or responsibilities of the City or property owners with respect to the Removal, establishment, or relocation of a Street Tree; (2) prevent the City from entering into voluntary agreements with third parties for them to assume responsibility for Street Tree Maintenance or continuing to abide by any such prior agreement; (3) prevent the City from imposing any legally permitted penalties or fees on persons who injure, damage, or destroy Trees; or (4) relieve abutting property owners from their responsibility for the care and Maintenance of the Sidewalk and Sidewalk areas adjacent to any Street Tree, other than the responsibility for Sidewalk repairs related to the Tree's growth or root system, which shall be the responsibility of the City.

(d) Limitation of Liability. Beginning on July 1, 2017, any City law imposing liability on property owners that do not Maintain Street Trees for injury or property damage shall not apply to the extent that the injury or property damage occurred on or after July 1, 2017, and was proximately caused by the City's failure to Maintain a Street Tree under this Section 16.130, but shall otherwise remain applicable. Nothing in this Section 16.130 shall be construed to impose liability on the City for injury or property damage that occurred as a result of the property owner's responsibility to Maintain a Street Tree prior to July 1, 2017. To the extent that the Maintenance of a Street Tree requires that the City access private property, the City shall attempt in good faith to obtain permission from the owner of the private property. If the owner refuses to grant the City permission to access the private property for the purpose of Maintaining the Street Tree, the City shall have no liability for any damages related to the Maintenance of that Street Tree, and the property owner shall be subject to liability for such damages.

(e) No later than April 1, 2017, the Department of Public Works shall submit to the Board of Supervisors recommended amendments to Public Works Code Article 16, including but not limited to Section 805, to conform to this Section 16.130.

(f) It is the policy of the City that, should this Section 16.130 be repealed or amended to transfer responsibility for Maintaining some or all Street Trees to abutting property owners, the City shall, before effectuating such a transfer, perform all necessary Major Maintenance on the Street Trees as to which the transfer of responsibility will apply.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

By: THOMAS J

Deputy City Attorney

n;\legana\as2015\1600272\01108072.docx

LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

(First Draft - 05/24/2016)

[Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees]

Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.

Existing Law

The City's Public Works Code generally makes it the duty of property owners whose properties abut on, front on, or are adjacent to a tree located along a City street ("a street tree") to maintain that tree. These property owners are also responsible for the care and maintenance of the sidewalk and sidewalk areas adjacent to the trees.

The Code further provides that if someone suffers an injury or property damage as a result of the abutting property owner's failure to maintain a street tree or sidewalk as required, the injured person may sue the property owner, and the property owner must re-pay the City for any damages the City must pay when someone sues the City for an injury to a person or property cause by the property owner's failure to maintain a street tree or sidewalk.

Amendments to Current Law

The proposal is a Charter amendment that would transfer from abutting property owners to the City the responsibility for maintaining street trees, including repair of any sidewalk damage caused by the tree's growth or root system. The proposal would not: (1) affect the rights or responsibilities of the City or property owners with respect to the removal, establishment, or relocation of street trees; (2) prevent the City from entering into or continuing to abide by voluntary agreements with third parties for them maintain street trees; (3) prevent the City from imposing penalties or fees on persons who injure, damage, or destroy trees; or (4) relieve abutting property owners of their responsibility for the care and maintenance of the sidewalk areas adjacent to any street tree where the damage is not caused by the tree's growth or root system.

Under the proposal, abutting property owners would no longer be liable for injury or property damage to the extent that the injury or property damage was caused by the City's failure to maintain a street tree under the new law. However, the City would not be responsible for any injury or damages related to the maintenance of a street tree if the injury or damages occurred as a result of the abutting property owner's failure to maintain the street tree prior to July 1, 2017, or if the maintenance of such tree would require that the City access private property, and the private property owner refused to grant the City such access.

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

June 20, 2016

Ms. Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

RE: File 160582 — Charter amendment regarding City responsibility for maintaining street trees (first draft)

Dear Ms. Calvillo,

Should the proposed charter amendment be approved by the voters, in my opinion, it would significantly increase the cost of government.

The proposed amendment would transfer responsibility for the maintenance of all street trees to the City on July 1, 2017. The City's Department of Public Works estimates the additional annual maintenance cost for trees subject to the ordinance at \$13.1 million in fiscal year 2017-18, although the actual cost of the program would be subject to approval of the Mayor and Board of Supervisor in the annual budget process.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield Controller

> Note: This analysis reflects our understanding of the proposal as of the date shown. At times further information is provided to us which may result in revisions being made to this analysis before the final Controller's statement appears in the Voter Information Pamphlet.



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

June 2, 2016

File No. 160582

Sarah Jones Environmental Review Officer Planning Department 1650 Mission Street, 4th Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Jones:

On May 24, 2016, Supervisor Avalos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election:

File No. 160582 Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

By: Derek Evans, Assistant Clerk Rules Committee

Attachment

c: John Rahaim, Director, Planning Department AnMarie Rodgers, Planning Department Aaron Starr, Planning Department Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planner Jeanie Poling, Environmental Planner Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment.

Joy Navarrete Planning,

Digitally signed by Joy Navarrete DN: cn=Joy Navarrete, o=Planning, ou=Environmental Planning, email=Joy.navarrete@sfgov.org, C=US Date: 2016.06.03 12:29:06 -07'00'



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

MEMORANDUM

TO:

Nicole Elliott, Mayor's Office

Jon Givner, Office of the City Attorney

John Arntz, Director, Department of Elections

John Rahaim, Planning Department Mohammed Nuru, Public Works

FROM: V

Derek Evans, Clerk, Rules Committee

Board of Supervisors

DATE:

June 2, 2016

SUBJECT:

CHARTER AMENDMENT INTRODUCED

November 8, 2016, Election

The Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee has received the following Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election, introduced by Supervisor Avalos on May 24, 2016. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

File No. 160582 Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit any reports or comments you wish to be included with the legislative file.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7702 or email: derek.evans@sfbgov.org. To submit documentation, please forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: AnMarie Rodgers, Planning Department Aaron Starr, Planning Department Frank Lee, Public Works Fuad Swiess, Public Works



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

June 2, 2016

File No. 160582

Sarah Jones Environmental Review Officer Planning Department 1650 Mission Street, 4th Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Jones:

On May 24, 2016, Supervisor Avalos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election:

File No. 160582 Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

By: Derek Evans, Assistant Clerk Rules Committee

Attachment

c: John Rahaim, Director, Planning Department AnMarie Rodgers, Planning Department Aaron Starr, Planning Department Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planner Jeanie Poling, Environmental Planner



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

MEMORANDUM

TO:

Ben Rosenfield, City Controller

FROM:

Derek Evans, Clerk, Rules Committee

Board of Supervisors

DATE:

June 2, 2016

SUBJECT:

LEGISLATION INTRODUCED - CHARTER AMENDMENT

The Board of Supervisors Rules Committee has received the following legislation, introduced by Supervisor Avalos on May 24, 2016. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.3.

File No. 160582 Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit your written statement pursuant to the Charter to be included with the legislative file.

If you have any questions or concerns please call me at (415) 554-7702 or email derek.evans@sfgov.org. To submit documentation, please forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Todd Rydstrom, Office of the City Controller Maura Lane, Office of the City Controller

Evans, Derek

From:

Evans, Derek

Sent:

Thursday, June 02, 2016 2:06 PM

To:

Elliott, Nicole (MYR); Givner, Jon (CAT); Arntz, John (REG); Rahaim, John (CPC); Nuru,

Mohammed (DPW)

Cc: Subject: Lee, Frank (DPW); Sweiss, Fuad (DPW); Rodgers, AnMarie (CPC); Starr, Aaron (CPC) BOS Referral - File No. 160582 - Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining

Street Trees

Attachments:

160582 - Referral - Mandated.pdf

Hello,

On May 24, 2016, Mayor Lee and Supervisors Avalos, Wiener, and Farrell introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

File No. 160582 Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit any reports or comments you wish to be included with the legislative file.

Regards,

Derek K. Evans

Assistant Clerk, Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102 Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163 Derek.Evans@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org



Click here to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The Legislative Research Center provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

Evans, Derek

From:

Evans, Derek

Sent:

Thursday, June 02, 2016 2:06 PM

To:

Rosenfield, Ben (CON)

Cc:

Rydstrom, Todd (CON); Lane, Maura (CON)

Subject:

BOS Referral - File No. 160582 - Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining

Street Trees

Attachments:

160582 - Referral - CTRL.pdf

Hello,

On May 24, 2016, Mayor Lee and Supervisors Avalos, Wiener, and Farrell introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

File No. 160582

Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit your written statement pursuant to the Charter to be included with the legislative file.

Regards,

Derek K. Evans

Assistant Clerk, Board of Supervisors

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102
Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163
Derek.Evans@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org



Click here to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The Legislative Research Center provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

Evans, Derek

From:

Evans, Derek

Sent:

Thursday, June 02, 2016 2:06 PM

To:

Jones, Sarah (CPC)

Cc:

Rahaim, John (CPC); Rodgers, AnMarie (CPC); Starr, Aaron (CPC); Navarrete, Joy (CPC);

Poling, Jeanie (CPC)

Subject:

BOS Referral - File No. 160582 - Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining

Street Trees (Environmental Review)

Attachments:

160582 - Referral - CEQA.pdf

Hello,

On May 24, 2016, Mayor Lee and Supervisors Avalos, Wiener, and Farrell introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election:

File No. 160582 **Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to transfer responsibility for the maintenance of street trees from abutting property owners to the City; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Derek K. Evans

Assistant Clerk, Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102 Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163 Derek.Evans@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org



Click here to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The Legislative Research Center provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

Print Form

Introduction Form

By a Member of the Board of Supervisors or the Mayor

	Time stamp or meeting date				
□ 1. For reference to Committee.					
An ordinance, resolution, motion, or charter amendment.					
2. Request for next printed agenda without reference to Committee.	,				
☐ 3. Request for hearing on a subject matter at Committee.					
4. Request for letter beginning "Supervisor	inquires"				
☐ 5. City Attorney request.					
6. Call File No. from Committee.					
7. Budget Analyst request (attach written motion).					
8. Substitute Legislation File No.					
9. Request for Closed Session (attach written motion).					
☐ 10. Board to Sit as A Committee of the Whole.					
☐ 11. Question(s) submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the BOS on					
Please check the appropriate boxes. The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the followin Small Business Commission Youth Commission Ethics Commis	_				
☐ Planning Commission ☐ Building Inspection Commission	1				
Note: For the Imperative Agenda (a resolution not on the printed agenda), use a Imperative					
ponsor(s):					
Supervisor John Avalos					
Subject:					
Charter Amendment - City Responsibility for Maintaining Street Trees					
The text is listed below or attached:					
	A				
Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor:					
For Clerk's Use Only:					