BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 Tel. No. (415) 554-5184 Fax No. (415) 554-5163 TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

MEMORANDUM

TO: Youth Commission

FROM: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

DATE: December 6, 2023

SUBJECT: REFERRAL FROM BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

The Board of Supervisors has received the following, which at the request of the Youth Commission is being referred as per Charter Section 4.124 for comment and recommendation. The Commission may provide any response it deems appropriate within 12 days from the date of this referral.

File No. 231224

Ordinance amending the Housing Code to authorize occupants of residential dwelling units to sue to enforce the prohibition on substandard housing conditions.

Please return this cover sheet with the Commission's response to John Carroll, Assistant Clerk, Land Use and Transportation Committee at john.carroll@sfgov.org.

RESPONSE FROM YOUTH COMMISSION Date: _____

No Comment

____ Recommendation Attached

Chairperson, Youth Commission

1	[Housing Code - Tenant Enforcement of Habitability Requirements]
2	
3	Ordinance amending the Housing Code to authorize occupants of residential dwelling
4	units to sue to enforce the prohibition on substandard housing conditions.
5	
6	NOTE: Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.
7	Additions to Codes are in <i>single-underline italics Times New Roman font</i> . Deletions to Codes are in <i>strikethrough italics Times New Roman font</i> .
8	Board amendment additions are in <u>double-underlined Arial font</u> . Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font.
9	Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Code subsections or parts of tables.
10	
11	Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:
12	
13	Section 1. Purpose and Findings.
14	(a) The City's Department of Building Inspection helps to ensure that building
15	owners keep their housing units up to the standards in the Housing Code, and can enforce the
16	Code by issuing notices of violation and seeking administrative penalties. This ordinance
17	complements those efforts, by allowing the persons most directly affected by substandard
18	housing conditions – the occupants of those units – to file lawsuits to enforce their rights
19	under the Housing Code. Tenants should have full recourse to the judicial system if they
20	experience harm due to substandard conditions. But in allowing tenants to file lawsuits on
21	their own behalf to address specific harms that they have been experiencing, the City does
22	not intend for such lawsuits to preclude, or in any way undermine, the City's ability to pursue
23	its own enforcement efforts on behalf of specific tenants or the general public.
24	(b) This ordinance is particularly necessary where children, seniors, and persons
25	with disabilities have been exposed to poor housing conditions. Research has shown that

1	living in substandard housing conditions, for these populations especially, is linked with poorer
2	cognitive and socioemotional health, causing deficits in executive functioning, reading, math
3	performance, and socioemotional functioning. Substandard conditions can also cause toxic
4	levels of stress, increased risk of depression and anxiety, and poor physical and socio-
5	emotional health. The Board of Supervisors finds it is appropriate and in the public interest to
6	allow a trier of fact to award up to triple damages in those situations where a child, senior, or
7	person with a disability has experienced such harms.
8	
9	Section 2. Chapter 2 of the Housing Code is hereby amended by revising Section 204,
10	to read as follows:
11	SEC. 204. VIOLATIONS.
12	* * * *
13	(c) Presumption of Noncompliance with Order; Civil Penalty for Violation of
14	Code <u>; Civil Actions</u> .
15	* * * *
16	(3) Any person residing in a housing unit, other than a unit in a building zoned as a single-
17	family residence, where any of the conditions described in Section 1001 of this Code are present and
18	pose a substantial risk to the occupants' health and safety, may institute a civil action under this
19	subsection (c)(3) against the unit owner, subject to the following:
20	(A) The plaintiff must provide the unit owner (or the owner's authorized agent, such
21	as a master tenant or property manager) advance written notice of the alleged violation.
22	(B) The plaintiff must provide the City Attorney's Office written notice of its intent to
23	file the civil action at least 60 days before doing so; provided, however, that the City Attorney's Office
24	may authorize the plaintiff to file before the close of this 60-day period if the City Attorney's Office
25	determines in its sole and absolute discretion that the matters alleged pose a serious and imminent risk

Supervisor Melgar BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

1	to the unit occupants and that a waiver of the 60-day period is appropriate and will further the public
2	interest. The filing of an action by the City Attorney shall not affect or impair the right of a plaintiff to
3	file a civil action under this subsection $(c)(3)$.
4	(C) A plaintiff who prevails in an action under this subsection $(c)(3)$ shall be entitled
5	to actual damages (including damages for mental or emotional distress); and if any occupants of the
6	substandard unit are younger than 18, older than 65, or disabled within the meaning of Section
7	12955.3 of the California Government Code, then the trier of fact may award up to three times the
8	actual damages experienced by those occupants. A plaintiff who prevails in an action under this
9	subsection (c)(3) shall also be entitled to recover costs and attorney's fees. A plaintiff who prevails in
10	such an action may also obtain a court order requiring compliance with the requirements of Section
11	1001, except that the court may not order an occupant to vacate a building or portion thereof solely
12	based on a violation of Section 1001, subsection (o).
13	(D) A dismissal or judgment against a plaintiff in an action brought under this
14	subsection $(c)(3)$ shall not preclude an action by the City Attorney. Further, this subsection $(c)(3)$ shall
15	not limit any other right or remedy otherwise available to any party, including the City, and shall not
16	create a duty or obligation on the part of the City.
17	(4)(3) The remedies in this Section <u>204</u> are in addition to any other remedies
18	provided by law. No provision in this Section shall preclude prosecution of actions for civil and
19	criminal penalties concurrently, sequentially or individually.
20	* * * *
21	
22	Section 3. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after
23	enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the
24	ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board
25	of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

1

•	
2	Section 4. Scope of Ordinance. In enacting this ordinance, the Board of Supervisors
3	intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles,
4	numbers, punctuation marks, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent parts of the Municipal
5	Code that are explicitly shown in this ordinance as additions, deletions, Board amendment
6	additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under
7	the official title of the ordinance.
8	
9	Section 5. Undertaking for the General Welfare. In enacting and implementing this
10	ordinance, the City is assuming an undertaking only to promote the general welfare. It is not
11	assuming, nor is it imposing on its officers and employees, an obligation for breach of which it
12	is liable in money damages to any person who claims that such breach proximately caused
13	injury.
14	
15	APPROVED AS TO FORM: DAVID CHIU, City Attorney
16	DAVID CITIC, City Attorney
17	By: <u>/s/</u> MANU PRADHAN
18	Deputy City Attorney
19	n:\legana\as2022\2300048\01650926.docx
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

[Housing Code - Tenant Enforcement of Habitability Requirements]

Ordinance amending the Housing Code to authorize occupants of residential dwelling units to sue to enforce the prohibition on substandard housing conditions.

Existing Law

Section 1001 of the Housing Code defines the basic habitability standards for housing in San Francisco. If a unit does not meet these standards, the Department of Building Inspection can issue notices of violations and seek penalties against the unit owner. The Housing Code does not authorize private parties to file lawsuits over Section 1001 violations.

Amendments to Current Law

The ordinance would allow a unit occupant (unless the unit is in a building zoned as a singlefamily residence) to sue the unit owner if the unit does not meet the standards in Section 1001 and poses a substantial risk to the occupants' health and safety. The occupant would need to give the owner and the City advance notice of the lawsuit. An occupant who prevailed in the lawsuit could get attorneys' fees, an order that the owner must remedy the violation, and/or actual damages. If any of the occupants were younger than 18 or older than 65 or disabled, then the owner could have to pay up to three times the actual damages experienced by those occupants.

Background Information

The ordinance does not affect existing remedies that the City may have against owners of substandard housing. Nor does it affect other remedies that an occupant may have against an owner of substandard housing.

n:\legana\as2023\2300048\01717002.docx

Introduction Form

(by a Member of the Board of Supervisors or the Mayor)

I hereby submit the following item for introduction (select only one): \square 1. For reference to Committee (Ordinance, Resolution, Motion or Charter Amendment) \square 2. Request for next printed agenda (For Adoption Without Committee Reference) (Routine, non-controversial and/or commendatory matters only) \square 3. Request for Hearing on a subject matter at Committee Request for Letter beginning with "Supervisor 4. inquires..." 5. City Attorney Request Call File No. \square 6. from Committee. Budget and Legislative Analyst Request (attached written Motion) 7. Substitute Legislation File No. \square 8. Reactivate File No. 9. \square Topic submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the Board on 10. The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the following (please check all appropriate boxes): □ Small Business Commission □ Ethics Commission □ Youth Commission □ Building Inspection Commission □ Human Resources Department □ Planning Commission General Plan Referral sent to the Planning Department (proposed legislation subject to Charter 4.105 & Admin 2A.53): \Box Yes \square No (Note: For Imperative Agenda items (a Resolution not on the printed agenda), use the Imperative Agenda Form.) Sponsor(s): Subject: Long Title or text listed: