



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

MEMORANDUM

TO: Supervisor Norman Yee

FROM: Ben Rosenfield, Controller
Peg Stevenson, City Performance Director
Michael Perlstein, Performance Analyst

DATE: May 13, 2019

SUBJECT: **San Francisco Police Department Civilianization Progress and Options**

Summary and Recommendations

Utilizing civilian staff to perform non-law enforcement duties within police departments, known as civilianization, is a widely recognized best practice in public safety organizations to both increase the number of officers available for law enforcement and to increase efficiencies.

In the last ten years civilianization reviews of the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) have been done by the Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) in 2008,¹ the Controller's Office in 2010² and 2012³ and the Board of Supervisors Budget and Legislative Analyst (BLA) in 2018.⁴

At the Board of Supervisors' and Department's request, City Performance evaluated the SFPD's current status and options for future civilianization. Our findings and recommendations are:

- In the FY18-19 budget, the SFPD received 25 new positions for civilianization. Nineteen positions were budgeted for January 1 and six positions were budgeted for April 1. Progress has been made in filling these, but 12 positions are still awaiting exams or specifications and required assistance from the Department of Human Resources such that recruitments have not begun. These must be prioritized. See Table 2 for the list and Appendix A for details of this progress.

¹ https://sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/FileCenter/Documents/14694-San_Francisco_Organizational_Review_Final_Report.pdf

² <http://openbook.sfgov.org/webreports/details3.aspx?id=1144>

³ The San Francisco Charter Section 16.123 directs the Controller and Chief of Police to identify positions in the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) that could be filled appropriately by civilian personnel.

⁴ https://sfbos.org/sites/default/files/BA_Report_PA_of_San_Francisco_Police_Department_061218.pdf

- An additional 50 positions, if budgeted and authorized, will permit civilianization of jobs in Records Management, Media Relations, Police Commission, Legal, Professional Standards, Community Engagement and other units. The SFPD specified these positions for civilianization through a command staff review process. We have reviewed their work and concur with the identification of these 50 positions. These positions should be strongly considered for inclusion in the FY19-20 budget and future fiscal years in conjunction with a multi-year hiring and staffing plan. See Table 3 for the list and Appendix B for details.
- Additional study will likely yield more opportunities for civilianization of key functions. Clear opportunities exist in two Bureaus – Administration and Investigation (see Appendix E for details of these Bureaus) and in specific units such as the Operations Center and the Homeland Security Unit. These areas have been identified by prior Controller’s reviews, the BLA review, and the PERF review as having many roles which can be entirely civilian. The next analytical process should review SFPD’s overall progress in civilianizing these types of functions. The SFPD has engaged a consultant to conduct a complete department-wide staffing analysis, which will enable greater specificity in civilianization reviews and proposals for the FY20-21 budget.
- We also note that strong progress has been made in civilianization over the past seven years. Since FY12-13, the SFPD has successfully civilianized 60 positions recommended in a variety of prior reports by the Controller’s Office, BLA and others (See Appendix C for details).

Table 1 below summarizes the SFPD’s progress in filling positions recommended by past civilianization reports. We also recommend the 50 positions newly identified by the Department for consideration in the upcoming budget, accompanied by a realistic staffing plan.

Table 1: Summary of Progress and Options with Position Counts

FY18-19 Approved & Budgeted	Budgeted	Filled or in Final Backgrounds	Exam in Progress	Remaining
	25	11	2	12
Prior Controller Review - Budgeted	Filled	Addressed in FY18 Budget		
	46	2		
Prior Controller Review – Not Budgeted	Requested Not Budgeted	Addressed in New List	Not Addressed	No longer relevant
	8	2	4	5
New Proposed - Not Budgeted	Recommended (Multi-Year)			
	50			

Actions in the FY18-19 Fiscal Year

For FY18-19, SFPD was allocated budget and position authority to civilianize 25 positions (see Table 2 for positions by Bureau and Appendix B for the full list), with varying start dates anticipated through to the end of the fiscal year. As of May 1, 2019, the hiring status of those positions is as follows:

- Six filled
- Five candidates in background check
- Two exams being administered
- Six exam materials still in development
- Six recruitment not begun

SFPD notes that two of the positions included in this list (1823 Sr. Administrative Analysts within the Strategic Management Bureau) will be hired in lieu of assigning additional sworn officers to that Unit however SFPD does not plan to reduce the number of sworn officers in that Unit.

Table 2

Count of FY18-19 Budgeted Civilian Positions by Bureau

Bureau	Count of Positions
Administration Bureau	15
Investigations Bureau	6
Strategic Management Bureau	2
Chief of Staff	2
Total	25

Options for the FY19-20 Fiscal Year

In the winter of FY18-19 SFPD asked all Command Staff to conduct a review of their personnel and identify positions currently held by sworn staff that could be civilianized. The resulting list of 50 positions (see Table 3 below for positions by Bureau and Appendix B for the full list) are those which SFPD feels could likely be transitioned in full to civilian staff. We have reviewed this work, compared it to past analyses and recommend that these positions be considered for inclusion in the FY19-20 and subsequent budgets. This would be done in conjunction with a hiring plan that is realistic about the effort to recruit these jobs.

In developing the list of 50 positions, the SFPD has retained uniformed supervision in some units that are otherwise entirely civilian. For example, if all positions in the FY18-19 budget and the new proposed lists were filled, four sworn officers would remain in the Strategic Management Bureau: one captain, one

sergeant, and two officers within Staff Inspections, each of whom would be paired with a civilian counterpart. SFPD should examine this approach and specifically justify where they propose to retain sworn supervision of a function that is otherwise completely staffed by civilians.

The SFPD’s process of identifying the 50 positions also did not touch on light duty and disability assignments. In the past, some responsibilities which might have been civilianized have been reserved for sworn staff that need a place to work while assigned to a light duty or are permanently accommodated in their positions as determined by Americans with Disabilities Act determinations. However, SFPD is phasing out long-term disability staffing, and as officers currently in those roles retire, those positions will be gradually transitioned to civilian staff. Similarly, SFPD now uses short-term, light duty assignments to fill ad-hoc staffing shortages as requested by various Units, rather than to continuously staff positions which do not require law enforcement capabilities. An exception to this protocol is the Department Operations Center, which is staffed by rotating light duty assignments.

Table 3

Count of Identified Civilian Positions by Bureau

Bureau	Count of Positions
Chief of Staff	13
Administration	11
Field Operations	11
Strategic Management	10
Special Operations	4
Investigations	1
Total	50

Options from Prior Studies

The 2012 Controller’s Office report suggested 67 specific positions for civilianization. As noted above, of these, 46 have been successfully filled with civilian hires. Of the 21 that remain unfilled two recommended job classes are unavailable to the SFPD, and three positions are no longer relevant due to consolidation of a function. Of the remaining 16 positions:

- Four are in SFPD’s current civilianization plans—two are included in the FY18-19 budgeted list and two are in the newly identified list
- Eight were requested in past budget years but were not funded – these functions, including the Operations Center and Homeland Security Unit may still be candidates for civilianization
- Four remain unaddressed.

See Table 4 for a summary of Controller’s recommendations by Unit, and Appendix D for details of which recommendations have been fully or partially completed.

Table 4

CON Recommended Positions for Civilianization

Unit	Count of Positions Recommended	Count of Unfilled Recommendations⁵
Compstat	14	3
Facilities	11	0
Operations Center and Homeland Security Unit	10	8
Academy	4	2
Police Law Enforcement Services	3	3
Technology	3	0
Alcohol Liaison Unit	2	1
Crime Scene Investigation	2	2
Fleet and Tactical	2	0
Permits	2	0
Property	2	0
Records Management - Contracts	2	0
Records Management - Legal	2	0
Behavioral Science	1	0
Crime Lab Director	1	0
Mounted Unit	1	0
Permits/Property	1	1
Records Management - Professional Standards	1	0
Special Operations	1	1
Total	67	21

⁵ Some of the unfilled recommendations have been addressed in other ways. Please see Appendix D for details.

The 2018 BLA report did not identify specific positions or functions for civilianization. However, it included suggestions of Units with work that could be done by a properly trained civilian and proposed that up to 34 positions in five Units might be civilianized. Because the BLA report did not identify specific positions, we cannot accurately assess the degree to which the recommendations are met by the FY18-19 budgeted positions and the newly identified proposal. However, these two lists of positions generally address the units specified in the BLA report, as shown in Table 5.⁶

Table 5

2018 BLA Suggested Civilianization by Unit

Division/ Unit	# Recommended for Civilianization	# Addressed in FY19 Budget	# Addressed in New FY20 List
Staff Services	11	6	3
Property	10	8	
Crime Scene Investigations	6	6	
Professional Standards	5	2	8
Administration	2	1	
Total	34	23	11

The 2008 PERF report recommended many specific positions throughout the Department for civilianization. While the status of many recommendations cannot be evaluated due to organizational changes over time, two significant findings can be compared to current civilianization efforts.

SFPD has made significant progress on civilianizing its Administration Bureau and has additional efforts underway, however it has not achieved near complete civilianization of the Bureau as recommended by PERF. The PERF report states that “[o]ther than in the Training Division, almost all positions in the [Administration] Bureau should be civilianized in order to best provide the professional services required through skilled workers and achieve a stability of institutional knowledge while offering fiscal benefits to the department.”⁷

Eleven out of the 50 positions proposed for civilianization in the newly identified list and 15 of the 25 in the FY18-19 budgeted list are within the Administration Bureau. As of April 2019, there are 90 sworn staff

⁶ The BLA report makes clear that the recommended count of positions within each Unit is a broad suggestion, and that they lacked information for position-specific analysis. Thus, the SFPD addressed the positions they found most likely civilianizable within those Units via the FY18-19 budgeted and new identified lists, even though the number identified within each Unit across the two lists does not match the report’s recommendations.

⁷ PERF Report page 147. https://sanfranciscopolice.org/sites/default/files/FileCenter/Documents/14694-San_Francisco_Organizational_Review_Final_Report.pdf

in the Administration Bureau, 41 of which are within the Academy (i.e. the "Training Division" mentioned by the PERF report). The remaining 49 sworn staff consist of 44 sworn positions of rank Lieutenant or below, three Captains, one Commander, and the Deputy Chief. Filling all positions in the FY18-19 budgeted and newly identified lists would reduce the 90 sworn staff to 64. See Appendix E for a complete Administration staffing breakdown.

The PERF report also suggested increasing the number of civilian staff in the Investigations Bureau by more than 250%, from 62 to 166.5 FTEs. As of April 2019, there are 96 civilians in the bureau (see Appendix E for an Investigations staffing breakdown). Filling all positions in the FY18-19 budgeted group and newly identified list would increase the civilian count to 103.

The PERF report also recommended complete or near-complete civilianization of Units such as Forensic Services, Operations Center, Facilities, Support Services, Permits, Airport Administrative, and Public Affairs. Though some positions in these Units have been civilianized in past years (see Appendix C for an accounting of all civilianized positions since FY12-13) or are included in the SFPD's FY18-19 budgeted and new identified lists, a comprehensive staffing analysis is required to identify what portion of responsibilities in these groups which might be civilianized remains sworn.

Conclusion

In summary, strong progress has been made by the SFPD to move uniformed personnel back out onto the street and into jobs requiring law enforcement expertise and training, and in turn use civilian personnel for jobs where other skills are required. This progress has clearly benefited the SFPD in administration, public affairs, information technology and other areas. Nonetheless, there are areas where more of this changeover can take place now.

No further analysis is needed to move forward with completing the hires already identified for FY18-19 and proceeding with the 50 newly identified positions as discussed above. The expert consultant's staffing review that is currently planned need not delay any of these actions. The SFPD needs a realistic and well supported staffing plan to recruit and hire these positions. The Controller's Office will continue to work with the Department in FY19-20 and monitor progress in this important effort.

APPENDIX A: FY2018-19 BUDGET ACTIONS

Positions Approved in the FY2018-19 Budget

	Classification	Unit	Hiring Status as of April 30	Notes
1	7120 Blds & Grnds Maint. Superintendent	Facilities Manager	Filled with Acting Employee Pending next Citywide Exam	
2	1823 Senior Admin Analyst	Principled Policing/Professional Standards	Exam Being Administered	Since the budget was approved, this position is no longer intended for civilianization; it will fill a new investigative role originally intended for a sworn officer.
3	1823 Senior Admin Analyst	Principled Policing/Professional Standards	Exam Being Administered	Since budget approved, this position no longer intended for civilianization. Will fill new investigative role originally intended for a sworn officer.
4	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Filled	
5	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Filled	
6	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Filled	
7	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Filled	
8	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Candidate in backgrounds	
9	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Candidate in backgrounds	
10	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Candidate in backgrounds	
11	1934 Storekeeper	Property / Evidence	Candidate in backgrounds	
12	1310 Public Relations Assistant	Website / Communications in Media Unit	Candidate in backgrounds	
13	8173 Legal Assistant	PRA -Media Requests in Media Unit	Filled	
14	8253 Forensic Latent Examiner	Crime Scene Investigations	Exam Materials in development	Will be hired as Temp. Exempt to expedite hiring while job classification is edited by DHR
15	8253 Forensic Latent Examiner	Crime Scene Investigations	Exam Materials in development	Will be hired as Temp. Exempt to expedite hiring while job classification is edited by DHR

	Classification	Unit	Hiring Status as of April 30	Notes
16	8253 Forensic Latent Examiner	Crime Scene Investigations	Exam Materials in development	Will be hired as Temp. Exempt to expedite hiring while job classification is edited by DHR
17	8253 Forensic Latent Examiner	Crime Scene Investigations	Exam Materials in development	Will be hired as Temp. Exempt to expedite hiring while job classification is edited by DHR
18	8253 Forensic Latent Examiner	Crime Scene Investigations	Exam Materials in development	Will be hired as Temp. Exempt to expedite hiring while job classification is edited by DHR
19	8253 Forensic Latent Examiner	Crime Scene Investigations	Exam Materials in development	Will be hired as Temp. Exempt to expedite hiring while job classification is edited by DHR
20	TBD - 1244 Placeholder Job Class	Backgrounds Investigations	Recruitment Not Begun	DHR finalizing proposed 1251 Background Investigator classification.
21	TBD - 1244 Placeholder Job Class	Backgrounds Investigations	Recruitment Not Begun	DHR finalizing proposed 1251 Background Investigator classification.
22	TBD - 1244 Placeholder Job Class	Backgrounds Investigations	Recruitment Not Begun	DHR finalizing proposed 1251 Background Investigator classification.
23	TBD - 1244 Placeholder Job Class	Backgrounds Investigations	Recruitment Not Begun	DHR finalizing proposed 1251 Background Investigator classification.
24	TBD - 1244 Placeholder Job Class	Backgrounds Investigations	Recruitment Not Begun	DHR finalizing proposed 1251 Background Investigator classification.
25	TBD - 1244 Placeholder Job Class	Backgrounds Investigations	Recruitment Not Begun	DHR finalizing proposed 1251 Background Investigator classification.

APPENDIX B: CURRENT CIVILIANIZATION OPTIONS

This is a list of 50 positions identified by SFPD Command Staff as potential candidates for civilianization as of February 2019.

	Bureau	Unit	General Duties	Civilian Job Class Proposed	Civilian Cost	Uniform Position	Uniform Cost	Civilianization Savings
1	Administration	Staff Services	Medical Liaison for On the Job Injuries	5177 Safety Officer	\$ 198,491	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$12,702
2	Administration	Staff Services	Recruitment	1250 Recruiter	\$ 167,695	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$14,160
3	Administration	Staff Services	Recruitment	1250 Recruiter	\$ 167,695	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$14,160
4	Administration	Crime Information Services	Records	941 Manager VI	\$ 248,700	Q082 (Captain III)	\$304,741	\$56,040
5	Administration	Crime Information Services	Records	923 Manager II	\$ 192,734	Q062 (Lieutenant III)	\$241,150	\$48,416
6	Administration	Crime Information Services	Records	1827 Administrative Services Manager	\$ 162,089	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$49,104
7	Administration	Crime Information Services	Records	1827 Administrative Services Manager	\$ 162,089	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$49,104
8	Administration	Crime Information Services	Records	1827 Administrative Services Manager	\$ 162,089	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$49,104
9	Administration	Academy	Defensive Tactics - Fitness Coordinator	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$36,655

Bureau	Unit	General Duties	Civilian Job Class Proposed	Civilian Cost	Uniform Position	Uniform Cost	Civilianization Savings	
10	Administration	Academy	Professional Development- A/O, etc.	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
11	Administration	Facilities - DeHaro	Building Maintenance and Supplies Support for SOB DeHaro Facility	1942 - Assistant Material Coordinator	\$ 156,629	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$25,225
12	Chief of Staff	Media Relations	PIO & support duties	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
13	Chief of Staff	Media Relations	PIO & support duties	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
14	Chief of Staff	Media Relations	PIO & support duties	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
15	Chief of Staff	Media Relations	PIO & support duties	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
16	Chief of Staff	Media Relations	PIO & support duties	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
17	Chief of Staff	Police Commission	Police Commission Secretary	923 Manager II	\$ 192,734	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$18,459
18	Chief of Staff	Police Commission	Police Commission support	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$21,403
19	Chief of Staff	Legal	Body Camera Unit - Audit Role	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$21,403

Bureau	Unit	General Duties	Civilian Job Class Proposed	Civilian Cost	Uniform Position	Uniform Cost	Civilianization Savings	
20	Chief of Staff	Legal	Body Camera Unit - Audit Role	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$21,403
21	Chief of Staff	Legal	Court Liaison Sergeant	1827 Administrative Services Manager	\$ 162,089	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$49,104
22	Chief of Staff	Legal	Legal Sergeant	8177 Attorney	\$ 269,251	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	(\$58,058)
23	Chief of Staff	Legal	Legal support	8177 Attorney	\$ 269,251	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	(\$87,396)
24	Chief of Staff	Legal	Legal support	8177 Attorney	\$ 269,251	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	(\$87,396)
25	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Professional Standards	932 Manager IV	\$ 215,184	Q062 (Lieutenant III)	\$241,150	\$25,966
26	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Written Directives	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$65,993
27	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Written Directives	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
28	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Professional Standards / DOJ Reforms	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
29	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Professional Standards / DOJ Reforms	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$21,403

Bureau	Unit	General Duties	Civilian Job Class Proposed	Civilian Cost	Uniform Position	Uniform Cost	Civilianization Savings
30	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Professional Standards / DOJ Reforms	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$21,403
31	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Professional Standards / DOJ Reforms	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$21,403
32	Strategic Management	Professional Standards	Professional Standards / DOJ Reforms	1823 Senior Administrative Analyst	\$ 160,451	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$21,403
33	Strategic Management	Technology	Telecomm Lead w. Vendors & DT	1094 IT Ops Support Administrator IV	\$ 171,007	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$10,847
34	Strategic Management	Technology	Smart Phone and Wireless Support	1094 IT Ops Support Administrator IV	\$ 171,007	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$10,847
35	Special Operations	Traffic	Front Desk STOP / Tow Desk (Public Counter)	9209 Community Police Services Aide	\$ 106,725	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$75,130
36	Special Operations	Traffic	Front Desk General Questions & Police Reports	9209 Community Police Services Aide	\$ 106,725	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$75,130
37	Special Operations	Traffic	Subpoena Processing & Admin Work	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193 \$84,484
38	Special Operations	Traffic	Co. K Motorcycle Fleet Management - Must have M1 License	7313 Automotive Machinist	\$ 130,385	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$51,470
39	Field Operations	PLES - 10B Services	Scheduling PLES Assignments	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854 \$55,146

Bureau	Unit	General Duties	Civilian Job Class Proposed	Civilian Cost	Uniform Position	Uniform Cost	Civilianization Savings	
40	Field Operations	PLES - 10B Services	Scheduling PLES Assignments	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
41	Field Operations	Patrol Specials	Patrol Specials Officers	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
42	Field Operations	Permits	One of the two Permit Officers	1842 Management Assistant	\$ 126,708	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$55,146
43	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	Limited Proficiency Officer	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$36,655
44	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	Safe Place Program Coordinator	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$36,655
45	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	SF Police Foundation Coordination	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$36,655
46	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	Command Post at Healthy Streets Ops Center	1827 Administrative Services Manager	\$ 162,089	Q052 (Sergeant III)	\$211,193	\$49,104
47	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	Command Post at Healthy Streets Ops Center	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$36,655
48	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	Command Post at Healthy Streets Ops Center	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$181,854	\$36,655

Bureau	Unit	General Duties	Civilian Job Class Proposed	Civilian Cost	Uniform Position	Uniform Cost	Civilianization Savings
49	Field Operations	Community Engagement Div.	Command Post at Healthy Streets Ops Center	1844 Senior Management Assistant	\$ 145,200	Q004 (Police Officer III)	\$36,655
50	Investigations	Crime Lab	Crime Lab Technical Support	2416 Laboratory Technician II	\$ 103,995	0382 (Inspector III)	\$107,198
				\$ 7,879,868		\$9,656,920	\$1,777,052

APPENDIX C: FY12-13 THRU FY16-17 CIVILIANIZATION

This is a list of 54 positions which have been civilianized between FY12-13 and FY16-17.

	Classification	Unit	Filled?
FY12/13			
1	1842 Management Assistant	Academy/POST Compliance Position	Yes
2	1766 Media Production Technician	Academy/ Tech Video	Yes
3	1822 Admin Analyst	Admin Compstat	Yes
4	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
5	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
6	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
7	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
8	1408 Principal Clerk	Community Engagement	Yes
9	1822 Admin Analyst	Traffic - Traffic Stats / Vision Zero	Yes
10	1942 Assist Mat. Coord.	Crime Lab Facility	Yes
11	1023 IS Administrator III	Technology	Yes
12	1023 IS Administrator III	Technology	Yes
13	1023 IS Administrator III	Technology	Yes
14	8173 Legal Assistant	Legal / Chief of Staff	Yes
15	8173 Legal Assistant	Legal / Chief of Staff	Yes
16	8259 Criminalist	CSI	Repurposed in FY17-18 for Technology/Police Reforms
17	8259 Criminalist	CSI	Repurposed in FY17-18 for Technology/Police Reforms
18	5322 Graphic Artist	CSI - Artist	Yes
19	1770 Photographer	CSI Photo Lab	Yes
20	1842 Management Assistant	Administration Bureau	Yes
21	0933 Manager V	Crime Lab Director	Yes
FY13-14			
22	7410 Vehicle Maintenance Operator	Fleet	Yes
23	1842 Management Assistant	Academy	Yes
24	1823 Senior Admin Analyst	Administration Compstat	Yes
25	1822 Admin Analyst	Administration Compstat	Yes
26	1408 Principal Clerk	Permits	Yes
27	1244 - Sr. Personnel Analyst	Permits	Yes
28	1934 Storekeeper	Property	Yes
29	1934 Storekeeper	Property	Yes

	Classification	Unit	Filled?
30	8108 Sr. Legal Process Clerk	Legal / Contracts	Yes
31	1842 Management Assistant	Alcoholic Liaison Unit	Yes
32	1842 Management Assistant	Professional Standards/Chief of Staff	Yes
33	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
34	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
35	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
36	1822 Admin Analyst	Operations Compstat	Yes
37	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
38	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
39	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
40	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
41	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
42	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
43	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
44	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
45	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
46	1942 Assistant Materials Coordinator	Facilities -District Station	Yes
47	1408 Principal Clerk	Staff Services	Yes
48	9209 Comm. Police Service Aide	Homeland Security Unit	Yes
49	9209 Comm. Police Service Aide	Homeland Security Unit	Yes
50	3310 Stable Attendant	Mounted Unit	Yes
51	3310 Stable Attendant	Mounted Unit	Yes
52	7410 Vehicle Maintenance Operator	Special Operations	Yes
53	1823 Senior Admin Analyst	Department Contracts Administrator	Yes
FY16-17			
54	0922 Manager I	Fleet Manager	Yes

APPENDIX D: DETAIL OF 2012 CONTROLLER'S REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS

This table provides a civilianization status on 67 positions recommended for civilianization per the Controller's Office 2012 report.

Unit	Proposed Job Class	Title	# Positions	# Recommended positions unfilled	Status	Notes
Academy	1766	Media Production Technician	1		Complete	
Academy	1842	Management Assistant	1		Complete	
Academy	8259	Fire Arm Specialist	1	1	N/A	Per Peace Officers Standards and Training (P.O.S.T) - Firearm Specialist must be sworn, so this couldn't happen. Repurposed to 1942 Facilities Coordinator
Academy	9772	Community Development Specialist	1	1	N/A	9772 job class is specific to MYR, could not be used
Alcohol Liaison Unit	1842	Management Assistant	2	1	Partially Complete	Could still be civilianized
Behavioral Science	1406	Senior Clerk	1		Complete	
Compstat	1822	Administrative Analyst	13	3	Complete	Compstat is now centralized, three positions no longer needed
Compstat	1823	Senior Administrative Analyst	1		Complete	
Crime Lab Director	0933	Manager V	1		Complete	
Crime Scene Investigation	1770	Photographer	1		Complete	
Crime Scene Investigation	5322	Graphic Artist	1		Complete	

Unit	Proposed Job Class	Title	# Positions	# Recommended positions unfilled	Status	Notes
Crime Scene Investigation	8259	Criminalist	1	1	Addressed but incomplete	Identified in FY18-19 Budgeted List
Crime Scene Investigation	8260	Criminalist II	1	1	Addressed but incomplete	Addressed in FY18-19 Budgeted List
Facilities	1942	Assistant Materials Coordinator	11		Complete	One of these was Firearm Specialist recommendation
Fleet and Tactical Mounted Unit	7410	Automotive Services Worker	2		Complete	
	3310	Stable Attendant	1		Complete	
Operations Center and Homeland Security Unit	9209	Community Police Service Aides	10	8	Partially Complete	Per BLA 2018 analysis: six requested positions denied in FY13-14 budget, two denied in FY16-17. Potentially could still be civilianized.
Permits	0922	Manager I	1		Complete	Repurposed to 1244 and assigned to Staff Services
Permits	1408	Principal Clerk	1		Complete	
Permits/Property	1944	Materials Coordinator	1	1	Addressed but incomplete	Addressed in 2019 Identified List
Police Law Enforcement Services	1408	Principal Clerk	2	2	Unfilled	Could still be civilianized
Police Law Enforcement Services	1823	Senior Administrative Analyst	1	1	Addressed but incomplete	Addressed in 2019 Identified List
Property	1934	Storekeeper	2		Complete	

Unit	Proposed Job Class	Title	# Positions	# Recommended positions unfilled	Status	Notes
Records Management - Contracts	1844	Senior Management Assistant	1		Complete	Moved from Legal to Fiscal
Records Management - Contracts	8108	Senior Process Clerk	1		Complete	
Records Management - Legal	8173	Legal Assistant	2		Complete	
Records Management - Professional Standards	1842	Management Assistant	1		Complete	
Special Operations	1844	Senior Management Assistant	1	1	Unfilled	Could still be civilianized
Technology	1023	Information Services Admin.	3		Complete	Job class changed to 1093
			67	21		

APPENDIX E: CIVILIANIZATION IN TWO BUREAUS

Of the SFPD's six Bureaus (Administration, Strategic Management, Field Operations, Investigations, Special Operations, and Airport) past reports have identified two which contain the most opportunity for civilianization: Administration and Investigations. The tables below provide a breakdown of staffing within these two Bureaus by Unit and position type. Civilian job types are shaded yellow, and Academy Units are shaded blue. Civilianizable positions included in the FY18-19 budgeted and the newly identified lists are shown on the right.

Sufficiently detailed organization charts for the remaining Bureaus and the Strategic Communications, Chief of Staff, and Policy & Public Affairs Divisions were not provided.

Administration Bureau Staffing

Unit	Deputy Chief	Cmdr./ Director	Capt.	Lt.	Sgt.- Inspector	Ofc.	Light Duty	Prop F (960) ⁸	Civilian	Total	FY18-19 Budgeted	Newly Identified
General	1	1	1		1				8	12	1	1
Academy - General			1						1	2		
Professional Development Unit				1	2	2			5	10		1
Basic Recruit Course				1	4	23		5	1	34		1
Field Training Office				1	1	2			1	5		
Field Tactics Unit				1	1	1		1		4		
Property			1	1	2	7	1	12	7	31	8	
Records				1	2		8		29	40		5
Staff Services - General			1	1	1			2	1	6		
Personnel									13	13		
Equal Employment Opportunity Programs									1	1		
Physician Specialist									1	1		
Payroll									9	9		
Background Investigations						6		21	3	30	6	
Behavioral Science					2	1			1	4		
Medical Liaison					1	1			2	4		1
Recruitment Unit					1	4			2	7		2
Staffing and Deployment				1	1	1			1	4		
Total	1	1	4	8	19	48	9	41	86	217	15	11

⁸ 960 staff are retired SFPD members who are hired back on a part-time basis under Prop. F. They may perform specialized duties but do not respond to calls for service.

Investigations Bureau Staffing

This table provides a breakdown of staffing within the Investigations Bureau by Unit and position type. Civilian job types are shaded. Civilianizable positions included in the FY18-19 budgeted and new identified Lists are shown on the right.

	Deputy Chief	Cmdr./ Director	Capt.	Lt.	Sgt.- Inspector	Ofc.	Prop F (960)	Community Policing Service Aide (9209)	Civilian	Cadet	Total	FY18-19 Budgeted	Newly Identified
Main Office	1	1			1			1	2		6		
Gun Crimes Invest. Ctr.				1	2	2	3		vacant (clerk)		8		
Special Invest.				1	16	13	1		1		32		
Crime Analysis		1							10		11		
Crime Lab		1			1			3	29		34		1
CSI				1	6	14			4		25	6	
ID ABIS						1			27		28		
GTF			1	1	15	1			1	1	20		
Homicide				1	15		3		1		20		
Robbery				1	10				vacant (clerk)		11		
Night Invest.					9				1		10		
Burglary			1	1	14			1	vacant (clerk)		17		
Narcotics				1	4	12	1		1		19		
TCIU				1	5				vacant (clerk)		6		
SVU			1	3	52	1	1	1	4	2	65		
Total	1	3	3	12	150	44	9	6	81	3	312	6	1