



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Transit Shelter Cleaning Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Diana Hammons, Senior Manager

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning (18764)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2024-25

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	8.64	\$ 956,418	\$ 1,128,430
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	8.64	\$ 1,011,858	\$ 1,196,436
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 16,815	\$ 20,185
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 22,499	\$ 27,009
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>17.28</b>	<b>\$ 2,007,590</b>	<b>\$ 2,372,060</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates
Materials & Supplies	0		\$ 162,496	\$ 162,496
Safety Equipment	0		\$ 5,806	\$ 5,806
Vehicle Maintenance	0		\$ 1,161	\$ 1,161
Overhead at 59.4% of salaries and benefits	0		\$ 1,192,508	\$ 1,409,004
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 1,361,971</b>	<b>\$ 1,578,467</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** **\$ 3,369,561** **\$ 3,950,527**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>		\$ 3,369,561	\$ 3,950,527
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>		\$ 860,763	\$ 860,763
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>		<b>\$ 2,508,798</b>	<b>\$ 3,089,764</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>		<b>74.45%</b>	<b>78.21%</b>

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning (18764)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2025-26

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	8.64	\$ 993,256	\$ 1,170,665
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	8.64	\$ 1,050,426	\$ 1,240,799
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 17,247	\$ 20,704
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 23,078	\$ 27,704
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>17.28</b>	<b>\$ 2,084,007</b>	<b>\$ 2,459,872</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26 Low Estimate	FY 2025-26 High Estimates
Materials & Supplies	0		\$ 166,672	\$ 166,672
Safety Equipment	0		\$ 5,955	\$ 5,955
Vehicle Maintenance	0		\$ 1,191	\$ 1,191
Overhead at 59.4% of salaries and benefits	0		\$ 1,237,900	\$ 1,461,164
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 1,411,718</b>	<b>\$ 1,634,982</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 3,495,725 \$ 4,094,854**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>		\$ 3,495,725	\$ 4,094,854
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>		\$ 886,746	\$ 886,746
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>		<b>\$ 2,608,979</b>	<b>\$ 3,208,108</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>		<b>74.63%</b>	<b>78.34%</b>