



MEMORANDUM

DATE: June 2, 2021

TO: Andrico Penick  
 Director of Real Estate, City and County of SF

FROM: Tony Bardo  
 SFPUC Assistant Real Estate Director

RE: Director of Real Estate Approval of Property Appraisals  
 (Caltrans/Alameda CTC Highway Projects in Sunol, CA)

Background

The California Department of Transportation (“Caltrans”) and the Alameda County Transportation Commission (“Alameda CTC”) are improving State Route 84 (“SR 84”) and a portion of Interstate 680 (“I-680”) in Alameda County and seek to acquire various fee and easement interests in property owned by the City and County of San Francisco (“City Property”).

**Caltrans has authority to exercise the power of eminent domain and compel City to sell the City Property.** Caltrans and City recognize the expense, time, effort, and risk to both parties in determining the compensation for acquiring the City Property by eminent domain litigation. To avoid such litigation, Caltrans and City desire to enter into sale agreements.

The projects are described below.

**A. SR 84/ I-680 Highway Widening Project**

Caltrans, in cooperation with the Alameda CTC, proposes to widen and conform SR-84 to expressway standards in an area south of Ruby Hill Drive and the I-680 interchange in Alameda County. This project will also improve the SR 84/I-680 interchange ramps and extend the existing southbound I-680 High Occupancy Vehicle/express lane northward by approximately two miles in the City of Pleasanton, the unincorporated Town of Sunol, and in other portions of Alameda County.

**B. Niles Canyon Safety Improvement Project**

Caltrans proposes to construct certain safety improvements to address structural and operational deficiencies at spot locations along SR-84 on Niles Canyon Road and Paloma Way between State Route 238 and I-680 in southern Alameda County.

**London N. Breed**  
 Mayor

**Sophie Maxwell**  
 President

**Anson Moran**  
 Vice President

**Tim Paulson**  
 Commissioner

**Ed Harrington**  
 Commissioner

**Newsha Ajami**  
 Commissioner

**Michael Carlin**  
 Acting  
 General Manager

**OUR MISSION:** To provide our customers with high-quality, efficient and reliable water, power and sewer services in a manner that values environmental and community interests and sustains the resources entrusted to our care.



**C. Alameda Creek Bridge Replacement Project**

Caltrans is replacing the Alameda Creek Bridge and realigning the eastern and western approaches to the bridge on SR 84 in an unincorporated portion of Alameda County, California.

APPRAISALS

The SR 84/ I-680 Highway Widening Project is the most significant of the three projects mentioned above. Alameda CTC engage the services of Associated Right of Way Services ("ARWS") to value the City Property as of April 2021. The ARWS appraisal is attached.

Caltrans in-house appraisal staff valued the City Property related to the two smaller projects. The Caltrans appraisals were conducted in 2018. Values were updated in April of 2021.

**Approach to Value**

All appraisals utilized the Sales Comparison Approach to value, the approach typically used when valuing unimproved property. SFPUC staff found the comparable sales used in the ARWS appraisal to be reasonable, while the comparable sales used in the Caltrans appraisals were not. The City Property related to the three projects is similar, and in some cases involve the same Assessor Parcel, yet the appraised fee value of the City Property as determined by Caltrans was less than half of the value as determined by ARWS. When SFPUC staff brought this value disparity to Caltrans' attention, Caltrans agreed to match the fee values in the ARWS appraisal.

A schedule of the appraised value of the City Property that Caltrans and Alameda CTC seek to acquire is attached.

If you approve please sign below.

 6/17/21

Andrico Penick

Date

Director of Real Estate, City and County of SF

SR 84 / I-680 Widening Project

April-21      October-19

Caltrans Parcel	Type	Unit Measure	Unit Value	Factor	Fee Value	Fee Value
<b>Quitclaim to State:</b>						
63869-1	Fee	35,388	\$0.48	100%	\$16,986	\$16,632
63869-2	Fee	117,555	\$0.48	100%	\$56,426	\$55,251
63869-3	Fee	5,934	\$0.48	100%	\$2,848	\$2,789
63869-4	Fee	1,845	\$0.48	100%	\$886	\$867
63868-1	Fee	7,493	\$0.48	100%	\$3,597	\$3,522
63868-2	Fee	436	\$0.48	100%	\$209	\$205
63868-3	Fee	3,001	\$0.48	100%	\$1,440	\$1,410
63879-1	Fee	72,251	\$0.51	100%	\$36,848	\$36,848
63881-1	Fee	12,839	\$0.48	100%	\$6,163	\$6,034
63881-2	Fee	440	\$0.48	100%	\$211	\$207
<b>Total</b>		<b>257,182</b>			<b>\$125,614</b>	<b>\$123,765</b>
<b>Access Easement to State:</b>						
63879-2	Easement	30,941	\$0.51	15%	\$2,367	\$2,367
<b>Access Easement to ACTC:</b>						
63879-4	Easement	30,941	\$0.51	15%	\$2,367	\$2,367
<b>Electric Easement to PG&amp;E:</b>						
63879-3	Easement	27,475	\$0.51	20%	\$2,802	\$2,802
63868-6	Easement	24,473	\$0.48	30%	\$3,524	\$3,451
63868-7	Easement	415	\$0.48	30%	\$60	\$59
63868-8	Easement	3,812	\$0.48	30%	\$549	\$537
<b>Total</b>		<b>56,175</b>			<b>\$6,935</b>	<b>\$6,849</b>
<b>Abutters Rights Deed:</b>						
63869-9	Access	43.29			\$16	\$16
63869-10	Access	162.16			\$59	\$59
63869-11	Access	69.30			\$25	\$25
63868-4	Access	609.78			\$228	\$228
63868-5	Access	724.56			\$272	\$272
<b>Total</b>		<b>1,609.09</b>			<b>\$600</b>	<b>\$600</b>
<b>Quitclaim Deed to County:</b>						
63869-12		5,371	\$0.48	100%	\$2,578	\$2,524
<b>Retaining Wall Easement to State:</b>						
63869-5	Easement	10,324	\$0.48	30%	\$1,487	\$1,456
63869-6	Easement	30,788	\$0.48	30%	\$4,433	\$4,341
63869-7	Easement	20,136	\$0.48	30%	\$2,900	\$2,839
63869-8	Easement	7,449	\$0.48	30%	\$1,073	\$1,050
		<b>68,697</b>			<b>\$9,893</b>	<b>\$9,686</b>
<b>Subtotal</b>					<b>\$150,354.00</b>	<b>\$148,158.00</b>
Site Improvements					\$1,875	\$1,875
Cost to Cure Damages					\$625	\$625

Rounding					\$98	-\$66
<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>\$152,952.00</b>	<b>\$150,592.00</b>

### Niles Canyon Safety Improvements Projects

Caltrans Parcel	Type	Unit Measure	Unit Value	Factor	April-21	Original April-18
					Fee Value	Fee Value
<b>Quitclaim to State:</b>						
63653	Fee	8,925	\$0.51	100%	\$4,552	\$1,874
63648-1	Fee	8,907	\$0.51	100%	\$4,543	\$1,870
<b>Total</b>		<b>17,832</b>			<b>\$9,095</b>	<b>\$3,744</b>
<b>Temporary Construction Easement to State:</b>						
63654	Easement (36 Mos)	16,150	\$0.51	30%	\$2,471	\$1,017
		1				
<b>Electric Easement to PG&amp;E:</b>						
63648-2	Easement	1,583	\$0.51	50%	\$404	\$166
<b>Subtotal</b>					<b>\$11,970</b>	<b>\$4,927</b>
Site Improvements					\$0	\$0
Cost to Cure Damages					\$0	\$0
Rounding					\$0	\$123
<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>\$11,970.00</b>	<b>\$5,050.00</b>

### Alameda Creek bridge Replacement Project

Parcel	Type	Unit Measure	Unit Value	Factor	April-21	Original March-19
					Fee Value	Fee Value
<b>Quitclaim to State:</b>						
63663-1	Fee	19,033	\$0.51	100%	\$9,707	\$3,997
63662	Fee	2,618	\$0.51	100%	\$1,335	\$550
<b>Total</b>		<b>21,651</b>			<b>\$11,042</b>	<b>\$4,547</b>
<b>Temporary Construction Easement to State:</b>						
63663-2	Easement (94 mos)	25,863	\$0.51	78%	\$10,332	\$4,254
63893	Easement (94 mos)	7,895	\$0.51	78%	\$3,154	\$1,299
		16,150			\$13,486	\$5,553
<b>Subtotal</b>					<b>\$24,528</b>	<b>\$10,100</b>
Site Improvements					\$0	\$0
Cost to Cure Damages					\$0	\$0
Rounding					\$0	\$100
<b>Grand Total</b>					<b>\$24,528.00</b>	<b>\$10,200.00</b>

