



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Parking Meter Collection Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_

Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Diana Hammons, Senior Manager

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Parking Meter Collections (18762)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2024-25

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,986	\$ 225,652
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	10.00	\$ 1,100,308	\$ 1,297,408
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 870,910	\$ 1,030,885
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 758,998	\$ 903,025
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0.25	\$ 53,224	\$ 65,840
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 199,309	\$ 246,868
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 65,511	\$ 78,647
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 40,745	\$ 46,649
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>24.25</b>	<b>\$ 3,277,991</b>	<b>\$ 3,894,974</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates
Rent	0		\$ 75,942	\$ 91,166
Utilities	0		\$ 10,849	\$ 13,024
Uniform	0		\$ 8,950	\$ 10,745
Vehicles	0		\$ 73,280	\$ 73,280
Radios	0		\$ 11,586	\$ 13,909
Gas	0		\$ 35,109	\$ 42,148
Overhead (99.2% of salary and benefits)	0		\$ 3,251,767	\$ 3,863,814
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 3,467,483</b>	<b>\$ 4,108,086</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 6,745,474 \$ 8,003,060**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 6,745,474	\$ 8,003,060
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 4,753,839	\$ 4,772,408
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,991,635	\$ 3,230,652
% of Savings to City Cost	29.53%	40.37%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Parking Meter Collections (18762)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2025-26

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost High
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 195,724	\$ 233,539
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	10.00	\$ 1,142,745	\$ 1,346,026
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 903,773	\$ 1,068,763
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 786,761	\$ 935,308
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0.25	\$ 55,173	\$ 68,279
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 206,663	\$ 256,099
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 67,195	\$ 80,669
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 41,792	\$ 47,847
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>24.25</b>	<b>\$ 3,399,826</b>	<b>\$ 4,036,530</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26 Low Estimate	FY 2025-26 High Estimates
Rent	0		\$ 86,159	\$ 86,159
Utilities	0		\$ 12,308	\$ 12,308
Uniform	0		\$ 10,154	\$ 10,154
Vehicles	0		\$ 73,223	\$ 73,223
Radios	0		\$ 13,539	\$ 13,539
Gas	0		\$ 41,028	\$ 41,028
Overhead (99.2% of salary and benefits)	0		\$ 3,372,627	\$ 4,004,238
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 3,609,038</b>	<b>\$ 4,240,649</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 7,008,864 \$ 8,277,179**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 7,008,864	\$ 8,277,179
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 4,902,328	\$ 4,918,915
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,106,536	\$ 3,358,264
% of Savings to City Cost	30.06%	40.57%