



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner
Controller
ChiaYu Ma
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Paratransit Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner
Greg Wagner,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Paratransit (24163)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE		FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.00	\$	270,699	\$ 324,923
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.00	\$	201,349	\$ 244,260
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.00	\$	278,678	\$ 329,440
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.00	\$	290,653	\$ 407,423
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.00	\$	760,207	\$ 1,048,722
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.00	\$	272,823	\$ 322,522
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.00	\$	377,498	\$ 444,660
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.00	\$	612,591	\$ 725,025
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$	204,728	\$ 243,995
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.00	\$	2,399,392	\$ 2,818,530
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.00	\$	3,606,704	\$ 4,250,162
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.00	\$	133,649	\$ 157,967
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.00	\$	327,800	\$ 384,283
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.00	\$	136,549	\$ 161,130
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.00	\$	2,141,931	\$ 2,141,931
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.00	\$	418,277	\$ 418,277
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.00	\$	980,744	\$ 1,156,118
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.00	\$	838,911	\$ 987,010
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.00	\$	663,097	\$ 783,179
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.00	\$	2,499,686	\$ 2,956,745
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.00	\$	1,340,349	\$ 1,591,557
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	299.00	\$	22,288,294	\$ 30,556,417
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.00	\$	649,616	\$ 803,285
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.00	\$	200,325	\$ 238,132
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$	861,012	\$ 1,033,627
Premium Pay - Platform			\$	959,761	\$ 1,152,174
Sum:		438.00	\$	43,715,323	\$ 55,681,494

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure		FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$14,000, Replacement Years 4	\$	583,100	\$ 700,000

Van, Type A, lift equipped	49	FY27: Unit Cost \$38,315, Replacement Years 4	\$ 390,976	\$ 469,359
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	FY27: Unit Cost \$41,772, Replacement Years 4	\$ 556,737	\$ 668,352
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	FY27: Unit Cost \$18,417, Replacement Years 4	\$ 95,884	\$ 115,106
2 way radios	338	FFY27: Unit Cost \$54.21, Replacement Years 4	\$ 3,816	\$ 4,581
Tablets	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$1000 Replacement Years 4	\$ 41,650	\$ 50,000
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.1 at \$5.20 per gallon)	0		\$ 1,936,423	\$ 2,324,637
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)	0		\$ 729,323	\$ 875,538
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system	0		\$ 226,427	\$ 271,821
CabConnect	0		\$ 329,402	\$ 395,440
Claims Est.	0	3.9% of Total Salary	\$ 1,191,122	\$ 1,429,918
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 136,987	\$ 164,450
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$660/person/year)	0		\$ 7,697	\$ 9,240
Other Pay: 7382/7381/7410 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 11,087	\$ 13,310
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 962	\$ 1,155
2905_C Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility Worker	4		\$ 550,394	\$ 621,481
2907_C Eligibility Worker Supervisor	1		\$ 152,525	\$ 172,225
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 2,062	\$ 2,475
Overhead @45.6%	0		\$ 19,934,187	\$ 25,390,761
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 26,880,761	\$ 33,679,849

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 70,596,084 \$ 89,361,343

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 70,596,084	\$ 89,361,343
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 27,074,627	\$ 32,505,813
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 43,521,457	\$ 56,855,530
	% of Savings to City Cost	61.65%	63.62%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Paratransit (24163)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 285,784	\$ 342,488
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 212,102	\$ 256,977
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 294,068	\$ 347,152
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 306,790	\$ 428,904
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 803,998	\$ 1,105,710
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 287,929	\$ 339,905
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 398,617	\$ 468,855
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.00	\$ 646,192	\$ 763,770
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,634	\$ 256,697
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.00	\$ 2,535,436	\$ 2,973,742
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.00	\$ 3,808,825	\$ 4,481,736
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 141,069	\$ 166,500
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 346,505	\$ 405,574
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 144,141	\$ 169,849
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.00	\$ 2,258,004	\$ 2,258,004
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 440,572	\$ 440,572
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.00	\$ 1,035,421	\$ 1,218,826
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 886,163	\$ 1,041,038
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 699,950	\$ 825,521
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.00	\$ 2,637,281	\$ 3,115,274
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 1,413,015	\$ 1,675,721
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	299.00	\$ 22,961,042	\$ 31,248,594
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 685,202	\$ 846,141
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 211,137	\$ 250,676
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 883,143	\$ 1,060,194
Premium Pay - Platform			\$ 984,429	\$ 1,181,786
	Sum:	438.00	\$ 45,522,449	\$ 57,670,206

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$14,000, Replacement Years 4	\$ 583,100	\$ 700,000
Van, Type A, lift equipped	49	FY27: Unit Cost \$38,315, Replacement Years 4	\$ 390,976	\$ 469,359
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	FY27: Unit Cost \$41,772, Replacement Years 4	\$ 556,737	\$ 668,352
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	FY27: Unit Cost \$18,417, Replacement Years 4	\$ 95,884	\$ 115,106
2 way radios	338	FFY27: Unit Cost \$54.21, Replacement Years 4	\$ 3,816	\$ 4,581
Tablets	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$1000 Replacement Years 4	\$ 41,650	\$ 50,000
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.1 at \$5.20 per gallon)	0		\$ 1,936,423	\$ 2,324,637
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)	0		\$ 753,391	\$ 904,431
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system	0		\$ 233,899	\$ 280,791
CabConnect	0		\$ 340,272	\$ 408,490
Claims Est.	0	3.9% of Total Salary	\$ 1,230,429	\$ 1,477,105
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 141,507	\$ 169,877
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$660/person/year)	0		\$ 7,951	\$ 9,545
Other Pay: 7382/7381/7410 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 11,453	\$ 13,749
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 994	\$ 1,193
2905_C Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility Worker	4		\$ 564,539	\$ 637,453
2907_C Eligibility Worker Supervisor	1		\$ 156,445	\$ 176,651
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 2,130	\$ 2,475
Overhead @45.6%	0		\$ 20,758,237	\$ 26,297,614
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 27,809,833	\$ 34,711,409

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 73,332,282 \$ 92,381,615

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 73,332,282	\$ 92,381,615
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 27,975,019	\$ 33,586,423
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 45,357,263	\$ 58,795,192
% of Savings to City Cost	61.85%	63.64%