



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner
Controller
ChiaYu Ma
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner
Greg Wagner,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency
 Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning (24177)
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,131,118	\$ 1,330,803
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,195,505	\$ 1,409,483
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 16,815	\$ 20,185
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 22,499	\$ 27,008
		Sum:	\$ 2,365,937	\$ 2,787,479

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Materials & Supplies	0		\$ 171,672	\$ 171,672
Safety Equipment	0		\$ 6,134	\$ 6,134
Vehicle Maintenance	0		\$ 1,227	\$ 1,227
Overhead at 44.9% of salaries and benefits	0		\$ 1,062,306	\$ 1,251,578
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 1,241,339	\$ 1,430,611

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 3,607,276 \$ 4,218,090

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 3,607,276	\$ 4,218,090
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 921,334	\$ 927,621
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 2,685,942	\$ 3,290,469
	% of Savings to City Cost	74.46%	78.01%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency
 Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning (24177)
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,194,901	\$ 1,403,718
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,262,407	\$ 1,486,185
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 17,246	\$ 20,703
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 23,077	\$ 27,704
Sum:		18.70	\$ 2,497,631	\$ 2,938,310

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Materials & Supplies	0		\$ 177,337	\$ 177,337
Safety Equipment	0		\$ 6,336	\$ 6,336
Vehicle Maintenance	0		\$ 1,267	\$ 1,267
Overhead at 44.9% of salaries and benefits	0		\$ 1,121,436	\$ 1,319,301
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 1,306,376	\$ 1,504,241

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 3,804,007 \$ 4,442,551

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 3,804,007	\$ 4,442,551
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 952,488	\$ 959,062
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 2,851,519	\$ 3,483,489
	% of Savings to City Cost	74.96%	78.41%