

**From:** [Colin Cusac](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Friday, January 9, 2026 7:41:36 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/>.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance

- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Colin Cusac

**From:** [Jake Watters](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docodocomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docodocomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFAC, SFRPD meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Thursday, January 8, 2026 10:46:45 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

I am writing to express my strong opposition to removing the large fountain at Embarcadero plaza. I was born and raised in San Francisco and have many fond memories of the fountain growing up. Many critics have pointed out that it is out of date without its freeway backdrop, but when I was growing up in the 90s- it felt like an icon. The erratic lines and forms were endlessly intriguing and I remember it as an important landmark from weekly visits to the farmer's market with my mother (back before it was at the newly renovated Ferry Building).

Aside from my personal memories of the fountain, I fear that the proposed redevelopment is yet another step in the replacement of a sometimes messy but culturally vibrant and diverse city with a generic space optimized for the frictionless flow of capital. San Francisco is a beautiful and alluring place precisely because it is messy. The eclectic amalgamation of different eras and styles of architecture perched on a barely tameable topography is an important reminder of all the people who have had a hand in creating such an important global city- a city that looms large in the international imagination despite its small footprint. This variety provides endless delight and discovery to its citizens and visitors. I think the fountain at the embarcadero is an invaluable asset to the city's fabric and the skilled landscape architects at HOK should be capable of keeping the fountain in place while designing a new plaza that better functions.

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the plaza's namesake urban renewal era. Or more recently Mayor Ed Lee's tax deal with Twitter, their subsequent flight from the city and continued issues with blight in the mid-market- is kowtowing to private business

interests the most cost effective way for the city to effect meaningful and lasting change to the city? I understand the BPX has offered to pay for design services and some construction costs- is it really fair for them to build an amenity for their properties that the city is then left to maintain?

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year. I agree that the plaza is somewhat underutilized but having a large open space for civic engagement at this location is important. I even wager if the Tuesday and Sunday markets were shifted to JH Plaza, that the plaza would be better utilized across the rest of the week.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- **Be responsible with public money** by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- **Explore real design alternatives** that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- **Actively engage with relevant experts**, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- **Require full transparency from project sponsors**, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade

Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)

- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance

- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance

- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance

- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR

- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR

- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR

- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment

- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version

- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities

- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)

- Embarcadero Donor Presentation

- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC

- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you,

Jake Watters

**From:** Miguel Santos  
**To:** [Colina, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madani, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoenna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Aubrey \(REC\)](#); [Sauter/Staff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation \(BOS\)](#)  
**CC:** [info@recreation-parks.org](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFROS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Thursday, January 8, 2026 9:40:07 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at [https://url.avanan.click/v2/r01/\\_\\_\\_\\_https://frdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/\\_\\_\\_\\_.YXAzOnNmZHQyOmE6bz0MjQzNmI1ZmEwNmZmZjA1Mjg1OTZkM2RkMjRjYWExYT03OjM4YmQ6NWU0MjUyYmRiMmlxODJhZDE0MmMmQ1Zjg0ZmlzYWQ4ZjJjZTQyYzdiMDRhMjNhNDRIbmVjNTE0ZmRlZTY1YTMyZ2Tp0OIQ6Tg](https://url.avanan.click/v2/r01/____https://frdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/____.YXAzOnNmZHQyOmE6bz0MjQzNmI1ZmEwNmZmZjA1Mjg1OTZkM2RkMjRjYWExYT03OjM4YmQ6NWU0MjUyYmRiMmlxODJhZDE0MmMmQ1Zjg0ZmlzYWQ4ZjJjZTQyYzdiMDRhMjNhNDRIbmVjNTE0ZmRlZTY1YTMyZ2Tp0OIQ6Tg).
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\*:** Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Miguel R Santos  
491 Linden Street  
San Francisco, CA 94102

**From:** [Tomohiko Aono](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Save Vaillancourt Fountain  
**Date:** Wednesday, January 7, 2026 11:04:40 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors:

I request that you move to preserve artist Armand Vaillancourt's fountain by integrating it with the future of Embarcadero Plaza. Like the Ferry Building across the street, may it serve as a testament to adaptation and resilience in an evolving urban landscape, a celebration of San Francisco's history and culture for the benefit of generations to come.

Sincerely,

Tomo Aono  
District 7 resident

**From:** [Michele Gloor](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [Dhaliwal, Manraj \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Ginsburg, Phil \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Preservation of Vaillancourt Fountain Public Comment for SFBOS, SFAC, SFRPD meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Tuesday, January 6, 2026 1:26:22 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

SF Board of SuperPublic Comment for SFBOS, SFAC, SFRPD meetings + Immediate Disclosure Requestors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

**The Vaillancourt Fountain, with its water, is a strong, beautiful, participatory joy & landmark for residents, visitors & passersby. It is unique & my favorite in my long experience of fountains. It needs to be restored, cared for & preserved, not destroyed. Its loss would be deeply regretted in the future.**

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- **Be responsible with public money** by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.

- **Explore real design alternatives** that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/>.

- **Actively engage with relevant experts**, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.

- **Require full transparency from project sponsors**, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)

**Thank you for your time, hard work & attention to this & many other important matters.**

**In peace & hope,**

**Michele Gloor**

**1271 11th Ave. Apt. 1, San Francisco, CA 94122**



This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

• Be expeditious with public money by right-sizing the project and finding a better approach for the \$15-30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.

• Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://url.avanan.click/2/r0/> - <https://jrdy.com/embarcadere-reimagined/> - <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YYXAoNnMhZQ&list=PLKMD3rhmNjNjUyM0G8aM3eM3EJZUjUj0dWjYmJ0NtUj1NDz30jA5E6OTg0Zj3MTUj2mYjNTZjNzE2NmRkNzE0OWIwMjNmZTNjNWExMDFnZDk4NDI2MjFkMjI2ZjNhZWYhYjFhZGFhZnZpOjE0G6Tg>

• Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.

• Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadere Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.  
Kit Lofroos

**From:** [Mona Marks](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Tuesday, January 6, 2026 10:16:45 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,  
**The Vaillancourt Fountain is a San Francisco landmark and an important piece of art. It would be a crime to destroy it and would be a mistake and would serve no logical reason to eliminate it. Do not let this be "the East Wing fiasco" of San Francisco.**

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/>.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)

- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.  
Mona Marks

From: [SBS](#)  
To: [Collins, Charles \(S&T\)](#); [B&T-Info](#); [Madford, Sarah \(B&C\)](#); [Commission, Research \(B&C\)](#); [Goodwin, Eogenna \(B&C\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(B&C\)](#); [SauterShaf](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation \(BOS\)](#)  
Cc: [info@sfboardsup.com](#)  
Subject: Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
Date: Tuesday, January 6, 2026 10:15:33 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://url.avanam.click/v2/r0l/> <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/> [\\_YXAzOnNmZHQyOmE6bzplMGQwM2UwYTk2ZGYN4NzUzZjVioDQ5N2YzNWUwNGFjNDc3Ojk3ZDE6MTlhMzFhZTVjMTU3Y2EzYWY3MTM3YmZmNWEnNWQyMmQ3ZjRmZWJhMTg3Njk3MTcxNTdlZTMzOGVnZTUwNmVhNDp0OjQ6Tg.](#)
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

Thank you.

Dennis Sullivan

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

- Be responsible with public money by going-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15-30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from established architecture firm can be found at <https://url.avanian.click/c2e0/> & <https://rdw.com/embarcadere-reimagined/>.  
~~reimagined/\_XXYAOnNmZH0rOmE68gipJbnjNgiMzMuNTQZtJOQM7K3mJdUGM5Y3WY2ZnGjbhAo3oQBhYmM6YTUzADTUDxkNTUs7zC2NDy9znQ2ZDYz4YWFYIWE3YThmNDQ5ZTd&MDY0YjimOTxNDvINzA4YgmXyzqH0DY2YpwIO6Tg~~
- Actively engage with relevant experts, architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, paddle courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDF Meeting slides, pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Charles Eilhardt  
Mobile: 510-697-8413  
Sent from my iPad

**From:** [Liz Waytkus](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** File No. 251202  
**Date:** Monday, January 5, 2026 2:24:26 PM  
**Attachments:** [01052026 Docomomo Vaillancourt CEQA.pdf](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear colleagues,

Attached you will find Docomomo US letter of support for appeal File No. 251202 stating the misuse of an emergency exemption for CEQA related to the removal of the Vaillancourt Fountain.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Liz Waytkus  
Executive Director

**Docomomo US**  
P.O. Box 230977  
New York, NY 10023  
t: 203-671-6609  
[www.docomomo-us.org](http://www.docomomo-us.org)

**Board of Directors**

Katie Horak  
PRESIDENT

Meredith Arms Bzdak  
PRESIDENT-ELECT

Todd Grover  
VICE-PRESIDENT

Eric Keune  
VICE-PRESIDENT

Flora Chou  
TREASURER

Barbara Yanni  
SECRETARY

Jesús (Chuy) Barba Bonilla  
Nina Chmura  
Zoe Detweiler  
T. Gunny Harboe  
Tyler Jones  
Robert Meckfessel  
Tonia Moy  
Theodore Prudon  
Robert Pullum  
Michelangelo Sabatino  
Monica Schaffer  
Barry Solar  
Robert Thomas  
Bradford J. White

Liz Waytkus  
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

**Docomomo US Chapters**

Chicago/Midwest  
Colorado  
DC  
Florida  
Georgia  
Hawaii  
Michigan  
Mid Tex Mod  
Minnesota  
New England  
New Orleans/Louisiana  
New York/Tri-State  
Northern California  
North Texas  
Oregon  
Philadelphia  
Southern California  
Western Washington  
Wisconsin

**Friend Organizations**

CF3 Cincinnati  
Houston Mod  
Indiana Modern  
Landmark Columbus  
Modern STL

January 5, 2026

City Hall  
BOARD of SUPERVISORS  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689

RE: File No. 251202

To Whom It May Concern:

On behalf of the thousands of members represented by Docomomo US and Docomomo International, we write to urge you to retain and preserve the Vaillancourt Fountain—one of San Francisco's most recognizable and nationally significant works of public art—by supporting the appeal challenging the City's "emergency" designation to remove and store the fountain.

Historic Modern landscapes such as the Vaillancourt Fountain and Embarcadero Plaza are integral to San Francisco's cultural identity and to a broader understanding of the diversity and evolution of our shared public spaces.

With broad public support for renovating and reinvigorating Armand Vaillancourt's monumental fountain, it is evident that City officials manufactured a false sense of urgency to justify unilateral action. Docomomo US remains steadfast in our support for this nationally significant work and urge the City to complete the legally required environmental review.

We respectfully ask that you uphold the protections afforded under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) for the Vaillancourt Fountain, which was formally deemed a historic resource on October 29, 2025. We further urge you to allow the CEQA process to proceed as intended and to fully consider preservation alternatives rather than rushing toward removal.

Sincerely,

Liz Waytkus  
Executive Director

Todd Grover  
Vice President, Advocacy

**From:** [Alexis](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\); Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Support letter for the CEQA appeal from Armand Vaillancourt  
**Date:** Friday, January 2, 2026 1:24:46 PM  
**Attachments:** [Letter of support for the Appeal 2025.pdf](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To Whom It May Concern,

Here is my father Armand Vaillancourt's letter of support for CEQA's appeal.

Please acknowledge receipt.

Alexis Vaillancourt

**Letter of Support for the Appeal of the San Francisco Arts Commission Decision**

From Armand Vaillancourt,  
artist and creator of the Vaillancourt Fountain

Montréal, November 2025

To whom it may concern,

I, Armand Vaillancourt, the sculptor of the Vaillancourt Fountain, wish to express my full support for the legal appeal of the recent decision by the San Francisco Arts Commission authorizing the dismantling and storage of my work.

This decision was based on claims of imminent danger and contamination that, according to the official reports available, are not supported by factual or structural evidence. No engineering study has concluded that the fountain presents an immediate risk to the public. The corrosion and structural wear observed are the result of years of neglect and lack of maintenance, not of any inherent flaw in the work itself.

Furthermore, the allegations of asbestos and lead hazards have been greatly exaggerated. These materials, present only in isolated and enclosed areas, do not pose a public threat. There are many responsible and technically feasible ways to stabilize, repair, and preserve the fountain without dismantling it.

To dismantle the work now would be, in effect, to begin its destruction. Once taken apart, the likelihood of a full restoration would be severely diminished. The fountain was created as an integral part of the Embarcadero Plaza, a space of public encounter, freedom, and community. It should remain there as a living testimony to the city's artistic and social history.

I therefore support the efforts of our coalition and our legal representatives to pursue this appeal, not only to protect the Vaillancourt Fountain, but also to preserve the cultural and historical integrity of the Embarcadero Plaza for future generations.

Sincerely,  
Armand Vaillancourt  
Sculptor, creator of Vaillancourt Fountain.

*A. Vaillancourt,*

**From:** [Morten Jensen](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** File No. 251202 Support for the Appeal JRDV Morten Jensen  
**Date:** Friday, January 2, 2026 7:52:46 AM  
**Attachments:** [File No. 251202 jrdv morten jensen 010126.pdf](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear San Francisco Board of Supervisors

This is Morten Jensen an architect and urban designer urging you **to support the Appeal.**

I have worked for many decades in the San Francisco Bay Area on prominent planning projects and know the difference between a careful professional planning process and hasty decision-making. The original approval and construction of the Embarcadero Freeway Viaduct was an example of hasty decision-making that precipitated years of controversy, economic pain and environmental degradation.

Late last year it came to my attention that in some circles there is a mistaken belief that it is not possible to create the greatest possible public space at the most consequential location in the City of San Francisco without presupposing the removal of the fountain. I believed this was wrong and therefore created an alternative design titled **Embarcadero Reimagined** showing how the fountain can be incorporated into a design that brings pedestrians to the upper retail levels of Embarcadero Center and anchors it to the Ferry Building Marketplace. A press release showing this design is linked here: [https://jrdv.com/wp-content/uploads/2025/12/Embarcadero-Reimagined-JRDV-Dec-9-2025\\_01.pdf](https://jrdv.com/wp-content/uploads/2025/12/Embarcadero-Reimagined-JRDV-Dec-9-2025_01.pdf) A 3-minute narrated video showing the design is linked here <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined-jrdv-video/>

This design alternative demonstrates that a comprehensive design for all of Embarcadero Plaza and Sue Bierman Park is possible without erasing the layers of history, but by better connecting and activating the spaces.

Sincerely,

Morten Jensen

**Morten Jensen**  
Architect, President  
**JRDV Urban International**

DK +45 31 53 44 51  
US +1 415 699 7171  
[morten@jrdv.com](mailto:morten@jrdv.com)  
[View Our Work](#)

COPENHAGEN  
Bloxhub  
Bryghuspladsen 8, 3.  
DK-1473 Copenhagen

SHANGHAI  
Jingan Kerry Center  
1228 Yan'an Zhong Rd,  
Bldg 3, 22F

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA  
560 14th Street  
Suite 300  
Oakland, CA 94612





January 1, 2026

San Francisco Board of Supervisors  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

**RE: File No. 251202** Support for the Appeal of the Statutory Exemption under the California Environmental Quality Act on October 31, 2025 for the proposed project to remove the Embarcadero Fountain by Armand Vaillancourt (Vaillancourt Fountain)

Dear Board of Supervisors,

This is Morten Jensen an architect and urban designer urging you to **support the Appeal**.

I have worked for many decades in the San Francisco Bay Area on prominent planning projects and know the difference between a careful professional planning process and hasty decision-making. The original approval and construction of the Embarcadero Freeway Viaduct was an example of hasty decision-making that precipitated years of controversy, economic pain and environmental degradation.

Late last year it came to my attention that in some circles there is a mistaken belief that it is not possible to create the greatest possible public space at the most consequential location in the City of San Francisco without presupposing the removal of the fountain. I believed this was wrong and therefore created an alternative design titled *Embarcadero Reimagined* showing how the fountain can be incorporated into a design that brings pedestrians to the upper retail levels of Embarcadero Center and anchors it to the Ferry Building Marketplace. A press release showing this design is linked here: [https://jrdv.com/wp-content/uploads/2025/12/Embarcadero-Reimagined-JRDV-Dec-9-2025\\_01.pdf](https://jrdv.com/wp-content/uploads/2025/12/Embarcadero-Reimagined-JRDV-Dec-9-2025_01.pdf) In addition, A 3-minute narrated video showing the design is linked here <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined-jrdv-video/>

This design alternative demonstrates that a comprehensive design for all of Embarcadero Plaza and Sue Bierman Park is possible without erasing the layers of history, but by better connecting and activating the spaces.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Morten Jensen', written over a horizontal line.

Morten Jensen  
Architect President

**JRDV Urban International**

BLOXHUB  
Bryghuspladsen 8, 3. DK-1473  
Copenhagen Denmark Europe

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA  
560 14th Street, Suite 300  
Oakland, CA 94612

JINGAN KERRY CENTER  
1228 Yan'an Zhong Rd, Bldg 3,  
22F  
Shanghai, PRC

www.jrdv.com  
US +1 415 699 7171  
DK +45 31 53 44 51

**From:** [Janet Gracyk](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** File No. 251202  
**Date:** Thursday, January 1, 2026 5:06:28 PM  
**Attachments:** [Re Vaillancourt. CGLHS.pdf](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Please see the attached letter.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Janet Gracyk  
President  
CGLHS.org

## Board of Directors

Janet Gracyk  
President  
Petaluma

John Martin  
Vice President  
Alameda

Keith Park  
Past President  
Martinez

Patrick O'Hara  
Treasurer  
Atascadero

Danny Hughes  
Membership Officer  
Los Angeles

Jesse Lattig  
Recording Secretary  
Los Angeles

Nancy Carol Carter  
Director-at-Large  
San Diego

Stacy Farr  
Director-at-Large  
Oakland

Rich Freitas  
Director-at-Large  
San Francisco

Tanisha Herr  
Director-at-Large  
Pacific Palisades

Joel Michaelson  
Director-at-Large  
Santa Barbara

Haley O'Connor  
Director-at-Large  
Los Angeles

Libby Simon  
Director-at-Large  
Pasadena

Steven Keylon  
*Eden* Editor  
Palm Springs



January 1, 2026

Rafael Mandelman, President  
San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Dear President Mandelman and members of the San Francisco Board of Supervisors,

We urge you to overturn the Planning Department's decision to issue a CEQA determination of Statutory Exemption for the proposed removal of the Vaillancourt Fountain. The department's decision continues the city's disingenuous march towards demolition of the fountain, an iconic piece in San Francisco's public art collection, and a designated historic landmark. The exemption is inappropriate because no meaningful change has been documented in the condition of the fountain since a formal conditions assessment report was released in June 2025. The CEQA exemption is the latest in a series of actions, led by the Department of Recreation and Parks, to avoid a meaningful public process for the redesign of Embarcadero Plaza that includes the fountain in its future. Given the shadow of impropriety that taints the Planning Commission's decision, we urge you to reverse their finding.

We express our strong support for the preservation and restoration of the Vaillancourt Fountain and Embarcadero Plaza, a landscape of exceptional cultural and historical significance. This site, designed by renowned landscape architect Lawrence Halprin, stands as a testament to the modernist era and embodies Halprin's vision of dynamic urban parks that celebrate both the beauty of cities and the vibrancy of their communities. The plaza was conceived as a grand urban space, with the fountain serving as a bold and fitting counterpoint to the plaza's broad expanse and the surrounding environment. The plaza also marks the beginning of Market Street, sharing material continuity and design intent with the corridor and reflecting Halprin's vision for a connected public realm. As the beginning point of a seam unifying intersecting urban grids, demolition of Embarcadero Plaza and the Vaillancourt Fountain would erase an essential physical and symbolic link between the waterfront, San Francisco's central spine, and its cultural and urban legacy. Halprin's influential ideas and designs continue to shape the field of landscape architecture today.

The Vaillancourt Fountain, created by Armand Vaillancourt through an international competition, is an impressive sculpture that transcends its initial context. While some have associated the fountain with the now-demolished elevated freeway, it also evokes the natural forms of cliffs and waterfalls. Its playful and interactive character invites visitors to engage with the space in new and meaningful ways. The careful integration of fountain and plaza was a central aspect of the design, and the fountain has become a beloved modern landmark, resilient and layered with cultural and historical meaning.

We respectfully urge the Board to pause and reconsider any decision to dismantle the fountain. There are alternative solutions that honor the creativity of this landmark and the shared history it

January 1, 2026

Rafael Mandelman, President  
San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Page Two

represents. The city's aspiration to be recognized for its rich, diverse, and stimulating cultural environment would be undermined by the demolition of the Vaillancourt Fountain.

The California Garden & Landscape History Society asks you to overturn the Planning Department's decision to issue a CEQA determination of Statutory Exemption for the proposed removal of the Vaillancourt Fountain. We support the retention and restoration of Vaillancourt Fountain, and we agree with Docomomo's statement that "The future of Embarcadero Plaza and the Vaillancourt Fountain must be determined in the San Francisco tradition; transparently, equitably, and factually, free of carefully steered narratives and revisionist history."

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Janet Gracyk".

Janet Gracyk  
President  
California Garden & Landscape History Society

**From:** [Daniel Filipkowski](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Vaillancourt Fountain  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 30, 2025 11:53:20 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello,

I am writing in my support of removing the Vaillancourt Fountain from the Embarcadero Plaza to make way for improvements to this essential civic space. I think that there may be a possibility for a compromise here: perhaps parts of the fountain (notably its distinctive arms) could be incorporated into parts of the new park as freestanding sculptures with a plaque to memorialize the history of the fountain. Ultimately, I support its removal as it is important that we have a public space that can support the needs of the community and ensure a safe and beautiful park for generations to enjoy.

Thank you.

Respectfully,

--

**Daniel Filipkowski**  
**199 New Montgomery St, Unit 709**  
**San Francisco, CA 94105**  
[avantdan@gmail.com](mailto:avantdan@gmail.com)  
**+1 415-577-3160**

**From:** [Woody LaBounty](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Mandelman, Rafael \(BOS\)](#); [Melgar, Myrna \(BOS\)](#); [Sherrill, Stephen \(BOS\)](#); [Chan, Connie \(BOS\)](#); [Felder, Jackie \(BOS\)](#); [Chen, Chyanne \(BOS\)](#); [Dorsey, Matt \(BOS\)](#); [Mahmood, Bilal \(BOS\)](#); [Sauter, Danny \(BOS\)](#); [Waltonstaff \(BOS\)](#); [WongStaff \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** SF Heritage SUPPORT of Appeal (File No. No. 251202)  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 30, 2025 10:51:28 AM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)  
[SFH SUPPORT - File 251202.pdf](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

**RE: File No. 251202** (Appeal of CEQA Exemption for Embarcadero Fountain Removal)—scheduled for the BOS agenda of **January 13, 2026**.

Supervisors,

San Francisco Heritage, a 54-year-old California nonprofit with a mission to preserve and enhance San Francisco's architectural and cultural heritage, strongly supports Docomomo/NOCA's appeal of the Planning Department's October 31, 2025 CEQA exemption on the Embarcadero Fountain by artist Armand Vaillancourt.

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) prohibits pre-commitment to a project in making determinations. While fundraising for a new park, the Recreation and Parks Department aggressively pushed for the removal of the Embarcadero Fountain a year ahead of any condition assessments, inspection, or public process.

General Manager Phil Ginsburg said in a public forum that the fountain would be removed even while community outreach meetings were still being scheduled. The assessment by consultants Page & Turnbull did not find an immediate or sudden danger to the public, yet the Recreation and Parks Department quickly declared an emergency and erected fencing to support that pretext ahead of the CEQA exemption.

Alternatives to disassembly and removal of the fountain, a historic work of public art, have not been adequately investigated. It is clear that the California Environmental Quality Act has been improperly employed to avoid a full Environmental Impact Report.

San Francisco Heritage requests this appeal be upheld and a true public process exploring preservation alternatives and community engagement be conducted.

Thank you,

Woody LaBounty  
President & CEO



***Woody LaBounty***  
***President & CEO***  
*he/him/his*

---

**SAN FRANCISCO HERITAGE**  
**On Unceded Ramaytush Ohlone Land**  
**HAAS-LILIENTHAL HOUSE**  
**2007 FRANKLIN STREET**  
**SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**  
**P: 415.441.3000 x 104**

**[www.sfheritage.org](http://www.sfheritage.org)**  
**[wlabbounty@sfheritage.org](mailto:wlabbounty@sfheritage.org)**

---

Join Heritage Now

December 30, 2025

Angela Calvillo  
Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102

RE: File No. 251202 (Appeal of CEQA Exemption for Embarcadero Fountain Removal)

San Francisco Heritage, a 54-year-old California nonprofit with a mission to preserve and enhance San Francisco's architectural and cultural heritage, **strongly supports** Docomomo/NOCA's appeal of the Planning Department's October 31, 2025 CEQA exemption on the Embarcadero Fountain by artist Armand Vaillancourt.

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) prohibits pre-commitment to a project in making determinations. While fundraising for a new park, the Recreation and Parks Department aggressively pushed for the removal of the Embarcadero Fountain a year ahead of any condition assessments, inspection, or public process.

General Manager Phil Ginsburg said in a public forum that the fountain would be removed even while community outreach meetings were still being scheduled. The assessment by consultants Page & Turnbull did not find an immediate or sudden danger to the public, yet the Recreation and Parks Department quickly declared an emergency and erected fencing to support that pretext ahead of the CEQA exemption.

Alternatives to disassembly and removal of the fountain, a historic work of public art, have not been adequately investigated. It is clear that the California Environmental Quality Act has been improperly employed to avoid a full Environmental Impact Report.

San Francisco Heritage **requests this appeal be upheld** and a true public process exploring preservation alternatives and community engagement be conducted.

Sincerely,



Woody LaBounty  
President & CEO

**From:** [Brooks Kolb](#)  
**To:** [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [SauterStaff](#)  
**Cc:** [Lydia Aldredge](#); [darkunz@me.com](mailto:darkunz@me.com); [landuse.docs@gmail.com](mailto:landuse.docs@gmail.com)  
**Subject:** Public Comment: Vaillancourt Fountain - support appeal of CEQA Emergency Exemption  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 30, 2025 5:21:36 PM  
**Attachments:** [AAF Vaillancourt fountain ltr 12-30-25.docx](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear President Mandelman, Supervisor Sauter, and Members of the San Francisco Board of Supervisors

On behalf of the Allied Arts Foundation of Seattle, please accept the attached letter in support of Docomomo NOCA's request to appeal the CEQA Emergency Exemption and save the landmark Vaillancourt Fountain.

Submitted by Brooks Kolb, Vice President and Lydia Aldredge, President  
Allied Arts Foundation

**Brooks Kolb, ASLA**

**Brooks Kolb LLC**

**LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURE**

206 459-5133

[www.brookskolbllc.net](http://www.brookskolbllc.net)



**BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
EXECUTIVE OFFICERS**

**Lydia Aldredge**  
PRESIDENT  
**Brooks Kolb**  
VICE PRESIDENT

**Llewelyn G. Pritchard**  
PRESIDENT EMERITUS

**Lyle Bicknell**  
**Karen Kane**  
**Sabrina Libertty**  
**Tamara Moats**  
**Jeff Rinedahl**

**MEMBERS-AT-LARGE**  
**Kenan Block**  
**John Bowen, Jr.**  
**Deborah Callahan**  
**Patricia V. Clark**  
**Mary Coney**  
**Glenda Downs**  
**Leonard Garfield**  
**Effie Gleason**  
**Abigail Hagan**  
**Gerald Hansmire**  
**Sally Hayman**  
**Virginia Hungate-Hawke**  
**Cheryl Lee**  
**Margaret Pageler**  
**Cherie Seymore**  
**Michele Soderstrom**  
**Peter Steinbrueck**  
**Judy Talley**  
**Boyka Thayer**  
**Jessica Thonn**  
**Janet True**  
**Virginia Wyman**

**Allied Arts Foundation**  
999 N Northlake Way  
Suite 207  
Seattle, WA 98103  
[alliedartsfoundation.org](http://alliedartsfoundation.org)

Supporting the arts  
for over  
**50**  
years!

December 30, 2025

Supervisor Rafael Mandelman, President  
Supervisor Danny Sauter  
San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Subject: Vaillancourt Fountain

Dear President Mandelman, Supervisor Sauter, and members of the San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Seattle Allied Arts Foundation has advocated for historic preservation since the late 1960s. Our signature achievement was saving Seattle's Pike Place Market from the wrecking ball via a 1971 citizens' initiative. Currently, we are campaigning to restore and preserve the iconic pools and courtyard at Seattle's Pacific Science Center, designed by the pioneering Japanese American architect, Minoru Yamasaki. [Home | Friends of Yamasaki](#)

Recently, we have been following with great concern San Francisco's imminent plans to demolish the Vaillancourt Fountain and place it in storage. That would be a travesty, considering the fountain is as significant a cultural monument in San Francisco as the Pacific Science Center pools are in Seattle. Anchoring Lawrence Halprin's Embarcadero Plaza in proximity with John Portman's Hyatt Regency Hotel, the Vaillancourt Fountain is a prime 1970s San Francisco landmark. Landscape historian Alison Hirsch called the fountain the "true anchoring event" of Market Street.

The argument that Vaillancourt Fountain would be too expensive to preserve is not valid. The City of Minneapolis made a similar argument that Peavey Plaza (1974), designed by landscape architect M. Paul Friedberg, could not be saved, but after a public campaign, the rehabilitation of its fountains and pools has been an outstanding success. Today, Peavey Plaza is once again a leading public landmark and even a symbol of Minneapolis.

We believe strongly that the Vaillancourt Fountain can and should be restored, and that its rehabilitation will be one of San Francisco's big urban design success stories, regardless of the final price tag. **We urge you to support the Appeal of CEQA Emergency Exemption filed on December 1 by Docomomo/Northern California Chapter (Docomomo NOCA) to save this landmark fountain!**

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Lydia'.

Lydia Aldredge, President  
Seattle Allied Arts Foundation

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Brooks R Kolb'.

Brooks Kolb, ASLA, Vice President  
Seattle Allied Arts Foundation

cc:

Mayor Daniel Lurie  
Allied Arts of Seattle  
Historic Seattle  
The Cultural Landscape Foundation



**From:** [Nord Wennerstrom](#)  
**To:** [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Board of Supervisors File No. 251202; Vaillancourt Fountain  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 30, 2025 12:15:02 PM  
**Attachments:** [img-0d9a1778-4113-4d36-b965-99900546d95f](#)  
[2025-12-30 SF BOARD OF SUPERVISORS-VAILLANCOURT-EMBARCADERO.pdf](#)

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisor Mandelman,

Per the forthcoming January 13, 2026, meeting to consider review of the CEQA exemption for the Vaillancourt Fountain ([Board of Supervisors File No. 251202](#)), Charles A. Birnbaum, President & CEO of The Cultural Landscape Foundation, a Washington, D.C.-based education and advocacy non-profit, has asked me to submit the following letter (below and attached), urging the Board of Supervisors to overturn the exemption.

December 30, 2025

Supervisor Rafael Mandelman, President  
San Francisco Board of Supervisors  
1 Dr Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
City Hall, Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Dear Supervisor Mandelman,

On behalf of The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), a Washington, D.C.-based education and advocacy non-profit, I write to urge you and the Board of Supervisors to overturn the exemption of the Vaillancourt Fountain from reviews pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). TCLF has been advocating on behalf of the Lawrence Halprin-designed Embarcadero Plaza, which includes the Vaillancourt Fountain, for more than a decade, and the foundation has many decades of involvement with Halprin's legacy. TCLF is also known for its many years of effective advocacy on behalf of nationally significant site-specific installations, such as the Vaillancourt Fountain, throughout the country.

On November 3, 2025, the San Francisco Arts Commission (SFAC), which owns the iconic Vaillancourt Fountain, [voted eight to five to disassemble the artwork and put it into storage](#). The Docomomo US/Northern California Northern chapter (Docomomo NOCA) [filed an appeal](#) on December 1 challenging the pre-text for the vote.

The city, at the behest of the real estate develop BXP, which is the largest commercial landlord in the city and owns Embarcadero Center next to the plaza, wants to redevelop the plaza and neighboring Sue Bierman Park; the Recreation and Park Department (RPD) is the lead agency in the redevelopment effort. City and BXP officials claim the fountain, which is dry and has been ill-

maintained for years, is too costly to rehabilitate and now presents a public health hazard. In order for the artwork to be demolished, the SFAC must first deaccession it. Doing so, however, would be embarrassing because the SFAC's own ill-management of the work led to its current diminished state (had they maintained the work, as they're required to do, they would not have been faced with having to remove it from the collection). Instead, the vote to disassemble and put the fountain into storage was a face saving move.

The SFAC faced one significant roadblock; the fountain had recently been determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and that meant changes to it would trigger reviews pursuant to CEQA. RPD obtained a [letter from the city's Planning department exempting the fountain from CEQA](#) thus allowing the work to be disassembled "to eliminate an immediate public threat." **Remarkably, the "immediate" hazard claim and CEQA exemption rely on two "reports"—a [letter from the Department of Building Inspection](#) and a [DCI Engineers fifteen-page report](#) dated May 19, 2025—neither of which say anything about an "immediate" hazard.**

While RPD spokesperson Tamara Aparton told the *San Francisco Chronicle* putting the fountain into storage "is a temporary measure that does not have anything to do with [its] ultimate fate," the reality is that there's been a bull's-eye on the plaza and fountain for years. [RPD's General Manager Phil Ginsburg said during an October 17, 2024, Recreation and Park Commission meeting](#) that he started having conversations with developer BXP about redeveloping the plaza "eight to ten years ago."

In fact, [according to the appeal](#), the city's "multi-year administrative process [to remove the fountain] illustrates a textbook violation of CEQA's prohibition of project pre-commitment. With **no** public review of potential significant environmental impacts such as likely destruction of a historic resource, or identification of feasible mitigations and alternatives—**e.g.**, better fencing and patrolling of the fountain site—the Department proposed to remove the Fountain to facilitate a park redesign long before declaring any 'emergency.' The proposed emergency exemption occurred in tandem with pre-approval."

The appeal goes on to say that CEQA allows for reliance on "a statutory exemption for emergency—thus eliminating environmental review—only for a narrowly construed 'sudden, unexpected occurrence.'" It continues: "There has been no such occurrence here. The worn condition of the historic fountain is the logical outcome of the Department's calculated, long-term deferred maintenance. The exemption is a pretextual device to unlawfully bypass the mandatory" environmental reviews.

The CEQA exemption approved by the SFAC because of an "immediate" hazard is based on two reports, neither of which says anything about an "immediate" hazard. Moreover, the hazard being addressed is not sudden and unexpected; rather, it's the result of years of ill-maintenance. An RPD memo claimed the fountain has "historically required extensive, near-daily maintenance" and that has "averaged approximately \$100,000 per year, inclusive of documented labor costs, travel and equipment time, material handling, and additional support activities which reflect tens of thousands of cumulative labor hours." RPD spokespeople were quoted for months in the media making the claim as well as in writing to the SFAC.

TCLF FOIA'ed RPD for documents to support their claims. The [response RPD sent to TCLF](#) showed that:

- 1. RPD had inflated the average annual maintenance budget by 250%**
- 2. The “tens of thousands of cumulative labor hours” is actually 1,578.**

Even if these numbers are “to be taken with a grain of salt,” as RPD’s Director of Operations Eric Andersen cautioned in a [memo accompanying](#) the estimates, **they vastly exceed a rounding error.**

The pretext for the CEQA exemption does not exist and, therefore, we urge the Board of Supervisors overturn the SFAC’s decision and nullify the exemption.

Sincerely,



Charles A. Birnbaum, FASLA, FAAR  
President & CEO

### **Nord Wennerstrom**

Director of Communications  
The Cultural Landscape Foundation  
1711 Connecticut Avenue NW, Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20009  
(t) 202.483.0553 (m) 202.255.7076 (f) 202.483.0761  
[www.tclf.org](http://www.tclf.org)

[FACEBOOK](#) | [TWITTER](#) | [LINKEDIN](#) | [INSTAGRAM](#) | [PINTEREST](#)

**Read about Mario Schjetnan and Grupo de Diseño Urbano, winner of the [2025 Cornelia Hahn Oberlander International Landscape Architecture Prize](#)**



December 30, 2025

Supervisor Rafael Mandelman, President  
San Francisco Board of Supervisors  
1 Dr Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
City Hall, Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Dear Supervisor Mandelman,

On behalf of The Cultural Landscape Foundation (TCLF), a Washington, D.C.-based education and advocacy non-profit, I write to urge you and the Board of Supervisors to overturn the exemption of the Vaillancourt Fountain from reviews pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). TCLF has been advocating on behalf of the Lawrence Halprin-designed Embarcadero Plaza, which includes the Vaillancourt Fountain, for more than a decade, and the foundation has many decades of involvement with Halprin's legacy. TCLF is also known for its many years of effective advocacy on behalf of nationally significant site-specific installations, such as the Vaillancourt Fountain, throughout the country.

On November 3, 2025, the San Francisco Arts Commission (SFAC), which owns the iconic Vaillancourt Fountain, [voted eight to five to disassemble the artwork and put it into storage](#). The Docomomo US/Northern California Northern chapter (Docomomo NOCA) [filed an appeal](#) on December 1 challenging the pre-text for the vote.

The city, at the behest of the real estate developer BXP, which is the largest commercial landlord in the city and owns Embarcadero Center next to the plaza, wants to redevelop the plaza and neighboring Sue Bierman Park; the Recreation and Park Department (RPD) is the lead agency in the redevelopment effort. City and BXP officials claim the fountain, which is dry and has been ill-maintained for years, is too costly to rehabilitate and now presents a public health hazard. In order for the artwork to be demolished, the SFAC must first deaccession it. Doing so, however, would be embarrassing because the SFAC's own ill-management of the work led to its current diminished state (had they maintained the work, as they're required to do, they would not have been faced with having to remove it from the collection). Instead, the vote to disassemble and put the fountain into storage was a face saving move.

The SFAC faced one significant roadblock; the fountain had recently been determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and that meant changes to it would trigger reviews pursuant to CEQA. RPD obtained a [letter from the city's Planning department exempting the fountain from CEQA](#) thus allowing the work to be disassembled "to eliminate an immediate public threat."

**Remarkably, the "immediate" hazard claim and CEQA exemption rely on two "reports" — a [letter from the Department of Building Inspection](#) and a [DCI Engineers fifteen-page report](#) dated May 19, 2025 — neither of which say anything about an "immediate" hazard.**

While RPD spokesperson Tamara Aparton told the *San Francisco Chronicle* putting the fountain into storage "is a temporary measure that does not have anything to do with [its] ultimate fate," the reality is that there's been a bull's-eye on the plaza and fountain for years. [RPD's General Manager Phil Ginsburg said during an October 17, 2024, Recreation and Park Commission meeting](#) that he started having conversations with developer BXP about redeveloping the plaza "eight to ten years ago."

In fact, [according to the appeal](#), the city's "multi-year administrative process [to remove the fountain] illustrates a textbook violation of CEQA's prohibition of project pre-commitment. With *no* public review of potential significant environmental impacts such as likely destruction of a historic resource, or identification of feasible mitigations and alternatives—*e.g.*, better fencing and patrolling of the fountain site—the Department proposed to remove the Fountain to facilitate a park redesign long before declaring any 'emergency.' The proposed emergency exemption occurred in tandem with pre-approval."

The appeal goes on to say that CEQA allows for reliance on "a statutory exemption for emergency—thus eliminating environmental review—only for a narrowly construed 'sudden, unexpected occurrence.'" It continues: "There has been no such occurrence here. The worn condition of the historic fountain is the logical outcome of the Department's calculated, long-term deferred maintenance. The exemption is a pretextual device to unlawfully bypass the mandatory" environmental reviews.

The CEQA exemption approved by the SFAC because of an "immediate" hazard is based on two reports, neither of which says anything about an "immediate" hazard. Moreover, the hazard being addressed is not sudden and unexpected; rather, it's the result of years of ill-maintenance. An RPD memo claimed the fountain has "historically required extensive, near-daily maintenance" and that has "averaged approximately \$100,000 per year, inclusive of documented labor costs, travel and equipment time, material handling, and additional support activities which reflect tens of thousands of cumulative labor hours." RPD spokespeople were quoted for months in the media making the claim as well as in writing to the SFAC.

TCLF FOIA'ed RPD for documents to support their claims. The [response RPD sent to TCLF](#) showed that:

- 1. RPD had inflated the average annual maintenance budget by 250%**
- 2. The "tens of thousands of cumulative labor hours" is actually 1,578.**

Even if these numbers are "to be taken with a grain of salt," as RPD's Director of Operations Eric Andersen cautioned in a [memo accompanying](#) the estimates, **they vastly exceed a rounding error.**

The pretext for the CEQA exemption does not exist and, therefore, we urge the Board of Supervisors overturn the SFAC's decision and nullify the exemption.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, consisting of a large, stylized 'C' followed by a series of loops and a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Charles A. Birnbaum, FASLA, FAAR  
President & CEO

**From:** [Gaelan](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Saturday, December 20, 2025 3:49:11 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/>. There are amazing opportunities to be had if you include the public!
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance

- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Gaelan Haleigh McKeown Hickel Spor

## To San Francisco supervisors

I urge you to restore the beautiful historic constructionist art of the Villancourt Fountain in 'Embarcadero Plaza where one can view and experience it at ground level and view from the top down from the hotel. I think the water front group opposition may fear the competition.

Pat ODonnell

*Patricia O'Donnell*

RECEIVED  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
SAN FRANCISCO  
JUN 26 PM 02:29

**From:** [David Mischel](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Improve, not destroy, the Embarcadero Park  
**Date:** Sunday, December 21, 2025 12:36:37 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I have lived in the City since 1970 and was there when the Vaillancourt Fountain was dedicated. At that time it looked like a criticism and rejection of the Embarcadero freeway. That insight remains true is one we should not destroy but honor.

For too long we have allowed buildings to define our public spaces but that is not what makes a community vibrant and self healing. The fountain still mocks the convention of concrete, just as it did when that awful freeway stood and as it does today.

San Francisco should be celebrating and restoring this sculpture as part of renewing this important public space and as yet another irreverent reminder that built things all fall down. The counterpoint with trees, paths and water becomes much more effective and meaningful.  
< david

Sent from my fone which, if it were really smart, should spill butter

**From:** [Gaelan](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Saturday, December 20, 2025 3:49:21 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces. An example alternative from an established architecture firm can be found at <https://jrdv.com/embarcadero-reimagined/>. There are amazing opportunities to be had if you include the public!
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance

- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Gaelan Haleigh McKeown Hickel Spor

**From:** [Augie Phillips](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Wednesday, December 10, 2025 6:18:35 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Augie Phillips  
340 Steiner St, San Francisco, CA 94117

**From:** [Dianne Platner](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 9, 2025 6:31:13 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\*:** Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version

- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

**From:** [Lance L](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 9, 2025 5:54:10 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\*:** Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version

- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

—Lance La'shagway

Longtime Citizen of San Francisco and Voter

**From:** [Joe Maly](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** In support of the Vaillancourt Fountain  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 9, 2025 4:15:48 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Board,

I believe the Vaillancourt Fountain is a beautiful and historic part of the Financial District. It would be a shame to remove it and rob future generations of enjoying it as I have. We need to preserve those parts of our history that are important and the Fountain is in that category.

Best Regards,  
Joe Maly

Sent from my iPhone

**From:** [Fred Bamber](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Monday, December 8, 2025 2:56:26 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\*:**

Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment

- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Fred Bamber

617-549-7979

**From:** [Anthony Barreiro](#)  
**To:** [Fielder, Jackie \(BOS\)](#); [FielderStaff](#)  
**Cc:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Save Vaillancourt Fountain!  
**Date:** Sunday, December 7, 2025 5:41:24 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisor Fielder and other Supervisors -- I understand that the Art Commission's decision to allow Rec and Park to demolish Vaillancourt Fountain has been appealed to the Board of Supervisors. Vaillancourt Fountain is an invaluable and irreplaceable part of San Francisco's artistic and cultural history. Please preserve the fountain and restore it to working order.

Thank you for your consideration, and thank you for your service to the people of San Francisco.

Anthony Barreiro  
973 South Van Ness Avenue, Apartment B  
San Francisco, CA 94110

=====  
Anthony Barreiro (he, him) [anthonybarreiro@yahoo.com](mailto:anthonybarreiro@yahoo.com)  
San Francisco, California, Turtle Island  
Ramaytush Ohlone Land  
=====

May all beings be happy, peaceful, and free.  
=====

**From:** [Charles Eilhardt](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Sunday, December 7, 2025 2:56:04 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\*:** Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version

- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Charles Eilhardt  
Mobile: 510-697-8413  
Sent from my iPad

**From:** [Makoto Valdez](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Sunday, December 7, 2025 1:27:37 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\*:** Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version

- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.

Sent from my iPhone

**From:** [Tom Walker](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Removal of Vaillancourt Fountain  
**Date:** Sunday, December 7, 2025 11:33:27 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

The rushed decision by the landmarks Commission to remove the fountain as a so-called emergency is nonsense. This is in fact a historic resource of aesthetic value and historic value. It not only commemorates it's original purpose to ameliorate the effects of the freeway that later was removed after an earthquake but also evokes the destruction of the 1906 earthquake.



**From:** [Margots999@sonic.net](mailto:Margots999@sonic.net)  
**To:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org); [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Save Embarcadero Plaza  
**Date:** Sunday, December 7, 2025 11:22:55 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016.

It was prescient, predicting the 1989 earthquake and is an appropriate memorial, showing the resulting turmoil, now a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

Thank you.

Margot Smith, San Francisco Native  
1300 A Shattuck Ave  
Berkeley 94709  
[Margots999@sonic.net](mailto:Margots999@sonic.net)

Margot Smith  
510-486-8010  
510-660-5508 (Text)  
[Margots999@sonic.net](mailto:Margots999@sonic.net)

**From:** [Alicia Marie Smith](#)  
**To:** [Collins, Charles \(ART\)](#); [ART-Info](#); [Madland, Sarah \(REC\)](#); [Commission, Recpark \(REC\)](#); [Goodwin, Eoanna \(REC\)](#); [Summers, Ashley \(REC\)](#); [SauterStaff](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [info@docomomo-noca.org](mailto:info@docomomo-noca.org)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for SFBOS, SFRPD, SFAC meetings + Immediate Disclosure Request  
**Date:** Sunday, December 7, 2025 9:32:02 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To SF Board of Supervisors, SF Arts Commission, SF Recreation & Parks,

The San Francisco Recreation and Park Department's plan for this project feels like a step backward, reminiscent of the urban renewal era.

Embarcadero Plaza, designed by Lawrence Halprin, is a historic site that has been part of the Market Street Cultural Landscape District since 2016. It's a vital public space, symbolizing our city's history and serving as a crucial site for civic engagement and free expression for decades, including this year.

The Vaillancourt Fountain is an internationally recognized landmark, representing our diverse history, our connection with Canada and Quebec, and the location of countless community and activist gatherings. San Francisco Planning recognized it as a historic resource on October 29, 2025.

I oppose this plan for blank-slate urban redevelopment and the use of an artificial emergency to bypass public review. Instead, I urge you to:

- Be responsible with public money by right-sizing this project and finding a better approach for the \$15–30+ million in public and private funds during this time of economic uncertainty.
- Explore real design alternatives that go beyond the 2024 proposal from private interests. This must include serious consideration of adaptive reuse and drawing inspiration from acclaimed international public spaces.
- Actively engage with relevant experts, including architects, artists, and recognized art and preservation organizations.
- Require full transparency from project sponsors, especially when requesting a behested payments waiver. They must publicly communicate the entire scope, including Embarcadero Plaza South, Sue Bierman Park West, Phase 2, and all planned features like bocce courts, padel courts, a beer garden, and the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Monument.

Please include this as a public comment—either as general public comment or associated with a specific agenda item—for these meetings:

- SF Board of Supervisors - Vaillancourt Fountain Appeal Hearing - January 13, 2026 (File #251202)
- SF Board of Supervisors - Embarcadero Plaza Behested Payments Waiver - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Civic Design Review Committee meeting - next instance
- SF Arts Commission - Full Commission meeting - next instance
- SF Recreation and Park Commission meeting - next instance

**\*\*Recreation & Parks\*\***: Please complete an **\*\*Immediate Disclosure Request\*\*** by supplying to me via email the following simple and routine public records by the close of the next business day:

- 2025 Embarcadero Plaza HRR
- 2025 Sue Bierman Park HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain HRR
- 2025 Vaillancourt Fountain Conditions Assessment
- 2024-05-10 BxP Presentation BXP version
- MAP Embarcadero Plaza Maintenance Responsibilities
- Justin Herman Embarcadero Plaza - Maintenance Agreement Docs, 1998-2000 (not in order)
- Embarcadero Donor Presentation
- Prospect List for Mayor and DDC
- 20250729 PDT Meeting slides.pdf
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Project Delivery meeting notes
- The most recent Embarcadero Plaza Fundraising Committee meeting notes

Thank you.