AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE - 10/8/03

FILE NO. 030869

ORDINANCE NO.

| 1 | [Tobacco Sales Permit.] |
|----|--|
| 2 | |
| 3 | Ordinance amending the San Francisco Health Code by adding Article 19H to require a |
| 4 | permit for tobacco sales and amending the San Francisco Business and Tax |
| 5 | Regulations Code by adding section 249.16 to set the fee for the tobacco sales permit. |
| 6 | Note: Additions are <u>single-underline italics Times New Roman</u> ; |
| 7 | deletions are strikethrough italies Times New Roman. Board amendment additions are double underlined. |
| 8 | Board amendment deletions are strikethrough normal. |
| 9 | Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco: |
| 10 | Section 1. The San Francisco Health Code is hereby amended by adding Article 19H, |
| 11 | to read as follows: |
| 12 | |
| 13 | ARTICLE 19H. PERMITS FOR THE SALE OF TOBACCO. |
| 14 | SEC. 1009.50. FINDINGS. The Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San |
| 15 | Francisco hereby finds and declares as follows: |
| 16 | A. State law prohibits the sale or furnishing of cigarettes, tobacco products and smoking |
| 17 | paraphernalia to minors, as well as the purchase, receipt, or possession of tobacco products by minors |
| 18 | (California Penal Code section 308.) State law also prohibits public school students from smoking or |
| 19 | using tobacco products while on campus, attending school-sponsored activities, or under the |
| 20 | supervision or control of school district employees. (California Education Code section 48901(a).) In |
| 21 | addition, state law prohibits smoking in enclosed places of employment (California Labor Code section |
| 22 | 6404.5). Moreover, San Francisco has adopted ordinances that ban cigarette vending machines in the |
| 23 | City (San Francisco Health Code section 1009.1), prohibit the self-service merchandising of tobacco |
| 24 | products, except in places to which access by minors is prohibited by law (San Francisco Police Code |
| 25 | |

| 1 | section 4600.3), and prohibit smoking in enclosed areas and sports stadiums (San Francisco Health |
|----|--|
| 2 | <u>Code section 1009.22).</u> |
| 3 | B. Despite these state and local restrictions, minors continue to obtain cigarettes and other |
| 4 | tobacco products at alarming rates. Children under the age of 18 consume 924 million packs of |
| 5 | cigarettes annually in the United States. Over 29 million packs of cigarettes are sold to California |
| 6 | children annually. More than 60 percent of all smokers begin smoking by the age of 14, and 90 percent |
| 7 | begin by age 19. |
| 8 | C. In a 2002 California youth buying survey, 19.3 percent of retailers surveyed unlawfully sold |
| 9 | tobacco products to minors compared to 17.1 percent in 2001. |
| 10 | D. California's rate of illegal tobacco sales to minors is steadily increasing. In 2002 the rate |
| 11 | was 19.3 percent, up from 17.1 percent in 2001, and 12.8 percent in 2000. |
| 12 | E. The California Department of Health Services reports that 26.7 percent of California |
| 13 | adolescents believe it is easy to buy a pack of cigarettes. |
| 14 | F. Despite active enforcement by the San Francisco Police Department, a significant number of |
| 15 | retailers continue to sell tobacco illegally to minors. The rate of illegal tobacco sales documented by |
| 16 | the Police Department during 2001 was 25.3 percent and 20.2 percent in 2002. |
| 17 | G. In a youth decoy operation conducted by the Police Department, 50 percent of the 12 bars |
| 18 | visited illegally sold tobacco to a minor. |
| 19 | H. San Francisco has a substantial interest in promoting compliance with State laws |
| 20 | prohibiting sales of cigarettes and tobacco products to minors, in promoting compliance with laws |
| 21 | intended to discourage the purchase of tobacco products by minors, and in protecting our children |
| 22 | from illegally obtained tobacco. |
| 23 | I. Requiring tobacco vendors to obtain a tobacco sales permit will not unduly burden legitimate |
| 24 | business activities of retailers who sell or distribute cigarettes or other tobacco products to adults. It |
| 25 | |

| 1 | will, however, allow the City to regulate those establishments selling tobacco products to ensure that |
|----|--|
| 2 | they comply with federal, state, and local tobacco laws. |
| 3 | J. This Article is designed to promote the public interest in ensuring that San Francisco |
| 4 | businesses operate in compliance with applicable laws regulating tobacco, including laws prohibiting |
| 5 | the sale of tobacco to minors and laws regulating smoking. |
| 6 | SEC. 1009.51. DEFINITIONS. The following words and phrases, whenever used in this |
| 7 | Article, shall be construed as defined in this section. Words in the singular include the plural and |
| 8 | words in the plural include the singular. Words in the present tense include the future. |
| 9 | (a) "Department" means the Department of Public Health. |
| 10 | (b) "Director" means the Director of Health or his or her designee. |
| 11 | (c) "Establishment" means any store, stand, booth, concession or any other enterprise that |
| 12 | engages in the retail sale of tobacco products. |
| 13 | (d) "Permittee" means a person who has obtained a tobacco sales permit for a specific |
| 14 | location pursuant to this Article. |
| 15 | (e) "Person" means any individual, partnership, cooperative association, private corporation, |
| 16 | personal representative, receiver, trustee, assignee, or any other legal entity. |
| 17 | (f) "Tobacco products" means tobacco and any substance containing tobacco leaf, including |
| 18 | but not limited to cigarettes, cigars, pipe tobacco, snuff, chewing tobacco, dipping tobacco, or any |
| 19 | other preparation of tobacco, including the cigarettes commonly known as bidis. |
| 20 | (g) "Tobacco sales" means sales, or any offer to sell or exchange, for any form of |
| 21 | consideration, tobacco products to any person by any person who operates an establishment. |
| 22 | "Tobacco sales" includes any display of tobacco products. |
| 23 | SEC. 1009.52. REQUIREMENT FOR TOBACCO SALES PERMIT. It shall be unlawful for |
| 24 | any person to engage in tobacco sales, or to allow tobacco sales, in any establishment without first |
| 25 | obtaining and maintaining a valid tobacco sales permit from the Department for each location where |

| 1 | tobacco sales are conducted. Nothing in this Article shall be construed to grant any person obtaining |
|----|---|
| 2 | and maintaining a tobacco sales permit any status or right other than the right to act as a tobacco |
| 3 | retailer at the location identified on the face of the permit. The obtaining of a permit does not in and of |
| 4 | itself transform a business into a retail tobacco or wholesale shop within the meaning of California |
| 5 | Labor Code section 6404.5. It shall be unlawful for any person to engage in tobacco sales, or to allow |
| 6 | tobacco sales, at an establishment for which the Director has suspended the tobacco sales while the |
| 7 | period of suspension remains in effect. It shall be unlawful for any person to engage in or allow |
| 8 | tobacco sales at an establishment for which the Director has revoked the tobacco sales permit for three |
| 9 | years from the date of revocation. Permits are valid as long as the annual license fees are paid. |
| 10 | SEC. 1009.53. APPLICATION PROCEDURE; INSPECTION OF PREMISES; ISSUANCE |
| 11 | AND DISPLAY OF PERMIT. (a) Application. An application for a tobacco sales permit shall be |
| 12 | submitted in the name of the person(s) proposing to engage in the sale of tobacco products and shall be |
| 13 | signed by each person or an authorized agent thereof. The application shall be accompanied by the |
| 14 | appropriate fees as described in section 35 of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code. |
| 15 | A separate application is required for each location where tobacco sales are to be conducted. All |
| 16 | applications shall be submitted on a form supplied by the Department and shall contain the following |
| 17 | information: |
| 18 | 1. The name, address, and telephone number of the applicant; |
| 19 | 2. The establishment name, address, and telephone number for each location for which |
| 20 | a tobacco sales permit is sought; |
| 21 | 3. Such other information as the Director deems appropriate, including the applicant's |
| 22 | type of business, and whether the applicant has previously been issued a permit under this Article that |
| 23 | is, or was at any time, suspended or revoked. |
| 24 | (b) Inspection by Director. Upon receipt of a completed application and fees, the Director may |
| 25 | inspect the location at which tobacco sales are to be permitted. The Director may also ask the |
| | |

| 1 | applicant to provide additional information that is reasonably related to the determination whether a |
|----|--|
| 2 | permit may issue. |
| 3 | (c) Issuance of Permit. If the Director is satisfied that the applicant has met the requirements |
| 4 | of this Article and that issuance of the permit will not violate any law, the Department shall issue the |
| 5 | permit. No permit shall issue if the Director finds that the applicant is in violation of San Francisco |
| 6 | Health Code section 1009.1 (regulating cigarette vending machines) or San Francisco Police Code |
| 7 | section 4600.3 (regulating the self-service merchandising of tobacco products). No permit shall issue if |
| 8 | the application is incomplete or inaccurate. |
| 9 | (d) Display of Permit. Each permittee shall display the permit prominently at each location |
| 10 | where tobacco sales occur. No permit that has been suspended shall be displayed during the period of |
| 11 | suspension. A permit that has been revoked is void and may not be displayed. |
| 12 | SEC. 1009.54. FEES FOR PERMIT. The Department shall charge every applicant for a |
| 13 | tobacco sales permit a non-refundable application fee for the initial inspection and processing of the |
| 14 | application and an annual license fee sufficient to cover the costs of annual inspections, as determined |
| 15 | by the Director. The application and processing fee shall be \$50 and is otherwise governed by is |
| 16 | described in section 35 of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code. The annual fee is |
| 17 | listed in section 249.16 of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code. |
| 18 | SEC. 1009.55. PERMIT MAY NOT BE TRANSFERRED TO NEW PERSONS OR |
| 19 | LOCATIONS. As described in section 77 of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code, |
| 20 | tobacco permits may not be transferred or assigned. |
| 21 | SEC. 1009.56. ENFORCEMENT AND INSPECTION. The Director may enforce all |
| 22 | provisions of this Article. Specific grounds for enforcement are set forth in sections 1009.57 through |
| 23 | 1009.65. Upon presentation of proper credentials, the Director may enter and inspect at any time |
| 24 | during regular business hours any establishment that is engaging in tobacco sales, or is suspected by |
| 25 | the Director of engaging in such sales. |

| 1 | SEC. 1009.57. CONDUCT VIOLATING SAN FRANCISCO HEALTH CODE SECTION |
|----|--|
| 2 | 1009.1 (REGULATING CIGARETTE VENDING MACHINES). (a) Upon a decision by the |
| 3 | Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or employee has engaged in any conduct that |
| 4 | violates San Francisco Health Code section 1009.1 (regulating cigarette vending machines), the |
| 5 | Director may suspend a tobacco sales permit as set forth in section 1009.66, impose administrative |
| 6 | penalties as set forth in section 1009.67, or both suspend the permit and impose administrative |
| 7 | penalties. |
| 8 | (b) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving either a notice of |
| 9 | correction under section 1009.68 of this Article or a notice of initial determination under section |
| 10 | 1009.69 of this Article. |
| 11 | SEC.1009.58. CONDUCT VIOLATING SAN FRANCISCO POLICE CODE SECTION |
| 12 | 4600.3 (REGULATING THE SELF-SERVICE MERCHANDISING OF TOBACCO PRODUCTS). |
| 13 | (a) Upon a decision by the Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or employee has |
| 14 | engaged in any conduct that violates San Francisco Police Code section 4600.3 (regulating the self- |
| 15 | service merchandising of tobacco products), the Director may suspend a tobacco sales permit as set |
| 16 | forth in section 1009.66, impose administrative penalties as set forth in section 1009.67, or both |
| 17 | suspend the permit and impose administrative penalties. |
| 18 | (b) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving either a notice of |
| 19 | correction under section 1009.68 of this Article or a notice of initial determination under section |
| 20 | 1009.69 of this Article. |
| 21 | SEC. 1009.59. CONDUCT VIOLATING SAN FRANCISCO HEALTH CODE SECTION |
| 22 | 1009.22 (PROHIBITING SMOKING IN ENCLOSED AREAS AND SPORTS STADIUMS). (a) |
| 23 | Upon a decision by the Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or employee has engaged in |
| 24 | any conduct that violates San Francisco Health Code section 1009.22 (prohibiting smoking in enclosed |
| 25 | areas and sports stadiums), the Director may suspend a tobacco sales permit as set forth in section |

| 1 | 1009.66, impose administrative penalties as set forth in section 1009.67, or both suspend the permit |
|----|---|
| 2 | and impose administrative penalties. |
| 3 | (b) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving either a notice of |
| 4 | correction under section 1009.68 of this Article or a notice of initial determination under section |
| 5 | 1009.69 of this Article. |
| 6 | SEC. 1009.61. CONDUCT VIOLATING CALIFORNIA PENAL CODE SECTION 308 |
| 7 | (PROHIBITING THE SALE OF TOBACCO TO MINORS). (a) Upon a decision by the Director |
| 8 | that the permittee or the permittee's agent or employee has engaged in any conduct that violates |
| 9 | California Penal Code section 308 (prohibiting the sale of tobacco to minors), the Director may |
| 10 | suspend a tobacco sales permit as set forth in section 1009.66. |
| 11 | (b) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving a notice of initial |
| 12 | determination in accordance with section 1009.69 of this Article. |
| 13 | SEC. 1009.62. CONDUCT VIOLATING CALIFORNIA LABOR CODE SECTION 6404.5 |
| 14 | (PROHIBITING SMOKING IN ENCLOSED PLACES OF EMPLOYMENT). (a) Upon a decision |
| 15 | by the Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or employee has engaged in any conduct that |
| 16 | violates California Labor Code section 6404.5 (prohibiting smoking in enclosed places of employment), |
| 17 | the Director may suspend a tobacco sales permit as set forth in section 1009.66. |
| 18 | (b) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving a notice of initial |
| 19 | determination in accordance with section 1009.69 of this Article. |
| 20 | SEC. 1009.63. FRAUDULENT PERMIT APPLICATIONS. (a) Upon a decision by the |
| 21 | Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or employee has obtained a tobacco sales permit |
| 22 | from the Department by fraudulent or willful misrepresentation, the Director may suspend a tobacco |
| 23 | sales permit as set forth in section 1009.66. |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |

| (b) Upon a final decision by the Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or |
|---|
| employee has obtained a tobacco sales permit from the Department by fraudulent or willful |
| misrepresentation, the Director may impose administrative penalties as set forth in section 1009.67. |
| (c) Upon a final decision by the Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or |
| employee has obtained a tobacco sales permit from the Department by fraudulent or willful |
| misrepresentation, the Director may revoke a tobacco sales permit. |
| (d) Upon a final decision by the Director that the permittee or the permittee's agent or |
| employee has obtained a tobacco sales permit from the Department by fraudulent or willful |
| misrepresentation, the Director may impose administrative penalties in addition to either suspending or |
| revoking the tobacco sales permit. |
| (e) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving a notice of initial |
| determination in accordance with section 1009.69 of this Article. |
| (f) Any person who obtained a permit by fraud or misrepresentation may be prosecuted for |
| either an infraction or a misdemeanor punishable by a fine not to exceed one hundred dollars (\$100) |
| for a first violation, two hundred dollars (\$200) for a second violation within one year, and five |
| hundred dollars (\$500) for a third and for each subsequent violation within one year. |
| SEC. 1009.64. SELLING TOBACCO WITHOUT A PERMIT. (a) Upon a final decision by |
| the Director that any person has engaged in the sale of tobacco at any establishment without a permit, |
| the Director may impose administrative penalties as set forth in section 1009.67. Persons with a |
| permit application pending under section1009.53 may sell tobacco without violating section |
| 1009.64 until and unless their permit application is rejected by the Director. |
| (b) The Director shall commence enforcement of this section by serving a notice of initial |
| determination in accordance with section 1009.69 of this Article. This Notice of Initial Determination |
| may require that all tobacco sales cease and may impose an administrative penalty. |
| |

| 1 | (c) The City Attorney may maintain an action for injunction to restrain any person from selling |
|----|---|
| 2 | tobacco without a valid tobacco sales permit. In any such action, the City Attorney may seek civil |
| 3 | penalties and may seek a judicial determination that a person must pay any administrative penalties. |
| 4 | The person against whom an injunction issues also shall be liable for the costs and attorney's fees |
| 5 | incurred by the City and County of San Francisco in bringing a civil action to enforce the provisions of |
| 6 | this section. |
| 7 | (d) Any person who engages in tobacco sales without the required permit may be prosecuted |
| 8 | for either an infraction or a misdemeanor punishable by a fine not to exceed one hundred dollars |
| 9 | (\$100) for a first violation, two hundred dollars (\$200) for a second violation within one year, and five |
| 10 | hundred dollars (\$500) for a third and for each subsequent violation within one year. |
| 11 | SEC. 1009.65. OTHER ENFORCEMENT. (a) Violations of this Article are hereby declared |
| 12 | to be public nuisances and may be enforced as set forth in section 596 of the San Francisco Health |
| 13 | <u>Code.</u> |
| 14 | (b) Violations of this Article are hereby declared to be unfair business practices and are |
| 15 | presumed to damage each and every resident of the community in which the business operates. |
| 16 | (c) In addition to other remedies provided by this Article or by other law, any violation of this |
| 17 | ordinance may be remedied by a civil action brought by the City Attorney, including, for example, |
| 18 | administrative or judicial abatement proceedings, civil or criminal code enforcement proceedings, and |
| 19 | suits for injunctive relief. The person against whom a successful civil action is brought shall be liable |
| 20 | for the costs and attorney's fees incurred by the City and County of San Francisco. |
| 21 | SEC. 1009.66. TIME PERIOD OF SUSPENSION OF PERMIT. When this Article allows |
| 22 | the Director to suspend a permit, the following sanctions may be imposed: |
| 23 | (a) The Director may suspend the permit for a maximum of 90 days for the first violation. |
| 24 | (b) If a second violation occurs within twelve months of the first violation, the Director may |
| 25 | suspend the permit for a maximum of six months. |

| 1 | (c) Upon the third, and each subsequent violation, if within twelve months of the prior |
|----|---|
| 2 | violation, the Director may suspend the permit for a maximum of one year. |
| 3 | (d) Each suspension is an independent sanction and is served consecutively. |
| 4 | SEC. 1009.67. ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY. When this Article allows the Director to |
| 5 | impose an administrative penalty, the Director may assess an administrative penalty not exceeding one |
| 6 | hundred dollars (\$100) for a first violation; not exceeding two hundred dollars (\$200) for a second |
| 7 | violation; and not exceeding five hundred dollars (\$500) for the third and each subsequent violation. |
| 8 | For purposes of administrative penalties, each day that tobacco sales occur without a permit shall |
| 9 | constitute a separate violation. |
| 10 | SEC. 1009.68. NOTICE OF CORRECTION. When the Director commences an enforcement |
| 11 | action with a notice of correction, the Director shall serve the notice on the permittee or the permittee's |
| 12 | agent. The notice shall state that the Department has determined that a violation may have occurred |
| 13 | and that reasonable grounds exist to support this determination. The notice may require corrective |
| 14 | action immediately or upon a schedule required by the Director. The Director may require the |
| 15 | permittee to post the notice of correction at the location where the Department alleges that violations |
| 16 | have occurred. If the permittee fails to obey a notice of correction, the Director may serve a notice of |
| 17 | initial determination in accordance with section 1009.69 of this Article. |
| 18 | SEC. 1009.69. NOTICE OF INITIAL DETERMINATION. When the Director sends a notice |
| 19 | of initial determination, the Director shall serve the notice on the permittee or the permittee's agent. |
| 20 | The Notice of Initial Determination may require that all tobacco sales cease. The notice shall state the |
| 21 | basis for the Department's initial determination, including the alleged acts or failures to act that |
| 22 | constitute a basis for suspension, revocation, and/or an administrative penalty as provided in this |
| 23 | Article. After affording the permittee an opportunity to provide information contesting the initial |
| 24 | determination, the Director shall issue a decision, including an order imposing an administrative |
| 25 | penalty, if any. Copies of this decision and related order(s) shall be served upon the party served with |

| 1 | the notice of initial determination. If no notice of appeal of the Director's decision is filed within the |
|----|--|
| 2 | appropriate period, the decision shall be deemed final and shall be effective 15 days after it was issued |
| 3 | SEC. 1009.71. PAYMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTIES. Unless a timely notice of |
| 4 | appeal of the Department's final decision is filed, the Department may require payment of any |
| 5 | administrative penalty within 30 days of the Director's decision. The Department shall make a written |
| 6 | demand for payment by personal delivery or certified mailed notice to the person sanctioned. Any |
| 7 | administrative penalty assessed and received in an action brought under this Article shall be paid to |
| 8 | the Treasurer of the City and County of San Francisco. The person against whom an administrative |
| 9 | penalty is imposed also shall be liable for the costs and attorney's fees incurred by the City and County |
| 10 | of San Francisco in bringing any civil action to enforce the provisions of this section, including |
| 11 | obtaining a court order requiring payment of the administrative penalty. |
| 12 | SEC. 1009.72. APPEALS TO BOARD OF APPEALS. (a) Right of Appeal. The final |
| 13 | decision of the Director to deny, suspend, or revoke a permit, or to impose administrative sanctions, as |
| 14 | provided in this Article, may be appealed to the Board of Appeals in the manner prescribed in Article I |
| 15 | of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code. An appeal shall stay the action of the |
| 16 | <u>Director.</u> |
| 17 | (b) Hearing. The procedure and requirements governing an appeal to the Board of Appeals |
| 18 | shall be as specified in Article I of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code. |
| 19 | SEC. 1009.73. OTHER REMEDIES. Nothing in this Article shall affect any other remedies |
| 20 | which are available to the City and County under any law, including (1) San Francisco Health Code |
| 21 | section 1009.1 (regulating cigarette vending machines); (2) San Francisco Police Code section 4600.3 |
| 22 | (regulating the self-service merchandising of tobacco products); (3) San Francisco Health Code |
| 23 | section 1009.22 (prohibiting smoking in enclose areas and sports stadiums); (4) California Penal Code |
| 24 | section 308 (regulating sales of tobacco products to minors), and (5) California Labor Code section |
| 25 | 6404.5 (prohibiting smoking in enclosed places of employment). |

| 1 | SEC. 1009.74. AUTHORITY TO ADOPT RULES AND REGULATIONS. The Director may |
|----|--|
| 2 | issue and amend rules, regulations, standards, guidelines, or conditions to implement and enforce this |
| 3 | <u>Article.</u> |
| 4 | SEC. 1009.75. CITY UNDERTAKING LIMITED TO PROMOTION OF THE GENERAL |
| 5 | WELFARE. In undertaking the enforcement of this ordinance, the City is assuming an undertaking |
| 6 | only to promote the general welfare. It is not assuming, nor is it imposing on its officers and |
| 7 | employees, an obligation for breach of which it is liable in money damages to any person who claims |
| 8 | that such breach proximately caused injury. |
| 9 | SEC. 1009.76. PREEMPTION. In adopting this Article, the Board of Supervisors does not |
| 10 | intend to regulate or affect the rights or authority of the State to do those things that are required, |
| 11 | directed or expressly authorized by federal or state law. Further, in adopting this Article, the Board of |
| 12 | Supervisors does not intend to prohibit that which is prohibited by federal or state law. |
| 13 | SEC. 1009.77. SEVERABILITY. In the event that a court or agency of competent jurisdiction |
| 14 | holds that federal or state law, rule or regulation invalidates any clause, sentence, paragraph or |
| 15 | section of this Article or the application thereof to any person or circumstances, it is the intent of the |
| 16 | Board of Supervisors that the court or agency sever such clause, sentence, paragraph or section so that |
| 17 | the remainder of this Article shall remain in effect. |
| 18 | Section 2. The San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code is hereby amended |
| 19 | by adding section 249.16, to read as follows: |
| 20 | SEC. 249.16. TOBACCO SALES PERMIT FEE. Every person, firm or corporation engaged |
| 21 | in tobacco sales shall pay an annual permit fee of \$300 <u>175</u> to the Tax Collector. |
| 22 | APPROVED AS TO FORM: |
| 23 | DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney |
| 24 | By: |
| 25 | Aleeta M. Van Runkle Deputy City Attorney |