



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Towing Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/_____

Greg Wagner,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Diana Hammons, Senior Manager

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency
Towing (18759)
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2024-25

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS					
Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High	
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 218,273	\$ 267,800	
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 172,515	\$ 209,247	
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 150,754	\$ 177,013	
Account Clerk	1630_C_MTA	3.25	\$ 332,558	\$ 391,348	
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.56	\$ 840,905	\$ 996,024	
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 281,732	\$ 334,049	
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,920	\$ 225,520	
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	4.20	\$ 440,320	\$ 518,384	
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	4.20	\$ 479,911	\$ 566,583	
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,986	\$ 225,652	
Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor	1926_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 106,558	\$ 125,475	
Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.60	\$ 790,736	\$ 930,484	
Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 328,700	\$ 387,933	
Purchaser	1952_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 143,248	\$ 170,036	
Cashier II	4321_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 164,578	\$ 193,780	
Cashier III	4322_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 181,038	\$ 213,951	
Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	31.23	\$ 4,206,328	\$ 5,170,980	
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 854,380	\$ 854,380	
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	11.39	\$ 1,064,529	\$ 1,472,854	
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 425,802	\$ 526,723	
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 33,190	\$ 39,845	
Sum:		91.31	\$ 11,593,961	\$ 13,998,061	

ADDITIONAL CITY COST					
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates	
Postage+supplies+uniforms	0		\$ 74,396	\$ 74,396	
Specialized Software	0		\$ 413,929	\$ 413,929	
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)	0		\$ 1,008,170	\$ 1,008,170	
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)	0		\$ 115,399	\$ 115,399	
Communications: ipad air \$650 + case \$30 + cellular data (\$200/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life 4 years	0		\$ 12,154	\$ 12,154	
Utilities	0		\$ 47,220	\$ 47,220	
Lien Fees	0		\$ 137,036	\$ 137,036	
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)	0		\$ 28,639	\$ 28,639	
Credit card fees	0		\$ 87,442	\$ 87,442	
Overhead, at 99.2% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	0		\$ 11,336,887	\$ 13,967,032	
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 13,261,272	\$ 15,891,417	

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 24,855,233 \$ 29,889,478

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY			
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 24,855,233	\$ 29,889,478
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 15,972,416	\$ 16,039,428
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 8,882,817	\$ 13,850,050
% of Savings to City Cost		35.74%	46.34%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency
Towing (18759)
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2025-26

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS					
Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26		
			Personnel Cost Low	Personnel Cost High	
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 225,929	\$ 277,388	
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 178,737	\$ 216,620	
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 156,722	\$ 183,802	
Account Clerk	1630_C_MTA	3.25	\$ 345,560	\$ 406,195	
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.56	\$ 872,470	\$ 1,032,454	
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 292,196	\$ 346,155	
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 195,655	\$ 233,402	
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	4.20	\$ 457,451	\$ 537,969	
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	4.20	\$ 498,289	\$ 587,680	
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 195,724	\$ 233,539	
Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor	1926_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 110,692	\$ 130,202	
Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.60	\$ 821,558	\$ 965,686	
Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 341,383	\$ 402,479	
Purchaser	1952_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 148,555	\$ 176,184	
Cashier II	4321_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 170,979	\$ 201,098	
Cashier III	4322_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 187,951	\$ 221,896	
Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	31.23	\$ 4,367,159	\$ 5,362,082	
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 885,936	\$ 885,936	
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	11.39	\$ 1,106,932	\$ 1,528,080	
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 441,369	\$ 546,216	
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 34,229	\$ 41,091	
Sum:		91.31	\$ 12,035,476	\$ 14,516,154	

ADDITIONAL CITY COST					
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26		
			Low Estimate	High Estimates	
Postage+supplies+uniforms	0		\$ 76,308	\$ 76,308	
Specialized Software	0		\$ 424,567	\$ 424,567	
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)	0		\$ 10,345,080	\$ 1,034,080	
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)	0		\$ 118,365	\$ 118,365	
Communications: ipad air \$650 + case \$30 + cellular data (\$200/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life 4 years	0		\$ 12,466	\$ 12,466	
Utilities	0		\$ 48,434	\$ 48,434	
Lien Fees	0		\$ 140,558	\$ 140,558	
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)	0		\$ 29,375	\$ 29,375	
Credit card fees	0		\$ 89,690	\$ 89,690	
Overhead, at 99.2% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	0		\$ 12,196,805	\$ 14,642,022	
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 23,481,648	\$ 16,615,865	

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 35,517,124 \$ 31,132,019

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY			
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 35,517,124	\$ 31,132,019
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 16,453,418	\$ 16,522,568
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 19,063,706	\$ 14,609,451
	% of Savings to City Cost	53.67%	46.93%