

File No. 230672

Committee Item No. 4

Board Item No. \_\_\_\_\_

## COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

### AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget and Appropriations Committee Date June 21, 2023

Board of Supervisors Meeting Date \_\_\_\_\_

#### Cmte Board

- Motion
- Resolution
- Ordinance
- Legislative Digest
- Budget and Legislative Analyst Report
- Youth Commission Report
- Introduction Form
- Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report
- MOU
- Grant Information Form
- Grant Budget
- Subcontract Budget
- Contract/Agreement
- Form 126 – Ethics Commission
- Award Letter
- Application
- Public Correspondence

#### OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

- Controller’s Letter - BOS/BLA Services
- Controller’s Letter - Fleet Security Services
- Controller’s Letter - Real Estate - Custodial Services
- Controller’s Letter - Real Estate - Security Services
- Controller’s Letter - Convention Facilities Management
- Controller’s Letter - Public Works Security Services
- Controller’s Letter - HSH Security Services
- Controller’s Letter - HSA Security Services
- Controller’s Letter - Sheriff’s Food Services
- Controller’s Letter - Elections - Vote by Mail Envelope Services
- Controller’s Letter - MOHCD Security Services
- Controller’s Letter - DPH Security Services
- MYR Budget Submission Letter 6/1/2023
- MYR Trailing Legislation List

Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date June 16, 2023

Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date \_\_\_\_\_

1 [Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services Previously Approved]

2

3 **Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services**  
4 **previously approved can be performed by a private contractor for a lower cost than**  
5 **similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services:**  
6 **Budget and Legislative Analyst Services (Board of Supervisors); Fleet Security**  
7 **Services, Real Estate Division Custodial Services, Real Estate Division Security**  
8 **Services, and Convention Facilities Management (General Services Agency -**  
9 **Administrative Services); Security Services (Department of Public Works); Security**  
10 **Services (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); Security Services (Human**  
11 **Services Agency); Food Services at County Jails (Sheriff's Department); Assembly of**  
12 **Vote by Mail Services (Department of Elections); Security Services (Mayor's Office of**  
13 **Housing and Community Development); and Security Services (Department of Public**  
14 **Health).**

15

16 WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed  
17 Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with  
18 private companies for specific services that can be performed for a lower cost than similar  
19 work by City and County employees (Charter, Section 10.104.15); and,

20 WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services  
21 listed below; and,

22 WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for  
23 the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve cost savings for the  
24 City; and,

25

1 WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco has a Charter obligation to enact a  
 2 balanced budget each fiscal year; and,

3 WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be  
 4 performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of  
 5 the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 230672,  
 6 which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now,  
 7 therefore be it;

8 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's  
 9 certification and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of  
 10 a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2023  
 11 through June 30, 2024.

12  
 13 Fiscal Year 2023-2024

14		City Cost	Contract Cost	\$	
15	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
16	Board of Supervisors (BOS)				
17	Budget Analyst	3,748,166	3,141,519	606,647	15.5
18	General Services Agency–City Administrator (ADM)				
19	Fleet Security Services	469,678	246,703	222,975	3.4
20	Real Estate Division Custodial Services	4,649,575	2,412,071	2,237,504	36.2
21	Real Estate Division Security Services	5,998,709	2,818,181	3,180,527	44.4
22	Convention Facilities Management	49,913,416	42,929,673	6,983,743	261.7
23	Department of Public Works (DPW)				
24	Security Services	837,288	450,086	387,202	6.7

25

1		City Cost	Contract Cost	\$	
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HOM)				
4	Security Services	5,516,859	2,037,867	3,478,992	39.7
5	Human Services Agency (HSA)				
6	Security Services	9,618,879	4,358,304	5,260,576	73.4
7	Sheriff (SHF)				
8	Food Services for Jail Inmates	2,573,502	1,456,983	1,116,519	19.1
9	Elections (REG)				
10	Assembly of Vote by Mail Ballots	2,161,901	298,701	1,863,200	21.0
11	Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development (MOHCD)				
12	Security Services	2,706,529	1,619,902	1,086,627	20.0
13	Department of Public Health (DPH)				
14	Security Services	1,323,038	577,882	745,156	4.2
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Honorable Board of Supervisors  
City Hall - Room 244  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

RE: Budget and Legislative Analyst Services – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears that they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-2024 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Edward de Asis, Deputy Director of Finance & Administration

Board of Supervisors  
 Clerk of the Board  
 Budget and Legislative Analysis  
**COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES**  
**FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	7,452	8,946	\$ 193,743	\$ 232,585
Manager III	0931	1.0	5,996	7,198	\$ 155,888	\$ 187,141
Principal Administrative Analyst II	1825	1.0	6,096	7,318	\$ 158,491	\$ 190,265
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	3.0	5,167	6,203	\$ 403,039	\$ 483,840
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	5.5	4,463	5,358	\$ 638,194	\$ 766,139
Performance Analyst III	1830	3.0	5,517	7,217	\$ 430,355	\$ 562,956
Executive Secretary I	1450	1.0	3,243	3,893	\$ 84,305	\$ 101,207
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		15.5				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 2,064,015	\$ 2,524,133
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953	74,879	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	66,864	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1825	62,127	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824	56,513	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823	51,179	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1830	61,655	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1450	41,919	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 773,348	\$ 881,777

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Operating expenses (materials & supplies, travel & training, membership, copier lease, off-site storage, telephone, etc.)	\$ 69,493	\$ 69,493
Space rental	\$ 215,469	\$ 215,469
Equipment & furniture	\$ 28,172	\$ 28,172
Email & software licenses	\$ 29,121	\$ 29,121
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 342,255	\$ 342,255

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 3,179,618	\$ 3,748,166
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 3,137,602	\$ 3,141,519
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 42,016	\$ 606,647
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	1%	16%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Fleet Security – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager

296644 ADM Internal Services - Fleet Management  
 Security Guard Service at Central Shops

**COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	3.37	\$ 2,762	3,316	\$ 241,864	\$ 290,353
City Shops Assistant Superintendent	7277	0.05	\$ 5,198	6,240	\$ 6,757.71	\$ 8,112.50
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			13,671	16,412
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			15,398	18,486
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			2,021	2,021
Total FTE		3.4				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 262,292.46	\$ 298,465.17
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 31,090.39	\$ 36,918.24

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8,207	38,206	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7,277	58,145	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 118,180.79	\$ 131,594.35

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Uniform costs	\$ 2,700	\$ 2,700
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 2,700	\$ 2,700

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 414,264	\$ 469,678
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 205,707	\$ 246,703
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 208,557	\$ 222,975
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	50%	47%





**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Real Estate Division Custodial Services – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager

228875 ADM Real Estate Division  
 Custodial Services for RED Buildings  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Custodian	2708	25.0	\$ 2,474	\$ 2,969	\$ 1,607,794	\$ 1,930,125	
Custodian (Temporary Status)	2708	8.0	\$ 2,474	\$ 2,969	\$ 514,494	\$ 617,640	
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	2.0	\$ 2,721	\$ 3,267	\$ 141,503	\$ 169,872	
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,601	\$ 78,000	\$ 93,637	
Management Assistant	1842	0.1	\$ 3,525	\$ 4,231	\$ 9,164	\$ 11,002	
Manager II	0923	0.05	\$ 5,560	\$ 6,674	\$ 7,228	\$ 8,677	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 4,452	\$ 5,345	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 153,938	\$ 184,799	
Total FTE		36.2					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 2,358,183	\$ 2,830,953
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 158,390	\$ 190,144

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	\$ 35,980	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	\$ 35,980	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2716	\$ 37,892	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	\$ 40,045	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	\$ 44,099	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923	\$ 64,460	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 1,182,453	\$ 1,310,802

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Materials and Supplies	\$ 275,190	\$ 300,029
Uniform	\$ 16,265	\$ 17,648
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 291,455	\$ 317,677

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 3,990,483	\$ 4,649,575
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 2,229,807	\$ 2,412,071
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,760,676	\$ 2,237,504
% of Savings to City Cost	44%	48%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Real Estate Security Services – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager

296644 ADM Internal Services - Real Estate Division  
 Security Services for RED Buildings  
 Insert name of the contract's main purpose here  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	41.3	\$ 2,762	3,316	2,966,126	3,560,776
Superv. Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8211	3.0	\$ 3,056	3,669	238,377	286,167
Manager I	0922	0.1	\$ 5,179	6,218	13,466	16,166
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			80,162	96,232
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			80,184	96,260
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		44.4				
Total Salary Costs--->					3,298,131	3,863,109
Total of Other Compensation--->					160,346	192,492

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	38,206	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211	40,479	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922	62,004	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		1,532,177	1,705,808

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Cellular Phones (\$2800 per year + \$509.50 one-time cost), (\$4500 a year + \$700 one-time cost); for the 8207 officers	138,999	218,400
Uniform (\$450)	18,900	18,900
	-	-
	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	157,899	237,300

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	5,148,553	5,998,709
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	2,761,443	2,818,181
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	2,387,110	3,180,527
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	46%	53%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Carmen Chu, City Administrator  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager

ADM Convention Facilities Management FY 2023-2024  
Comparative Costs of Contracting vs. In-House Services

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	\$ 3,841	4,611	\$ 59,913	\$ 71,924
IS Manager	1071	0.6	\$ 7,452	8,946	\$ 116,246	\$ 139,551
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	\$ 4,259	5,113	\$ 110,740	\$ 132,941
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 3,323	3,989	\$ 86,393	\$ 103,713
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	\$ 4,945	5,937	\$ 128,579	\$ 154,357
Principal HR Analyst	1246	1.0	\$ 6,014	7,219	\$ 156,359	\$ 187,706
Senior Clerk	1406	1.0	\$ 2,978	3,575	\$ 77,417	\$ 92,938
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 3,243	3,893	\$ 84,305	\$ 101,207
Secretary II	1446	2.0	\$ 2,978	3,575	\$ 154,835	\$ 185,876
Executive Secretary 3	1454	1.0	\$ 3,874	4,651	\$ 100,731	\$ 120,926
Accountant III	1654	2.0	\$ 4,463	5,358	\$ 232,075	\$ 278,602
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	\$ 2,762	3,316	\$ 71,807	\$ 86,203
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	\$ 4,575	5,492	\$ 237,905	\$ 285,600
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$ 5,982	7,181	\$ 155,529	\$ 186,709
Custodian	2708	92.0	\$ 2,474	2,969	\$ 5,916,683	\$ 7,102,860
Custodial Supervisor	2718	39.0	\$ 3,000	3,601	\$ 3,041,985	\$ 3,651,843
Fire Safety Inspector 2	6281	1.5	\$ 5,438	6,528	\$ 212,088	\$ 254,607
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	6.0	\$ 4,802	5,765	\$ 749,125	\$ 899,310
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	\$ 4,896	5,878	\$ 127,300	\$ 152,821
Painting Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$ 4,176	5,014	\$ 108,585	\$ 130,354
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	3.0	\$ 3,667	4,402	\$ 286,038	\$ 343,383
Stationary Engineer	7334	14.0	\$ 3,860	4,633	\$ 1,404,898	\$ 1,686,552
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	\$ 4,374	5,251	\$ 341,171	\$ 409,569
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$ 3,790	4,549	\$ 98,532	\$ 118,286
Electrician	7345	1.0	\$ 4,462	5,357	\$ 116,013	\$ 139,271
Painter	7346	3.0	\$ 3,488	4,187	\$ 272,036	\$ 326,574
Plumber	7347	1.0	\$ 4,497	5,398	\$ 116,918	\$ 140,358
Security Guard	8202	23.0	\$ 2,762	3,316	\$ 1,651,563	\$ 1,982,669
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	6.0	\$ 3,596	4,316	\$ 560,901	\$ 673,350
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Ofcr	8211	3.0	\$ 3,056	3,669	\$ 238,377	\$ 286,167
Parking Control Officer	8214	10.0	\$ 2,754	3,306	\$ 716,047	\$ 859,600
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	3.0	\$ 3,291	3,951	\$ 256,685	\$ 308,145
Public SafetyComm Supv	8239	1.0	\$ 4,604	5,526	\$ 119,692	\$ 143,688
Manager I	0922	16.0	\$ 5,179	6,218	\$ 2,154,564	\$ 2,586,512
Manager II	0923	4.0	\$ 5,560	6,674	\$ 578,222	\$ 694,144
Manager III	0931	1.0	\$ 5,996	7,198	\$ 155,888	\$ 187,141
Manager IV	0932	7.0	\$ 6,435	7,725	\$ 1,171,168	\$ 1,405,964
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$ 6,942	8,333	\$ 180,482	\$ 216,665
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	\$ 7,452	8,946	\$ 193,743	\$ 232,585
Deputy Director IV	0954	2.0	\$ 8,480	10,181	\$ 440,983	\$ 529,392
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	\$ 9,030	10,841	\$ 234,785	\$ 281,855
0	0		\$ -	0	\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 359,857	\$ 432,001
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 272,291	\$ 326,881
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 340,364	\$ 408,601
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 359,857	\$ 432,001
Total FTE			261.7			
			Total Salary Costs-->		\$ 23,217,308	\$ 27,871,918
			Total of Other Compensation-->		\$ 1,332,369	\$ 1,599,483

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1062	\$ 47,045				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1071	\$ 74,879				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1218	\$ 49,772				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1222	\$ 42,540				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1244	\$ 53,747				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1246	\$ 60,579				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1406	\$ 39,873				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1408	\$ 41,919				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1446	\$ 39,873				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1454	\$ 46,219				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1654	\$ 51,181				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1936	\$ 38,206				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1956	\$ 52,030				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1958	\$ 61,485				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2708	\$ 35,980				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2718	\$ 40,045				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 6281	\$ 58,420				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7203	\$ 55,556				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7205	\$ 56,268				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7242	\$ 50,948				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7333	\$ 47,513				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7334	\$ 49,000				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7335	\$ 52,314				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7344	\$ 49,477				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7345	\$ 54,368				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7346	\$ 45,627				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7347	\$ 54,862				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202	\$ 38,206				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8210	\$ 44,645				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8211	\$ 40,479				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8214	\$ 38,146				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8216	\$ 42,291				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8239	\$ 51,737				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0922	\$ 62,004				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0923	\$ 64,460				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0931	\$ 66,864				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0932	\$ 69,291				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0933	\$ 72,069				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0953	\$ 74,879				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0954	\$ 80,548				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0955	\$ 83,576				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0	\$ -				
<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>	<table border="0"> <tr> <td align="right">Low</td> <td align="right">High</td> </tr> <tr> <td align="right">\$ 10,232,033</td> <td align="right">\$ 11,496,368</td> </tr> </table>	Low	High	\$ 10,232,033	\$ 11,496,368
Low	High				
\$ 10,232,033	\$ 11,496,368				

<b>ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS</b>		
Contractual Services	\$ 7,028,925	\$ 7,028,925
Worker's Compensation	\$ 1,916,722	\$ 1,916,722
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>	\$ 8,945,647	\$ 8,945,647

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 43,727,357	\$ 49,913,416
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 42,877,581	\$ 42,929,673
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 849,776	\$ 6,983,743
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	2%	14%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Carla Short, Acting Director  
Department of Public Works  
City Hall – 1. Dr. Carlton B Goodlett Place, Room 348  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Chief Financial Officer, Department of Public Works

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Devin Macaulay, Budget Manager



Public Works - Yard Operations  
 207990 - DPW Operations and Street Tree Nursery

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202_C	6.5	\$ 2,762	3,316	\$ 466,746	\$ 560,320
Security Guard - As Needed	8202_C	0.11	\$ 2,762	3,316	\$ 7,898.78	\$ 9,482.33
Manager II	0923_C	0.04	\$ 5,560	6,674	\$ 5,782.22	\$ 6,941.44
Total FTE		6.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 480,427.14	\$ 576,743.27
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	38206	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	38206	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923_C	64460	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 229,173.25	\$ 255,120.04

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Uniform Allowance	\$ 4,725	\$ 4,725
Radios	\$ 700	\$ 700
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 5,425	\$ 5,425

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	715,025	837,288
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	408,545	450,086
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 306,480	\$ 387,202
% of Savings to City Cost	43%	46%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Shireen McSpadden, Director  
Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing  
440 Turk Street  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Gigi Whitley, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: HSH Security – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Christine Rolan, Budget Director

Homelessness and Supportive Housing  
HOM ADMIN

Security Services  
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	32.1	\$ 2,762	3,316	\$ 2,305,008	\$ 2,767,116
Security Supervisor	8228	5.4	3,074	3,691	\$ 431,620.28	\$ 518,151.60
Senior Human Resources Analyst	1244	2	4,945	5,937	\$ 257,158.76	\$ 308,714.00
Manager II	0923	0.2	5,560	6,674	\$28,911	\$34,707
Total FTE		39.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 3,022,698	\$ 3,628,689
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,206
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8228 \$ 40,618
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1244 \$ 53,747
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923 64,460
Total Fringe Benefits	Low High \$ 1,404,039.55 \$ 1,566,135.71

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

vehicles (4 vehicles and maintenance)	\$166,400	\$166,400
parking for 4 vehicles	\$9,984	\$9,984
supplies estimates at \$2250 per officer	\$83,250	\$83,250
radios/communication equipment	\$62,400	\$62,400
Total Capital & Operating	\$322,034	\$322,034

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 4,748,772	\$ 5,516,859
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 1,845,833	\$ 2,037,867
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,902,938	\$ 3,478,992
% of Savings to City Cost	61%	63%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Trent Rhorer, Director  
City and County of San Francisco Human Services Agency  
170 Otis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Esperanza Zapien, Contracts Director

RE: HSA Security – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Celia Pedroza, Budget Director

Human Services Agency  
 Site Security

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202_C	68.4	\$ 2,762	3,316	4,914,590	5,899,868
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205_C	4.0	\$ 4,122	4,948	428,685	514,628
Manager I	0922_C	1.0	\$ 5,179	6,218	134,660	161,657
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a	3,983	4,782	103,568	124,331
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		73.4				
Total Salary Costs-->					5,477,935	6,576,153
Total of Other Compensation-->					103,568	124,331

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	\$ 38,206	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205_C	\$ 45,540	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922_C	\$ 62,004	
Total Fringe Benefits			Low High 2,565,553 2,859,042

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the service.	-	-
Uniform	44,065	44,065
Radios (\$200 per staff)	14,688	14,688
Metal detecting wands	600	600
Total Capital & Operating	59,353	59,353

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	8,206,410	9,618,879
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	4,353,970	4,358,304
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>3,852,440</u>	<u>5,260,576</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	47%	55%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Paul Miyamoto, Sheriff  
San Francisco Sheriff's Department  
City Hall – 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 456  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Katherine Johnson, Undersheriff

RE: Contracting for Food Service at County Jails – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Mylan Luong, Sheriff's Department Fiscal Officer

**06 - Sheriff  
Jail Food Services**

**COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Food Service Manager Administrator	2620	1.0	\$ 4,056	\$ 4,870	\$ 105,466	\$ 126,610	
Senior Food Service Supervisor	2619	4.0	\$ 3,059	\$ 3,672	\$ 318,106	\$ 381,880	
Food Service Supervisor	2618	3.0	\$ 2,772	\$ 3,328	\$ 216,228	\$ 259,578	
Cook	2654	9.0	\$ 2,871	\$ 3,446	\$ 671,709	\$ 806,373	
Assistant Cook	2650	2.0	\$ 2,304	\$ 2,765	\$ 119,782	\$ 143,796	
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	0.1	\$ 4,463	\$ 5,358	\$ 11,604	\$ 13,930	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 31,976	\$ 38,386	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 28,523	\$ 34,242	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE		19.1					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 1,442,895	\$ 1,732,167
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 60,499	\$ 72,628

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2620	\$ 54,256	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2619	\$ 40,499	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2618	\$ 38,287	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2654	\$ 40,112	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2650	\$ 35,734	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823	\$ 51,179	
Total Fringe Benefits			\$ 688,178.35
			\$ 768,706.90

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 2,191,572	\$ 2,573,502
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 1,454,052	\$ 1,456,983
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 737,520	\$ 1,116,519
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	34%	43%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

John Arntz, Director  
Department of Elections  
City Hall – 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 48  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Nataliya Kuzina, Deputy Director

RE: Assembly of Vote by Mail Envelope Services – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Mayank Patel, Budget Manager



080-Department of Elections  
 Assembly and mailing of vote-by-mail ballot packets for FY24  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2023-24**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Junior Clerk	1,402	21	2,174	2,610	1,187,023	1,424,997
Chief Clerk	1,410	0	3,717	4,462	9,665	11,602
Junior Management Assistant	1,840	0	3,105	3,728	8,074	9,692
Total FTE		21				
Total Salary Costs-->					1,204,761	1,446,292
Total of Other Compensation-->					-	-

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,402	33,665	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,410	45,584	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,840	40,859	
Total Fringe Benefits		649,209	715,609

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	1,853,970	2,161,901
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	240,852	298,701
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	1,613,117	1,863,200
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	87%	86%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2023

Eric Shaw, Director  
Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development  
One South Van Ness Ave, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Benjamin McCloskey, Director of Finance and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Andrea Gremer, Finance Director, Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development

Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development  
232065

Insert name of the contract's main purpose here  
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202.00	18.0	\$ 2,762	3,316	1,292,528	1,551,654
Institutional Police Officer	8204.00	2.0	\$ 3,220	3,866	167,443	201,012
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			38,776	46,550
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			90,477	108,616
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		20.0				
Total Salary Costs--->					1,498,747	1,752,666
Total of Other Compensation--->					129,253	155,165

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 38,206		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8204 41,745		
Total Fringe Benefits		692,508	771,198

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Parking for 3 vehicles	7,500	7,500
Supplies estimates at \$800 per officer	16,000	16,000
Radios/ communication equipment	4,000	4,000
	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	27,500	27,500

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	2,348,007	2,706,529
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	1,572,055	1,619,902
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	775,953	1,086,627
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	33%	40%



DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH  
 240642 HPC Primary Care  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Deputy Sheriff	8304	4.2	\$ 3,392	\$ 5,218	\$ 370,406	\$ 569,776
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ -	\$ -
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ -	\$ -
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ -	\$ -
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ -	\$ -
Total FTE		4.2			\$ 370,406	\$ 569,776
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 370,406	\$ 569,776
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8304 \$ 97,679		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0 \$ -		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0 \$ -		
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 288,714	\$ 410,252

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

	\$ -	\$ -
SHF workorder rate includes 35% relief factor on top of budgeted rate with MFB	\$ 230,692	\$ 343,010
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 230,692	\$ 343,010

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 889,812	\$ 1,323,038
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 466,067	\$ 577,882
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 423,745	\$ 745,156
% of Savings to City Cost	48%	56%

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR  
SAN FRANCISCO



RECEIVED  
LONDON N. BREED  
SAN FRANCISCO MAYOR  
2023 MAY 31 9:05 AM  
PH 2:31  
BY *[Signature]*

To: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
From: Anna Duning, Mayor's Budget Director  
Date: June 1, 2023  
Re: Mayor's FY 2023-24 and FY 2024-25 Budget Submission

---

Madam Clerk,

In accordance with City and County of San Francisco Charter, Article IX, Section 9.100, the Mayor's Office hereby submits the Mayor's proposed budget by June 1<sup>st</sup>, corresponding legislation, and related materials for Fiscal Year (FY) 2023-24 and FY 2024-25.

In addition to the Mayor's Proposed FY 2023-24 and FY 2024-25 Budget Book, the following items are included in the Mayor's submission:

- The Annual Appropriation Ordinance and Annual Salary Ordinance, along with Administrative Provisions
- The proposed budget for the Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure for FY 2023-24
- The Airport Annual Salary Ordinance Supplemental for FY 2023-24
- The Port of San Francisco Annual Salary Ordinance Supplemental for FY 2023-24 and Annual Appropriation Ordinance Supplemental for FY 2023-24
- The Public Utilities Commission Capital Budget for FY 2023-24 and Annual Appropriation Ordinance Supplemental for FY 2023-24
- 34 separate pieces of trailing legislation (see list attached)
- A Transfer of Function letter detailing the transfer of positions from one City department to another
- An Interim Exception letter
- A letter addressing funding levels for nonprofit corporations or public entities for the coming two fiscal years
- Memo to the Board President requesting for 30-day rule waivers on ordinances

Please note the following:

- Technical adjustments to the June 1 budget are being prepared, but are not submitted with this set of materials.

Sincerely,

*[Signature]*  
Anna Duning  
Mayor's Budget Director

cc: Members of the Board of Supervisors  
Budget & Legislative Analyst's Office  
Controller

RECEIVED  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
SAN FRANCISCO  
2023 JUN -1 PM 2:34  
BY *[Signature]*

<b>DEPT</b>	<b>Item</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Type of Legislation</b>	<b>File #</b>
ADM	Code Amendment	Amending the Administrative Code to eliminate the Annual Joint Fundraising Drive	Ordinance	230648
ADM	Code Amendment	Amending the Administrative and Environment Codes to reduce reporting burdens, so as to update insurance manuals when requested or necessary, instead of on an annual basis, and eliminating some scheduled reports	Ordinance	230647
ADM	Code Amendment	Amending the Administrative Code relating to Technology Commodities and Services Procurements, to eliminate the Tech Marketplace fee	Ordinance	230649
ADM	Continuing Prop J	City Administrator's Office convention facility management services, Real Estate custodial services, and Fleet and Real Estate security services	Resolution	230672
BOS	Continuing Prop J	Board of Supervisors Budget and Legislative Analyst Services for FY 2023-24	Resolution	230672
CON	Access Line Tax (ALT) Tax Rates	Sets Access Line Tax in line with 2023 Consumer Price Index. Revenues assumed in budget.	Ordinance	230676
CON	Neighborhood Beautification Fund	Neighborhood Beautification and Graffiti Clean-Up Fund Option (now known as the Community Challenge Grant Program)	Ordinance	230668
DBI	Department of Building Inspection Fee Changes	Changing the fee structure for DBI fees that are charged for permitting and inspection	Ordinance	230658
DEC	Early Care and Education Commercial Rents Tax Baseline	Amending the baseline funding requirements for early care and education programs to enable the City to use Early Care and Education Commercial Rents Tax revenues for those programs	Ordinance	230661
DEC	Early Care and Education, Commercial Rents Tax Deductions	Amending the Business and Tax Regulations Code relating to the Early Care and Education Commercial Rents Tax Sublessor Deduction	Ordinance	230660
DEM	EMSA Fee Changes	Updating medical services fees due to annual adjustments for the purposes of funding trauma and pediatric centers. Fees also required for certain additional services.	Ordinance	230659

DPH	Patient Rates	Amending the Health Code to set patient rates and rates for other services provided by the Department of Public Health.	Ordinance	230662
DPH	Recurring State Grants	Accept and expend for annual, recurring state grant funds.	Resolution	230677
DPH	Managed Care Rates	Amending the Health Code to set managed care rates provided by the Department of Public Health.	Ordinance	230650
DPH	Public Health Foundation MOU	MOU between DPH and San Francisco Public Health Foundation to establish roles and responsibilities for purposes of fundraising and capital projects	Resolution	230673
DPH	Hospital Foundation MOU	MOU between DPH and San Francisco General Hospital Foundation to establish roles and responsibilities for purposes of fundraising and capital projects	Resolution	230674
DPH	Mobile Crisis Grant	Grant agreement between DPH and Advocates for Human Potential Inc. for anticipated revenue that support behavioral health mobile crisis and non-mobile crisis services	Resolution	230679
DPH	Continuing Prop J	Department of Public Health Security Services	Resolution	230672
DPW	Continuing Prop J	Department of Public Works Security Services for FY 2023-24	Resolution	230672
ECN	Contract Amendment - MidMarket Foundation	Contract amendment to reflect budgeted funding levels for the Mid-Market Foundation - Mid-Market/Tenderloin Community-Based Safety Program	Resolution	230681
ECN	Contract Amendment – San Francisco Tourism Improvement District Management Corporation	Contract amendment to reflect budgeted funding levels for the San Francisco Tourism Improvement District Management Corporation – Downtown Welcome Ambassador Program	Resolution	230680
ECN	Film Commission Fee Changes	Increase of filming fees for the SF Film Commission	Ordinance	230651
HOM	CAAP Legislation	Annual legislation for CAAP housing, required if appropriations for HSH fund exceed \$11.9 million, including expenditure details and explanation of benefits provided	Resolution	230675
HOM	Continuing Prop J	Homelessness and Supportive Housing security services	Resolution	230672



HSA	Continuing Prop J	Human Services Agency Security Services for FY 2023-24	Resolution	230672
HSH/ DPH	Funding Reallocation - Our City, Our Home Homelessness Gross Receipts Tax	Ordinance reallocating approximately \$60,000,000 in unencumbered revenues from the Our City, Our Home Fund to allow the City to use revenues from the Homelessness Gross Receipts Tax to provide services to prevent homelessness.	Ordinance	230657
LIB	Friends of the Library A&E	Annual Accept & Expend legislation for the SFPL's Friends of the Library Fund	Resolution	230678
MOHCD	Continuing Prop J	Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development security services for undeveloped real property	Resolution	230672
OCII	OCII Interim Budget Resolution	OCII Interim Budget Resolution	Resolution	230670
	Citywide Tax Changes	Gross Receipts Tax Rate Increase Postponement and Credits for Opening City Location	Ordinance (Introduced)	File No. 230155
REG	Continuing Prop J	Department of Elections Envelope Assembly Services for FY 2023-24	Resolution	230672
REG	Ballot Arguments Opt-Out	Legislation for CCSF opt out of arguments on ballots required in AB 1416	Ordinance	230663
SHF	Continuing Prop J	Sheriff's Department County Jails Food Services for FY 2023-24	Resolution	230672
TTX	First Year Free	Continues waiving certain small business first-year permit, license, and business registration fees	Ordinance	230664

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR  
SAN FRANCISCO



LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR

TO: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
FROM: Tom Paulino, Liaison to the Board of Supervisors  
RE: Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services  
Previously Approved  
DATE: June 1, 2023

---

**Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: Budget and Legislative Analyst Services (Board of Supervisors); Fleet Security Services, Real Estate Division Custodial Services, Real Estate Division Security Services, Convention Facilities Management (General Services Agency – Administrative Services); Security Services (Department of Public Works); Security Services (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); Security Services (Human Services Agency); Food Services at County Jails (Sheriff's Department); Assembly of Vote by Mail Services (Department of Elections); Security Services (Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development); and Security Services (Department of Public Health).**

Should you have any questions, please contact Tom Paulino at 415-554-6153.