

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. 554-5184  
Fax No. 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

March 24, 2021

**File No. 210286**

Lisa Gibson  
Environmental Review Officer  
Planning Department  
1650 Mission Street, Ste. 400  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Gibson:

On March 16, 2021, Supervisor Mandelman submitted the following substitute legislation:

**File No. 210286**

**Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, as a Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Erica Major".

By: Erica Major, Assistant Clerk  
Land Use and Transportation Committee

Attachment

c: Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planning  
Don Lewis, Environmental Planning

1 [Planning Code - Landmark Designation - Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan Street]

2

3 **Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan**  
 4 **Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, as a Landmark consistent with**  
 5 **the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning**  
 6 **Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and**  
 7 **making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code,**  
 8 **Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority**  
 9 **policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

10 NOTE: **Unchanged Code text and uncodified text** are in plain Arial font.  
 11 **Additions to Codes** are in *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.  
 12 **Deletions to Codes** are in *strikethrough italics Times New Roman font*.  
 13 **Board amendment additions** are in double-underlined Arial font.  
 14 **Board amendment deletions** are in ~~strikethrough Arial font~~.  
 15 **Asterisks (\* \* \* \*)** indicate the omission of unchanged Code  
 16 subsections or parts of tables.

14

15 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

16 Section 1. Findings.

17 (a) CEQA and Land Use Findings.

18 (1) The Planning Department has determined that the Planning Code  
 19 amendment proposed in this ordinance is subject to a Categorical Exemption from the  
 20 California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et  
 21 seq., "CEQA") pursuant to Section 15308 of California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Sections  
 22 15000 et seq., the Guidelines for implementation of the statute for actions by regulatory  
 23 agencies for protection of the environment (in this case, landmark designation). Said  
 24 determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 25 and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board of Supervisors affirms this determination.

1 (2) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board of Supervisors finds that  
2 the proposed landmark designation of Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan Street, Assessor's  
3 Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036 ("Lyon-Martin House"), will serve the public necessity,  
4 convenience, and welfare for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission  
5 Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_, recommending approval of the proposed designation, which is  
6 incorporated herein by reference.

7 (3) The Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed landmark designation of  
8 Lyon-Martin House is consistent with the General Plan and with Planning Code Section  
9 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No.  
10 \_\_\_\_\_.

11 (b) General Findings.

12 (1) Pursuant to Charter Section 4.135, the Historic Preservation Commission  
13 has authority "to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark designations  
14 and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors."

15 (2) The Landmark Designation Fact Sheet was prepared by Planning  
16 Department Preservation staff. All preparers meet the Secretary of the Interior's Professional  
17 Qualification Standards for historic preservation program staff, as set forth in Code of Federal  
18 Regulations Title 36, Part 61, Appendix A. The report was reviewed for accuracy and  
19 conformance with the purposes and standards of Article 10 of the Planning Code.

20 (3) The Historic Preservation Commission, at its regular meeting of February  
21 17, 2021, reviewed Planning Department staff's analysis of the historical significance of Lyon-  
22 Martin House set forth in the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet dated \_\_\_\_\_.

23 (4) On October 20, 2020, the Board of Supervisors adopted Resolution No.  
24 507-20, initiating landmark designation of the Lyon-Martin House, identified in that resolution  
25 as 649-651 Duncan Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot Nos. 036 and 037, as a

1 San Francisco Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. On October 30,  
2 2020, the Mayor approved the resolution. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board  
3 of Supervisors in File No. 201138.

4 (5) On February 17, 2021, after holding a public hearing on the proposed  
5 designation and having considered the specialized analyses prepared by Planning  
6 Department staff and the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet, the Historic Preservation  
7 Commission recommended designation of Lyon-Martin House, including 651 Duncan Street,  
8 Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, but excluding 649 Duncan Street, Assessor's  
9 Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 037, as a landmark consistent with the standards set forth in  
10 Section 1004 of the Planning Code by Resolution No. 1170. Said resolution is on file with the  
11 Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. \_\_\_\_\_.

12 (6) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that the Lyon-Martin House, 651  
13 Duncan Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, has a special character and  
14 special historical interest and value, and that its designation as a Landmark will further the  
15 purposes of and conform to the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code. In  
16 doing so, the Board hereby incorporates by reference the findings of the Landmark  
17 Designation Fact Sheet, as revised per the Historic Preservation Commission's  
18 recommendation.

19  
20 Section 2. Designation.

21 Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan  
22 Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, is hereby designated as a San  
23 Francisco Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Section 1004. Appendix A to  
24 Article 10 of the Planning Code is hereby amended to include this property.  
25

1 Section 3. Required Data.

2 (a) The description, location, and boundary of the Landmark site consists of the parcel  
3 located at 651 Duncan Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, in San  
4 Francisco's Noe Valley neighborhood.

5 (b) The characteristics of the Landmark that justify its designation are described and  
6 shown in the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet, as revised by the Historic Preservation  
7 Commission at its February 17, 2021 hearing, and other supporting materials contained in  
8 Planning Department Record Docket No. 2020-011305DES. In brief, the Lyon-Martin House  
9 is eligible for local designation as it is associated with events that have made a significant  
10 contribution to the broad patterns of San Francisco history and with persons significant to San  
11 Francisco history. Specifically, designation of Lyon-Martin House is proper given association  
12 with the history of development of homophile organizations in San Francisco, specifically the  
13 Daughters of Bilitis, the first lesbian-rights organization in the United States, and as the  
14 longtime home of pioneering lesbian-rights activists, Phyllis Lyon and Del Martin. The period  
15 of significance is 1955 to 2020.

16 (c) The particular features that should be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined  
17 necessary, are those generally shown in photographs and described in the Landmark  
18 Designation Fact Sheet, as revised by the Historic Preservation Commission at its February  
19 17, 2021 hearing, which can be found in Planning Department Record Docket No. 2020-  
20 011305DES, and which are incorporated in this designation by reference as though fully set  
21 forth. Specifically, the following features at the Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan Street,  
22 Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, should be preserved or replaced in-kind:

23 (1) Location of the house on the property, which is set back and up from the  
24 street with the house at the high point of a hillside sloping downward to the street;

25 (2) Physical and visual connection between front façade of the house and street;

1 (3) Massing and roof form at front half of building, which consists of a one-story-  
2 over-basement expression, flat roofs with overhanging boxed eaves that extend along front  
3 (north) and side (west) elevations, and clerestory-like expression of front façade where the  
4 building steps up with the topography;

5 (4) Cladding at elevations visible from street, which consists of natural, wood  
6 shingles, painted wood corner boards, and painted cement stucco;

7 (5) Oversize picture window at front (north) façade, which opens into living room,  
8 and which consists of single-light, fixed, wood sash flanked by single-light, casement wood  
9 sash;

10 (6) Window openings at upper portion of front (north) façade that open into  
11 dining room/office;

12 (7) Location of primary entry at side (west) elevation;

13 (8) Living room configuration, specifically the volume of the room, its location at  
14 front of house, and its spatial relationship with the rest of the interior; and,

15 (9) Dining room/office configuration, specifically the volume of the room and its  
16 location within the floorplan relative to the living room.

17

18 Section 4. Effective Date.

19 This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs  
20 when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not

21 //

22 //

23 //

24 //

25 //

1 sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the  
2 Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

3

4 APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
5 DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

6 By: /s/ Victoria Wong

7 VICTORIA WONG  
8 Deputy City Attorney

8

9

n:\legana\as2021\1800206\01516525.docx

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

## LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

[Planning Code - Landmark Designation - Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan Street]

**Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Lyon-Martin House, 651 Duncan Street, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036, as a Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

### Existing Law

Under Article 10, Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Board of Supervisors may, by ordinance, designate an individual structure that has special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value as a City landmark. Unless prohibited by state law, once a structure has been named a landmark, any construction, alteration, removal or demolition for which a City permit is required necessitates a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Commission. (Planning Code § 1006; Charter of the City and County of San Francisco, § 4.135.) Thus, landmark designation generally affords a high degree of protection to historic and architectural structures of merit in the City. There are currently 290 individual landmarks in the City under Article 10, in addition to structures and districts in the downtown area that are protected under Article 11. (See App. A to Article 10.)

### Amendments to Current Law

This ordinance amends the Planning Code to add a new historic landmark to the list of individual landmarks under Article 10: 651 Duncan Street (aka Lyon-Martin House), Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6604, Lot No. 036.

The ordinance finds that 651 Duncan Street is eligible for designation as it is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of San Francisco history and with persons significant to San Francisco history. Specifically, designation of Lyon-Martin House is proper given association with the history of development of homophile organizations in San Francisco, specifically the Daughters of Bilitis, the first lesbian-rights organization in the United States, and as the longtime home of pioneering lesbian-rights activists, Phyllis Lyon and Del Martin. The period of significance is 1955 to 2020.

As required by Section 1004, the ordinance lists the particular features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined necessary.

n:\egana\as2020\1800206\01516065.docx