

1 [Planning Code - Market Street Masonry Historic District]

2

3 **Ordinance amending the Planning Code, by adding a new Appendix M to Article 10**
4 **(Preservation of Historical, Architectural, and Aesthetic Landmarks), to create the**
5 **Market Street Masonry Historic District, a discontinuous landmark historic district; and**
6 **making findings, including environmental findings, and findings of consistency with**
7 **the General Plan, and Planning Code, Section 101.1(b).**

8

NOTE: Additions are *single-underline italics Times New Roman*;
9 deletions are ~~*strike-through italics Times New Roman*~~.
Board amendment additions are double-underlined;
10 Board amendment deletions are ~~strike-through normal~~.

9

10

11

12 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

12

13 Section 1. Findings. The Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco
14 hereby finds and determines that:

13

14

15 (a) Historic Preservation Commission Findings. On September 19, 2012, at a duly
16 noticed public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission in Resolution No. 690 found
17 that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance were consistent
18 with the City's General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) and recommended that
19 the Board of Supervisors adopt the proposed amendments. A copy of said Resolution is on
20 file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 121004.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21 (b) Planning Commission Findings. On September 20, 2012, at a duly noticed
22 public hearing, the Planning Commission in Resolution No. 18707 found that the proposed
23 Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance were consistent with the City's
24 General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b). In addition, the Planning Commission
25 recommended that the Board of Supervisors adopt the proposed Planning Code

21

22

23

24

25

1 amendments. A copy of said Resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in
2 File No. 121004 and is incorporated herein by reference.

3 (c) The Board finds that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this
4 ordinance are on balance consistent with the City’s General Plan and with Planning Code
5 Section 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in both Historic Preservation Commission
6 Resolution No. 690 and Planning Commission Resolution No. 18707 and their associated
7 staff reports, which reasons are incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.

8 (d) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board finds that the proposed
9 ordinance will serve the public necessity, convenience and welfare for the reasons set forth in
10 Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 690 and Planning Commission Resolution
11 No. 18707 and their associated staff reports, which reasons are incorporated herein by
12 reference as though fully set forth.

13 (e) Environmental Findings. The Planning Department has determined that the
14 actions contemplated in this Ordinance are exempt from the California Environmental Quality
15 Act (California Public Resources Code section 21000 et seq.) (CEQA). Said determination is
16 on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 121004 and is incorporated herein
17 by reference.

18
19 Section 2. The San Francisco Planning Code is hereby amended by amending Article
20 10 to add a new Appendix M, to read as follows:

21 APPENDIX M TO ARTICLE 10

22 MARKET STREET MASONRY HISTORIC DISTRICT

23 Sec. 1. Findings and Purposes.

24 Sec. 2. Designation.

25 Sec. 3. Location And Boundaries.

1 Sec. 4. Relation To Planning Code And The Provisions Of The Charter Of The City And County
2 Of San Francisco.

3 Sec. 5. Statement Of Significance.

4 Sec. 6. Significance Of Individual Buildings To The Landmark District.

5 Sec. 7. Features Of The District And Existing Buildings.

6 Sec. 8. Review Standards For Certificates Of Appropriateness

7
8 SEC. 1. FINDINGS AND PURPOSES.

9 The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that the area known and described in this ordinance
10 as the Market Street Masonry Historic District contains a number of structures having a special
11 character and special historical, architectural and aesthetic interest and value, and constitutes a
12 distinct section of the City. The Board of Supervisors further finds that designation of said area as a
13 Historic District will be in furtherance of and in conformance with the purposes of Article 10 of the
14 Planning Code and the standards set forth therein, and that preservation on an area basis rather than
15 on the basis of individual structures alone is in order.

16 This ordinance is intended to further the general purpose of historic preservation legislation
17 as set forth in Section 1001 of the Planning Code, to promote the health, safety and general welfare of
18 the public.

19
20 SEC. 2. DESIGNATION.

21 Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Market Street Masonry Historic District
22 is hereby designated as a Historic District, this designation having been duly recommended for
23 approval by Resolution No. 690 of the Historic Preservation Commission and comments transmitted by
24 the Planning Commission by Resolution No. 18707, which Resolutions are on file with the Clerk of the

1 Board of Supervisors under File No. 121004 and which Resolutions are incorporated herein and made
2 part hereof as though fully set forth.

3
4 SEC. 3. LOCATION AND BOUNDARIES. The location and boundaries of the Market Street
5 Masonry Historic District include the following eight (8) buildings and Assessor Parcel Numbers: 150
6 Franklin Street (Block and Lot No. 0834/012); 20 Franklin Street, aka 1580-1598 Market Street (Block
7 and Lot No. 0836/010); 1649-1651 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/001); 1657 Market Street
8 (Block and Lot No. 3504/046); 1666-1668 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 0854/004); 1670-1680
9 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 0854/005); 1687 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/040); and
10 1693-1695 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/038); and shall be as designated on the Market
11 Street Masonry Historic District Map, the original of which is on file with the Clerk of the Board of
12 Supervisors in File No. 121004, which Map is hereby incorporated herein as though fully set forth.

13
14 SEC. 4. RELATION TO PLANNING CODE AND THE PROVISIONS OF THE CHARTER OF
15 THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO.

16 (a) Article 10 of the Planning Code is the basic law governing historic preservation in the
17 City and County of San Francisco. This ordinance, being a specific application of Article 10, is both
18 subject to and in addition to the provisions thereof.

19 (b) Except as may be specifically provided to the contrary in this ordinance, nothing in
20 this ordinance shall supersede, impair or modify any Planning Code provisions applicable to property
21 in the Market Street Masonry Historic District, including but not limited to existing and future
22 regulations controlling uses, height, bulk, lot coverage, floor area ratio, required open space, off-street
23 parking and signs.

1 SEC. 5. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE.

2 Eight architecturally significant buildings located between Franklin and Valencia Streets
3 comprise the Market Street Masonry Historic District. Highly regarded master architects such as
4 August Nordin, G. Albert Lansburgh, Conrad A. Meussdorffer, and George Applegarth worked in the
5 popular revival styles of the early 20th-century such as Classical Revival, Colonial Revival, and
6 Venetian Gothic Revival.

7 The architects utilized a formal three-part arrangement consisting of a base (often with a
8 commercial storefront), main portion or column (often with residential floors), and decorative top with
9 either a projecting cornice or decorative parapet. All buildings comprising this non-contiguous
10 historic district are three to six stories tall and are fully built out, covering their entire lot. Most are
11 mixed-use with commercial ground floor uses and residential above.

12 Built between 1911 and 1925, following the 1906 Earthquake and Fire, and responding to new
13 building codes, they influenced the visual transition of San Francisco from a city of wood and brick, to
14 one of brick veneer, concrete, and stucco. Projecting bay windows—a long-standing feature in San
15 Francisco—visually reinforce the vertical emphasis, while increasing the light and air into the interior
16 of many of the buildings. The buildings are executed in earthquake and fire-resistant materials with
17 steel frames, reinforced concrete, brick, and galvanized metal ornament.

18 While each building is unique, they relate to each other as a group because of the period in
19 which they were constructed, their high-style design, and fire-proof masonry construction. All of the
20 buildings are well-preserved examples and retain character-defining features, such as elaborate metal
21 cornices, pattern brickwork, historic storefronts with glass transom lights, bronze plate glass window
22 frames and decorative bases.

23 Additional historic information may be found in the Market Street Masonry Historic District
24 Designation Report, which is hereby incorporated herein as though fully set forth. This document is on
25 file at the Planning Department under Case No. 2011.0705L.

1
2 SEC. 6. SIGNIFICANCE OF INDIVIDUAL BUILDINGS TO THE LANDMARK DISTRICT.

3 A district is usually a single geographic area of contiguous historic properties; however, a
4 district may also be composed of multiple definable significant resources separated by non-significant
5 areas. The Market Street Masonry discontinuous district is composed of eight buildings on four blocks
6 that are spatially discrete. The space between the buildings is not related to the significance of the
7 district. While all buildings can be seen from the intersection of Market and Franklin Streets, the
8 visual continuity is not a factor in the significance. Each of the eight discontinuous buildings are
9 contributory to the Market Street Masonry Historic District.

10 An architectural description, building history and evaluation of each parcel within the Historic
11 District is documented in the Market Street Masonry Historic District Designation Report and are
12 hereby incorporated herein as though fully set forth. It is important to note that street address numbers
13 are subject to change, and that the most reliable, official method for identifying a property within the
14 Landmark District is to refer to it by its assigned Assessor Block and Lot number.

15
16 SEC. 7. FEATURES OF THE DISTRICT AND EXISTING BUILDINGS.

17 The character-defining features of the Market Street Masonry Historic District include all
18 exterior elevations, including rooflines, of each of the eight buildings. The following section describes
19 in further detail character-defining features of the District and of individual buildings contained
20 therein. Historic District designation is intended to protect and preserve these character-defining
21 features.

22 (a) Overall Form, Continuity, Scale and Proportion. All buildings are built to the property
23 lines, rise vertically without setbacks, and have flat roofs. Building height is within a three-to six story
24 range, with one building at three stories, one at four, four at five stories, and two at six stories in
25

1 height. All buildings in the district retain their historic integrity. The buildings are consistent in height,
2 bulk, scale and proportion.

3 (b) Fenestration. Existing fenestration consists of predominantly double-hung, wood sash
4 windows that are vertical in orientation; however, industrial steel sash is found, as are awning and
5 casement sash. Buildings feature a symmetrical and regular pattern of windows with consistent
6 dimensions along primary facades. Aside from some ground floor commercial storefronts, the size and
7 shape of window openings have not been altered over time. Replacement window sash that were added
8 to buildings after the period of significance have not gained significance in their own right.

9 (c) Materials and Finishes. Unpainted brick is the predominant cladding material found in
10 five of the eight buildings in the district; however, painted stucco on concrete is found on three
11 buildings in the district. Galvanized sheet iron is used extensively for decorative features and the
12 cladding of projecting bay windows.

13 (d) Architectural Details. There are no character-defining interior features or spaces
14 included in this designation. The character-defining exterior features of the buildings are:

15 (1) 150 Franklin Street. The significant historical and architectural features of 150
16 Franklin Street are: five-story height and rectangular massing; scored concrete cladding on the raised
17 basement and brick cladding on the upper stories; recessed main entrance with a concrete, segmental
18 arch surround, marble steps, and glazed wood door with sidelights and transom; glass and metal
19 framed curved marquise; fenestration pattern of recessed, semi-hexagonal bays, with double-hung
20 wood sash windows set within galvanized metal surrounds that extend the full height of the building;
21 Classical Revival decorative details, including a basement story separated from the upper stories by a
22 band of Greek key ornament, metal architrave with beveled shield ornaments between the bays, a frieze
23 with brick Flemish diagonal bond ornament, and a deeply projecting metal cornice with dentils, egg
24 and dart molding, drop finials on the soffit, galvanized metal spandrel panels, and geometric fascia
25 ornament with plaques set between the bays on the cornice fascia; and flat roof; as well as:

- 1 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- 2 • Rectangular massing;
- 3 • Projecting metal and glass marquee above the main entry on Franklin Street
- 4 • Exterior cladding including unpainted common bond brick; painted stucco base and
- 5 terra cotta and/or cast stone water table and bay frames and panels;
- 6 • Historic one-over-one wood double hung windows on residential floors; paired wood
- 7 casement sash at the raised basement; and
- 8 • Projecting metal cornice.

9 (2) 20 Franklin Street, aka 1580-1598 Market Street. The significant historical and
 10 architectural features are: six-story height and E-shaped massing; brick cladding; high vertically
 11 divided transoms at the second story level; light wells at second story that are separated from those
 12 below and above by metal cornices; light wells fronted by a dentilated triangular pediment supported
 13 by Tuscan columns; symmetrical fenestration pattern with flat arch lintels and keystones; sixth floor
 14 windows with molded surrounds and label molding; modillion cornice; parapet; and flat roof; as well
 15 as:

- 16 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- 17 • Irregular pentagonal massing at the base, and “E” shaped apartment blocks on upper
- 18 floors;
- 19 • Pediments supported by columns fronting the southern light courts;
- 20 • Window openings with double hung sash, historically one-over-one wood double hung
- 21 sash;
- 22 • Unpainted English bond brick on Market and Page Street elevations;
- 23 • Brick piers and bases at the glazed storefronts with glass transoms;
- 24 • Projecting metal cornice; and
- 25 • Flag pole.

1 (3) 1649 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are: five-story
2 height and U-shaped massing; stucco and brick cladding; recessed entrance with glazed wood door,
3 sidelights and transom; wood sash mezzanine windows at several storefronts; distinctive upper story
4 fenestration pattern of modified Chicago-style windows with six- over-one light double-hung wood sash
5 windows separated by spandrel panels with inlaid brick designs; side windows angled to the depth of
6 the building wall; fifth story stucco cladding with an elaborate decorative scheme; slightly arched fifth
7 story window openings with Corinthian columns with embossed patterning on the shafts; sills
8 supported on molded brackets, and recessed panels between windows; a relief panel with a female face
9 surrounded by garlands at the left and right ends of the story; and a metal entablature with dentils and
10 a modillion cornice; as well as:

- 11 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- 12 • Rectangular massing;
- 13 • Unpainted Flemish bond brick on Market, Brady and Stevenson Streets;
- 14 • Recessed residential entry with marble paneling and beveled divided lights;
- 15 • Glazed storefronts with wood divided-light transoms set within embossed metal frames;
- 16 • Painted stucco base on Market, Brady and Stevenson Streets;
- 17 • Historic six-over-one and nine-over-one wood double hung sash;
- 18 • Terra cotta ornament at the fifth floor; and
- 19 • Projecting metal cornice.

20 (4) 1657 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are: five-story
21 height and rectangular massing; brick cladding; intact lattice transom at the former storefront; multi-
22 story canted bays; approximately fifty percent of the original double-hung, wood-sash windows;
23 paneled spandrels and projecting cornices at the bays; a distinctive fifth story fenestration pattern
24 including a pair of arched window openings with double-hung, wood sash in the left and right bays,
25

1 and a blind window opening in the center bay, all divided with pilasters, a continuous sill and outlined
2 with coping; and a cornice with dropped brackets and a molded frieze; as well as:

3 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;

4 • Rectangular massing;

5 • Storefront surround with embossed metal ornament, painted stucco base, embossed
6 metal frames, prism glass storefront transom;

7 • Projecting bay windows supported on scroll brackets;

8 • Historic one-over-one wood double hung sash; and

9 • Projecting metal cornice.

10 (5) 1666-1668 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are:

11 height and massing; brick cladding; fenestration pattern with six- over-six light, wood, double-hung
12 sash; Colonial Revival decorative features including arched, recessed entrance in the left (western) bay
13 with Doric columns and divided sidelights and a fanlight transom; upper stories with arched window
14 openings on the second story with infilled, paneled arches; third story with flat lintels and sills; fourth-
15 story with segmental arch lintels and keystones; belt course that separates the fifth story; entablature
16 with triglyphs and medallions on the frieze and a modillion cornice; and parapet topped with a
17 balustrade; as well as:

18 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;

19 • Trapezoidal massing;

20 • Unpainted Flemish bond brick on Market Street; stucco and galvanized metal on Rose
21 Street;

22 • Storefront enframingent of painted molded stucco (the configuration within the
23 enframingent is non-historic);

24 • Historic six-over-six wood double hung sash; and

25 • Projecting metal cornice and balustrade parapet.

1 (6) 1670-1680 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are: six-
2 story height and massing; stucco cladding; storefronts with tiled water tables and window
3 enframements and original wood frame storefront windows and high, divided, straight, transom with
4 arched openings and turned spindle muntins; entry with shouldered, arched opening and a door hood
5 on brackets with a shouldered pediment; upper stories with bay windows in the second, fourth, and
6 sixth bays with paneled spandrels, colonnettes with spiral fluting, and molded friezes; and entablature
7 with molded medallion frieze and modillion cornice; as well as:

- 8 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- 9 • Trapezoidal massing;
- 10 • Recessed residential entry with marble step, tiled floor, and wood entry door and
11 transom with wrought iron grilles;
- 12 • Glazed storefronts with wooden arched top divided light storefront transoms, tiled piers
13 and bases and retractable awning pockets;
- 14 • “Gaffney Building” incised panel above the storefronts;
- 15 • Historic wood casement windows with transoms; and
- 16 • Projecting metal cornice.

17 (7) 1687 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are identified
18 as follows: two-story with mezzanine / three-story height and massing; stucco cladding; glazed
19 storefronts; deeply recessed entry with tiled floor; wood entry doors with transoms; steel windows with
20 divided-light transoms; stucco moldings framing the façade and between the mezzanine and upper
21 floor; metal tile pent roof and shaped parapet on Market Street; and three levels of industrial divided-
22 light steel sash on Stevenson Street; as well as:

- 23 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- 24 • Rectangular massing;
- 25 • Deeply recessed entry with tile floor, mirror, two wood doors and transoms;

1 • Glazed storefronts with painted stucco bases and no transoms;

2 • Steel windows with divided light transoms on Market Street; divided light steel

3 industrial sash on Stevenson Street;

4 • “Edward McRoskey Mattress Co” incised panel; and

5 • Shaped parapet with metal tile pent roof.

6 (8) 1693 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are: five story
7 height and rectangular massing; combination brick and metal cladding; recessed residential entry at
8 the left bay; four-story continuous canted bays with wood sash awning windows, spandrel panels and
9 fixed, recessed, half-round or square transoms; fire escape at the central bays on the second through
10 fifth floors; entablature and double, arched parapet with decorative keystones above the first and
11 fourth bays; and a flagpole in the center; as well as:

12 • All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;

13 • Rectangular massing;

14 • Recessed residential entry with divided-light transom;

15 • Commercial storefront with painted masonry piers;

16 • Unpainted stacked and American bond brick above the ground floor;

17 • Wood awning windows with transoms;

18 • Metal-clad projecting bay windows;

19 • Double-arched brick and metal shaped parapet; and

20 • Flag pole.

21 (e) Landscape Elements. All properties in the Historic District are built to their respective
22 lot lines, and do not have landscape features. Streets, sidewalks and other public spaces are present in
23 this dense urban environment, but are incidental, rather than integral to the significance of the
24 buildings. Streets and sidewalks are not included as character-defining features. Public landscape
25 elements are therefore specifically excluded from this designation.

1 (f) Additional features of the Historic District are documented in the Market Street
2 Masonry Historic District Designation Report within the section entitled “Common Characteristics of
3 Buildings in the Market Street Masonry District,” and are hereby incorporated herein as though fully
4 set forth, and are on file at the Planning Department under Case No. 2011.0705L.

5
6 SEC. 8. REVIEW STANDARDS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

7 The standards for review of all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness are as set forth
8 in Section 1006.6 of Article 10. For the purposes of review under those standards, the "character of the
9 Historic District" shall mean the exterior architectural features of the Market Street Masonry Historic
10 District referred to and described in Section 7 of this Appendix.

11 The procedures, requirements, controls, and standards in Sections 1005 through 1006.7 of the
12 Planning Code shall apply to all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness in the Market Street
13 Masonry Historic District. In addition to those requirements, the following provisions shall apply to all
14 such applications; in the event of any conflict or inconsistency between the following provisions and
15 Article 10, those procedures, requirements, controls and standards affording stricter protection to
16 landmarks, landmark sites and the Historic District shall prevail:

17 (a) A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for painting previously unpainted
18 brickwork.

19 (b) Administrative Certificates of Appropriateness:

20 (1) Brickwork: An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for
21 cleaning brick surfaces with abrasives or treatment of such surfaces with waterproofing chemicals or
22 anti-graffiti coatings.

23 (2) Galvanized Metal Ornament: An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be
24 required for any repair of metal ornament that necessitates its removal from the building in order to
25 carry out such repair.

1 (3) Signs and Awnings: An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required
2 for new tenant signs, signage programs and awnings. Signage programs established for individual
3 buildings with a Notice of Special Restrictions (NSR) on file may avoid future Administrative
4 Certificates of Appropriateness provided future signs follow the established program. Signs, signage
5 programs and awnings that are compatible in terms of material, location, size, method of attachment,
6 and method of illumination with the building and/or district and meet the following requirements:

7 (i) Proposal shall not obscure or cover any exterior character-defining features;

8 (ii) Proposal includes the removal of any abandoned conduit, outlets, attachment structures,
9 and related equipment;

10 (iii) All signs shall be constructed out of durable high-quality materials that retain their
11 characteristics within a high-traffic area over time. Poor quality materials that are prone to fading,
12 rapid deterioration, or damage are discouraged;

13 (iv) Materials shall be compatible with the color, craftsmanship, and finishes associated
14 with the District. Materials shall not have glossy or highly reflective surfaces;

15 (v) All signage applied to or installed directly behind storefront glass shall not exceed one-
16 third of the glass area;

17 (vi) Awnings shall be constructed out of cloth or a material similar in appearance and
18 texture to cloth;

19 (vii) Retractable and operable awnings are encouraged; however, a fixed awning may be
20 acceptable if it expresses the same characteristics as retractable awnings or has a free-moving valance,
21 and does not appear to be rigid, hard, or inflexible;

22 (viii) All signs shall be attached in a manner that avoids damaging or obscuring any of the
23 character-defining features associated with the subject building;

1 (ix) For masonry buildings, projecting signs shall be anchored through mortar joints or
2 attached to a non-historic storefront system. All other signs shall be attached in a manner that allows
3 for their removal without adversely impacting the exterior of the subject building.

4 (4) Exterior lighting. An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for
5 lighting systems, not otherwise defined as a sign by this Code, whether mounted on the façade of the
6 building or not, the purpose of which is to illuminate the architectural features of the building.

7
8 Section 3. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days from the
9 date of passage.

10
11 Section 4. In enacting this Ordinance, the Board intends to amend only those words,
12 phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles, numbers, punctuation, charts, diagrams,
13 or any other constituent part of the Planning Code that are explicitly shown in this legislation
14 as additions, deletions, Board amendment additions, and Board amendment deletions in
15 accordance with the "Note" that appears under the official title of the legislation.

16 APPROVED AS TO FORM:
17 DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

18 By: _____
19 MARLENA G. BYRNE
20 Deputy City Attorney