



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2018

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attn: Kaitlyn Connors, Budget Director, San Francisco International Airport

RE: Contracting for Airport Information Booth & Guest Assistance – FY 2018-19 and FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2018-19 and 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,



Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

AIR Airport Commission
 109662 AIR Chief Operating Officer/228993 AIR Communications & Mrktng
 Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services Contract
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2018-19

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Senior Operational Manager	9143	3.0	\$ 5,543	\$ 6,738	\$ 432,390	\$ 525,584
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.5	3,282	3,989	213,303	259,297
Training Officer	1232	0.5	3,275	3,981	42,580	51,752
Management Assistant	1842	8.4	2,957	3,481	645,837	760,338
Principal Account Clerk	1634	5.6	2,700	3,282	393,066	477,798
Senior Account Clerk	1632	93.3	2,390	2,897	5,796,692	7,028,489
Account Clerk	1630	1.0	2,064	2,509	53,667	65,236
Accountant I	1650	2.0	2,885	3,505	150,022	182,265
					\$ -	\$ -
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					245,201	296,707
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					218,728	264,673
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		116.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 7,727,556	\$ 9,350,759
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 463,930	\$ 561,380

FRINGE BENEFITS

	Amount
9143 Senior Operational Manager	70,077.90
1844 Sr. Management Assistant	43,011.84
1232 Training Officer	43,424.90
1842 Management Assistant	39,391.19
1634 Principal Account Clerk	37,966.93
1632 Senior Account Clerk	35,272.39
1630 Account Clerk	32,460.10
1650 Accountant I	40,037.59
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low High
	\$ 3,861,924.18 \$ 4,286,425.79

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Office Equipment and Technical Support	57,110	57,110
Reward & Recognition	10,000	10,000
Uniforms and Dry Cleaning	85,000	85,000
ADM Customer Support Supplies	15,000	15,000
Fringe Reimbursement	5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating	172,110	172,110

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 12,225,520	\$ 14,370,675
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 7,870,300	\$ 7,875,464
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,355,221	\$ 6,495,211
% of Savings to City Cost	36%	45%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs, disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. The Estimated Contract Cost includes 0.20 FTE for contract monitoring.

Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

AIR Airport Commission
 109662 AIR Chief Operating Officer/228993 AIR Communications & Mrktng
 Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services Contract
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Senior Operational Manager	9143	3.0	\$ 5,543	\$ 6,738	\$ 432,390	\$ 525,584
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.5	3,282	3,989	213,303	259,297
Training Officer	1232	0.5	3,275	3,981	42,580	51,752
Management Assistant	1842	8.4	2,957	3,481	645,837	760,338
Principal Account Clerk	1634	5.6	2,700	3,282	393,066	477,798
Senior Account Clerk	1632	93.3	2,390	2,897	5,796,692	7,028,489
Account Clerk	1630	1.0	2,064	2,509	53,667	65,236
Accountant I	1650	2.0	2,885	3,505	150,022	182,265
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					245,201	296,707
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					218,728	264,673
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		116.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 7,727,556	\$ 9,350,759
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 463,930	\$ 561,380

FRINGE BENEFITS

	Amount
9143 Senior Operational Manager	70,077.90
1844 Sr. Management Assistant	44,014.95
1232 Training Officer	44,468.55
1842 Management Assistant	40,409.76
1634 Principal Account Clerk	38,989.75
1632 Senior Account Clerk	36,306.08
1630 Account Clerk	33,504.80
1650 Accountant I	41,094.37
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low High
	\$ 3,959,314 \$ 4,403,340

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Office Equipment and Technical Support	57,110	57,110
Reward & Recognition	10,000	10,000
Uniforms and Dry Cleaning	85,000	85,000
ADM Customer Support Supplies	20,000	20,000
Fringe Reimbursement	5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating	177,110	177,110

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 12,327,910	\$ 14,492,590
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 7,987,765	\$ 7,992,964
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,340,145	\$ 6,499,626
% of Savings to City Cost	35%	45%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. The Estimated Contract Cost includes 0.20 FTE for contract monitoring.