

Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION
 PARATRANSIT SERVICES
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate (2)		Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	148.0	\$ 1,488	\$ 2,362	\$ 5,747,846	\$ 9,123,934
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$ 1,190	\$ 1,890	\$ 7,177,041	\$ 11,392,587
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629	\$ 3,629	\$ 189,434	\$ 189,434
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,012	\$ 3,012	\$ 943,358	\$ 943,358
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$ 2,009	\$ 2,442	\$ 419,479	\$ 509,890
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 1,918	\$ 2,332	\$ 350,419	\$ 426,056
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	\$ 3,387	\$ 145,429	\$ 176,801
Transit Manager I	9140	4.0	\$ 3,289	\$ 3,998	\$ 343,372	\$ 417,391
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$ 2,110	\$ 2,564	\$ 770,994	\$ 936,886
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0	\$ 1,886	\$ 2,292	\$ 295,348	\$ 358,927
Senior Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0	\$ 2,354	\$ 2,862	\$ 307,197	\$ 373,491

Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					344,467	514,837
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					458,514	682,657
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year)					44,400	44,400
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year)					69,300	69,300
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)					2,000	2,000
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)					7,700	7,700

FY2011-12 Projected Trips	1,106,377					
FY2014-15 Projected Trips	860,213					
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)			(3,919,548)	(5,822,632)
Total Salary Costs		341.3			\$ 13,696,749	\$ 20,347,019

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)					6,820,001	9,892,768
Fixed Fringes (4)					4,070,469	4,070,469
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%	63,436	94,602
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%				(2,437,196)	(3,127,807)
Total Fringe Benefits					8,516,710	10,930,032

Capital and Operating Costs

Estimated Capital Costs	Quantity	Unit cost		
Sedans, 4-door midsize	200	\$ 28,000		5,600,000 5,600,000
Vans, Type A, lift equipped	49	\$ 56,000		2,744,000 2,744,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped	64	\$ 60,000		3,840,000 3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped	25	\$ 45,000		1,125,000 1,125,000
2-way radios	338	\$ 50		16,900 16,900
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%			(2,964,954) (2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned	0	\$ 56,000		0 0
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss	0	\$ 56,000		0 0
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned	(61)	\$ 60,000		(3,660,000) (3,660,000)
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss	61	\$ 60,000		3,660,000 3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned	(6)	\$ 45,000		(270,000) (270,000)
Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss	6	\$ 45,000		270,000 270,000
Total Capital Costs (Straight line depreciation over 4 years)				10,360,946 10,360,946
Total Capital Costs				2,590,237 2,590,237

Estimated Operating Costs				
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon)				1,597,576 1,597,576
Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle)				610,739 610,739
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)				635,192 635,192
Total Operating Costs				2,843,507 2,843,507

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

27,647,202 36,710,794

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(20,524,139) (20,495,569)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 7,123,063 \$ 16,215,224

% of Savings to City Cost

26% 44%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Biweekly salary rates: FY1415 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to related
6. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in

Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION
 PARATRANSIT SERVICES
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate (2)		Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	148.0	\$ 1,488	\$ 2,362	\$ 5,769,869	\$ 9,158,891
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$ 1,190	\$ 1,890	\$ 7,204,539	\$ 11,436,237
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629	\$ 3,629	\$ 190,160	\$ 190,160
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,012	\$ 3,012	\$ 946,973	\$ 946,973
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$ 2,009	\$ 2,442	\$ 421,086	\$ 511,843
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 1,918	\$ 2,332	\$ 351,761	\$ 427,689
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	\$ 3,387	\$ 145,986	\$ 177,479
Transit Manager I	9140	4.0	\$ 3,289	\$ 3,998	\$ 344,687	\$ 418,990
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$ 2,110	\$ 2,564	\$ 773,948	\$ 940,475
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0	\$ 1,886	\$ 2,292	\$ 296,479	\$ 360,302
Senior Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0	\$ 2,354	\$ 2,862	\$ 308,374	\$ 374,922
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					344,467	514,837
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					460,270	685,273
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year)					44,400	44,400
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year)					69,300	69,300
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)					2,000	2,000
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)					7,700	7,700
FY2011-12 Projected Trips	1,106,377					
FY2015-16 Projected Trips	860,213					
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)			(3,934,167)	(5,844,397)
Total Salary Costs		341.3			13,747,833	20,423,075

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)					6,582,813	9,145,113
Fixed Fringes (4)					4,199,157	4,199,157
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%	63,735	95,049
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%				(2,413,121)	(2,990,189)
Total Fringe Benefits					8,432,583	10,449,130

Capital and Operating Costs

Estimated Capital Costs	Quantity	Unit cost		
Sedans, 4-door midsize (200 Count)	200	\$ 28,000	5,600,000	5,600,000
Vans, Type A, lift equipped	49	\$ 56,000	2,744,000	2,744,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped	64	\$ 60,000	3,840,000	3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped	25	\$ 45,000	1,125,000	1,125,000
2-way radios	338	\$ 50	16,900	16,900
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%		(2,964,954)	(2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned	0	\$ 56,000	0	0
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss	0	\$ 56,000	0	0
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned	(61)	\$ 60,000	(3,660,000)	(3,660,000)
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss	61	\$ 60,000	3,660,000	3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned	(6)	\$ 45,000	(270,000)	(270,000)
Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss	6	\$ 45,000	270,000	270,000
Total Capital Costs (Straight line depreciation over 4 years)			2,590,237	2,590,237
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)				
Estimated Operating Costs				
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon)			1,597,576	1,597,576
Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = 3%			629,061	629,061
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)			637,185	897,519
Total Operating Costs			2,863,822	3,124,156

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

27,634,475 36,586,598

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(21,144,601) (21,116,844)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 6,489,874 \$ 15,469,753

% of Savings to City Cost

23% 42%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Biweekly salary rates: FY1415 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to
6. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in this estimate.
7. Assumed 3% CPI adjustment for FY1516 automotive parts.