

City & County of San Francisco
London N. Breed, Mayor



Office of the City Administrator
Carmen Chu, City Administrator
Jillian Johnson, Director
Committee on Information Technology

To: Angela Calvillo
Clerk of Board of Supervisors

From: Carmen Chu, City Administrator
Jillian Johnson, Director, Committee of Information Technology

Date: July 18, 2022

Subject: Legislation introduced for Approval of Surveillance Technology Policies for
Multiple City Departments

In compliance with Section 19B of the City and County of San Francisco's Administrative Code, the City Administrator's Office is pleased to submit Surveillance Technology Policies and Impact Reports for the following technologies to the Board of Supervisors for their review:

- Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPR)
- Biometric Processing Software and/or System
- Body-Worn Cameras
- People-Counting Camera
- Security Cameras
- Third-Party Security Cameras
- Location Management System
- Computer Management System
- Social Media Monitoring Software

The Committee on Information Technology (COIT) and its subcommittee, the Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB), held public meetings over the course of the last year to engage the public in developing these Surveillance Technology policies. All details of these discussions are available at sf.gov/COIT.

The following sections provide more detail on the departments seeking Board of Supervisors approval for their surveillance technology policies, and the COIT recommended course of action.

If you have questions on the review process, please direct questions to Jillian Johnson, Director of the Committee on Information Technology (COIT).

Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPR)

Department	Authorized Uses
Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Enforce parking restrictions and laws. 2. Transit Only Lane Enforcement (TOLE). 3. Link individual vehicles to their times of entry/exit into City-owned parking garages and lots to accurately calculate parking fees. 4. Identify vehicles that are the subject of an active investigation by the SFPD (e.g., vehicles included on “hot lists” generated by the SFPD –see Appendix B & C of MTA policy, and page 8 of SFPD ALPR Policy). 5. Analysis of and reporting on parking and curb usage.

ALPR Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
August 27, 2021	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
September 24, 2021	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
October 21, 2021	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the ALPR Surveillance Technology Policy for the MTA.

Biometric Processing Software or System

Department	Authorized Uses
Juvenile Probation	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Youth are only placed on continuous alcohol monitoring (CAM) in San Francisco with a court order. The Court may order a youth to be placed on CAM as a condition of probation, if the Court determines that is in the interest of public safety and the youth's wellbeing. CAM data is analyzed on a daily basis by probation officers to ensure compliance with the Court's order.

Biometric Processing Software/System Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
January 14, 2022	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
February 17, 2022	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Biometric Processing System Surveillance Technology Policy for Juvenile Probation.

Body-Worn Cameras

Departments	Authorized Uses
Fire	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Use by Public Information Officer (PIO) at large incidents to capture video of surroundings and the totality of the incident
Recreation and Parks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Recording video and audio footage in the event of an incident. Incidents can be: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Actual or potential criminal conduct o Situation when a Park Ranger reasonably believes recordings of evidentiary value may be obtained o Calls for service involving a crime where the recording may aid in the apprehension/ prosecution of a suspect - Providing recording to law enforcement or other authorized persons upon request.

Body-Worn Cameras Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting	Departments
September 10, 2021	PSAB	Fire
September 24, 2021	PSAB	Recreation and Parks
October 21, 2021	COIT	Fire, Recreation and Parks

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Body-Worn Camera Surveillance Technology Policies for the Fire Department and the Recreation and Parks Department.

People-Counting Cameras

Departments	Authorized Uses
Library	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- To tally the entry and exit of Library visitors at all 28 public facilities.- To track usage of meeting rooms, elevators and restrooms for purposes of resource allocation.

People-Counting Cameras Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
January 28, 2022	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
March 11, 2022	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
April 21, 2022	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the People-Counting Camera Surveillance Technology policy for the Library.

Security Cameras

Departments	Authorized Uses
Elections	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Live monitoring of voting center lines.- Live monitoring of Department staff during elections operations.- Recording of video and images of Department staff during elections operations.- Reviewing camera footage of Department staff in the event of an incident.- Sharing camera footage of Department staff with the public to promote transparency into elections operations.

Security Cameras Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
October 22, 2021	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
November 18, 2021	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Security Camera Surveillance Technology Policy for the Department of Elections.

Third-Party Security Cameras

Departments	Authorized Uses
Airport (AIR)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reviewing camera footage in the event of an incident. - Approving Tenant’s disclosure of digital recordings and other data from its security camera system.
Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Review recording of on-board incidents based upon complaints received from the public and at appeals hearing in response to a fine, suspension or response to fine revocation. - Review video data in response to complaints from the public to ensure compliance by taxi cab companies and other taxi permittees with requirements and conditions under Article 1100 (Regulation of Motor Vehicles for Hire) of Division II of the SF Transportation Code. - Review video data to confirm taxi cab companies and other taxi permittees complete rides paid for with public funds before paying the companies for those rides. For example, under its wheelchair program taxi incentive, the Department reviews video data from the technology to confirm that taxi cab drivers pick up individuals with certain disabilities before paying drivers for those rides, which are funded under various paratransit programs. - Review video to investigate criminal acts involving taxi drivers or riders. - Review video data to investigate accidents involving a taxi cab.
War Memorial (WAR)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Live monitoring internal office space and public area of Davies Symphony Hall. - Reviewing camera footage provided by Tenant/Contractor upon request in the event of an incident.

Third-Party Security Cameras Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting	Departments
October 22, 2021	PSAB	WAR
January 14, 2022	PSAB	WAR, AIR
January 28, 2022	PSAB	AIR
February 17, 2022	COIT	AIR
March 11, 2022	PSAB	MTA
April 21, 2022	COIT	WAR, MTA

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Third-Party Security Camera Surveillance Technology Policies for the Airport, Municipal Transportation Agency, and War Memorial.

Location Management System

Department	Authorized Uses
Juvenile Probation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Youth are only placed on electronic monitoring in San Francisco with a court order. The Court may order a youth to be placed on electronic monitoring as an alternative to detention. - Electronic monitoring (EM) may also be added as a condition of probation if additional supervision is warranted. EM data is analyzed on a daily basis by probation officers to ensure compliance with: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Court ordered curfews <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Inclusion zones: addresses/areas where the minor has approval to be present, for example their home, school, work. o Exclusion zones: addresses/areas where the minor should not be present, including Stay Away orders o Schedules: To monitor school attendance, program participation, work.
Recreation and Parks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Confirm that the person who reserved the booking for a tennis court is at the location at the reserved time. - Utilize data to determine if there are any reservation holders who are violating booking policies because they are not showing up at the reserved time.

Location Management System Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting	Department
October 22, 2021	PSAB	Juvenile Probation
November 18, 2021	COIT	Juvenile Probation
March 11, 2022	PSAB	Recreation and Parks
May 27, 2022	PSAB	Recreation and Parks
June 16, 2022	COIT	Recreation and Parks

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Location Management Surveillance Technology Policies for Juvenile Probation and the Recreation and Parks Department.

Social Media Monitoring Software

Department	Authorized Uses
Library	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Plan and execute more effective and strategic campaigns across social media platforms. - Schedule multiple social media posts in advance. - Create and monitor multiple streams of content across various platforms. - Maintain active social media presence that is automated, specifically on weekends when staff is off. - Ensure consistency of messaging across all social media platforms. - Track post performance and analyze trends to improve content and strategy. - Create reports.

Social Media Monitoring Software Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
August 27, 2021	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
October 21, 2021	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Social Media Monitoring Software Surveillance Technology Policy for the Library.

Computer Management System

Departments	Authorized Uses
Library	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The authorized use case for the TBS Computer Time and Print Management tool is to provide time-delimited public access to library computers and allow the public to print, copy, scan and fax documents, as well as track usage of computers and print resources throughout the library's 28 facilities for purposes of resource allocation and management. The five specific components within TBS Computer Time and Print Management are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MyPC: Manages patron access to library computers and regulates amount of time each patron can use computers • EZ Booking: Allows patrons to manage their reservations in MyPC, schedule public computer use, etc. • Papercut/EPrintIt: Manages public print jobs sent from library computers and patrons' personal devices, allowing them to print their documents on library printers. Also allows select library staff members, in the interest of customer service and support, to retrieve and print jobs submitted to the system by users during the 24-hour period in which documents are retrievable. This allows staff to print jobs when printers fail, when print jobs do not meet user expectations, to intermedate when users are struggling with technology, etc. • Allows library patrons to scan, manipulate, manage, print, email, fax and save documents using either the library's flat-bed or document feeder scanners. • Payment Kiosk: Allows patrons to pay for print and copy jobs processed through Papercut/EPrintIt and/or ScanEZ.

Security Cameras Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
May 27, 2022	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)

June 16, 2022	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)
---------------	--

COIT Recommendation:

COIT recommends the Board of Supervisors adopt the Computer Management System Surveillance Technology Policy for the Library.