



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget & Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Bus Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIR - Airport Commission  
 Airport Shuttle Bus Services (18721)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2024-25**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C	6.00	\$ 985,824	\$ 985,824
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 657,945	\$ 789,849
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 436,648	\$ 524,187
<b>Total:</b>		<b>6.00</b>	<b>\$ 2,080,417</b>	<b>\$ 2,299,860</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates
9163 Transit Operator	85	FTE's	\$ 6,439,955	\$ 7,731,038
9139 Transit Supervisor	5	FTE's	\$ 533,532	\$ 640,495
9141 Transit Manager II	2	FTE's	\$ 284,491	\$ 341,526
9140 Transit Manager I	1	FTE's	\$ 125,973	\$ 151,228
9102 Transit Car Cleaner	2	FTE's	\$ 148,279	\$ 178,006
Core Operating Expenses: Consumables, Parts, etc	0		\$ 3,125,431	\$ 3,125,431
Auxilliary Costs: Utilities, Technology, Workers Comp, etc.	0		\$ 643,138	\$ 643,138
Contingency, Uncategorized expenses	0		\$ 232,416	\$ 464,832
Benefits for 5 Job Classes	0		\$ 3,591,371	\$ 4,025,685
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 15,124,586</b>	<b>\$ 17,301,379</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 17,205,003 \$ 19,601,239**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 17,205,003	\$ 19,601,239
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 15,675,213	\$ 15,679,080
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,529,789	\$ 3,922,159
% of Savings to City Cost	8.89%	20.01%

AIR - Airport Commission  
 Airport Shuttle Bus Services (18721)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2025-26**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost High
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C	6.00	\$ 1,022,236	\$ 1,022,236
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 684,790	\$ 822,075
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 454,463	\$ 545,574
<b>Total:</b>		<b>6.00</b>	<b>\$ 2,161,489</b>	<b>\$ 2,389,885</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26 Low Estimate	FY 2025-26 High Estimates
9163 Transit Operator	85	FTE's	\$ 6,704,738	\$ 8,048,905
9139 Transit Supervisor	5	FTE's	\$ 554,649	\$ 665,845
9141 Transit Manager II	2	FTE's	\$ 295,752	\$ 355,044
9140 Transit Manager I	1	FTE's	\$ 130,959	\$ 157,214
9102 Transit Car Cleaner	2	FTE's	\$ 154,148	\$ 185,052
Core Operating Expenses: Consumables, Parts, etc	0		\$ 3,467,090	\$ 3,467,090
Auxilliary Costs: Utilities, Technology, Workers Comp, etc.	0		\$ 669,271	\$ 669,271
Contingency, Uncategorized expenses	0		\$ 232,416	\$ 464,832
Benefits for 5 Job Classes	0		\$ 3,630,066	\$ 4,072,138
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 15,839,089</b>	<b>\$ 18,085,391</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 18,000,578 \$ 20,475,276**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 18,000,578	\$ 20,475,276
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 16,125,465	\$ 16,123,186
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,875,113	\$ 4,352,090
% of Savings to City Cost	10.42%	21.26%