



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Rules Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Ahsha Safai, Sandra Lee Fewer, Norman Yee*

*Clerk: Derek Evans (415) 554-7702*

---

Wednesday, April 26, 2017

1:00 PM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

---

**Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Ahsha Safai, Sandra Lee Fewer, and Norman Yee

*The Rules Committee met in regular session on Wednesday, April 26, 2017, with Chair Ahsha Safai presiding.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*Chair Safai called the meeting to order at 1:04 p.m. On the call of the roll, Chair Safai and Vice Chair Fewer were noted present. There was a quorum.*

*Member Yee was noted present at 1:05 p.m.*

## **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## **REGULAR AGENDA**

### **170462 [Appointment, Bay Conservation and Development Commission - Supervisor Aaron Peskin]**

Hearing to consider appointing one Member of the Board of Supervisors, for an indefinite term, to the Bay Conservation and Development Commission. (Rules Committee)

04/21/17; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: David Pilpel; spoke in support of appointing Supervisor Aaron Peskin.*

#### **PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Supervisor Aaron Peskin, for an indefinite term, to the Bay Conservation and Development Commission. (Rules Committee)

**Vice Chair Fewer moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Fewer, Yee

**170461 [Appointment, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors - Art Torres]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Art Torres to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a term ending March 1, 2021. (Rules Committee) (Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: April 18, 2017.)

04/18/17; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Art Torres; spoke on their qualifications. David Pilpel; spoke in support of appointing Art Torres.*

**Member Yee moved that this Motion be AMENDED to approve the Mayor's nomination of Art Torres to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Safai, Fewer, Yee

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Art Torres to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a term ending March 1, 2021. (Rules Committee) (Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: April 18, 2017.)

(Supervisor Fewer dissented in committee.)

**Member Yee moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED to the May 2, 2017, Board of Supervisors meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Yee

Noes: 1 - Fewer

**170460 [Appointment, Police Commission - Robert Hirsch]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Robert Hirsch to the Police Commission, for a term ending April 30, 2020. (Rules Committee) (Charter, Section 4.109, provides that this nomination is subject to approval by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: April 18, 2017.)

(Supervisor Safai dissented in committee.)

04/18/17; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Robert Hirsch; spoke on their qualifications. Paul Henderson, Deputy Chief of Staff and Public Safety Director (Mayor's Office); provided information and responded to questions raised throughout the hearing. Richard Butler; Steve Liebman; David Handsher; Preston Gilmore; Frank Lee; Bill Tamayo; Karen Francois; Sharon Bell; Bill Feyling; Jay Streets; Dan Calamuci; Timothy Reif; Alex Lantsberg; Peter Garza; spoke in support of appointing Robert Hirsch.*

*Vice Chair Fewer moved that this Motion be REFERRED WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION to the May 2, 2017, Board of Supervisors meeting. Before the vote was taken, Vice Chair Fewer withdrew the motion.*

**Member Yee, seconded by Vice Chair Fewer, moved that this Motion be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Fewer, Yee

Noes: 1 - Safai

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 2:22 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*