

Presentation to Budget & Appropriations Committee

Alternatives to Law Enforcement Services

May 12, 2021

San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Budget & Legislative Analyst's Office



Report Contents

- ❑ Overview of Police & Sheriff Budget Changes
- ❑ Police Civilianization Update
- ❑ Staffing of Certain Police Units
- ❑ Traffic Enforcement
- ❑ Civilianizing Response to Calls for Service
- ❑ Police Work Orders
- ❑ Sheriff Work Order with Public Health
- ❑ Police & Sheriff Administrative Costs



Primary Questions & Focus

1. Can the City provide a civilian response to 911 calls related to homelessness and mental health crises?
2. What is the public safety impact of certain Police and Sheriff assignments?
3. Are there funded alternatives to certain programs currently carried out by the Police Department?
4. Are there opportunities to civilianize work-ordered services provided by the Police and Sheriff Departments to other City departments?
5. Are there opportunities to reduce administrative costs at the Police and Sheriff Departments?

Overview of Police & Sheriff Budgets

Police

- Exhibit 3 (pg. 10) details BOS changes to Police budget in FY 2020-21 & FY 2021-22
 - 1/2 General Fund Police Academy deleted in FY 2020-21
 - 2/2 General Fund Police Academies deleted in FY 2021-22
 - General Fund overtime reduced by 25% in FY 2020-21 and by 50% in FY 2021-22
 - 9 Civilianization positions added-back in FY 2020-21
 - \$12.8 million of overtime placed on Committee Reserve in FY 2021-22; BOS must take action again to maintain reserve

Sheriff

- Exhibit 4 (pg. 11) details BOS changes to Police budget in FY 2020-21 & FY 2021-22
 - \$7.9 million of overtime and \$9.3 million of CBO funding placed on Committee Reserve in FY 2021-22; BOS must take action again to maintain reserves

Police Civilianization Update

Previously Funded Positions	75
Cut by Mayor in FY 2020-21 Proposed	(45)
Added back by BOS in FY 2020-21	9
FY 2020-21 Net Funded Positions	39
Filled	32
Vacant	7



Police Civilianization Update

Policy Option 1: Choose to (a) fund the civilianization positions recommended by the Police Commission for FY 2021-22 or (b) enhance funding for civilianization positions based on the recommendations of prior staffing studies.

Staffing of Select Police Units

Unit/Assignment	June 2020	March 2021	Change	Annual Cost (based on March 2021 staff)
Homeless Outreach Team	27	29	2	\$2,289,872
Healthy Streets Operations Center (HSOC)	33	14	(19)	1,206,439
School Resource Officers	11	0	(11)	0
Honda	19	17	(2)	1,662,798
Marine	8	6	(2)	535,320
Mounted	15	15	0	1,326,543
Bomb Squad	10	7	(3)	662,465
Traffic	61	62	1	7,004,156



Staffing of Select Police Units

Policy Option 2: Work with the Mayor, Police Commission, and Police Chief to align staffing of Police units with Board policy priorities.

Traffic Enforcement

- ❑ Under State law, only law enforcement may issue citations for moving violations.
- ❑ The Police Department has a dedicated unit for traffic enforcement, the Traffic Company, which is responsible for proactive traffic enforcement, traffic-related investigations, and motorcades for dignitaries.
- ❑ In addition, car patrols conduct proactive enforcement and respond to traffic-related calls for service.
- ❑ As part of Vision Zero, Police Department has committed to ensuring that at least half of its traffic citations are for top five causes of traffic fatalities: (1) speeding, (2) violating pedestrian right-of-way in a crosswalk, (3) running red lights, (4) running stop signs, and (5) failing to yield while turning.

Traffic Stops in 2019

Violation Type	Count	Percent
Equipment violation	9,865	15.3%
Moving violation	42,363	65.9%
Non-moving violation*	12,054	18.8%
Total	64,282	100.0%

* Non-moving refers to registration and local ordinance violations

2019 Traffic Stops, by Race

	Asian/PI	Black	Latino	White	Other
Equipment violation	11%	34%	20%	26%	9%
Moving violation	18%	14%	17%	39%	12%
Non-moving violation	15%	18%	22%	24%	21%
Total Traffic Stops	16%	18%	19%	34%	13%
Proportion of Drivers in Collisions	18%	14%	20%	29%	20%

Focus Enforcement on Safety

Traffic Stops for Low-Level Violations in 2019

Regulation	Count	Duration (minutes)
Local Ordinance	6,634	38,741
License Plate	4,544	61,580
Registration	4,595	58,831
Lamps	2,187	23,729
Window/Windshield	527	5,182
Parking	133	1,551
Total	18,620	189,614

Police Workload for Low-Level Violations

Stops	18,620
Duration (Minutes)	189,614
FTE	6.25
FTE Cost	\$1,146,779



Automated Traffic Enforcement

- ❑ SFMTA has red-light cameras at 19 intersections and plans to expand program by up to 8 additional intersections
- ❑ There are opportunities to expand the program further if funding is identified.
- ❑ However, cameras may only be used to issue citations for violating red-lights and illegal right-hand turns.
- ❑ State law must be changed to deploy speed and parking cameras.
- ❑ Assembly Bill 550 would allow for speed cameras in San Francisco.

Civilianize Traffic Enforcement

- ❑ To transfer traffic enforcement to a civilian agency, State law must be changed.
- ❑ Transferring functions to a new civilian agency could take over a year, as was the case when parking enforcement was civilianized.
- ❑ A new civilian agency would incur fixed administrative costs, similar to the creation of the Department of Homelessness & Supportive Housing when it absorbed programs from DPH and HSA.
- ❑ New job classes would have to be developed, recruited, and trained.
- ❑ If the civilian traffic enforcement is placed at SFMTA, the staff costs would be burdened by SFMTA overhead (85%).



Traffic Enforcement Policy Options

Policy Option 3: The Board of Supervisor could work with the Mayor and MTA Board of Directors to increase funding for Automated Enforcement.

Policy Option 4: The Board of Supervisors could work with the Mayor, Police Commission, and Police Chief to provide policy guidance to the enforcement priorities of low-level traffic violations.

Policy Option 5: The Board of Supervisors could request an update from the Chief of Police regarding the implementation status of the traffic enforcement bias recommendations from the 2016 Department of Justice assessment.

Civilian Response to Calls For Service

Derived Police Staff and Costs Required to Respond to Mental Health, Homeless, Wellness Check, and Noise Compliant Calls by Priority Level

Radio Code	Description	Priority A Calls (FTEs)	Priority B Calls (FTEs)	Priority C Calls (FTEs)	Total Calls (FTEs)	Total Cost
800/800 CR	Mentally Disturbed Person	47.28	23.09	0.07	70.44	\$12,923,779
801/801 CR	Person Attempting Suicide	40.80	0.03	0.00	40.83	7,490,976
5150	Mental Health Detention	0.42	1.22	0.00	1.64	300,597
806	Juv. Beyond Control	1.45	0.41	0.01	1.87	342,991
915	Homeless Related	0.02	0.01	27.94	27.97	5,131,264
910	Wellness Check	12.27	25.52	0.02	37.82	6,938,609
415	Noise Complaint	0.00	0.65	16.35	17.00	3,119,693
Radio Code	Total Calls	102.24	50.93	44.39	197.55	
	Total Cost	\$18,758,857	\$9,344,316	\$8,144,735		\$36,247,909



Civilian Response to Calls For Service

Policy Option 6: The Board of Supervisors could request that the Mayor, Police Chief, Department of Public Health, and Fire Department conduct further analysis to determine if a civilian behavioral health team is suited to respond to other mental health related calls, including persons attempting suicide, mental health detention, juvenile beyond parental control, wellness checks, and noise complaints and report back to the Board by May 1, 2022.

Policy Option 7: The Board of Supervisors could request that the Mayor, Police Chief, and Department of Homelessness & Supportive Housing develop a plan for a civilian response to homeless-related 911 calls and report back to the Board by May 1, 2022.



Police Work Orders

The Police Department provides law enforcement services to other City departments, the Transbay Joint Powers Authority, and Treasure Island Development Authority through work orders and a memorandum of understanding.

- Exhibit 17 on pages 27 & 28 of our report summarizes Police work orders and potential alternatives.
- Most work orders are funded by enterprise or special revenues.
- Reducing work orders for Police overtime would not impact Police staff levels. However, if work orders that fund full-time positions were reduced, alternative funding sources would need to be identified for those positions or the positions would need to be deleted, which could result in layoffs.



Police Work Orders Policy Options

Policy Option 8: The Board of Supervisors could work with the Mayor, City Administrator, SFMTA Board of Directors, Port Commission, and Police Commission to evaluate the ongoing need for Police Department work orders for SFMTA Garage Security, Taxi Enforcement, Nighttime Parking Enforcement, Port Cruise Security, and Public Works Graffiti Abatement.

Policy Option 9: The Board of Supervisors could work with the Mayor, Police Commission, Police Chief, and TJPA Board of Directors to reduce the scope of Police Department services at the Transbay Transit Center (removing responses to homeless and mental illness incidents) and enter into new agreements between TJPA, the Department of Public Health, and the Department of Homelessness & Supportive Housing to fund the work of the Street Crisis Response Team and Homeless Outreach Team at the Transbay Transit Center.

Sheriff Work Order with Public Health

- ❑ Sheriff provides law enforcement services at Zuckerberg General Hospital, Laguna Honda Hospital, and San Francisco Health Network clinics
- ❑ Public Health has developed a proposal to partially civilianize fixed-post security and patrol at these sites by reducing Deputy Sheriffs and replacing them with behavioral health teams, Sheriff Cadets, and non-profit safety staff. **(See detail in Exhibit 20 on page 34 of our report.)**
 - Net increase of 26.40 FTE civilian staff
 - Cost increase of \$2.7 million

Uses of Force at General Hospital

	FY 2018-19 Use of Force	FY 2018-19 Patient Population	FY 2019-20 Use of Force	FY 2019-20 Patient Population
Asian	3%	22%	2%	21%
Black	42%	15%	48%	15%
Latino	11%	38%	14%	37%
White	41%	19%	29%	18%
Other	3%	6%	7%	9%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%



Policy Options for DPH Work Order

Policy Option 10: The Board of Supervisors could request that the Mayor include the civilianization of security at Public Health hospitals and clinics in the FY 2021-23 two-year proposed budget.

Policy Option 11: The Board of Supervisors could request that the Mayor, Director of Public Health, and Sheriff define measures of success to the civilianization effort, including timeline for implementation, demographic patterns for uses of force, and impact on public safety. Depending on the outcome of the pilot, the Board of Supervisors could then request an expansion of civilian security at DPH facilities.



Police & Sheriff Administrative Costs

- ❑ Exhibit 22 on page 36 of our report details the changes to Police and Sheriff administrative costs.
- ❑ We will review administrative costs as part of our annual budget review.
- ❑ Page 37 of our report contains information of certain Police Department contracts, as requested by the Budget & Appropriations Committee.

Questions?

