

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

MEMORANDUM

TO: Manohar Raju, Public Defender
Chesa Boudin, District Attorney

FROM: John Carroll, Assistant Clerk, Government Audit and Oversight Committee,
Board of Supervisors

DATE: October 25, 2021

SUBJECT: LEGISLATION INTRODUCED

The Board of Supervisors' Government Audit and Oversight Committee has received the following proposed legislation, introduced by Supervisor Ronen on October 19, 2021:

File No. 211108

Resolution urging the San Francisco Superior Court to prioritize assignment of criminal trials and safely open more courtrooms to ensure that the speedy trial rights of both defendants and victims are upheld.

If you have any comments or reports to be included with the file, please forward them to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Offices of Chair Preston and Supervisor Ronen
David Campos, Office of the District Attorney
Tara Anderson, Office of the District Attorney

1 [Urging the San Francisco Superior Court to Prioritize Criminal Trials and Safely Open
2 Courtrooms to Uphold Justice-Involved Individuals' Speedy Trial Rights]

3 **Resolution urging the San Francisco Superior Court to prioritize assignment of**
4 **criminal trials and safely open more courtrooms to ensure that the speedy trial rights**
5 **of both defendants and victims are upheld.**

6
7 WHEREAS, The United States and the California Constitution guarantee that a
8 defendant in a criminal trial has a right to a speedy trial without unnecessary delay (U.S.
9 Const. VI; Cal. Const. Art. I §15); and

10 WHEREAS, When this speedy trial right is violated, the court must dismiss the case
11 and release the defendant unless good cause is shown; and

12 WHEREAS, The California legislature found that "...criminal courts are becoming
13 increasingly congested with resulting adverse consequences to the welfare of the people and
14 defendant. Excessive continuances contribute substantially to this congestion and cause
15 substantial hardship to victims and other witnesses. Continuances also lead to longer periods
16 of presentence confinement for those defendants in custody, and the concomitant
17 overcrowding and increased expense of local jails..." (Penal Code, Section 1050(a)); and

18 WHEREAS, Because of these adverse consequences, the California legislature
19 created a requirement that courts give precedence to criminal cases over civil cases and that
20 courts "...expedite these proceedings to the greatest degree that is consistent with the ends of
21 justice..." (Penal Code, Section 1050(a)); and

22 WHEREAS, On February 25, 2020, San Francisco Mayor London Breed declared a
23 state of emergency and less than a month later, the California Superior Court ("Court") shut
24 down all criminal trial courtrooms as San Francisco implemented its shelter in place order;
25 and

1 WHEREAS, In June 2020, after the shelter in place was lifted, the Court opened four
2 courtrooms for felony trials to be conducted at the Hall of Justice (“HOJ”); and

3 WHEREAS, By July 9, 2020, because of continuances and a lack of courtroom
4 availability, the Court had a backlog of 135 cases that had been continued past the last
5 required day for trial with 31 of those cases involving a defendant in custody; and

6 WHEREAS, In April 2021, the Court began sending out-of-custody misdemeanor cases
7 to the Civic Center Courthouse while in-custody felony defendants remained in jail only to
8 have their cases continued again and again by the Court; and

9 WHEREAS, By June 2021, California and San Francisco removed all social distancing
10 requirements and lifted restrictions for most businesses and activities; and

11 WHEREAS, On June 28, 2021, the Court posted an operations update on its website
12 indicating “beginning June 28 the court will be fully open with services re-expanded to pre-
13 pandemic levels;” and

14 WHEREAS, Despite indicating that the Court would return services to “pre-pandemic
15 levels,” it opened only 9 departments at the HOJ, as opposed to the 12 departments that held
16 criminal trials prior to the pandemic; and

17 WHEREAS, By October 19, 2021, the Court’s backlog had reached 437 felony cases
18 with 248 of those defendants in-custody pre-pretrial past their statutory trial date; and

19 WHEREAS, Continuing cases under the facade of “good cause” due to the pandemic
20 has detrimental consequences for both defendants and for victims; and

21 WHEREAS, Allowing a person to be caged for an extended period of time when they
22 have not been convicted of a crime is contradictory to one of our nation’s most basic rights
23 and principles - that a person is innocent unless and until the government proves the case
24 against them beyond a reasonable doubt; and

25

1 WHEREAS, Victims involved in the criminal justice system also have a right to a
2 speedy trial and a prompt and conclusion of the case (Cal. Const. Art. I §28(b)); and

3 WHEREAS, Unnecessary delay of a case detrimentally affects victims because as time
4 goes on witnesses' memories fade, evidence can be lost, and victims can continue to
5 experience emotional distress caused by a lack of closure of their case; and

6 WHEREAS, By continuing these cases well past their statutory trial date, the Court is
7 essentially stripping away the rights of both defendants and victims without any recourse for
8 these violations; and

9 WHEREAS, The Court cannot continue criminal trials citing the pandemic as good
10 cause given that pandemic related restrictions have eased, including the requirement to
11 socially distance; and

12 WHEREAS, These presumptively innocent people who have asserted their right to a
13 speedy trial are languishing in jail while the Court cites safety concerns, court congestion, or
14 staffing issues, none of which constitute good cause, to continue criminal cases; and

15 WHEREAS, Other institutions such as schools, hospitals, gyms, concert halls, bars,
16 restaurants, and San Francisco's City Hall have updated COVID 19 protocols to safely open
17 and operate; and

18 WHEREAS, The Court has historically held felony trials for defendants who are
19 incarcerated pre-trial at the Civic Center Courthouse; and

20 WHEREAS, The Court has 37 departments at the Civic Center Courthouse, almost all
21 of which are currently being used for civil trials as opposed to criminal; and

22 WHEREAS, The Court has failed to use the Civic Center Courthouse to conduct in-
23 custody felony trials to clear this backlog; now, therefore, be it

24
25

1 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the Court to prioritize assignment of
2 criminal trials over civil and safely open additional courtrooms to deal with the backlog caused
3 by the pandemic; and, be it

4 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board
5 to transmit copies of this of this Resolution to Samuel K. Feng, the presiding judge of the
6 Court, with a request to take all actions necessary to achieve the objectives of this resolution.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25