

Board of Supervisors
 Budget and Legislative Analysis
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES(1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	\$ 6,534	\$ 8,338	\$ 170,537	\$ 217,622
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	5,387	6,875	140,601	179,438
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	5,387	6,875	140,601	179,438
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	3.0	3,922	4,767	307,093	373,256
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	4.0	3,388	4,117	353,707	429,815
Administrative Manager II	1822	1.0	2,752	3,346	71,827	87,331
Executive Secretary I	1450	1.0	2,463	2,994	64,284	78,143
Temporary Salaries	TEMP_M	0.5	1,723	1,723	22,485	22,485
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					-	-
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					3,500	3,500
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs		12.5			1,274,635	1,571,027

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)	338,318	468,570
Fixed Fringes (4)	193,670	193,670
Total Fringe Benefits	531,988	662,240

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Operating Expenses (materials and supplies, office equipment, other expenses)	79,792	79,792
Space Rental	0	165,625
Data Processing Hardware & Software	16,868	16,868
Payroll Tax Expense		
	96,660	262,285

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

1,903,283 2,495,552

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(2,126,950) (2,126,950)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ (223,667) \$ 368,602

% of Savings to City Cost

-12% 15%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1979 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Term disability, where applicable.
4. Total fringe benefits costs are estimated at 40% of total salary costs.
5. Classifications based on current configuration of Budget and Legislative Analyst services.
6. Full time equivalent (FTE) positions include 11 managers and analyst staff and 1 administrative staff. The staff level of 11 managers and analysts is based on the number of staff required to provide 16,860 hours of productive service, as well as MOU-mandated leave and training hours and other nonproductive administrative hours (staff meetings, performance evaluations, and other administrative hours) consistent with ALGA (Association of Local Government Auditors) standards.
7. Any potential seasonal or overtime costs if brought in-house have not been determined.
8. Calculations do not include liability for retiree health. Based on the CAFR for year ending June 30, 2011, the City's annual
9. Estimated total contract cost includes the 3.25% COLA requested by the contractor. If this COLA is not approved by the Board of Supervisors, the total estimated contract cost would be \$2,060,000 in FY 2015/16.

PROP J SUBMISSION COVER SHEET

[DEPARTMENT] GSA / City Administrator
 [DIVISION] Internal Services / Central Shops
 [CONTRACT DESCRIPTION] Security guard Services (Unarmed)
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

To Be Completed By Department:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	3.0	2,032 2,469	159,106	193,323
Holiday Pay (If Applicable)				3,353	4,074
Premium Pay (If Applicable)				10,064	12,229
Total Salary Costs		3.0		172,523	209,626

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)				49,324	53,397
Fixed Fringes (4)				38,790	38,790
Total Fringe Benefits				88,114	92,187

ESTIMATED CAPITAL & OPERATING COSTS

Uniforms				1,500	1,500
Total Capital & Operating				1,500	1,500

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (5) (6)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

% of Savings to City Cost

	262,137	303,313
	(122,420)	(123,430)
\$	139,717	179,883
	53%	59%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. These services have been contracted out since 1983.
2. Salaries and fringe for City employees reflect actual salary and fringe rates effective July 01, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. If a COLA estimate had been added to inflate anticipated City salary and fringe rates, the savings to the City would be higher.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of employer retirement, Social Security, Medicare, unemployment, and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. The estimated City cost does not include materials, supplies, and uniforms; if included these costs would increase the estimated savings to the City.
6. Contract cost estimates include 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring.

**GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY -- CITY ADMINISTRATOR, REAL ESTATE
CITYWIDE CUSTODIAL SERVICES
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2015-16**

<u>PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS</u>	<u>Class</u>	<u>Positions</u>	<u>BW Rate</u>		<u>Low</u>	<u>High</u>
Custodian	2708	31.00	1,820	2,212	1,477,948	1,796,313
Custodian Assistant Supervisor	2716	2.00	2,001	2,433	104,844	127,475
Holiday Pay					31,026	37,709
Premium Pay					101,554	123,432
Total Salary Costs		33.00			1,715,371	2,084,930
 <u>FRINGE BENEFITS</u>						
Variable Fringes (2)					487,403	592,758
Fixed Fringes (3)					426,690	426,690
Total Fringe Benefits					914,093	1,019,448
 <u>ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS</u>						
Temp Salaries and est. MFB (4)					278,666	338,694
Worker's Comp & SFGH Medical					95,054	95,054
Total Additional Costs					373,721	433,749
 <u>ESTIMATED CAPITAL & OPERATING COSTS</u>						
Materials and Supplies--Cleaning and Paper Products					430,692	430,692
Total Capital & Operating					430,692	430,692
 ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					3,433,877	3,968,818
 LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (5)					(2,248,946)	(2,251,998)
 ESTIMATED ANNUAL SAVINGS					\$ 1,184,931	\$ 1,716,820
% of Savings to City Cost					35%	43%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect actual salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. If a COLA estimate had been added to inflate anticipated City salary and fringe rates, the savings to the City would be higher.
2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-
3. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
4. Temp employees will be needed primarily for coverage while fulltime staff are on leave.
5. The estimated contract cost includes 0.15 FTE for contract monitoring.

**GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY - CITY ADMINISTRATOR - REAL ESTATE
SECURITY SERVICES: 1650 MISSION STREET, 1660 MISSION STREET, 25 VAN NESS AVENUE &
30 VAN NESS AVENUE, ONE SOUTH VAN NESS, ALEMANY/UNITED NATIONS PLAZA MARKETS
196 OTIS STREET, 1200 15TH STREET.
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
FISCAL YEAR 2015-16**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:
PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	36.60	1,985 2,412	\$1,895,840	\$2,303,893
Night Pay Premium (5PM-7AM) 8%				59,121	71,846
Holiday Pay				18,558	22,552
Total Salary Costs		36.60		1,973,519	2,398,291
FRINGE BENEFITS					
Variable Fringes (3)				580,895	705,924
Fixed Fringes (4)				473,198	473,198
Total Fringe Benefits				1,054,093	1,179,122
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				3,027,612	3,577,414
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (5) (6)				(1,307,581)	(1,310,314)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$1,720,032	\$2,267,100
% of Estimated Savings to Estimated Cost				57%	63%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. These services have been contracted for various times, depending on location.
2. Salary levels reflect rates effective July 1, 2015. If a COLA estimate had been added to inflate midyear City salary increases, the savings to the City would be higher.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement costs, employee retirement pick-up, and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. The estimated contract cost includes 0.1 FTE for contract monitoring.
6. Both the City and contract cost estimates exclude operating costs that would be the same under either scenario. This does not affect the estimated cost savings.

Administrative Services
 SMG - Convention Facilities Management
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015 -16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Manager III	0931	4.0	4,202 5,364	440,397	562,134
Manager IV	0932	2.0	4,510 5,756	236,341	301,607
Manager V	0933	1.0	4,884 6,209	127,448	162,682
Deputy Director IV	0954	1.0	5,945 7,588	155,764	198,801
Department Head V	0965	1.0	8,485 10,830	222,317	283,748
IS Programmer Analyst	1082	0.6	2,803 3,274	40,913	51,467
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	0.6	3,681 4,632	57,871	72,817
Sr Departmental Personnel Officer	1272	1.0	4,438 5,393	116,213	141,284
Public Relations Officer	1314	1.0	3,098 3,765	81,167	98,650
Special Assistant XI	1370	3.0	3,302 4,013	259,508	315,416
Special Assistant XII	1371	4.0	3,551 4,317	372,182	452,410
Special Assistant IV	1373	1.0	4,092 4,973	107,203	130,290
Special Assistant XV	1374	1.0	4,400 5,347	115,274	140,104
Senior Clerk	1406	3.0	1,806 2,195	141,981	172,550
Principal Clerk	1408	2.0	2,387 2,901	125,062	152,037
Clerk Typist	1424	1.5	1,810 2,201	71,152	86,516
Secretary II	1446	3.0	2,190 2,663	172,147	209,312
Executive Secretary II	1452	1.0	2,624 3,190	68,752	83,580
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	2,165 2,631	170,136	206,818
Principal Payroll/Personnel Clerk	1224	1.0	2,694 3,274	70,575	85,779
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,658 4,445	95,834	116,454
Supervising Fiscal Officer	1675	1.0	4,328 5,261	113,397	137,825
Storekeeper	1934	1.0	1,908 2,317	49,928	60,707
Senior Purchaser	1956	1.0	3,366 4,092	88,192	107,203
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	4,092 4,973	107,203	130,290
Registered Nurse	2320	0.8	4,440 5,833	87,240	114,611
Custodian	2708	132.0	1,820 2,212	6,293,197	7,648,818
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	1.0	2,001 2,433	52,422	63,737
Custodial Supervisor	2718	7.0	2,207 2,682	404,681	491,981
Janitorial Services Supervisor	2720	1.0	2,433 2,958	63,737	77,493
Environmental Health Inspector	6120	1.0	3,478 4,225	91,081	110,889
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	1.5	5,293 5,293	208,025	208,025
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supervisor	7203	14.5	4,138 4,138	1,571,945	1,571,945
Painter Supervisor	7242	1.0	2,914 3,739	76,340	97,852
Operating Engineer, Universal	7328	13.0	3,039 3,693	1,034,950	1,257,696
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	1.0	2,162 3,159	56,632	82,776
Carpenter	7344	1.0	2,790 3,391	73,096	88,836
Electrician	7345	1.0	3,136 3,811	82,159	99,856
Painter Supervisor	7346	3.0	2,568 3,118	201,670	245,109
Plumber	7347	1.0	3,243 3,941	84,974	103,262
Window Cleaner	7392	3.0	2,457 2,986	193,143	234,732
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,648 4,658	191,132	244,063
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	23.0	2,032 2,469	1,224,205	1,487,547
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	2.0	4,185 5,338	219,267	279,726
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	9.0	2,517 3,059	593,426	721,330
Parking Control Officer	8214	14.0	1,939 2,427	711,382	890,072
Senior Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	2,317 2,901	121,415	152,037
Senior Operations Manager	9143	3.0	5,020 6,102	394,572	479,600

Holiday Pay (if applicable)		291,023	347,282
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)		348,672	418,411
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		593,980	780,334
Other Pay (if applicable) (Vacation Relief)		317,480	376,853
Total Salary Costs	278.5	19,188,804	23,137,237

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)		5,409,336	6,526,515
Fixed Fringes (4)		3,764,493	3,764,493
Total Fringe Benefits		9,173,829	10,291,008

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Contractual Services		5,290,802	5,290,802
Workers' Compensation		1,211,370	1,211,370
Management Fee		450,000	450,000
		0	0
Total Capital & Operating		6,952,172	6,952,172

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

		35,314,805	40,380,417
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST & CONTRACT MONITORING		(31,031,708)	(31,031,708)
		(200,707)	(251,199)
		(31,232,415)	(31,282,907)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 4,082,390	\$ 9,097,510
% of Savings to City Cost	12% 23%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1977 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Annual costs per DHR compensation manual.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates, an estimate of dependent coverage and flexible benefit package, if applicable.

PUBLIC WORKS - INFRASTRUCTURE DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION
 SECURITY GUARD SERVICES at 1680 MISSION
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
Security Guard - 1680 Mission	8202	1.5	1,672	2,032	65,722	79,839
Security Guard as needed - 1680 Mission	8202	0.1	1,672	2,032	4,381	5,323
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					2,224	2,702
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					1,984	2,411
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total Salary Costs		<u>1.6</u>			\$ 74,312	\$ 90,275

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)					30,254	36,753
Fixed Fringes (4)					20,610	20,610
Total Fringe Benefits					\$ 50,864	\$ 57,362

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Total Capital & Operating					\$ -	\$ -
---------------------------	--	--	--	--	------	------

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

125,175 147,637

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(72,217) (69,718)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 52,958 \$ 77,919

% of Savings to City Cost

42% 53%

PROP J ANALYSIS SUMMARY
PUBLIC WORKS - BUREAU OF BUILDING DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION
SECURITY GUARD SERVICES AT 30 VAN NESS
FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 3rd - 5th Floors	8202	3.0	\$ 1,672	\$ 2,032	\$ 131,443	\$ 159,679
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 3rd - 5th Floors as-needed	8202	0.1	1,672	2,032	6,319	7,677
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					4,371	5,310
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					3,899	4,737
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Total Salary Costs		3.1			146,034	177,403

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes (3)					82,314	90,873
Fixed Fringes (4)					42,469	42,469
Total Fringe Benefits					124,783	133,343

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
Total Capital & Operating					0	0

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

270,817 310,746

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(144,357) (145,309)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 126,460 \$ 165,437

% of Savings to City Cost

47% 53%

DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY, Data Center Monitoring
Mainframe System Support
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES(1)(2)
FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
Information Systems Manager	0941	0.5	\$ 5,101	\$ 6,510	\$ 66,568	\$ 84,956
IS Engineer-Principal	1044	3.0	4,352	5,473	340,762	428,536
IS Engineer-Senior	1043	2.0	4,046	5,087	211,201	265,541
Clerk Typist	1424	0.5	1,769	2,151	23,085	28,071
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
Standby Pay					72,678	91,399
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable) (callback + works performed during standby hours)					57,011	71,696
Total Salary Costs		6.0			771,306	970,199

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes(3)	182,625	229,681
Fixed Fringes(4)	81,387	81,387
Total Fringe Benefits	264,011	311,068

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS(if applicable)

Specialized Training	158,400	158,400
Trident OSEM Software Purchase	49,200	49,200
Trident Annual Maintenance	7,380	7,380
	0	0
Total Capital & Operating	214,980	214,980

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

1,250,297 1,496,246

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

859,942 871,453

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 390,355 \$ 624,793

% of Savings to City Cost

31% 42%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2004-2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. In-house mainframe systems operations required contract services for specialized and as-needed services that could not be met by existing staffing and expertise levels. It is estimated staff will need 6 months training to be able to operate the system independently.
6. Trident Services, Inc. provides installation, configuration, maintenance and support of systems, collection of data for billing, and management of staff and projects.
7. The services are 24 hours/day, 7 days/week that requires employees to standby during the non regular business hours for emergency incidents.

Human Services Agency (Administration-Contracts)

Security Guard Services- Guardsmark Contract

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)(2)

FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
Security Guard	8202	89.5	1,672	2,032	\$ 3,921,396	4,763,753
Holiday Overtime Pay					99,162	120,463
Night Differential					160,822	195,369
Uniform Cost per SEIU Contract					44,750	44,750
TOTAL SALARY COSTS		<u>89.5</u>			<u>4,226,130</u>	<u>5,124,334</u>
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					134,098	162,599
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					119,621	145,044
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs		<u>179.0</u>			<u>4,479,849</u>	<u>5,431,977</u>
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					1,188,183	1,443,417
Fixed Fringes (4)					1,157,235	1,157,235
Total Fringe Benefits					<u>2,345,418</u>	<u>2,600,652</u>
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Added electronic door lock and closed circuit camera systems					145,000	250,000
Total Capital & Operating					<u>145,000</u>	<u>250,000</u>
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					<u>6,970,268</u>	<u>8,282,629</u>
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST					<u>(5,021,409)</u>	<u>(5,524,113)</u>
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					<u>\$ 1,948,859</u>	<u>\$ 2,758,516</u>
% of Savings to City Cost					<u>28%</u>	<u>33%</u>

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 84-85 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2015. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

DEPARTMENT-Sheriff

DIVISION-Custody

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2015-2016

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS	Class	Positions	BW Rate		Low	High
Food Service Manager Administrator	2620	1.0	\$2,709	\$3,292	70,706	85,932
Senior Food Service Supervisor	2619	4.0	\$2,251	\$2,735	234,958	285,497
Food Service Supervisor	2618	3.0	\$2,041	\$2,481	159,791	194,249
Cook	2654	7.0	\$2,111	\$2,566	385,747	468,767
Assistant Cook	2650	4.0	\$1,697	\$2,061	177,153	215,191
Holiday Pay					22,932	27,866
Premium Pay					21,105	25,646
Total Salary Costs		19.0			1,072,391	1,303,149
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (4.)					300,984	343,340
Fixed Fringes (5.)					260,005	260,005
Total Fringe Benefits					560,989	603,345
ESTIMATED CAPITAL & OPERATING COSTS						
Total Capital & Operating					-	-
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					1,633,381	1,906,494
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (7)					(1,017,191)	(1,021,874)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					616,190	884,620
% of Savings to City Cost					38%	46%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. These services have been contracted out since 1980.
2. CCSF and contract costs are presented as annualized costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates, and dependent coverage.
5. Assumes that capital, operating and supply cost are the same for either the City or the Contractor

Department of Elections
 Assembly of Vote-By-Mail Envelopes
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES(1)(2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
Junior Clerk	1402	30.0	\$ 1,602	\$ 1,944	\$ 1,254,124	\$ 1,521,777
Chief Clerk	1410	0.2	\$ 2,735	\$ 3,324	14,275	17,352
Junior Management Assistant	1840	0.2	\$ 2,282	\$ 2,775	11,914	14,483
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
					0	0
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					40,625	49,297
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					741	901
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Total Salary Costs		30.4			1,321,679	1,603,811

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable Fringes(3)					387,049	469,669
Fixed Fringes(4)					393,072	393,072
Total Fringe Benefits					780,121	862,741

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS(if applicable)

Ballot Printing					0	0
Freight 11/2015					8,500	8,500
Postage 11/2015					20,000	20,000
Freight 06/2016					8,500	8,500
Postage 06/2016					40,000	40,000
Total Capital & Operating					77,000	77,000

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

2,178,800 2,543,551

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

431,440 437,271

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 1,747,360 \$ 2,106,280

% of Savings to City Cost

80% 83%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.