



City and County of San Francisco
Meeting Minutes
Rules Committee

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Members: Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai, Aaron Peskin

Clerk: Victor Young
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org

Monday, September 16, 2024

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

Regular Meeting

Present: 2 - Ahsha Safai, and Aaron Peskin

Excused: 1 - Shamann Walton

The Rules Committee met in regular session, on Monday, September 16, 2024, with Vice Chair Ahsha Safai presiding. Vice Chair Safai called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.

ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

On the call of the roll, Vice Chair Safai and Member Peskin were noted present. Chair Walton was noted not present. A quorum of the Committee was present.

COMMUNICATIONS

Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public that public comment is taken on each item on the agenda. Alternatively, written comments may be submitted through email (victor.young@sfgov.org) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.

AGENDA CHANGES

There were no agenda changes.

Supervisor Walton Excused from Attendance

Vice Chair Safai moved that Supervisor Walton be excused from the September 16, 2024, Rules Committee meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

REGULAR AGENDA

240636 [Administrative Code - Use of Unassisted Aerial Vehicles]**Sponsors: Mayor; Dorsey**

Ordinance approving the Police Department's inventory and policy relating to the use of unassisted aerial vehicles, or drones, and making findings consistent with the criteria in State law. (Police Department)

06/04/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 7/4/2024.

06/10/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Police Department for informational purposes.

09/09/24; CONTINUED. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Carl Nicita and Sgt. Eric Batchelder (Police Department); Brad Russi (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. John Lindsay-Poland; Arthur Koch; spoke in opposition of the matter.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Carl Nicita (Police Department); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. H. Brown; spoke in support of the matter. Jordan Davis; spoke in opposition of the matter.

The Committee unanimously approved amendments to the Unassisted Aerial Vehicles (UAV) Policy.

Vice Chair Safai moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

240699 [Site for New Library Branch - 100 Orizaba Avenue]**Sponsor: Safai**

Ordinance requiring that the new Public Library branch serving the Oceanview, Merced Heights, Ingleside, and Lakeview neighborhoods be built on the City-owned parcel of land at 100 Orizaba Avenue (Assessor's Parcel Block No. 7136, Lot No. 060), subject to environmental review, required approvals, and other applicable laws; and prohibiting the expenditure of City funds to explore, pursue, or plan construction of a new Public Library branch serving those neighborhoods at any alternate location except to expand the existing Oceanview Branch Library located at 345 Randolph Street on any adjacent parcel, and except as required by the environmental review process, required approvals, or other applicable laws.

06/18/24; ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE to Rules Committee, expires on 7/18/2024.

06/24/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Library Dept. for informational purposes.

07/01/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Youth Commission for review and report.

09/09/24; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): City Librarian Michael Lambert; provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Renard Monroe (Youth First); Delia Patrick; Mary Harris; Al Harris; spoke in support of the matter.

09/09/24; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Josh Bean; H. Brown; provided information on the matter.

Vice Chair Safai moved that this Ordinance be REFERRED WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

240839 [Mayoral Appointment, Public Works Commission - Eleanor Blume]

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Eleanor Blume to the Public Works Commission, for a term ending July 2, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 4.141, provides that this nomination is subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: September 3, 2024.)

09/03/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Eleanor Blume; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. H. Brown; spoke in support of the appointment of Eleanor Blume. Jordan Davis; spoke in opposition of the appointment of Eleanor Blume.

Vice Chair Safai moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Eleanor Blume to the Public Works Commission, for a term ending July 2, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 4.141, provides that this nomination is subject to confirmation by the Board of Supervisors and shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days from the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board. If the Board fails to act on the nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is transmitted to the Clerk, then the nominee shall be deemed approved. Transmittal date: September 3, 2024.)

Vice Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

240589 [Mayoral Appointment, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors - Mike Chen]

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Mike Chen to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a four-year term ending March 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: May 30, 2024.)

06/04/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

07/22/24; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Mike Chen; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Bob Axlefender; Dillon Favors; Somar Ricken; spoke in support of the appointment of Mike Chen.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Mike Chen; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. H. Brown; Robin Pan; Peter Beldon; May-Anne Chang; spoke in support of the appointment of Mike Chen. Jordan Davis; spoke in opposition of the appointment of Mike Chen.

Member Peskin moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Mike Chen to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a four-year term ending March 1, 2025. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: May 30, 2024.)

Member Peskin moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

The meeting was recessed at 10:57 a.m and reconvened at 11:09 a.m.

240820 [Appointments, Urban Forestry Council - Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, Karla Nagy, Pamela Nagle, Edgar Xochitl Flores, Caroline Scanlan, Joshua Klipp, and Antonio Moreno]

Hearing to consider appointing seven members, terms ending November 18, 2024, and terms beginning November 18, 2024 and ending November 18, 2026, to the Urban Forestry Council. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, term expired, must represent an educational organization involved with tree management (University of California Cooperative Extension, etc.), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Seat 2, succeeding Andrew Sullivan, term expired, must be certified by a professional tree management organization (International Society of Arboriculture, American Society of Consulting Arborists, or American Society of Landscape Architects), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Seat 3, succeeding Pamela Nagle, term expired, must be certified by a professional tree management organization (International Society of Arboriculture, American Society of Consulting Arborists, or American Society of Landscape Architects), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Vacant Seat 4, succeeding Dan Flanagan, term expired, must be a member of a non-profit organization involved in urban forestry or other environmentally-related issues, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Seat 5, succeeding Ildiko Polony, term expired, must be a member of a non-profit organization involved in urban forestry or other environmentally-related issues, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Seat 6, succeeding Michael Sullivan, term expired, must be a representative of the community, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Seat 7, succeeding Edgar Xochitl Flores, term expired, must be a representative of the community, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

08/14/24; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

09/03/24; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Public Utilities Commission for informational purposes.

Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Speaker (Urban Forester Council); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Pamela Nagle; Joshua Klipp; Antonio Moreno; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.

Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel, seat 1, recommended (residency requirement waived).

Karla Nagy, seat 2, recommended.

Pamela Nagle, seat 3, recommended.

Edgar Xochitl Flores, seat 4, recommended.

Caroline Scanlan, seat 5, recommended (residency requirement waived).

Joshua Klipp, seat 6, recommended.

Antonio Moreno, seat 7, recommended.

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

Motion appointing Morgan Vasisset-Fauvel (residency requirement waived), Karla Nagy, Pamela Nagle, Edgar Xochitl Flores, Caroline Scanlan (residency requirement waived), Joshua Klipp, and Antonio Moreno, unexpired terms ending November 18, 2024, and terms beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026, to the Urban Forestry Council. (Rules Committee)
Morgan Vaisset-Fauvel (residency requirement waived), seat 1, succeeding themselves, term expired, must represent an educational organization involved with tree management (University of California Cooperative Extension, etc.), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Karla Nagy, seat 2, succeeding Andrew Sullivan, term expired, must be certified by a professional tree management organization (International Society of Arboriculture, American Society of Consulting Arborists, or American Society of Landscape Architects), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Pamela Nagle, seat 3, succeeding herself, term expired, must be certified by a professional tree management organization (International Society of Arboriculture, American Society of Consulting Arborists, or American Society of Landscape Architects), for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Edgar Xochitl Flores, seat 4, succeeding Dan Flanagan, term expired, must be a member of a non-profit organization involved in urban forestry or other environmentally-related issues, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Caroline Scanlan (residency requirement waived), seat 5, succeeding Ildiko Polony, term expired, must be a member of a non-profit organization involved in urban forestry or other environmentally-related issues, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Joshua Klipp, seat 6, succeeding Michael Sullivan, term expired, must be a representative of the community, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Antonio Moreno, seat 7, succeeding Edgar Xochitl Flores, term expired, must be a representative of the community, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending November 18, 2024, and two-year term beginning November 18, 2024, and ending November 18, 2026.

Vice Chair Safai moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - Safai, Peskin

Excused: 1 - Walton

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:20 a.m.

N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.