**BOARD of SUPERVISORS** 



City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco 94102-4689 Tel. No. (415) 554-5184 Fax No. (415) 554-5163 TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

### MEMORANDUM

Date: October 16, 2024
To: Planning Department/Planning Commission
From: John Carroll, Assistant Clerk, Land Use and Transportation Committee
Subject: Board of Supervisors Legislation Referral - File No. 240982 Building, Administrative, Public Works Codes - Disability Access Improvements for Places of Public Accommodation

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Determination (California Public Resources Code, Sections 21000 et seq.)

- Ordinance / Resolution
- □ Ballot Measure
- □ Amendment to the Planning Code, including the following Findings: (*Planning Code, Section 302(b): 90 days for Planning Commission review*)
   □ General Plan □ Planning Code, Section 101.1 □ Planning Code, Section 302
- Amendment to the Administrative Code, involving Land Use/Planning (Board Rule 3.23: 30 days for possible Planning Department review)
- □ General Plan Referral for Non-Planning Code Amendments (*Charter, Section 4.105, and Administrative Code, Section 2.A.53*) (Required for legislation concerning the acquisition, vacation, sale, or change in use of City property; subdivision of land; construction, improvement, extension, widening, narrowing, removal, or relocation of public ways, transportation routes, ground, open space, buildings, or structures; plans for public housing and publicly-assisted private housing; redevelopment plans; development agreements; the annual capital expenditure plan and six-year capital improvement program; and any capital improvement project or long-term financing proposal such as general obligation or revenue bonds.)
- Historic Preservation Commission
  - Landmark (Planning Code, Section 1004.3)
  - Cultural Districts (Charter, Section 4.135 & Board Rule 3.23)
  - Mills Act Contract (Government Code, Section 50280)
  - Designation for Significant/Contributory Buildings (*Planning Code, Article 11*)

Please send the Planning Department/Commission recommendation/determination to John Carroll at john.carroll@sfgov.org.

1	[Building, Administrative, Public Works Codes - Disability Access Improvements for Places of Public Accommodation]
2	Ordinance amending the Building, Administrative, and Public Works Codes to remove
3	the local requirement for existing buildings with a place of public accommodation to
4	have all primary entries and paths of travel into the building accessible to persons with
5	disabilities or to receive a City determination of equivalent facilitation, technical
6	infeasibility, or unreasonable hardship; and affirming the Planning Department's
7	determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.
8 9	NOTE: <b>Unchanged Code text and uncodified text</b> are in plain Arial font. Additions to Codes are in <u>single-underline italics Times New Roman font</u> .
10	Deletions to Codes are in <i>strikethrough italics Times New Roman font</i> . Board amendment additions are in <u>double-undel Arial font</u> .
11	Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font. Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Code
12	subsections or parts of tables.
13	Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:
14	De it ordanied by the recipie of the only and county of oar realised.
15 16	Section 1. Findings.
17	(a) Pursuant to Charter Section 4.121 and Building Code Section 104A.2.11.1.1, the
18	Building Inspection Commission considered this ordinance at a duly noticed public hearing
19	held on, 2024.
20	(b) Chapter 11D of the Building Code currently requires the owner of an existing
21	building with a place of public accommodation to have the building inspected for compliance
22	with accessible entry and path of travel requirements. If the building is not in compliance, the
22	owner must either bring the building into compliance or obtain a finding from the City of
23	equivalent facilitation, technical infeasibility, or unreasonable hardship. All mandated work
24	must be completed within the time periods specified in the Building Code for building permits
20	unless an extension of time is granted.

(c) Property owners are responsible for compliance with Code requirements, but
 leases may shift some or all of the burden of compliance onto tenants. Many of the buildings
 subject to the Chapter 11D requirements have multiple leased spaces, many of which are
 operated by small businesses without substantial financial resources.

5 (d) The requirements of Chapter 11D were designed to bring a broader set of property 6 and business owners into compliance with the accessibility standards of the California 7 Building Code and, to the greatest extent feasible, the federal Americans with Disabilities Act. 8 As a result, as of October 2024, over 16,500 businesses in San Francisco are compliant with 9 program accessibility requirements (including waived and exempted businesses) and another 10 1,190 businesses have applied for a permit to bring the properties into compliance with 11 Chapter 11D. With a compliance rate of 75% of businesses, the City intends to pivot its focus 12 and limited resources to facilitate compliance with State and Federal accessibility standards 13 by providing financial support and robust education and outreach.

(e) No local findings are required for this ordinance under California Health and Safety
Code Section 17958.7 because the amendments to the Building Code contained in this
ordinance do not regulate materials or manner of construction or repair, and instead relate in
their entirety to administrative procedures for implementing the code, which are expressly
excluded from the definition of a "building standard" by California Health and Safety Code
Section 18909(c).

(f) The Planning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this
ordinance comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources
Code Sections 21000 *et seq.*). Said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of
Supervisors in File No. \_\_\_\_ and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board affirms this
determination.

25

Section 2. Chapters 1A and 11D of the Building Code are hereby amended by (1)
 revising Sections 105A.3 (Section 105A.3.3 specifically), 1101D, and 1102D; (2) deleting
 existing Section 1103D and adding new Section 1103D; (3) deleting existing Sections 1104D,
 1105D, 1106D, 1107D, 1108D, 1109D, 1110D, and 1111D; and (4) renumbering existing
 Sections 1112D, 1113D, and 1114D as new Sections 1104D, 1105D, and 1106D respectively,
 and revising said Sections, to read as follows:

- 7
- 8

#### 105A.3 Access Appeals Commission.

9 **105A.3.1 Establishment; composition; purpose.** Pursuant to the provisions of 10 Section 19957.5 of the Health and Safety Code of the State of California, there is hereby 11 established an Appeals Board to be known as the Access Appeals Commission composed of 12 five members to hear written appeals brought by any person regarding action taken by the 13 Department in the enforcement of the requirements of Part 5.5 (commencing with Section 14 19955), Division 13 of the Health and Safety Code of the State of California, including the 15 exceptions contained in Section 19957 thereof, as well as action taken by the Department in 16 the enforcement of the disabled access and adaptability provisions of this code.

17

18 105A.3.3 Powers and duties; finality. The Access Appeals Commission shall conduct 19 hearings on written appeals made under Section 105A.3.4 hereof. In hearing such appeals, 20 the Access Appeals Commission may approve or disapprove the Department's interpretations 21 of Part 5.5, Division 13 of the Health and Safety Code of the State of California and of the 22 disability access and adaptability requirements of this code and actions taken by the 23 Department to enforce said requirements and abate violations. The Commission shall also 24 make determinations on equivalent facilitation, technical infeasibility, unreasonable hardship, 25 and extensions of time. , and such other matters as Chapter 11D Mandatory Accessibility

1	Improvements for Buildings with a Place of Public Accommodation may require or authorize. All such
2	approvals or disapprovals shall be final and conclusive as to the Department, in the absence
3	of fraud or prejudicial abuse of discretion. See Section 110A, Table 1A-K – Penalties,
4	Hearings, Code Enforcement Assessments – for applicable fee.
5	* * * *
6	Chapter 11D
7	MANDATORY ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS FOR BUILDINGS WITH A PLACE
8	OF PUBLIC ACCOMMODATION
9	SECTION 1101D – SCOPE
10	Any building or portion of a building with a Place of Public Accommodation subject to
11	the requirements of Chapter 11B of this Code is within the scope of this Chapter.
12	Exception: A building that was constructed under a building or site permit application
13	filed on or after January 1, 2002.
14	A building constructed under the Building Code in effect on or after January 1, 2002 is
15	presumed to be accessible to persons with disabilities and will be exempt from this Chapter
16	11D-upon receipt by the Department of a written notice of exemption from the Owner or the Owner's
17	authorized agent that provides a construction permit application number dated on or after January 1,
18	2002 and contact information for the Owner and/or Owner's authorized agent.
19	1101D.1. Compliance with Federal or State Laws. Nothing in this Chapter 11D is
20	intended to relieve the Owner or the operator of a Place of Public Accommodation of their
21	obligation to comply with the requirements of any Federal or State law, including but not
22	limited to the Americans with Disabilities Act, or to modify or extend the time for compliance
23	with any such law.
24	
25	

1	1101D.2. Contractual Obligations. Nothing in this Chapter 11D is intended to
2	interfere with any contractual obligations between the Owner of a building within the scope of
3	this Chapter and any lessee of space within the building.
4	
5	SECTION 1102D – DEFINITIONS
6	For the purposes of this Chapter 11D, the following definitions shall apply:
7	"Accessible Entrance Route." An identifiable path of travel by means of which a Primary Entry
8	may be approached, entered and exited, and which connects the Primary Entry with an exterior
9	approach (including any adjacent sidewalks, streets and parking areas).
10	"Building Official." The Director of the Department or the Director's designee.
11	"California Construction-Related Accessibility Standards Compliance Act." Sections 55.51
12	through 55.53 of the California Civil Code as amended from time to time.
13	"California Historical Building Code." Part 8 of Title 24, California Code of Regulations.
14	"CASp Inspector." A person who has been certified by the State of California as a
15	certified access specialist authorized to inspect a Place of Public Accommodation for
16	compliance with construction-related accessibility standards.
17	"Checklist for Alterations to Commercial Store-front for Accessibility." A Checklist developed
18	by or with the input of City departments or agencies with review authority over the subject buildings.
19	"Department." The Department of Building Inspection.
20	"Design Professional." A "Registered Design Professional" as defined in Chapter 2 of the
21	Building Code.
22	"Disability Access Compliance Unit" or "Compliance Unit." The Unit within the
23	Department established under Section 11 <u>04</u> +2D of this Chapter.
24	"Equivalent Facilitation." As defined in Chapter 2 of the Building Code.
25	

1	<i>"Historic Resource." A building designated pursuant to Articles 10 and 11 of the Planning</i>
2	Code, listed on or determined eligible for listing on the California Register of Historic Resources or the
3	National Register of Historic Places, or that is a 'qualified historical building' as defined in the
4	California Historical Building Code.
5	"Inspector." A CASp Inspector or a Design Professional approved by the Building Official as
6	qualified to evaluate compliance with disability access requirements.
7	"Owner." The owner of a building within the scope of this Chapter 11D.
8	"Place of Public Accommodation." As defined in Chapter 2 of the Building Code and 42
9	USC Section 12181(7) of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, as amended from time
10	to time.
11	"Primary Entry." As defined in Chapter 2 of this Code, the principal entrance through which
12	most people enter the building, as designated by the Building Official. If there are multiple commercial
13	tenants or spaces, a building may have multiple Primary Entries.
14	"Technically Infeasible." As defined in Chapter 2 of the Building Code.
15	"Technical Infeasibility." A Code requirement is Technically Infeasible.
16	"Unreasonable Hardship." As defined in Chapter 2 of the Building Code. If the Building
17	Official, or the Access Appeals Commission in any unreasonable hardship determination made under
18	Section 1105D, determines that any of the factors that the Building Code requires to be considered in
19	evaluating an Unreasonable Hardship request are not applicable because the required scope of work is
20	limited to the disability access improvements mandated by this Chapter 11D, the Building Official or
21	Access Appeals Commission may supplement the criteria by considering any applicable factor for
22	determining what is an Undue Hardship or is Readily Achievable in Title III of the Americans with
23	Disabilities Act (42 USC Sections 12181 - 12189) and its implementing regulations.
24	SECTION 1103D - COMPLIANCE CATEGORIES

1	The Department shall assign each building within the scope of this Chapter 11D to one of the
2	following four categories. If a building does not clearly fall within one of these categories, the Building
3	Official shall assign it to the category he or she determines is the most appropriate. The Building
4	Official's decision is appealable to the Building Inspection Commission pursuant to Section 77.3(b) of
5	the Administrative Code.
6	Category One: The Primary Entry or Entries and the Accessible Entrance Route(s) comply with
7	Code requirements. A building qualifies under Category One if any of the following descriptions
8	applies:
9	(a) A building or portion thereof was constructed or altered under a permit application filed
10	prior to July 1, 1992 and all Primary Entries and Accessible Entrance Routes are in compliance with
11	the requirements of the 1998 California Building Code.
12	(b) A building or portion thereof was constructed or altered under a permit application filed
13	on or after July 1, 1992, and prior to January 1, 2002, all Primary Entries and Accessible Entrance
14	Routes are in compliance with the requirements of the 1998 California Building Code or a later
15	Building Code in effect at the time of any permit application for a tenant improvement or other
16	alteration, and the Department gave final approval of the accessible entry work under the construction
17	permit or any alteration permits.
18	(c) A building is eligible to use the California Historical Building Code, a permit application
19	was filed on or after January 1, 1995, all Primary Entries and Accessible Entrance Routes are in
20	compliance with the California Historical Building Code in effect at the time of the permit application,
21	and the Department gave final approval of the accessible entry work under the construction permit or
22	any alteration permits.
23	(d) A building is within the scope of Chapter 4D of the Existing Building Code, which
24	mandates earthquake retrofit of certain existing Wood-Frame Buildings, and the Owner elected
25	

1	pursuant to Section 1107D to comply with the requirements of this Chapter prior to the compliance
2	deadlines in Table 1107D.
3	(e) A building or portion thereof was altered, or is proposed to be altered, under a permit
4	application filed on or after the effective date of this Chapter 11D and the Owner elected pursuant to
5	Section 1107D to comply with the requirements of this Chapter prior to the compliance deadlines in
6	<i>Table 1107D</i> .
7	Category Two: There are no steps to the Primary Entry or Entries and one or more elements of
8	the Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) do not comply with Code
9	requirements. A building qualifies under Category Two if any of the following descriptions applies:
10	(a) A building or portion thereof was constructed or altered under a permit application filed
11	prior to July 1, 1992, the building has a Primary Entry or Entries with no steps, and one or more
12	elements of the Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) are not in compliance
13	with the requirements of the 1998 California Building Code.
14	(b) A building or portion thereof was constructed or altered on or after July 1, 1992 and prior
15	to January 1, 2002, the building has a Primary Entry or Entries with no steps, and one or more
16	elements of the Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) are not in compliance
17	with the requirements of the 1998 California Building Code or a later Building Code in effect at the
18	time of any permit application for a tenant improvement or other alteration, or the Department did not
19	give final approval of the accessible entry work under the construction permit or any alteration permit.
20	(c) A building is eligible to use the California Historical Building Code, a permit application
21	was filed on or after January 1, 1995, the Primary Entry or Entries has no steps, and one or more
22	elements of the Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) are not in compliance
23	with the California Historical Building Code in effect at the time of permit application, or the
24	Department did not give final approval of the accessible entry work under a construction permit or any
25	alteration permit.

1	Category Three: There is one step to the Primary Entry or Entries and one or more elements of
2	the Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) do not comply with Code
3	requirements. A building qualifies under Category Three if the building or portion thereof was
4	constructed or altered under a permit application filed prior to July 1, 1992, the Department gave final
5	approval of the work under the permit, the building has a Primary Entry or Entries with one step and
6	one or more elements of the Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) are not in
7	compliance with the requirements of the 1998 California Building Code.
8	Category Four: The building has a Primary Entry or Entries with more than one step and one
9	or more elements of the Primary Entry or Entries and/or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) do not
10	comply with minimum Code requirements. A building qualifies under Category Four if the building or
11	portion thereof was constructed or altered under a permit application filed prior to July 1, 1992, the
12	building has a Primary Entry or Entries with more than one step, and one or more elements of the
13	Primary Entry or Entries or the Accessible Entrance Route(s) are not in compliance with the
14	requirements of the 1998 California Building Code, or the Department did not give final approval of
15	the accessible entry work under the construction permit.
16	<u>SECTION 1103D – DEPARTMENT COORDINATION</u>
17	The Department shall coordinate with the Planning Department, the Department of Public
18	Works, Mayor's Office on Disability, and other appropriate City departments and offices to do the
19	following:
20	(a) Provide information to project applicants who own or operate a Place of Public
21	Accommodation regarding the obligations of property owners, managers, and business tenants
22	regarding compliance with disability access requirements under the California Building Code and the
23	Americans with Disabilities Act, upon submittal of a project application; and
24	
25	

1

2

3

(b) Develop and distribute outreach tools, such as brochures and technical information sheets, to assist project applicants who own or operate a Place of Public Accommodation in understanding said requirements.

4

5

#### SECTION 1104D – INSPECTION AND SUBMISSION OF PRIMARY ENTRY

6 COMPLIANCE CHECKLIST

7 **1104D.1.** Category One Buildings. The Owner of a building classified in Section 1103D as 8 Category One shall obtain an inspection of the elements on the Department's Category One Primary 9 *Entry Compliance Checklist by an Inspector. On or before the time for compliance specified in Section* 10 1107D, the Owner shall submit to the Department's Disability Access Compliance Unit a copy of the 11 Checklist completed and signed by the person who performed the inspection and including his or her 12 business contact information and a professional stamp, CASp number, or California State License 13 Bureau contractor's license number, whichever is applicable. 14 If any elements on the Checklist are found by the Inspector or licensed general contractor to be 15 not in compliance with the standards for accessible entries set forth in the applicable California 16 Building Code or California Historical Building Code, or the Department did not give final approval of 17 the accessible entry work, the noncomplying elements shall be clearly specified in detail, the building 18 shall be reassigned by the Building Official to the appropriate Category, and the Owner shall comply 19 with all requirements of that Category. The Building Official's decision is appealable to the Building

20 *Inspection Commission pursuant to Section 77.3(b) of the Administrative Code.* 

*Exception:* For Category One subcategories (d) and (e), the Building Official may waive the
 requirement for an inspection and submittal of the Checklist if the Building Official determines that an
 *inspection or documents submitted under other permit applications are the equivalent of the inspection*

24 *and Checklist submittal requirements of this Chapter 11D.* 

25

1	1104D.2. Category Two Buildings. The Owner of a building classified in Section 1103D as
2	Category Two shall obtain an inspection of the elements on the Department's Category Two Primary
3	Entry Compliance Checklist by an Inspector. On or before the time for compliance specified in Section
4	1107D , the Owner shall submit to the Department's Disability Access Compliance Unit a copy of the
5	Checklist completed and signed by the person who performed the inspection and including his or her
6	business contact information and a professional stamp or CASp number.
7	Each element on the Checklist found by the Inspector to be not in compliance with the
8	applicable standards for accessible entries set forth in the applicable Building Code or California
9	Historical Building Code, including a failure to obtain final Department approval of the accessible
10	entry work, shall be specified in detail and one of the following four options selected by the Owner as
11	the method by which the Owner will address the Code deficiency within the time specified for
12	compliance in Section 1107D:
13	(a) Option 1. The Owner shall submit to the Disability Access Compliance Unit:
14	(1) Plans showing how the non-complying element or elements will be brought into full
15	compliance with the applicable standards for accessible entries set forth in either the California
16	Building Code or the California Historical Building Code, and
17	(2) If the Owner elects to use the California Historical Building Code, documentation
18	showing that the building is qualified to use the California Historical Building Code.
19	-The Owner must subsequently apply for and obtain a building permit to do the required
20	work within the time specified for compliance in Section 1107D.
21	(b) Option 2. The Owner shall submit to the Disability Access Compliance Unit:
22	(1) Plans, drawings, or other documentation required by the Compliance Unit
23	demonstrating that bringing the non-complying element or elements into full compliance with the
24	applicable Code standards for accessible entries is Technically Infeasible, and
25	

1	(2) Plans, drawings, a written explanation, or other documentation required by the
2	Compliance Unit showing what Equivalent Facilitation will be provided.
3	The Owner must subsequently apply for and obtain a building permit to do the work
4	required within the time specified for compliance in Section 1107D.
5	(c) Option 3. The Owner shall submit to the Disability Access Compliance Unit a Request for
6	Approval of an Unreasonable Hardship form together with plans, drawings, a written explanation, or
7	other documentation required by the Compliance Unit showing what Equivalent Facilitation will be
8	provided. The Compliance Unit will review the request and either approve or deny it, and then forward
9	the request and equivalency submittal information to the Access Appeals Commission for a hearing
10	pursuant to Section 1110D and Section 105A.3.3 of this Code.
11	The Owner must subsequently apply for and obtain a building permit to do the work required
12	within the time specified for compliance in Section 1107D.
13	(d) Option 4. The Owner shall submit to the Disability Access Compliance Unit a statement of
14	intent to request a hearing by the Access Appeals Commission to review the matter pursuant to Section
15	1110D and Section 105A.3.3 of this Code.
16	The request for a hearing by the Access Appeals Commission shall be submitted pursuant to the
17	procedures of Section 105A.3 of this Code and in sufficient time to obtain a decision prior to the other
18	compliance timelines in Table 1107D.
19	1104D.3. Category Three Buildings. The Owner of a building classified in Section 1103D as
20	Category Three shall obtain an inspection of the elements on the Department's Category Three
21	Primary Entry Compliance Checklist by an Inspector (as defined in Section 1102D). On or before the
22	time for compliance specified in Section 1107D, the Owner shall submit to the Department's Disability
23	Access Compliance Unit a copy of the Checklist completed and signed by the person who performed the
24	inspection and including his or her business contact information and a professional stamp or CASp
25	number.

1	Each element on the Checklist found by the Inspector to be not in compliance with the
2	applicable standards for accessible entries set forth in the applicable California Building Code or
3	California Historical Building Code shall be specified in detail and one of the options set forth in
4	Section 1104D.2 (a) through (d) selected by the Owner as the method by which the Owner will address
5	the Code deficiency within the time specified for compliance in Section 1107D.
6	1104D.4. Category Four Buildings. The Owner of a building classified in Section 1103D as
7	Category Four shall obtain an inspection of the elements on the Department's Category Four Primary
8	Entry Compliance Checklist by an Inspector. On or before the time for compliance specified in Section
9	1107D , the Owner shall submit to the Department's Disability Access Compliance Unit a copy of the
10	Checklist completed and signed by the person who performed the inspection and including his or her
11	business contact information and a professional stamp or CASp number.
12	Each element on the Checklist found by the Inspector to be not in compliance with the
13	applicable standards for accessible entries set forth in the applicable California Building Code or
14	California Historical Building Code shall be specified in detail and one of the options set forth in
15	Section 1104D.2(a) through (d) selected by the Owner as the method by which the Owner will address
16	the Code deficiency within the time specified for compliance in Section 1107D.
17	
18	SECTION 1105D - EQUIVALENT FACILITATION; TECHNICAL INFEASIBILITY, OR
19	UNREASONABLE HARDSHIP
20	1105D.1. Equivalent Facilitation. The Department shall develop an Approved Barrier Removal
21	Standard in consultation with the Access Appeals Commission, the Planning Department, and the
22	Department of Public Works. The Disability Access Compliance Unit shall maintain the Approved
23	Barrier Removal Standard and review any proposal for Equivalent Facilitation under this Chapter 11D
24	for compliance with that Standard. Any proposal for Equivalent Facilitation that does not comply with
25	the Approved Barrier Removal Standard must be approved by the Access Appeals Commission.

*1 1105D.2. Technically Infeasible.* A request for a finding that compliance is Technically
 *2 Infeasible can be based upon either a structural or a non-structural condition.*

- 3 (a) Structural Technical Infeasibility. A structural Technical Infeasibility is an existing
   4 condition of the building where full compliance would require the removal or alteration of a load-
- 5 *bearing structural element that is an essential part of the structural frame.*
- 6 (b) Non-structural Technical Infeasibility. A non-structural Technical Infeasibility may 7 include conditions where full compliance would require encroaching into the required egress width, 8 interfering with pedestrian use of the sidewalk or a permanent easement, and similar conditions that do 9 not impact the structural elements or frame. The Disability Access Compliance Unit shall compile a list of non-structural conditions that the Department would accept as supporting a request for a finding of 10 11 Technical Infeasibility and provide other written guidance, and may require that a request based on a 12 non-structural condition be ratified by the Access Appeals Commission pursuant to Section 105A.3.3 of 13 this Code.
- 14 *1105D.2.1. Acceptance of previously-granted determinations of Technical Infeasibility.* Under
   15 *the California Building Code, all findings of Technical Infeasibility must be documented by the*
- 16 *Department and can only be made on a case-by-case basis. The Department will accept and record a*
- 17 *previously-approved finding of Technical Infeasibility for a building within the scope of this Chapter*
- 18 *11D if: (1) the finding of Technical Infeasibility was approved by the Department and can be*
- 19 *documented, (2) the finding of Technical Infeasibility is applicable to the elements covered by this*
- 20 *Chapter 11D, and (3) an Inspector has submitted written documentation acceptable to the Department*
- 21 *that all conditions and requirements of the Technical Infeasibility are unchanged and remain*
- 22 *applicable*.

# 23 *1105D.3. Unreasonable Hardship.* The Compliance Unit, in consultation with the Access 24 Appeals Commission, shall develop and publish guidelines specifying the conditions under which an 25 Unreasonable Hardship would be approved by the Department. All Unreasonable Hardships must be

1	ratified by the Access Appeals Commission pursuant to Section 11B-202.4, Exception 8, and Section
2	1.9.1.5 of the California Building Code.
3	
4	SECTION 1106D - BUILDING PERMIT REQUIRED; INSPECTION AND
5	COMPLETION OF WORK; VALUATION APPLIED TO FUTURE PROJECTS; NOTICE TO
6	TENANT(S)
7	1106D.1. Building Permit Required. A building permit is required to make any and all
8	modifications to a building either mandated or authorized by this Chapter 11D. All work required by
9	this Chapter 11D shall be considered by the Department to be barrier removal and no additional path
10	of travel upgrade shall be required. Only those elements that are actually altered will be required to
11	comply with the current requirements of this Code.
12	If a permit is required to remediate the entryway or the sidewalk, the Owner shall provide
13	written notice to the business tenant or tenants of the building a minimum of 30 days prior to filing the
14	permit application with the Department.
15	1106D.1.1. Historic Resources.
16	(a) For a building considered to be a Historic Resource, the plans submitted with the building
17	permit application shall be prepared in conjunction with a Design Professional and in compliance with
18	the California Historical Building Code, requirements of the San Francisco Planning Department, and
19	guidelines developed and published by the Compliance Unit.
20	(b) As required by Articles 10 and 11 of the Planning Code, a permit application for a Historic
21	Resource designated pursuant to Article 10 or 11 of the Planning Code must be approved by the
22	Historic Preservation Commission unless delegated for review and approval without a hearing to
23	Planning Department staff.
24	1106D.2. Alteration Work That May Be Included in the Permit Application. The only work
25	that may be included in the permit required by Section 1106D.1 is: (a) the work to a Primary Entry or

1

Accessible Entrance Route mandated by Section 1104D or (b) any voluntary disability access

2

*improvements authorized by Section 1109D.* 

3 1106D.3. Inspection of Work. All work completed by permit under Option 1 of Section 1104D .2 for Category Two, Category Three, and Category Four buildings shall be inspected by the 4 5 Department's field inspector that is assigned to that district. If the work complies with requirements of 6 this Chapter 11D, the inspector shall issue to the Owner a Certificate of Final Completion stipulating 7 that the work complies with the requirements and shall provide a copy of the Certificate of Final 8 Completion to the Disability Access Compliance Unit. Upon request, the Owner may obtain a final 9 inspection and approval by a Department inspector who is certified as a CASp Inspector; the 10 inspection fee set forth in Table IA-D of Section 110A of this Code shall apply. 11 All work completed by permit under Options 3 and 4 of Section 1104D .2 for Category Two, 12 Category Three, and Category Four buildings shall be inspected by a Department CASp Inspector. If 13 the work complies with requirements of this Chapter 11D, the inspector shall issue to the Owner a 14 Certificate of Final Completion stipulating that the work complies with the requirements of this 15 Chapter and shall list his or her CASp number where applicable on both the Certificate of Final 16 Completion and the completed job card. 17 1106D.4. Completion of Work; Certificate of Final Completion. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Code, all work mandated by this Chapter 11D must be completed within the time 18 19 periods specified in Section 106A.4.4 of this Code for Permit Expiration unless an extension of time is granted pursuant to Section 1108D. Any Certificate issued by the Department upon final completion of 20 the work required by this Chapter 11D shall state that compliance is with Chapter 11D of this Code 21 22 and not with the requirements of either the Americans with Disability Act or the California Building 23 Code. 24 **1106D.5.** Valuation Applied to Future Projects. As authorized by the Building Code, the 25 valuation of both the mandatory and the voluntary disability access improvements performed under this

1	Chapter 11D may be used to comply with path of travel upgrade requirements in Building Code Section
2	11B-202.4 Exception #8 of this Code for any future project within the same building of portion of a
3	building for a period of time not to exceed four years from the completion date of the work; provided,
4	however, that only the valuation of the work described in 1106D.2(a) or (b) shall be allowed for this
5	purpose. In order to use the valuation of voluntary disability improvements for this purpose, the Owner
6	must follow the recommended order of priority for making accessibility improvements set forth in
7	Section 11B-202.4 of this Code.
8	
9	SECTION 1107D - COMPLIANCE SCHEDULE; OPTION TO COMPLY WITH
10	CURRENT CODE REQUIREMENTS
10	COMPLITE CODE REQUIREMENTS
11	<i>— The times for compliance with the requirements of this Chapter 11D are set forth in the</i>
-	~
11	- The times for compliance with the requirements of this Chapter 11D are set forth in the
11 12	<i>— The times for compliance with the requirements of this Chapter 11D are set forth in the following Table 1107D. The Owner of a building within the scope of this Chapter must submit all</i>
11 12 13	<i>— The times for compliance with the requirements of this Chapter 11D are set forth in the following Table 1107D. The Owner of a building within the scope of this Chapter must submit all required forms, documents, and permit applications to the Department prior to the deadlines set forth</i>
11 12 13 14	<i>—The times for compliance with the requirements of this Chapter 11D are set forth in the following Table 1107D. The Owner of a building within the scope of this Chapter must submit all required forms, documents, and permit applications to the Department prior to the deadlines set forth in Table 1107D but may comply with the requirements of this Chapter 11D, or elect to comply with the requirements of this Chapter 11D.</i>
11 12 13 14 15	The times for compliance with the requirements of this Chapter 11D are set forth in the following Table 1107D. The Owner of a building within the scope of this Chapter must submit all required forms, documents, and permit applications to the Department prior to the deadlines set forth in Table 1107D but may comply with the requirements of this Chapter 11D, or elect to comply with the requirements and procedures of the Building Code then in effect, at any time prior to the deadlines set

10					
19	COMPLIANCE SC	HEDULE			
20			<u>Submit</u>		
21			<del>compliance</del>	Eile application	Obtain nonvinod
22	Catagon	Category	Checklist and	File application	<i>Obtain required</i> <i>building</i>
23	Category	<b>Description</b>	specify	for required	0
24			<del>compliance</del>	<i>building permit(s)</i>	<del>permit(s) 1</del>
25			<i>Option</i>		

				1	
1	Category One		Luna 20, 2022		N7/4
2	<b>Buildings</b>	In compliance	June 30, 2022	<u>N/A</u>	<u>N/A</u>
3	Category Two	No steps but	June 30, 2022	<del>December 31,</del>	September 29,
4	<b>Buildings</b>	<del>barriers</del>		<del>2022</del>	<del>2023</del>
5	Category Three	One step with		<del>December 31,</del>	<del>September 29,</del>
6	<b>Buildings</b>	<del>barriers</del>	June 30, 2022	<del>2022</del>	<del>2023</del>
7	Category Four	1+ step with other	1 20 2022	<del>December 31,</del>	<del>September 29,</del>
8	<b>Buildings</b>	<del>barriers</del>	June 30, 2022	<del>2022</del>	<del>2023</del>
9	9				
10	1. Pursuant to Section 1106D.4, all mandated work must be completed within the time periods				
11	specified in Section 106A.4.4 of this Code for Permit Expiration unless an extension of time of time is				
12	granted pursuant to Section 1108D				
13					
14	SECTION 1108D EXTENSIONS OF TIME				
15	(a) For good cause shown, the Building Official may grant one extension of time for up to six				
16	months from the compliance timelines in Table 1107D. For good cause shown, one or more additional				
17	extensions of time may be granted by the Access Appeals Commission pursuant to Section 1110D;				
18	provided, however, that in no event shall the Commission extend the time to complete the mandatory				
19	work required by this Chapter 11D beyond June 30, 2026. The Commission's decision shall be final.				
20	(b) A written request for an extension of time shall be submitted to the Department or to the				
21	Access Appeals Commission prior to the time for compliance.				
22	(c) For purposes of this Chapter 11D, good cause may include but is not limited to:				
23	3 (1) The pendency of a request for a finding of Equivalent Facilitation or Technical				
24	Infeasibility;				
25					

1	(2) The desirability of coordinating the mandatory work required by this Chapter 11D
2	with voluntary disability access improvements;
3	(3) Financial hardship;
4	(4) A legal hardship such as an existing lease; or
5	(5) A undue procedural delay by the Department or another reviewing City agency.
6	
7	SECTION 1109D VOLUNTARY DISABILITY ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS
8	- In addition to the mandatory requirements of this Chapter 11D, the Owner may elect to make
9	additional corrections to the building or a portion thereof to comply with other State or Federal
10	disability access requirements.
11	
12	SECTION 1110D – APPEAL PROCEDURE
13	<i>—Any procedure provided under this Code to appeal accessibility issues is available in order to</i>
14	achieve compliance with this Chapter 11D. In addition, appeals to the Access Appeals Commission
15	may be made in accordance with the provisions of this Chapter 11D and 105A.3 of this Code.
16	
17	SECTION 1111D - ENFORCEMENT
18	<i>—Whenever the Owner of a building within the scope of this Chapter 11D fails to undertake or</i>
19	complete any action required by this Chapter within the time for compliance set forth in Table 1107D,
20	the Owner shall be considered to be in violation of this Code and the Building Official is authorized to
21	abate the violation in accordance with Section 102A of this Code.
22	
23	SECTION 11 <u>04</u> 12D – DISABILITY ACCESS COMPLIANCE UNIT
24	The Building Official shall establish within the Department a Disability Access
25	Compliance Unit to enforce this Chapter 11D and to perform such other duties as the Building

Official shall require. The Unit shall have at least one CASp Inspector from the Department and such other departmental employees as the Building Official deems appropriate. The *Compliance* Unit shall consult and coordinate with other City agencies with review authority over the permits necessary to comply with the requirements of this Chapter, including but not limited to the Planning Department and Department of Public Works, and any other City agencies that the Building Official determines are necessary or desirable to achieve the purposes of this Chapter.

8 *The Compliance Unit shall track and maintain records; coordinate review of checklists,* 

9 *documents, and permits; provide information to the owners of buildings subject to this Chapter, tenants* 

10 *of said buildings, and members of the public; provide guidance, training and assistance to the* 

11 *Department's plan review staff and field inspectors; develop the informational material described in* 

12 Section 1113D; and provide such progress reports on the effectiveness of this Chapter as the

13 *Compliance Unit deems appropriate or as the Building Official or the Access Appeals Commission may* 14 *require.*

15

### SECTION 11<u>05</u>13D - COORDINATION WITH OTHER CITY AGENCIES; REPORTS TO THE MAYOR'S OFFICE ON DISABILITY AND THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

#### 18 *1113D.1. Coordination with Other Agencies.* The Department shall coordinate with the

19 *Planning Department, the Department of Public Works, and other City departments with review* 

20 *authority over the accessibility improvements mandated or authorized by this Chapter 11D, as well as* 

21 *with the Office of Small Business, the Mayor's Office on Disability, and other appropriate City* 

22 *agencies, to develop and implement (1) outreach tools, (2) pre-screening procedures, (3) methods to* 

- 23 *streamline the process, (4) proposed Code revisions, and (5) administrative bulletins, brochures,*
- 24 *checklists, and guidelines or other documents to implement the purpose and objectives of this Chapter.*
- 25 *The Checklist for Alterations to Commercial Storefront for Accessibility in existence on the effective*

1 date of this Chapter 11D, as amended from time to time, and other guidance documents shall be used to 2 review and approve the disability access improvements mandated or authorized by this Chapter 11D. 3 1113D.2. After consultation and coordination with other appropriate City departments and agencies, on or before January 31, 2024, the Department shall submit a report in writing to the Board 4 5 of Supervisors concerning the effectiveness of this Chapter 11D and including recommendations, if any, 6 for amendments to this Chapter. A progress report shall be submitted to the Board of Supervisors once 7 a year thereafter until completion of this Chapter's disability access improvement program. Within six 8 months of the effective date of Board of Supervisors Ordinance No. , the Department shall report 9 to the Mayor's Office on Disability, or any successor department or office, regarding its progress in 10 directing resources to strengthen disability access reviews and inspections of small businesses serving 11 the public. Within twelve months of the effective date of said ordinance, the Department shall report to 12 the Board of Supervisors regarding its efforts to strengthen disability access reviews and inspections of 13 small businesses serving the public, including any successes related to these efforts. Within twelve 14 months of the effective date of said ordinance, the Office of Small Business and the Mayor's Office on 15 Disability, or any successor department or office, shall report to the Board of Supervisors regarding 16 their efforts to further advance accessibility for all persons with disabilities in partnership with local 17 businesses. 18

19

#### SECTION 11<u>06</u>14D – NOTICE

The Department shall post on its website the requirements of this Chapter 11D. The Department shall also prepare any administrative bulletins, brochures, or other materials that the Building Official determines are necessary or desirable to notify property owners and tenants about the requirements of this Chapter-*and shall coordinate with the Office of Small Business and, in the Building Official's discretion, other City departments concerning appropriate* 

25 *methods for providing notice about the requirements*.

1	
2	Section 3. Chapter 38 of the Administrative Code is hereby amended by revising
3	Sections 38.1 and 38.3, to read as follows:
4	
5	CHAPTER 38:
6	COMMERCIAL LANDLORDS; ACCESS IMPROVEMENT OBLIGATIONS AND
7	NOTICE TO SMALL BUSINESS TENANTS REGARDING DISABILITY ACCESS
8	SEC. 38.1. FINDINGS.
9	Given the significant number of small businesses in the City and County of San
10	Francisco, the Board of Supervisors finds:
11	(1) The City has a strong public interest in ensuring that small businesses operating
12	public accommodations comply with applicable disability access laws, and in ensuring clear
13	communications between Commercial Landlords and their Small Business Tenants regarding
14	their respective responsibilities for disability access improvements.
15	(2) The City has a strong public interest in ensuring clear communication between
16	Commercial Landlords and Small Business Tenants regarding the extent to which the
17	Commercial Landlord has or has not implemented required disability access improvements
18	prior to the start or renewal of a lease.
19	(3) The City has a strong public interest in protecting Small Business Tenants from
20	unforeseen expenses and liabilities arising out of required disability access improvements.
21	(4) This Chapter <u>38 is intended to ensure that:</u> (i) <i>public restrooms and ground floor</i>
22	entrances to and exits from real property leased to Small Business Tenants comply with applicable
23	disability access requirements and that Commercial Landlords disclose any noncompliance with
24	such requirements applicable construction-related accessibility standards, including but not limited to
25	standards for public restrooms, service counters, accessible seating, and ground floor entrances and

*exits*, before a Small Business Tenant enters into or renews a lease for the property; (ii)
 Commercial Landlords and Small Business Tenants receive priority permit processing for
 work consisting primarily of disability access improvements; and (iii) every new and amended
 commercial lease between a Commercial Landlord and a Small Business Tenant for premises
 that will be used as a *Place of P*ublic *A*ccommodation clearly and expressly addresses the
 respective obligations of the parties regarding disability access improvements. This Chapter is
 further intended to help encourage and facilitate disability access improvements by

8 Commercial Landlords and Small Business Tenants.

## 9 SEC. 38.3. DISABILITY ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS; NOTICE OF DISABILITY 10 ACCESS OBLIGATIONS.

11

(a) Before entering into or amending a Lease, a Commercial Landlord shall either:

(1) Ensure that existing public restrooms, *service counters, seating*, ground floor
entrances, and ground floor exits are accessible by removing all architectural barriers to
disability access, to the extent that such improvements are required by and "readily
achievable, i.e., easily accomplishable and able to be carried out without much difficulty or
expense" within the meaning of any applicable provisions of Title 28, Sections 36.304 and
36.305, of the Code of Federal Regulations; or,

18 (2) Provide written notice to any prospective Small Business Tenant that the
19 property may not currently meet all applicable construction-related accessibility standards,
20 including standards for public restrooms, *service counters, seating,* and ground floor entrances
21 and exits.

22

23 *requirements of Chapter 11D of the Building Code that are applicable to all places of public* 

(3) Provide written notice to any prospective Small Business Tenant of the mandatory

- 24 *accommodation*.
- 25

\* \* \* \*

1

Section 4. The Public Works Code is hereby amended by revising Section 723.2, to
read as follows:

- 4
- 5

#### SEC. 723.2. MINOR ENCROACHMENTS.

(a) Minor Encroachments. The Director of of the Department of Public Works 6 7 ("Department") may grant permission, revocable at the Director's will-*will*<sup>1</sup> in accordance with 8 subsection (f), to an owner of property abutting any court, alley, or street to install and 9 maintain minor encroachments such as fences, retaining walls, steps or stairways, sidewalk 10 (pipe) barriers to control illegal vehicular parking or driving in sidewalk and public right-of-way 11 areas, and other minor structures in the sidewalk fronting such property where such 12 encroachments are desirable or convenient in conjunction with the owner's use and 13 enjoyment of the property, or required for the safety, convenience, and comfort of the public 14 using the sidewalk. Pipelines or other portions of an alternate water source system 15 constructed within the public right-of-way for the purposes set forth in Article 12C of the Health 16 Code and in accordance with Health Code Section 12C.6 are minor encroachments subject to 17 the requirements of this Section 723.2. Tier 1 Projects and Tier 2 Projects, as defined in 18 Section 723.1(a), are minor encroachments subject to the requirements of Section 723.2. \* \* \* \*

19

(n) Unless otherwise provided in the<u>is</u> Section 723.2, the Department shall collect a
 public right-of-way occupancy assessment fee for the use of the sidewalk or other public right of-way space permitted under the provisions of this Section 723.2.

(1) In accordance with this subsection (n), the public right-of-way occupancy
 assessment fee for minor encroachments, whether permitted or unpermitted and as specified
 in subsection (n)(2), shall be an annual fee of \$3 per square foot of occupancy of the sidewalk

1 or other public right-of-way space. For purposes of calculating the assessment fee, the 2 Department shall charge no less than \$100 per year even though the calculated square 3 footage charge for the encroachment may result in a smaller assessment fee.

4 (2) The following categories of minor encroachments are subject to the public right-of-way occupancy assessment fee: 5

6 (A) Encroachments in, on, above, or below the public right-of-way that 7 are affixed or appurtenant to any building whose owner obtained a site permit for new 8 construction on or after August 29, 2005. This subsection (n)(2)(A) also shall apply to any 9 commercial, industrial, or mixed-use building whose owner obtained a site permit for new 10 construction prior to August 29, 2005; provided, however, that such building is not located in 11 any Neighborhood Commercial District as designated in Planning Code Article 7 and that the 12 encroachment associated with such building was installed or encroachment permit obtained 13 prior to August 29, 2005. This subsection (n)(2)(A) shall specifically include, but not be limited 14 to, doors that open over the public right-of-way and subsidewalk basements; provided, 15 however, that this subsection shall exclude encroachments for shoring and tiebacks. This 16 subsection (n)(2)(A) shall not apply to a building that has been converted from a commercial, 17 industrial, or mixed-use building into a building containing only residential use.

18 (B) Encroachments associated with a commercial, industrial, or mixed-use

19 building that change the vertical or horizontal plane of an existing sidewalk and modify the existing

sidewalk slope pattern in order to provide access necessary to comply with the Americans with 20

21 Disabilities Act; provided, however, that the building obtained a site permit for new construction on or

22 after August 29, 2005.

23 (BC) Any enclosure of the public right-of-way that is used exclusively for 24 private benefit and was installed on or after August 29, 2005. This subsection (n)(2)(BC) also 25 shall apply to any enclosure installed prior to August 29, 2005 that is associated with a

1	commercial, industrial, or mixed-use building; provided, however, that the building is not
2	located in any Neighborhood Commercial District as designated in Planning Code Article 7.
3	( <u>C</u> D) Underground storage tanks.
4	* * * *
5	(13) Notwithstanding subsection (n) of this Section 723.2, no public right-of-way
6	occupancy assessment fee shall be charged for any encroachment that is appurtenant to any building
7	and that is constructed exclusively for compliance with any applicable accessibility standard, including
8	but not limited to any requirement of the Americans with Disabilities Act.
9	* * * *
10	
11	Section 5. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after
12	enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the
13	ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board
14	of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.
15	
16	Section 6. Scope of Ordinance. In enacting this ordinance, the Board of Supervisors
17	intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles,
18	numbers, punctuation marks, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent parts of the Municipal
19	Code that are explicitly shown in this ordinance as additions, deletions, Board amendment
20	additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under
21	the official title of the ordinance.
22	
23	
24	
25	

1		OVED AS TO FORM:		
2	DAVID	D CHIU, City Attorney		
3	By:	<u>/s/ Peter Miljanich</u> PETER MILJANICH Deputy City Attorney		
4				
5	n:\legana\	as2024\2400401\01791860.docx		
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

#### LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

[Building, Administrative, Public Works Codes - Disability Access Improvements for Places of Public Accommodation]

Ordinance amending the Building, Administrative, and Public Works Codes to remove the local requirement for existing buildings with a place of public accommodation to have all primary entries and paths of travel into the building accessible to persons with disabilities or to receive a City determination of equivalent facilitation, technical infeasibility, or unreasonable hardship; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.

#### Existing Law

Chapter 11D of the Building Code requires the owner of an existing building with a place of public accommodation to have the building inspected for compliance with accessible entry and path of travel requirements. If the building is not in compliance, the owner must either bring the building into compliance or obtain a finding from the City of equivalent facilitation, technical infeasibility, or unreasonable hardship. All mandated work must be completed within the time periods specified in the Building Code for building permits, unless an extension of time is granted.

Chapter 38 of the Administrative Code requires commercial landlords, before entering into or amending a lease agreement with a small business tenant for use of a place of public accommodation, to either remove barriers to disabled access, or notify prospective tenants in writing of applicable disability access requirements, including Building Code Chapter 11D.

Public Works Code Section 723.2 sets forth the process by which the Director of the Department of Public Works may permit private property owners to install or maintain minor encroachments in the public right-of-way. Section 723.2 requires the Public Works Department to collect a public right-of-way occupancy assessment fee for use of the sidewalk or other public right-of-way space.

#### Amendments to Current Law

This ordinance would remove Building Code Chapter 11D's local requirement that owners of buildings with a place of public accommodation comply with accessible entry and path of travel requirements. This ordinance would not affect the application of state or Federal requirements for building accessibility to buildings in San Francisco. Instead, this ordinance would require the Department of Building Inspection to (1) provide information to project applicants who own or operate a place of public accommodation regarding obligations to comply with disability access requirements under the California Building Code and the Americans with Disabilities Act; and (2) develop and distribute outreach tools, such as brochures and technical information sheets, to assist project applicants who own or operate a

place of public accommodation in understanding these requirements. This ordinance would also make conforming amendments to Chapter 38 of the Administrative Code.

This ordinance would eliminate public right-of-way occupancy assessment fees for certain encroachments constructed exclusively for compliance with any applicable accessibility standard, including but not limited to any requirement of the Americans with Disabilities Act.

n:\legana\as2024\2400401\01791879.docx