

**From:** [ronald carter](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Stewart Juell \(HRC\)](#); [Gloriajpeace](#); [Ronald Carter](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: ATTENTION ALL COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS REGARDING THE FLAWED AFRICAN AMERICANS REPARATIONS PLAN  
**Date:** Monday, February 13, 2023 1:05:05 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

----- Forwarded Message -----

**From:** ronald carter <rdioncarter@yahoo.com>  
**To:** Stewart Juell (HRC) <juell.stewart@sf.gov.org>; Gloriajpeace <gloriajpeace@yahoo.com>; Ronald Carter <praisebophomelessfound@yahoo.com>; ronald carter <rdioncarter@yahoo.com>; REPARATIONS@SFGOV.ORG <reparations@sfgov.org>  
**Sent:** Monday, February 13, 2023 at 11:15:36 AM PST  
**Subject:** Re: TODAY'S REPARATIONS MEETING

On Sunday, February 12, 2023 at 02:17:39 PM PST, ronald carter <rdioncarter@yahoo.com> wrote:

DEAR MEMBERS OF THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS,.

PASTOR AMOS BROWN TOLD ME THAT THE REPARATIONS COMMITTEE WOULD ABSOLUTELY NOT INCLUDE MY BUSINESS PLATFORMS I HAVE MADE FOR ALL AMERICANS AS JOBS PROGRAMS AND COMMUNITY SERVICES TO BE INCLUDED IN THE REPARATIONS COMMITTEES REQUEST FOR FUNDING .

IT IS TOO BAD THE PLANS WERE DELAYED AND WERE CIRCUMVENTED ONLY BY MY STRUGGLE WITH EVICTION AND HOMELESSNESS OVER A 3 YR PERIOD OF TIME

THE ONLY LAST STEP I WILL TAKE IS TO SUBMIT MY BUSINESS PLANS TO THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO FOR SALE ITSELF OR REQUEST THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND I HEREBY REQUEST THEM TO EXAMINE THEM

HOWEVER I DONT NEED ANYONE TO ACCEPT MY BUSINESS PLANS BUT ME BECAUSE THEY ARE POSSIBLE WITHOUT OTHERS GIVING ME 'acceptance!!!!!!!!!!!!

THE REPARATIONS COMMITTEE I BELIVE MAKES A SERIOUS MISTAKE IN REJECTING MY BUSINESS PLATFORMS AS A PART OF REPARATIONS HOWEVER I WILL MOVE AHEAD WITH OR WITHOUT THEM

BECAUSE THEY CONTAIN JOBS PROGRAMS FOR NOT ONLY AFRICAN AMERICANS BUT ALL NATIONALITIES WHICH SHOULD BE OF INTEREST TO THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.AND GIVE FURTHER SUPPOTIVE REASONS TO RATIFY THE PLATFORMS I HAVE SUBMITTED..

EVEN WITH ALL THE BUSINESS PROTOCOLS GOVERNMENT HAVEIN PLACE AND PUT INTO LAW WHICH HINDER AFRICAN AMERICANS FROM BEING ABLE TO EARN MONEY LEGITIMATELY WHICH I PREVENT MOST AFRICAN AMERICANS BEING MAKING MONEY IN THE FIRST PLACE,

THEREFORE , I WILL CONTINUE ON BECAUSE BLACK FOLKS DO NOT HAVE ENOUGH BUSINESSES IN THE FIRST PLACE TO BE "REJECTING " ANY, ESPECIALLY MINE!!!!!!????????? TO RETIRE

I HAVE BEEN TRYING TO TAKE A SHORT CUT TO OPERATING THESE COMPANIES AND TO GET MY RETIREMENT MONEY BY HANDING THEM OVER TO OTHERS TO OPERATE LIKE THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO AND OTHER LOCAL COMMUNITY AGENCIES IN SAN FRANCISCO

THIS IS SO I COULD GET A BETTER RETIREMENT INCOME BECAUSE I AM 70 YEARS OLD AND I AM TIRED AFTER BUILDING 60 COMPANIES ON FACEBOOK.COM OVER AN 11 YEAR PERIOD OF TIME!!!!

THE REPARATIONS COMMITTEES ARE NOT GAURANTEED TO SUCCEED AND I WISH THEM LUCK AND IF THEY DO I'LL TAKE MY MONEY AND RETIR.

HOWEVER, I DONT KNOW HOW THEY ( REPARATIONS COMMITTEE) EXPECTS TO SUCCEED WITHOUT THE PLATFORMS I HAVE CREATED FOR THE AFRICAN AMERICAN PEOPLE AND ALL OTHER NATIONALITIES THAT ARE INCLUSIVE IN MY BUSINESS PLANS AND THEY WOULD BE BETTER OFF TO HAVE THEM THAN NOT TO HAVE THEM.

I HAVE SENT THE WEBSITES TO JUELL STEWART AND INSTRUCTIONS HOW TO FIND THEM AND YOU WILL FIND OUT WHY WHEN YOU DO.

THE REPARATIONS COMMITTEE IS THROWING ME AWAY

GOOD BYE AND GOOD LUCK

SINCERELY  
RONALD DION CARTER. CEO/CFO  
1825 MISSION ST.#APT 220  
SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA 94103  
(916) 598-4071

PLEASE FIND: :

- 1) AFRICAN ECONOMIC IMPROVEMENT MOVEMENT TO SAVE AN AFRICAN ECONOMY FOR Y(OUR) ESSENTIAL SURVIVAL
- 2) AMERICAN ECONOMIC RECOVERY PROJECT FOUNDATION INTL AFFL.
- 3) THE PRAISE BE FOUND HOMELESS FOUNDATION OF AMERICA

THE FIRST TWO CAN ONLY BE FOUND FROM INSIDE FACEBOOK.COM

IF THE COMMITTEE DOES NOT AGREE TO EXTEND FURTHER DISCUSSION WITH ME AND INCLUDE THESE IN THE REPARATIONS PLAN I WILL BRING THEM TO THE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS.WHICH IS THE PURPOSE OF THIS EMAIL

THE SECOND PURPOSE OF THIS EMAIL IS TO MAKE SURE THESE WEBSITES ARE UNDER CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO PROTECTION SO THAT PIRATES AND HACKERS WILL BE PUNISHED FOR ANY COPYRIGHT AND /OR FRAUD PERTAINING TO THESE WEBPAGES.

P.S..

I BELIEVE THE REPARARATIONS PLAN IS FURTHER FLAWED BY THE OMISSION OF PROTECTION OF RECIPIENTS CASH AWARDS FROM SUBSIDIZED HOUSING RENT INCREASES.BY APT. MANAGERS.

I TRUST THAT JUELL STEWART WILL BRING THESE THINGS TO THE ATTENTION OF TODAY'S REPARATIONS MEETING.

**From:** [Monica D](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [ChanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [StefaniStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [EngardioStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Preston, Dean \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MelgarStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Ronen, Hillary](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparation & SF budget deficit  
**Date:** Thursday, February 9, 2023 3:41:59 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

So how is this “deep financial crisis projected deficit of \$728 million over the next two fiscal years” aligned with that woke racist unconstitutional Black preparation that would cost us non-slave owning taxpayers “roughly \$50 billion?” Can’t do the math, especially Aaron Peskin and Shaman Walton? Oh yes, Math is racist!

<https://www.bizjournals.com/sanfrancisco/news/2023/02/09/san-francisco-downtown-revival.html>

**From:** [Monica D](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [ChanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [StefaniStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [EngardioStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Preston, Dean \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MelgarStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Ronen, Hillary](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparation  
**Date:** Wednesday, February 8, 2023 1:15:39 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Also, I'm going to start identifying as as a black "they" who have lived in SF for 49 years with great great grandparents who were black slaves!

\*\*\*\*\*

We, taxpayers, who were never slave owners in a state where it never held slaves, do NOT want to be paying taxes for Black Reparation. You are asking for a lawsuit!

~Asian taxpayer

**From:** [Andrew Debbane](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** reparation plan  
**Date:** Tuesday, February 7, 2023 1:08:05 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

i andrew debbane resident of san francisco reject the reparation plan .REJECT

**From:** [Julien DeFrance](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Souza, Sarah \(BOS\)](#); [HRC-Reparations](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#); [Info, HRC \(HRC\)](#); [ChanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Chan, Connie \(BOS\)](#); [StefaniStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Stefani, Catherine \(BOS\)](#); [PeskisStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Peskis, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [Joel Engardio](#); [Engardio, Joel \(BOS\)](#); [EngardioStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Preston, Dean \(BOS\)](#); [PrestonStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Dorsey, Matt \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Meigar, Myrna \(BOS\)](#); [MeigarStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Mandelman, Rafael \(BOS\)](#); [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Ronen, Hillary](#); [RonenStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [WaltonStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Absha \(BOS\)](#); [SafaiStaff \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [richie@greenbergnation.com](mailto:richie@greenbergnation.com)  
**Subject:** Re: Reparations Plan - REJECT IT NOW!  
**Date:** Tuesday, February 7, 2023 12:52:40 PM  
**Attachments:** [Image.png](#)

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Supervisors and all,

Today's the big day.

Do not fall into this trap.

**SHOW SOME LEADERSHIP.**  
**SHOW SOME COMMON SENSE**

Enough with the absurdity.

**REJECT ITEM #26.**  
**REJECT THE REPARATIONS PLAN**  
**DISSOLVE THE COMMITTEE.**

- 26. [230078](#) [Hearing - Committee of the Whole - Draft San Francisco Reparations Plan and Dream Keeper Initiative Updates - February 7, 2023, at 3:00 p.m.]**  
Hearing of the Board of Supervisors sitting as a Committee of the Whole on Tuesday, February 7, 2023, at 3:00 p.m., to hold a public hearing on the Draft San Francisco [Reparations Plan](#) and Dream Keeper Initiative updates; and requesting the Human Rights Commission, the African American Reparations Advisory Committee, and the Dream Keeper Initiative to present; scheduled pursuant to Motion No. M23-021 (File No. 230077), approved on January 31, 2023. (Clerk of the Board)
- Question: Shall this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED?**

On Sun, Feb 5, 2023 at 8:39 PM Julien DeFrance <[julien.defrance@gmail.com](mailto:julien.defrance@gmail.com)> wrote:

Dear Mayor, Supervisors, and other SF officials,

It is with immense stupefaction that I got to learn about the Reparations plans that California and San Francisco have in their boxes.

As other commentators noted,

"San Francisco taxpayers could be on the hook to pay out hundreds of billions of dollars in an unconscionably racist, neo-Apartheid move by a 15-member reparations committee. Their Reparations Plan reads like a blueprint to install racial segregation, impossible to fulfill financial payments and prioritizing the Black community before nearly all aspects of city life, all subsidized by San Francisco's non-Black taxpayers. Another surprise is the plan is already admittedly unlawful on both a state and federal level."

Richie Greenberg created a website which summarizes key provisions, and provides a link to download a copy for yourself, along with my commentary. The website is [www.RejectThePlan.com](http://www.RejectThePlan.com). Please visit the new website ASAP.  
<http://www.RejectThePlan.com>

While I do empathize with the black community and acknowledge what happened in this country CENTURIES ago, this is NOT the right approach. NOT the right time. NOT the right message. NOT the right solution.

We already are dealing with enough non-sense when having to listen to indigenous propaganda at the very beginning of every one of your meetings, San Francisco isn't a stolen land whatsoever, so why do you keep on brainwashing us with such absurd and debunked narrative?

As the preliminary public hearing is being held this week,

**I am urging you to showcase some common sense, at the very least once in your political career, and reject this absurd, illegitimate, unconstitutional plan that will only serve the interests of more-debilitating-than ever radical left, and further divide us.**

**SHOW SOME LEADERSHIP.**  
**SHOW SOME COMMON SENSE**

**REJECT THE PLAN.**  
**DISSOLVE THE COMMITTEE.**

Your absurd and unwarranted policies have already harmed and destroyed San Francisco so much during the pandemic, with unnecessary and absurd restrictions, beyond reason, and beyond federal and state guidelines. People have left. Companies have left. To never come back. San Francisco isn't anymore the great city it used to be. And it will take time to rebuild.

Another absurd plan and this city wouldn't at all recover.

WORKING CLASS CITIZENS, TAX PAYERS, SMALL BUSINESSES/SMALL BUSINESS OWNERS, HOMEOWNERS are already HAMMERED with your

policies, taxes, taxes, and again taxes.

So many city mandates increasing our costs of livings, for stupid, questionable programs and pilots you all love to come up with in your wildest dreams, billions of dollars taken away from our savings, from the economy, for everything but improving anyone's quality of life.

**AGAIN, HOW ABOUT SOME COMMON SENSE?  
IS IT TOO MUCH TO ASK, GOING FORWARD?**

For god sake, please hold yourselves to higher standards.

Best regards,

JD.



**From:** [Dee Seligman](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** File#230078 Item #26; File#230109 Item #34  
**Date:** Monday, February 6, 2023 1:02:58 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

For all supervisors:

I live in District 5, but this request is for ALL supervisors:

Please vote AYE to accept or to amend the Draft Reparations Plan of the San Francisco African Americans Advisory Committee.

Why: The long history of discrimination against African Americans here in San Francisco provides historical evidence of redlining; removal of homeowners and renters by so-called "urban renewal", displacing about 20,000 persons as the Fillmore was gentrified; the significant racial wealth gap (far below the AMI for many Black San Franciscans); the high percentage of foster children (65% compared to the state average of 33%) sent out of county to foster parents; and significant disparities in investments in schools and support staff between predominantly White and predominantly Black and Brown schools in San Francisco are all matters that should compel you to vote to ACCEPT or AMEND this plan.

To Accept/or Reject/or Amend: If you judge that amendments of any recommendation are necessary, please vote to AMEND, not to reject, this plan. This Committee has listened to public comment and thought carefully about the the best ways to repair the systemic discrimination against San Francisco's Black community. It is time our BOS makes it possible for our Black community to be increased, not decreased, in size. San Francisco's soul depends on its diversity, including our African American brothers and sisters.

Sincerely,

Dee Seligman, Ph.D.

**From:** [Eric Debbane](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Reparations Plan.  
**Date:** Monday, February 6, 2023 12:34:01 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors,

As a resident of San Francisco for over forty years, I am voicing my strong opposition to any reparations plan.

In my opinion this will cause a vast number of non African American middle class residents to flee the city causing a complete collapse of it's economy which is already struggling.

Strikes me as being very biased and racist. We cannot afford this !

Eric Debbane

**From:** [L Dill](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Say What??? Reconsider Reparation plan!!! SF!  
**Date:** Monday, February 6, 2023 11:29:48 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Happy Monday 2-6-2023....

In the wake of the tragic George Floyd murder, Covid-19 lockdowns and the Defund the Police movement, a special committee was formed at the direction of the San Francisco Board of Supervisors (City Council) to study reparations to Black residents of the city. Initially convening June 2020, the committee created a 60-page analysis and action plan. The resulting document entitled *Draft San Francisco Reparations Plan* was presented to the Board of Supervisors January 2023, resulting in immediate condemnation from across the city, by a multitude of San Franciscans, the subject reaching heated debate by analysts and activists across the nation. It has been largely misunderstood; readers, reporters and national media alike have been led to believe The Plan is about righting a wrong due to slavery prior to 1863, but digging into the 60 pages, we see very clearly it strays far beyond that.

#### FROM THE START, IT'S UNLAWFUL

We have federal and state laws which exist to prevent a government's awarding of resources to groups of people based on race, gender or ethnicity, in terms of employment, contracts and education. But this is precisely what The Plan aims to do. The Plan clearly violates California Prop 209, as well as the 14th Amendment to the US Constitution. In fact, the Plan committee laments this legal dilemma in its opening paragraphs, reiterated throughout its 60-pages, then pivots to a call to action: Let's focus on organizing a repeal of Prop 209 in California. Realistically, the repeal of any state proposition is a very high hurdle (along with the Federal 14th Amendment issue). If instead the reparations committee seeks to ignore the laws, this would guarantee an avalanche of lawsuits from the start, dooming their effort. Yet, though unlawful, authors of the reparations plan submitted it anyway. At this stage, The Plan is dead in the water.

#### IT'S CURIOUSLY INCOMPLETE

Reading through 60-pages, readers are struck by an obvious omission: no details of who would be liable to pay reparations. The Plan spells out which Black San Franciscans would be eligible to receive reparations, largely based on years being resident in the city and several categories of victimhood. Yet, as for paying out

those monies, there is no indication whether individual residents would be responsible (forced) to fork over funds, or just a portion of residents, or businesses, or government agencies. Have The Plan's authors formulated the answer to this very important detail yet? Outraged San Franciscans want to know.

## IT'S RACIST AND MIMICS APARTHEID

At the crux of criticism is The Plan's desire to levy a reparations tax (though by law, only voters may approve or reject a proposed tax); its blueprint to establish neo-Apartheid segregation and rule in San Francisco, encompassing a massive separation of the Black minority community (approx 5% of the city's population) into a preferred, prioritized class of residents through funding of Black-owned banks, a Black health care system, a Black-run education system with Black cultural-centric curriculum, Black-priority home ownership, Black community spaces, even Black mental health therapists to counter alleged current "White Supremacy" curriculum; it also seeks cancelation of Black consumers' credit card debt and loans, along with exemptions for property tax and business taxes for Black recipients. A new, successor reparations management committee will be formed once the current committee closes ("sunsets") this June 2023. This new committee aims to receive all reparations funds, empowered to manage the disbursements to Black recipients. The committee seeks to operate outside the auspices of the City of San Francisco government. This is absolutely ludicrous.

## A WALLED-OFF BLACK POPULATION

The Plan's authors seek to self-impose a psychological "walling-off" of their own Black community in the southeast section of the city from the rest of San Francisco. Such a drastic separation would be accomplished by replacement of San Francisco's current integrated education, health care, banking, town squares, tech hubs, housing and cultural aspects, with Black-only or Black-emphasized counterparts. At a time in our city's history (and indeed the history of our nation), the last thing San Francisco should ever consider is to fully segregate any portion of the population by race, enclosed by a wall literal or figurative, even if that segment of the population desires it. No good has ever come from walling-off residents (*think historic ghettos, Berlin, the racial segregation walls of Detroit and Miami's past Jim Crow era*).

## SCORCHED EARTH

Fiscally, this Plan is not only unfeasable, it would destroy the city. Total lump-sum payouts of \$5 million to qualified Black recipients could exceed the city's annual budget nearly twenty-fold. Moreover, annual subsidies to qualified Black recipients would perpetually siphon funds from the rest of the city, essentially laying San Francisco in financial ruin. Residents would leave. Home values would tank.

Businesses would flee.

## NOTE

The Draft Plan is just that, a *draft*. It is subject to revision, deletion, deliberation, partial or total rejection. The Draft has been presented to the San Francisco 11-member Board of Supervisors (our City Council), who will hold numerous hearings, inviting public comment. A vote on the Draft Plan is scheduled to be held in June 2023. Therefore, this RejectThePlan.com website will be updated as the days and weeks progress towards that June vote. Content and analysis will be updated here along the way. Be sure to bookmark this site and return often.

## CONCLUSION

This is an incredibly unserious, incomplete, unlawful, impossible to fulfill and astonishingly exploitive plan, already igniting racial tension, thrusting propaganda onto a gullible and vulnerable segment of San Francisco's population. Any city hall official who's read all 60 pages would not support it. Those officials who regardless support it anyway need to take a hard look in the mirror - and decide if they should continue serving in office.

Thank You for your consideration,

Community Bay Area Member

Sent from my iPhone

**From:** [Monica D](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [ChanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [StefaniStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [EngardioStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Preston, Dean \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MelgarStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Ronen, Hillary](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparation  
**Date:** Monday, February 6, 2023 9:53:03 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

We, taxpayers, who were never slave owners in a state where it never held slaves, do NOT want to be paying taxes for Black Reparation. You are asking for a lawsuit!

~Asian taxpayer

**From:** [CHRISTINE CORDARO](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparations  
**Date:** Monday, February 6, 2023 8:47:51 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors:

Please, please please to NOT endorse this proposal from the Reparations committee! It is not only financially irresponsible and impossible but is also racist, divisive and likely unconstitutional!

Money alone does NOTHING to solve the longstanding problems in the Black community. However, access to education, good jobs and healthcare do!

Please stop this fantasy!

Christine Cordaro

Sent from my iPad

**From:** [Charles Bush](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#); [ChanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [StefaniStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [EngardioStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Preston, Dean \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MelgarStaff \(BOS\)](#); [MandelmanStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Ronen, Hillary](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** REJECT the Reparations Plan  
**Date:** Monday, February 6, 2023 8:41:29 AM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To the Board of Supervisors:

I urge you to REJECT the Reparations Plan now before you. It is unacceptable for at least three reasons.

First, it is patently unconstitutional under both the federal and state constitutions.

Second, it would bankrupt the City many times over.

Third, it is racist in the worse sense of the term, creating a privileged class defined entirely by race.

Thank you for your attention.

Charles Bush  
2673 Pine Street



**From:** [E. Gittleman, ESH Consultants](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [ChanStaff \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** reparations  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 5:38:55 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Please do not approve the reparations plan that will be discussed on February 7. Reparations will only result in a bigger split between the various ethnic groups in the city. Making current citizens and future citizens of San Francisco responsible for activities that occurred prior to the civil war will result in reverse discrimination. Are we a city that goes from one extreme to the other just to get votes in the future.

None of my ancestors resided in the United States until after 1910. Why should we be held accountable for actions beyond our control prior to the civil war. There are members of the African American community whose ancestors did not reside in the United State until the 20th Century. Why would anyone think they deserve reparations. The next step will be providing reparations to the Asian community for treatment of Chinese workers brought to the US to build the railroads. What about reparations for Japanese Americans due to the internment camps that were established on the west coast, especially in California. Should the Irish, Germans, and other Europeans get reparations due to how they were treated as immigrant workers?

Should California request that Germany send me reparations for the over 100 members of my family that died during the holocaust? Almost none of whom I know the names as my long since deceased parents know who they were.

It would be better to use the funds (at a lower level) to increase education and work training for the underprivileged. Sending checks out will become a scam and a lot of the funds will end up in the hands of the wrong people. CA has a record of not properly overseeing these money giveaways. Just look at how much was stolen in Covid funds.

Do not vote in favor. In fact vote to abolish the commission.

Elliot Gittleman  
City of San Francisco, District 1  
[esh.fire@sbcglobal.net](mailto:esh.fire@sbcglobal.net)

**From:** [DAVID GREENBERG](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** "Reparations" Plan  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 4:57:12 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors:

The proposed plan to extort money from San Francisco taxpayers (none of whom have owned slaves, and most of whom have no slave-owning ancestors) and gift it to black San Franciscans (none of whom have been slaves, and many of whom probably *do* have slave-owning ancestors, who were known to rape their female slaves) is insane.

Even if this were not the case, the odious concept of trans-generational guilt, which the proposed measure embraces, is at odds with both fairness and logic. Maybe the city should focus instead on apprehending and punishing those who are themselves guilty of crimes, rather than encouraging crime by weakening the police and turning a blind eye to drug trafficking and related violence.

If this plan is approved, it will only accelerate the exodus of taxpayers from San Francisco, which is a consequence of your high-tax, soft-on-crime policies. You and your ilk have already hobbled a once great city. The real beneficiaries of the "Reparations" Plan will be conservative Republicans, who will rightly portray this foolishness as yet another example of the inability of leftists like yourselves to govern America's cities.

David A. Greenberg  
San Francisco, CA

**From:** [Gary Decad](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparatons Plan  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 4:35:05 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Another insane idea by the BOS. The City is a mess and this is what you come up with?

**From:** [May Mosquera](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparations is not right!  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 3:52:04 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To whom it make concern,

Reparations for one race is absolute racism! To choose one race to give reparations is a crime! How about the Native Americans, Asians , Latinos and Middle Easterners etc who also have contributed to America progress ! My tax dollars is going to paying \$ 5 million to each African American. That money should be spent to improve education, job opportunities and health care.

Where is the money coming from to pay for the reparations? From us tax payers?!? It's so scandalous! I work so hard to better my life! To achieve my goals without any handouts! This will only create racial divisions and it not solve all of problems! What is the purpose of reparations to lessen the guilt of the Whites who have been paying the sins of their ancestors!

This need to be voted by San Franciscan not some back door politicians who want to make this reparations pass ! Shame on you! Stop this progressive propaganda!

For the people by the people!

Concerned Citizen,  
May Mosquera

Reparations is not fair  
Sent from my iPhone

Sent from my iPhone

Sent from my iPhone

**From:** [Steven O'Connor](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reparations  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 3:35:14 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello Board,

I am an SF native and resident. I pay taxes like crazy.

The reparations proposal is not the right to way to create fairness. What about non-Black poor people? They get nothing? And do rich Black folks get the \$5 million?

100's of thousands of white (and black) boys died in the Civil War. Billions have been paid in welfare. Enough is enough already. I'm Jewish, do the Egyptians owe me money for slavery?

There are better ways to work for equity in SF!!

Thank you,  
Steven O'Connor  
88 Perry Street No. 525  
SF, CA 94107

**From:** [LRamlan](#)  
**To:** [ChanStaff \(BOS\); Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** RE: REPARATIONS  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 3:29:30 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

**The REPARATIONS PLAN is absurd - DON'T PASS IT!!!!!!!!!!**

**From:** [Joe Williams](#)  
**To:** [Richard Thalheimer](#)  
**Cc:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Re: Reject the Reparations plan please!  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 7:17:49 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Wow !! Excellent. So well stated. This whole thing is a fiasco. Brought to you by the same people that allowed a CCP Spy balloon to take photos of our major defensive air bases. And everything else. This is so insane. Wait a second — Mexicans killed white guys at the Alamo. So I want a million also. From the Mexicans. The blacks destroyed downtown Portland. Where's my checks ?!  
Sickening.

Joe

On Feb 5, 2023, at 7:12 PM, Richard Thalheimer  
<[richard.thalheimer@gmail.com](mailto:richard.thalheimer@gmail.com)> wrote:

To the Clerk:

Please distribute this to the SF Board of Supervisors for me? Thanks so much!

Dear Board Members,

Regarding the Draft Reparations Plan, I would like to register my strong opposition, based on these points:

1. We have federal and state laws which exist to prevent a government awarding of resources to groups of people based on race, gender or ethnicity.
2. No details have been given of who would be liable to pay reparations. The Plan spells out which Black San Franciscans would be eligible to receive reparations, largely based on years being resident in the city and several categories of victimhood. Yet, as for paying out those monies, there is no indication whether individual residents would be responsible (forced) to fork over funds, or just a portion of residents, or businesses, or government agencies.
3. The Plan's desire to levy a reparations tax (though by law, only voters may approve or reject a proposed tax); its blueprint to establish neo-

Apartheid segregation and rule in San Francisco, encompassing a massive separation of the Black minority community (approx 5% of the city's population) into a preferred, prioritized class of residents through funding of Black-owned banks, a Black health care system, a Black-run education system with Black cultural-centric curriculum, Black-priority home ownership, Black community spaces.

4. The Plans authors seek to self-impose a psychological "walling-off" of their own Black community in the southeast section of the city from the rest of San Francisco. Such a drastic separation would be accomplished by replacement of San Francisco's current integrated education, health care, banking, town squares, tech hubs, housing and cultural aspects, with Black-only or Black-emphasized counterparts. At a time in our city's history (and indeed the history of our nation), the last thing San Francisco should consider is to fully segregate any portion of the population by race, enclosed by a wall - literal or figurative, even if that segment of the population desires it..

5. Fiscally, this Plan is not only unfeasible, it would destroy the city. Total lump-sum payouts of \$5 million to each qualified Black recipient could exceed the city's annual budget nearly twenty-fold. Moreover, annual subsidies to qualified Black recipients would perpetually siphon funds from the rest of the city, essentially leaving San Francisco in financial ruin.

For these reasons and more, I strongly urge that it be rejected.

Sincerely,

Richard Thalheimer  
3330 California St #1  
SF 94118



**From:** [Richard Thalheimer](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reject the Reparations plan please!  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 7:12:19 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To the Clerk:

Please distribute this to the SF Board of Supervisors for me? Thanks so much!

Dear Board Members,

Regarding the Draft Reparations Plan, I would like to register my strong opposition, based on these points:

1. We have federal and state laws which exist to prevent a government awarding of resources to groups of people based on race, gender or ethnicity.
2. No details have been given of who would be liable to pay reparations. The Plan spells out which Black San Franciscans would be eligible to receive reparations, largely based on years being resident in the city and several categories of victimhood. Yet, as for paying out those monies, there is no indication whether individual residents would be responsible (forced) to fork over funds, or just a portion of residents, or businesses, or government agencies.
3. The Plan's desire to levy a reparations tax (though by law, only voters may approve or reject a proposed tax); its blueprint to establish neo-Apartheid segregation and rule in San Francisco, encompassing a massive separation of the Black minority community (approx 5% of the city's population) into a preferred, prioritized class of residents through funding of Black-owned banks, a Black health care system, a Black-run education system with Black cultural-centric curriculum, Black-priority home ownership, Black community spaces.
4. The Plans authors seek to self-impose a psychological "walling-off" of their own Black community in the southeast section of the city from the rest of San Francisco. Such a drastic separation would be accomplished by replacement of San Francisco's current integrated education, health care, banking, town squares, tech hubs, housing and cultural aspects, with Black-only or Black-emphasized counterparts. At a time in our city's history (and indeed the history of our nation), the last thing San Francisco should consider is to fully segregate any portion of the population by race, enclosed by a wall - literal or figurative, even if that segment of the population desires it..
5. Fiscally, this Plan is not only unfeasible, it would destroy the city. Total lump-sum payouts of \$5 million to each qualified Black recipient could exceed the city's annual budget nearly twenty-fold. Moreover, annual subsidies to qualified Black recipients would perpetually siphon funds from the rest of the city, essentially leaving San

Francisco in financial ruin.

For these reasons and more, I strongly urge that it be rejected.

Sincerely,

Richard Thalheimer  
3330 California St #1  
SF 94118

**From:** [Cary Fulbright](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [Marjorie Fulbright](#); [Cary Fulbright](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: Reject the Plan  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 6:26:12 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

On one side of my family one of my ancestors came to America as an indentured servant and worked without pay for seven years for someone else.

On the other side of my family one of my ancestors came to America in 1861, was promptly drafted, and had to sign his Union army draft papers with an "X" because he couldn't write and couldn't speak or understand English.

My wife's family came to America fleeing anti-Jewish pogroms in Russia and Romania.

Please tell us that this qualifies us for reparations.

Regards,

Cary Fulbright

On Sunday, February 5, 2023 at 05:22:07 PM PST, Marjorie Fulbright <fulbrightm@yahoo.com> wrote:

Hello! I am a homeowner and long-time taxpayer in San Francisco. I am against your reparations plan as I believe it will cause racism and further divide San Franciscans instead of bringing them together. AND, you are already wasting too much money on homelessness without actually solving the problem. Let's make San Francisco a better place not a more divided and dangerous place.

Marjorie Fulbright

**From:** [Marjorie Fulbright](#)  
**To:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** Reject the Plan  
**Date:** Sunday, February 5, 2023 5:28:59 PM

---

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello! Please distribute this to all the Supervisors. Thank you!

Hello! I am a homeowner and long-time taxpayer in San Francisco. I am against your reparations plan as I believe it will cause racism and further divide San Franciscans instead of bringing them together. AND, you are already wasting too much money on homelessness without actually solving the problem. Let's make San Francisco a better place not a more divided and dangerous place.

Marjorie Fulbright