



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Naomi Kelly, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Convention Facilities Management – FY 2020-21

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2020-21 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ _____
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Adam Nguyen, Finance and Planning Director

ADM - General Services Agency - City Administrator
 278641 ADM Convention Facilities Mgmt
 SMG Moscone Convention Center Contract
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
FISCAL YEAR 2020-21

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager I	0922	10.0	\$ 4,577	\$ 5,495	\$ 1,194,596	\$ 1,434,089
Manager II	0923	3.0	\$ 4,914	\$ 5,899	\$ 384,781	\$ 461,922
Manager III	0931	1.0	\$ 5,298	\$ 6,360	\$ 138,273	\$ 165,994
Manager IV	0932	8.0	\$ 5,687	\$ 6,828	\$ 1,187,547	\$ 1,425,626
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$ 6,135	\$ 7,365	\$ 160,118	\$ 192,218
Deputy Director III	0953	2.0	\$ 6,585	\$ 7,905	\$ 343,719	\$ 412,627
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	\$ 7,981	\$ 9,581	\$ 208,297	\$ 250,056
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	\$ 3,237	\$ 3,886	\$ 46,465	\$ 55,780
IS Manager	1071	0.6	\$ 6,585	\$ 7,905	\$ 94,523	\$ 113,473
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	\$ 3,765	\$ 4,520	\$ 98,266	\$ 117,967
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 2,937	\$ 3,525	\$ 76,646	\$ 92,012
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	\$ 4,142	\$ 4,972	\$ 108,106	\$ 129,779
Senior Clerk	1406	1.0	\$ 2,172	\$ 2,607	\$ 56,688	\$ 68,053
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,865	\$ 3,440	\$ 74,783	\$ 89,775
Secretary II	1446	1.0	\$ 2,631	\$ 3,159	\$ 68,676	\$ 82,445
Accountant III	1654	2.0	\$ 3,796	\$ 4,557	\$ 198,149	\$ 237,874
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	\$ 2,440	\$ 2,930	\$ 63,692	\$ 76,461
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	\$ 4,044	\$ 4,854	\$ 211,080	\$ 253,398
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$ 4,914	\$ 5,899	\$ 128,260	\$ 153,974
Custodian	2708	71.0	\$ 2,186	\$ 2,624	\$ 4,050,334	\$ 4,862,346
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,652	\$ 3,184	\$ 69,215	\$ 83,091
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	0.5	\$ 5,059	\$ 6,073	\$ 66,014	\$ 79,248
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	1.0	\$ 4,191	\$ 5,032	\$ 109,393	\$ 131,324
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	\$ 4,274	\$ 5,131	\$ 111,547	\$ 133,911
Painting Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$ 3,691	\$ 4,431	\$ 96,336	\$ 115,649
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	1.0	\$ 3,200	\$ 3,842	\$ 83,530	\$ 100,276
Stationary Engineer	7334	8.5	\$ 3,368	\$ 4,044	\$ 747,282	\$ 897,097
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	\$ 3,818	\$ 4,583	\$ 298,922	\$ 358,850
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$ 3,349	\$ 4,020	\$ 87,400	\$ 104,922
Plumber	7345	1.0	\$ 3,765	\$ 4,520	\$ 98,266	\$ 117,967
Painter	7346	1.5	\$ 3,082	\$ 3,700	\$ 120,661	\$ 144,851
Electrician	7347	1.0	\$ 3,898	\$ 4,680	\$ 101,746	\$ 122,144
Security Guard	8202	23.0	\$ 2,007	\$ 2,409	\$ 1,204,676	\$ 1,446,190
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	6.0	\$ 3,172	\$ 3,808	\$ 496,750	\$ 596,339
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Ofcr	8211	3.0	\$ 2,700	\$ 3,241	\$ 211,417	\$ 253,802
Parking Control Officer	8214	5.0	\$ 2,434	\$ 2,922	\$ 317,676	\$ 381,364
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	\$ 2,909	\$ 3,492	\$ 151,856	\$ 182,300
Public Safety/Comm Supv	8239	1.0	\$ 4,069	\$ 4,884	\$ 106,191	\$ 127,481
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			159,403	191,360
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			131,580	157,959
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			164,475	197,449
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			173,894	208,756
Total FTE		171.6				
Total Salary Costs-->					14,001,229	16,808,198
Total of Other Compensation-->					629,351	755,524

FRINGE BENEFITS	
Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922 64,583
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923 67,130
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 70,028
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932 72,971
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0933 76,350
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953 79,748
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0955 90,292
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062 47,293
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1071 79,748
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1218 51,781
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222 43,688
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1244 54,547
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406 36,218
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408 42,991
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1446 40,705
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1654 52,748
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936 38,840
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1956 55,165
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1958 62,061
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708 36,352
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718 40,907
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	6281 63,168
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7203 56,986
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205 57,974
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7242 52,906
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7333 48,133
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334 49,775
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7335 54,163
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7344 49,964
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7345 55,165
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7346 46,957
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7347 57,424
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,728
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8210 45,989
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211 41,377
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8214 38,781
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8216 43,419
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8239 54,132
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low High
	\$ 6,886,794 \$ 7,751,423

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Contractual Services	\$ 3,987,776	\$ 3,987,776
Workers' Compensation	\$ 930,519	\$ 930,519
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,918,295	\$ 4,918,295

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	26,435,668	30,233,440
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	23,139,396	23,187,849
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 3,296,273</u>	<u>\$ 7,045,591</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	12%	23%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1997 was the first year these services were contracted out.
 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability.
 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>