

File No. 190633

Committee Item No. 3

Board Item No. 14

COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget & Finance Committee

Date June 26, 2019

Board of Supervisors Meeting

Date July 23, 2019

Cmte Board

- | | | |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Motion |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Resolution |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Ordinance |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Legislative Digest |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Budget and Legislative Analyst Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Youth Commission Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Introduction Form |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | MOU |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Information Form |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Budget |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Subcontract Budget |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Contract/Agreement |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Form 126 - Ethics Commission |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Award Letter |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Application |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Public Correspondence |

OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____

Completed by: Linda Wong Date June 14, 2019

Completed by: Linda Wong Date July 8, 2019

1 [Proposition J Contract Certification - Specified Contracted-Out Services Previously Approved]

2
3 Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously
4 approved can be performed by a private contractor for a lower cost than similar work
5 performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget analyst
6 (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall); citywide
7 security services, central shops security, convention facilities management (General
8 Services Agency - City Administrator); security services at Building Design and
9 Construction, and Infrastructure Design and Construction (Public Works); mainframe
10 system support (General Services Agency - Technology); security services (Human
11 Services Agency); security services (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); food
12 services for jail inmates (Sheriff); and assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes
13 (Department of Elections).

14
15 WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed
16 Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with
17 private companies for specific services that can be performed for a lower cost than similar
18 work by City and County employees (Charter, Section 10.104.15); and

19 WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services
20 listed below; and

21 WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for
22 the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve substantial cost
23 savings for the City; and

1 WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco must reconcile a projected \$30.6
2 million budget deficit for FY2019-2020 with a Charter obligation to enact a balanced budget
3 each fiscal year; and

4 WHEREAS, The Mayor has determined that the state of the City's budget for
5 FY2018-2019 as indicated herein has created an emergency situation justifying a
6 Purchaser's award of a contract for the following services: budget analyst (Board of
7 Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services,
8 central shops security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency - City
9 Administrator); security services at Building Design and Construction, and Infrastructure
10 Design and Construction (Public Works); mainframe system support (General Services
11 Agency - Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); security services
12 (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly
13 of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); and

14 WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be
15 performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of
16 the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 190633,
17 which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now,
18 therefore be it;

19 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's
20 certification, and the Mayor's determination of an emergency situation, and approves the
21 Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of a contract to a private
22 contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020.
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Department/Function	City Cost (High)	Contract Cost (High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
Board of Supervisors (BOS)				
Budget Analyst	2,518,406	2,380,599	137,808	12.5
General Services Agency—City Administrator (ADM)				
Central Shops Security Services	348,243	166,712	181,531	3.0
Citywide Custodial Services	4,264,238	2,328,315	1,935,922	34.2
Citywide Security Services	3,950,997	2,129,855	1,821,142	37.8
Convention Facilities Management	52,828,950	41,993,300	10,835,650	341.7
General Services Agency—Technology (TIS)				
Mainframe System Support	1,689,797	1,027,140	662,657	6.0
General Services Agency – Public Works (DPW)				
Security Services at BDC	199,979	153,330	46,649	2.1
Security Services at IDC	295,231	199,587	95,644	3.1
Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HOM)				
Security Services	5,205,130	3,536,018	1,669,113	50.6
Human Services Agency (HSA)				
Security Services	7,817,868	4,386,794	3,431,074	74.7
Sheriff (SHF)				
Food Services for Jail Inmates	2,193,110	1,171,399	1,021,710	19.0
Elections (REG)				
Assembly of Vote by Mail Ballots	2,398,060	507,674	1,890,385	26.4



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Honorable Board of Supervisors
City Hall, Room 244
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

RE: Budget and Legislative Analyst Services – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Budget and Legislative Analyst services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met, when comparing contract costs to the high end of comparable City wages and benefits.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield", enclosed in a large, loopy oval.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

CITY HALL • 1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE • ROOM 316 • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-4694

PHONE 415-554-7500 • FAX 415-554-7466

Board of Supervisors
 207688 Budget and Legislative Analyst
 Budget and Legislative Analyst
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20
 ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class (Title)	Class	Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	\$ 5,930	\$ 7,568	\$ 155,375	\$ 198,274
Deputy Director I	0951	1.0	4,321	5,261	\$ 107,975	\$ 137,832
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	1.0	4,318	5,248	\$ 339,367	\$ 412,527
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	3,790	4,534	\$ 390,943	\$ 475,124
Performance Analyst III - Project Manager	1830	2.0	4,667	5,674	\$ 244,568	\$ 297,330
Executive Secretary I	1450	1.0	2,709	3,293	\$ 70,976	\$ 86,283
Temp		0.6	3,017	3,817	\$ 50,000	\$ 50,000
					\$ -	\$ -
					\$ -	\$ -
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE			12.5			
Total Salary Costs ->					\$ 1,359,204	\$ 1,657,370
Total of Other Compensation ->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	0953 73,855
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	0951 60,275
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	1824 55,217
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	1823 50,375
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	1830 57,837
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	1450 40,008
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low High
	\$ 578,561 \$ 656,961

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Operating Expenses	\$ 204,075	\$ 204,075
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 204,075	\$ 204,075

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 2,141,840	\$ 2,518,406
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 2,377,379	\$ 2,380,599
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ (235,539)	\$ 137,808
% of Savings to City Cost	-11%	5%

Comments/Assumptions:

- F.Y. 1978 would be the first year these services are contracted out.
- Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2019. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- Classifications based on current configuration of Budget and Legislative Analyst services.
- Full time equivalent (FTE) positions include 10 managers and analyst staff and 2 administrative staff. The staff level of 10 managers and analysts is based on the number of staff required to provide 18,860 hours of productive service, as well as MOU-mandated leave and training hours and other nonproductive administrative hours (staff meetings, performance evaluations, and other administrative hours) consistent with ALGA (Association of Local Government Auditors) standards.
- Space rental has been determined using Department of Real Estate estimates for the Civic Center area.
- Calculations do not include liability for retiree health. Based on the CAFR for year ending June 30, 2017, the City's annual liability for post-retirement employee health benefits is \$421 million. If the Budget and Legislative Analyst services were provided by City employees, the annual liability for retiree health benefits would be \$174,992 (equal to 0.04 percent of the City's total annual retiree health liability based on FTE count).
- Estimated total contract cost includes the 3.2% COLA requested by the contractor. If this COLA is not approved by the Board of Supervisors, the total estimated contract cost would be \$2,290,451 in F.Y. 2019-20.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Naomi Kelly, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attn: Jennifer Johnston, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Fleet Security – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be "Ben Rosenfield", written over a large, light-colored oval scribble.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

ADM - General Services Agency - City Administrator
 296644 ADM Internal Services - Fleet Management
 Security at Central Shops
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS:

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	PW Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	3.00	\$ 2,327	\$ 2,808	\$182,931	\$220,707
Holiday Pay (0.5 * 11 days * 24 hrs)					3,840	4,633
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					11,074	13,360
Uniform Allowance					1,500	1,500
Total FTE			3.0			
Total Salary Costs ->					\$182,931	\$220,707
Total of Other Compensation ->					\$16,414	\$19,494

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE—Job Class #:	8207	\$36,014	
Benefits per FTE—Job Class #:	7277	\$56,203	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$97,514	\$108,042

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$296,859	\$348,243
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$145,770	\$166,712
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 151,089	\$ 181,531
% of Savings to City Cost	51%	52%

Comments/Assumptions:

- Hours per FTE is 1,784. (2,088 hours - 80 hours vacation pay - 88 hours holiday pay - 32 hours floating holiday pay - 104 hours sick pay)
- Level of Service is similar to amount of hours specified in contract detail tab.
- Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective 7/1/2019 per BPMS 15.15.016 & BPMS 15.15.014. Contracts represented are annual 12 month costs.
- Fringe Benefits calculated in accordance with BPMS 15.15.016 and the template.
- 7 hours each day eligible for 8% shift-differential pay; 7 hours each day eligible for 10% shift-differential pay (Local 1021 MOU Items 293 & 294)
- 5% of 7277's time is spent supervising security guard employees.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Naomi Kelly, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attn: Jennifer Johnston, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Custodial Services at Various Locations – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield", enclosed within a hand-drawn oval.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

ADM - General Services Agency - City Administrator
 296644 ADM Internal Services - Real Estate Division
 Custodial Services
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Custodian	2708	31.0	\$ 2,068	\$ 2,513	\$ 1,679,884	\$ 2,040,755
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	2.0	\$ 2,274	\$ 2,764	\$ 119,158	\$ 144,812
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,506	\$ 3,047	\$ 65,669	\$ 79,843
Management Assistant	1842	0.1	2,946	3,580	\$ 7,718	\$ 9,380
Manager II	0923	0.1	4,426	5,647	\$ 5,798	\$ 7,398
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					\$ 108,608	\$ 129,509
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					\$ 126,800	\$ 154,048
Total FTE		34.2				
Total Salary Costs ->					\$ 1,878,227	\$ 2,282,188
Total of Other Compensation ->					\$ 233,408	\$ 283,557

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	2708 \$33,878
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	2716 \$35,813
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	2718 \$38,002
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	1842 \$42,111
Benefits per FTE - Job Class #:	0923 \$62,446
Total Fringe Benefits	Low \$ 1,057,806 High \$ 1,167,179

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Materials and Supplies - Consumables	\$ 241,215	\$ 241,215
Uniform	\$ 16,700	\$ 16,700
As-Needed Custodial and est. MFB	\$ 225,053	\$ 273,399
	\$ -	\$ -
Total	\$ 482,968	\$ 531,314

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 3,652,409.64	\$ 4,264,237.91
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 2,325,142.60	\$ 2,328,316.42
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,327,267	\$ 1,935,922
% of Savings to City Cost	36%	46%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FTE level assumes that one custodian can cover 35,000 square feet. Total square feet of six facilities is 1,085,000.
2. Supervision level is 1 FTE per 15 custodians (31/15 rounded up is 3)
3. If work were brought in house, instead of monitoring contracts, 0923 and 1842 would supervise custodial staff at same
4. Service Level during hours eligible for night/shift differential is 80% of service level during day.
5. City would purchase same level of consumables if work was not contracted out.
6. As-needed custodial staff cover 31 FTE custodians during sick and vacation leave. (2,088 hours - 80 hours vacation pay - 32 hours floating holiday pay - 104 hours sick pay) = 1872



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Naomi Kelly, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attn: Jennifer Johnston, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Real Estate Security Services – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield", written over a horizontal line.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

ADM - General Services Agency - City Administrator
 296644 ADM Internal Services - Real Estate Division
 Security Services
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	Full Time Equivalent Positions	Per Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost per FTE	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	37.7	\$ 1,900	\$ 2,310	\$ 1,878,100	\$ 2,282,842
Senior Real Property Officer	4142	0.1	\$ 4,458	\$ 5,419	\$ 11,681	\$ 14,199
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			53,691	65,261
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			62,812	76,348
Uniform Pay (\$500 per FTE)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		37.8				
Total Salary Costs ->					\$ 1,889,781	\$ 2,297,041
Total of Other Compensation ->					\$ 116,502	\$ 141,609

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202		
		\$34,240	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4142		
		\$56,928	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 1,175,414	\$ 1,297,312

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Uniform Pay (\$500 per FTE)	\$ 18,863	\$ 18,863
Cellular Phones (\$2800 per year + \$509.50 one-time cost) to (\$4500 a year + \$700 one-time cost)	\$ 124,852	\$ 196,172
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total	\$ 143,715	\$ 215,035

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 3,325,412	\$ 3,950,997
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 2,126,654	\$ 2,129,855
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,198,758	\$ 1,821,142
% of Savings to City Cost	36%	46%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FTE level assumes 1792 hours (2096 hours - 80 hours vacation pay - 32 hours floating holiday pay - 104 hours sick pay - 88 hours holidays and is divided by total hours in contracts)
2. For 24/7 items (5 in cost detail list) - assume 7 hours of pay eligible for 10% differential per shift, 7 hours of pay eligible for 8% differential per shift; 11 paid holidays (Local 1021 MOU Items 293 & 294)
3. For 1SVN shift between 2-7pm on M-F, assume two hours of 8% differential pay per shift
4. For 30VN shift between 6:30 am - 6:30 pm on M-F, assume 2 hours of 8% differential pay per shift
5. For 196 Ois shift between 6am - 11pm each day, assume seven hours of 8% differential pay per shift and 17 hours of holiday pay
6. For Alemany Market 16 hour weekend shifts, assume six hours of 8% differential pay per shift
7. Per Local 1021 MOU item 218, \$500 uniform allowance paid to 8202 Security Guards.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Naomi Kelly, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attn: Jennifer Johnston, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be "B. Rosenfield", written over a horizontal line.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

ADM - General Services Agency - City Administrator
 278641 ADM Convention Facilities Mgmt
 SMG Moscone Convention Center Contract
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job/Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager I	0922	14.0	4,121	5,261	\$ 1,511,656	\$ 1,929,653
Manager II	0923	5.0	4,426	5,647	\$ 579,758.25	\$ 739,821.65
Manager III	0931	2.0	4,770	6,089	\$ 249,957.59	\$ 319,048.93
Manager IV	0932	8.0	5,123	6,537	\$ 1,073,772.10	\$ 1,370,186.80
Manager V	0933	1.0	5,623	7,050	\$ 144,703.78	\$ 184,719.63
Deputy Director III	0953	2.0	5,930	7,568	\$ 310,749.34	\$ 396,547.64
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	7,188	9,172	\$ 188,330.49	\$ 240,310.67
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	2,958	3,720	\$ 46,499.23	\$ 58,479.73
IS Manager	1071	0.6	5,312	7,568	\$ 83,507.82	\$ 118,964.29
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	3,561	4,328	\$ 93,289.48	\$ 113,391.71
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	2,777	3,376	\$ 72,756.09	\$ 88,439.07
Personnel Analyst	1241	1.0	2,759	4,061	\$ 72,298.00	\$ 106,385.57
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	3,899	4,738	\$ 102,154.94	\$ 124,143.45
Senior Clerk	1406	2.0	2,052	2,496	\$ 107,517.33	\$ 130,799.28
Secretary I	1444	1.5	2,150	2,613	\$ 84,477.90	\$ 102,707.35
Secretary II	1446	1.0	2,488	3,025	\$ 65,184.07	\$ 79,250.24
Accountant III	1654	2.0	3,589	4,363	\$ 188,087.97	\$ 228,615.80
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,946	3,580	\$ 77,175.35	\$ 93,801.46
Storekeeper	1934	1.0	2,166	2,632	\$ 56,749.75	\$ 68,956.61
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	2,307	2,805	\$ 60,441.45	\$ 73,483.65
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	3,822	4,647	\$ 200,267.87	\$ 243,490.38
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	4,647	5,647	\$ 121,745.19	\$ 147,964.33
Custodian	2708	181.9	2,068	2,513	\$ 9,854,417.62	\$ 11,971,328.82
Custodial Supervisor	2718	5.0	2,506	3,047	\$ 328,345.54	\$ 399,215.36
Sr. Environmental Spec	5642	1.0	3,749	4,556	\$ 98,220.72	\$ 119,373.88
Principal Environ Specialist	5644	1.0	4,279	5,200	\$ 112,098.27	\$ 136,242.52
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	2.5	5,814	5,814	\$ 380,824.24	\$ 380,824.24
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	6.0	4,702	4,702	\$ 739,201.87	\$ 739,201.87
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	4,795	4,795	\$ 125,625.52	\$ 125,625.52
Painting Supervisor	7242	2.0	3,312	4,243	\$ 173,536.75	\$ 222,310.28
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	2.0	2,458	3,592	\$ 128,805.23	\$ 188,195.75
Stationary Engineer	7334	23.0	3,780	3,780	\$ 2,277,669.82	\$ 2,277,669.82
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	4,284	4,284	\$ 336,699.02	\$ 336,699.02
Painter	7346	3.0	2,916	3,543	\$ 229,181.68	\$ 278,494.14
Security Guard	8202	22.0	1,899	2,307	\$ 1,094,359.38	\$ 1,329,711.86
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	6.0	2,860	3,477	\$ 449,632.64	\$ 546,640.76
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Ofcr	8211	3.0	2,481	3,016	\$ 194,986.32	\$ 237,023.17
Parking Control Officer	8214	19.7	2,172	2,798	\$ 1,118,309.61	\$ 1,440,247.22
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	2,593	3,344	\$ 135,865.26	\$ 175,207.44
Public Safety Comm Supv	8239	1.0	3,849	4,677	\$ 100,834.55	\$ 122,526.64
Pub Safety Communication Coord	8240	1.0	4,041	4,911	\$ 105,873.58	\$ 128,670.49
Utility Mechanic	7325	2.0	3,885	3,885	\$ 203,565.37	\$ 203,565.37
IS Engineer	1044	1.0	5,061	6,366	\$ 132,604.71	\$ 166,800.07
Communications Systems Technician	7362	1.0	4,121	5,010	\$ 107,975.43	\$ 131,267.38
Public Relations Mgr	9251	1.0	4,667	5,674	\$ 122,284.12	\$ 148,664.94
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			366,842	431,428
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			302,811	365,124
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			378,514	445,155
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			400,191	470,649
Total FTE		341.7				
Total Salary Costs					\$ 24,711,640.13	\$ 28,764,646.99
Total of Other Compensation					\$ 1,448,357.87	\$ 1,703,355.81

FRINGE BENEFITS

	Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922	60,114
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923	62,446
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	65,030
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932	67,657
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0933	70,664
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953	73,695
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0955	83,094
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062	43,991
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1071	73,695
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1218	47,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222	40,532
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1241	45,748
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1244	50,376
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406	33,751
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1444	34,655
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1446	37,828
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1654	48,942
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	42,111
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1934	34,798
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936	36,131
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1956	51,128
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1958	57,559
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	33,878
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	38,002
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	5642	50,431
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	5644	54,732
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	6281	68,551
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7203	51,728
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205	52,430
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7242	48,939
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7333	43,756
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334	45,207
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7335	49,094
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7346	43,545
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	34,332
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8210	41,318
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211	37,757
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8214	36,075
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8216	40,287
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8239	49,975
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8240	52,543
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7325	46,616
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044	61,837
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7362	52,502
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9251	62,602
Total Fringe Benefits		
	Low	High
	\$ 12,231,633.75	\$ 13,656,272.81

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Contractual Services	\$ 6,870,077	\$ 6,870,077
Workers' Compensation	\$ 1,834,597	\$ 1,834,597
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 8,704,674	\$ 8,704,674

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 47,096,305.75	\$ 52,828,949.62
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 41,936,998.56	\$ 41,993,299.94
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 5,159,307	\$ 10,835,650
% of Savings to City Cost	11%	21%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1997 was the first year these services were contracted out.
 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2019. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability.
 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Linda Gerull, CIO
Department of Technology
1 South Van Ness Ave. 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Elaine Benvenuti, Deputy Director, Finance & Administration, CFO/CAO

RE: Mainframe System Support – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Mainframe System Support have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield", enclosed within a large, hand-drawn oval.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

Department of Technology
 232339 IDT SD Service Delivery

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class/Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Information Systems Manager	0941	0.5	\$ 5,930	\$ 7,568	77,687	99,137
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	2.0	\$ 4,705	\$ 5,918	246,562	310,103
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	3.0	\$ 5,061	\$ 6,366	397,814	500,400
Clerk Typist	1424	0.5	\$ 2,058	\$ 2,501	26,960	32,767
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			150,926	189,846
Total FTE			6.0			
Total Salary Costs—>					\$ 749,023.95	\$ 942,406.94
Total of Other Compensation—>					\$ 138,399.84	\$ 174,089.62

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE—Job Class #:	0941	73,855	
Benefits per FTE—Job Class #:	1043	59,287	
Benefits per FTE—Job Class #:	1044	61,956	
Benefits per FTE—Job Class #:	1424	33,902	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 313,511	\$ 358,320

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Specialized Training	\$ 158,400	\$ 158,400
Trident OSEM Software Purchase	\$ 49,200	\$ 49,200
Trident Annual Maintenance	\$ 7,380	\$ 7,380
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 214,980	\$ 214,980

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 1,415,914.46	\$ 1,689,796.69
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 978,000.00	\$ 1,027,140.00
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 437,914	\$ 662,657
% of Savings to City Cost	31%	39%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2004-2005 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2019. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. In-house mainframe systems operations required contract services for specialized and as-needed services that could not be met by
6. Trident Services, Inc. provides installation, configuration, maintenance and support of systems, collection of data for billing, and
7. The services are 24 hours/day, 7 days/week that requires employees to standby during the non-regular business hours for



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Mohammed Nuru
Director of Public Works
City Hall, Room 348
San Francisco, CA 94102-4645

Attn: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director for Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security at 3rd and 4th Floor of 30 Van Ness Avenue – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at 30 Van Ness Avenue have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield", written over a horizontal line.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

CITY HALL • 1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE • ROOM 316 • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-4694
PHONE 415-554-7500 • FAX 415-554-7466

Public Works - Building Design & Construction

Security Guard Services - 3rd and 4th Floor of 30 Van Ness
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	By Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	2.0	\$ 1,901	\$ 2,310	\$ 99,603	\$ 121,024
Security Guard - As Needed	8202	0.1	\$ 1,901	\$ 2,310	\$ 4,980	\$ 6,051
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		2.1				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 104,583.46	\$ 127,075.13
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8,202	34,240	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8,202	34,240	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 65,156.53	\$ 71,904.00

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Uniforms	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 170,739.99	\$ 199,979.13
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 138,558.24	\$ 163,329.75
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 32,182	\$ 46,649
% of Savings to City Cost	19%	23%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1999 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 20, 2019

Mohammed Nuru
Director of Public Works
City Hall, Room 348
San Francisco, CA 94102-4645

Attn: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director for Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security at 1680 Mission Street and 30 Van Ness Avenue – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at 1680 Mission Street have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'B. Rosenfield', written over a horizontal line.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

Public Works - Infrastructure Design & Construction

Security Guard Services - 1680 Mission & 5th Floor of 30 Van Ness

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2020-21

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full-time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	3.0	\$ 1,901	\$ 2,310	\$ 149,405	\$ 181,536
Security Guard - As Needed	8202	0.1	1,901	2,310	4,980	6,051
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		3.1				
Total Salary Costs ->					\$ 154,385	\$ 187,587
Total of Other Compensation ->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8,202 34240
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8,202 34240
Total Fringe Benefits	Low High \$ 96,183.45 \$ 106,144.00

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Uniforms	\$ 1,500	\$ 1,500
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 1,500	\$ 1,500

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 252,068.56	\$ 295,231.10
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 180,610.73	\$ 199,587.49
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 71,458	\$ 95,644
% of Savings to City Cost	28%	32%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1996 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out at the 1680 Mission location, and FY 1999 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out at the 30 Van Ness location.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Jeff Kositsky
Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing
1360 Mission Street, Suite 200
San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Gigi Whitley, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: HSH Security – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "BR", enclosed within a large, thin, hand-drawn oval.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

CITY HALL • 1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE • ROOM 316 • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-4694
PHONE 415-554-7500 • FAX 415-554-7466

Homelessness and Supportive Housing

A1 Protective Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	50.6	\$ 1,900	\$ 2,310	\$ 2,521,397	\$ 3,064,774
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			103,987	126,397
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			122,974	149,475
Total FTE		50.6				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 2,521,397.07	\$ 3,064,773.90
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 226,960.77	\$ 275,872.23

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 34,240		
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 1,571,432	\$ 1,734,166

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

vehicles (2 vehicles and maintenance)	80,000	80,000
parking for 2 vehicles	4,800	4,800
supplies estimates at \$800 per officer	40,518	40,518
radios/communication equipment	5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 130,318	\$ 130,318

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 4,450,107.76	\$ 5,205,130.12
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 3,209,323.38	\$ 3,536,017.55
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,240,784	\$ 1,669,113
% of Savings to City Cost	28%	32%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1984-85 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Trent Rhorer, Director
City and County of San Francisco Human services Agency
170 Otis Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: John Tsutakawa, Director of Contracts and Facilities

RE: HSA Security – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2017-18 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "B. Rosenfield", enclosed in a large, loopy oval.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

CITY HALL • 1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE • ROOM 316 • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-4694
PHONE 415-554-7500 • FAX 415-554-7466

Human Services Agency
 Site Security
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	B. Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202.00	69.7	1,900	2,310	\$ 3,468,294.95	\$ 4,215,734.19
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205.00	4.0	4,361	5,301	\$ 457,037.55	\$ 555,532.00
Manager II	0923	1.0	4,652	5,654	\$ 121,872.68	\$ 148,137.00
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			5,700	6,929
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			69,200	84,113
Total FTE		74.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 4,122,105.88	\$ 5,010,445.46
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 74,900.70	\$ 91,042.27

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	\$ 34,240	5,853,718	6,601,158
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205	\$ 56,282	682,166	780,660
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923	\$ 62,198	184,071	210,335
Total Fringe Benefits			\$ 2,413,442.91	\$ 2,672,749.37

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the service. May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.			
Uniforms (\$500 per officer)	\$	36,834	\$ 36,834
Radios (\$83 per staff)	\$	6,197	\$ 6,197
Metal detecting wands	\$	600	\$ 600
	\$	-	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$	43,631	\$ 43,631

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 6,654,080.77	\$ 7,817,868.38
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 4,255,767.74	\$ 4,386,794.05
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,398,313	\$ 3,431,074
% of Savings to City Cost	36%	44%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. According to limited records, these services were contracted out prior to FY00/01 (Black Bear), at least to FY97/98 (McCoy Patrol Svcs).
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual, 12-month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. To operate a 24/7 program, there may be additional overtime and night weekend coverage for limited 24-hour sites.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Vicki Hennessy, Sheriff
City Hall, Room 456
1 Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Mylan Luong

RE: Contracting for Food Service at County Jails – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Food Service at County Jails have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,



Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

CITY HALL • 1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE • ROOM 316 • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-4694
PHONE 415-554-7500 • FAX 415-554-7466

Sheriff
 Food Service
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class #	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Per Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Food Service Manager Administrator	2620	1.0	\$ 2,991	\$ 3,635	\$ 78,364	\$ 95,237
Senior Food Service Supervisor	2619	4.0	\$ 2,484	\$ 3,020	\$ 260,323.20	\$ 316,496.00
Food Service Supervisor	2618	3.0	\$ 2,254	\$ 2,739	\$ 177,164.40	\$ 215,285.40
Cook	2654	9.0	\$ 2,333	\$ 2,835	\$ 550,121.40	\$ 668,493.00
Assistant Cook	2650	2.0	\$ 1,873	\$ 2,275	\$ 98,145.20	\$ 119,210.00
Total FTE			19.0			
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 1,164,118.40	\$ 1,414,721.40
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 49,177.10	\$ 60,215.18

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2620	\$ 48,869	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2619	\$ 38,404	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2618	\$ 36,176	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2654	\$ 37,822	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2650	\$ 33,381	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 645,833.11	\$ 718,173.00

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Insert all additional costs with a description that the City would incur providing the service	\$	\$
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$	\$
Can not estimate additional cost for the procurement of food and misc supplies which are needed to	\$	\$
Total Capital & Operating	\$ -	\$ -

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 1,859,128.61	\$ 2,193,109.58
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 1,168,767.54	\$ 1,171,399.11
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 690,361	\$ 1,021,710
% of Savings to City Cost	37%	47%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
3. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

John Arntz, Director
Department of Elections
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 48
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Nataliya Kuzina, Deputy Director

RE: Ballot Preparation - FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Assembly of Vote by Mail Envelope (VBM) services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,


Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

Elections

Assembly and mailing of vote-by-mail ballot packets for the November 2019 election and March 2020 election.

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Junior Clerk	1402.00	26.0	\$ 1,767	\$ 2,117	\$ 1,194,492.00	\$ 1,451,372.00
Chief Clerk	1410.00	0.2	3,020	3,671	\$ 15,704.00	\$ 19,089.20
Junior Management Assistant	1840.00	0.2	2,521	3,066	\$ 13,109.20	\$ 15,943.20
Total FTE		26.4				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 1,223,305	\$ 1,486,404
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,402	\$ 34,417	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,410	\$ 44,364	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,840	\$ 39,641	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 825,541	\$ 911,655

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 2,048,846.16	\$ 2,398,059.82
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 470,708.41	\$ 507,674.40
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,578,138	\$ 1,890,385
% of Savings to City Cost	77%	79%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR
SAN FRANCISCO



LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR

TO: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
FROM: Sophia Kittler
RE: Proposition J Contract Certification Specified Contracted-Out Services
Previously Approved
DATE: May 31, 2019

SK

Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, central shops security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency-City Administrator); security services at Building Design & Construction and Infrastructure Design & Construction (Public Works); mainframe system support (General Services Agency-Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); security services (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections).

Should you have any questions, please contact Sophia Kittler at 415-554-6153.

RECEIVED
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
SAN FRANCISCO
2019 MAY 31 AM 11:02
BY *SK*

