



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2018

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attn: Kaitlyn Connors, Budget Director, San Francisco International Airport

RE: Contracting for Airport Parking Operations – FY 2018-19 and FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2018-19 and 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield". The signature is written in a cursive style and is positioned above the printed name and title.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

AIR AIRPORT COMMISSION
 109648 AIR Business & Finance
 PARKING OPERATIONS
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2018-19

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 4,981	\$ 6,356	\$ 129,508	\$ 165,259
Manager II	0923	2.0	\$ 4,303	\$ 5,491	\$ 223,774	\$ 285,528
Manager I	0922	1.0	\$ 4,007	\$ 5,115	\$ 104,174	\$ 132,989
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,039	\$ 4,909	\$ 105,004	\$ 127,633
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,282	\$ 3,989	\$ 85,321	\$ 103,719
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 2,700	\$ 3,282	\$ 70,190	\$ 85,321
Clerk	1404	2.0	\$ 1,924	\$ 2,338	\$ 100,050	\$ 121,581
Sr. Clerk	1406	6.0	\$ 1,995	\$ 2,427	\$ 311,237	\$ 378,562
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,634	\$ 3,202	\$ 68,476	\$ 83,259
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	\$ 2,864	\$ 3,481	\$ 74,475	\$ 90,516
Accountant II	1652	1.0	\$ 2,885	\$ 3,505	\$ 75,011	\$ 91,132
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	\$ 2,871	\$ 3,490	\$ 74,636	\$ 90,731
Investigator	4334	2.0	\$ 3,202	\$ 3,891	\$ 166,518	\$ 202,350
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	\$ 2,971	\$ 3,610	\$ 1,621,904	\$ 1,971,142
Customer Service Agent	1324	3.0	\$ 2,622	\$ 3,188	\$ 204,546	\$ 248,652
Cashier III	4322	73.0	\$ 2,402	\$ 2,920	\$ 4,558,920	\$ 5,542,255
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	\$ 3,839	\$ 4,665	\$ 99,809	\$ 121,287
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	\$ 3,675	\$ 3,675	\$ 191,102	\$ 191,102
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	\$ 4,662	\$ 4,662	\$ 121,206	\$ 121,206
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	\$ 4,630	\$ 5,906	\$ 120,371	\$ 153,560
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	\$ 2,957	\$ 5,153	\$ 153,774	\$ 267,979
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	59.0	\$ 2,246	\$ 2,730	\$ 3,444,959	\$ 4,188,361
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,437	\$ 2,963	\$ 63,361	\$ 77,046
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	\$ 2,211	\$ 2,687	\$ 172,490	\$ 209,607
Custodian	2708	38.0	\$ 2,011	\$ 2,443	\$ 1,986,433	\$ 2,413,842
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					454,615	554,166
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					405,533	494,336
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		226.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 14,327,251	\$ 17,464,621
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 860,148	\$ 1,048,502

FRINGE BENEFITS

		Amount
Manager IV	0932	62,323
Manager II	0923	57,747
Manager I	0922	55,758
Accountant IV	1657	49,416
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	43,012
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	37,967
Clerk	1404	31,241
Sr. Clerk	1406	31,873
Principal Clerk	1408	37,402
Management Assistant	1842	39,391
Accountant II	1652	40,038
Collection Supervisor	4366	39,451
Investigator	4334	42,314
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	40,309
Customer Service Agent	1324	37,299
Cashier III	4322	35,390
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	50,372
Stationary Engineer	7334	42,423
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	48,872
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	59,143
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	51,606
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	34,017
Custodial Supervisor	2718	35,698
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	33,730
Custodian	2708	31,990
Total Fringe Benefits		
		Low
		High
		\$ 7,318,763 \$ 8,106,403

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating Expenses	775,471	643,125
Credit Card Processing Fees	1,835,888	2,489,637
	0	0
	0	0
Total Capital & Operating		
	2,611,359	3,132,762

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,117,521	\$ 29,752,288
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	21,108,142	23,719,471
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,009,378	\$ 6,032,817
% of Savings to City Cost	16%	20%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. 1971 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Operating costs include operating expenses & credit card fees. FTEs are based on Contractor FTEs.

Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

AIR AIRPORT COMMISSION
 109648 AIR Business & Finance
 PARKING OPERATIONS
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 4,981	\$ 6,356	\$ 129,508	\$ 165,259
Manager II	0923	2.0	\$ 4,303	\$ 5,491	\$ 223,774	\$ 285,528
Manager I	0922	1.0	\$ 4,007	\$ 5,115	\$ 104,174	\$ 132,989
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,039	\$ 4,909	\$ 105,004	\$ 127,633
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,282	\$ 3,989	\$ 85,321	\$ 103,719
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 2,700	\$ 3,282	\$ 70,190	\$ 85,321
Clerk	1404	2.0	\$ 1,924	\$ 2,338	\$ 100,050	\$ 121,581
Sr. Clerk	1406	6.0	\$ 1,995	\$ 2,427	\$ 311,237	\$ 378,562
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,634	\$ 3,202	\$ 68,476	\$ 83,259
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	\$ 2,864	\$ 3,481	\$ 74,475	\$ 90,516
Accountant II	1652	1.0	\$ 2,885	\$ 3,505	\$ 75,011	\$ 91,132
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	\$ 2,871	\$ 3,490	\$ 74,636	\$ 90,731
Investigator	4334	2.0	\$ 3,202	\$ 3,891	\$ 166,518	\$ 202,350
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	\$ 2,971	\$ 3,610	\$ 1,621,904	\$ 1,971,142
Customer Service Agent	1324	3.0	\$ 2,622	\$ 3,188	\$ 204,546	\$ 248,652
Cashier III	4322	73.0	\$ 2,402	\$ 2,920	\$ 4,558,920	\$ 5,542,255
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	\$ 3,839	\$ 4,665	\$ 99,809	\$ 121,287
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	\$ 3,675	\$ 3,675	\$ 191,102	\$ 191,102
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	\$ 4,662	\$ 4,662	\$ 121,206	\$ 121,206
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	\$ 4,630	\$ 5,906	\$ 120,371	\$ 153,560
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	\$ 2,957	\$ 5,153	\$ 153,774	\$ 267,979
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	59.0	\$ 2,246	\$ 2,730	\$ 3,444,959	\$ 4,188,361
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,437	\$ 2,963	\$ 63,361	\$ 77,046
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	\$ 2,211	\$ 2,687	\$ 172,490	\$ 209,607
Custodian	2708	38.0	\$ 2,011	\$ 2,443	\$ 1,986,433	\$ 2,413,842
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					454,615	554,166
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					405,533	494,336
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		226.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 14,327,251	\$ 17,464,621
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 860,148	\$ 1,048,502

FRINGE BENEFITS

		Amount				
Manager IV	0932	64,087				
Manager II	0923	59,533				
Manager I	0922	57,255				
Accountant IV	1657	50,433				
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	44,015				
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	38,990				
Clerk	1404	34,343				
Sr. Clerk	1406	32,920				
Principal Clerk	1408	38,427				
Management Assistant	1842	40,410				
Accountant II	1652	41,094				
Collection Supervisor	4366	40,468				
Investigator	4334	43,320				
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	41,323				
Customer Service Agent	1324	38,325				
Cashier III	4322	36,423				
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	52,171				
Stationary Engineer	7334	43,557				
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	50,564				
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	60,514				
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	52,802				
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	35,055				
Custodial Supervisor	2718	36,731				
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	34,770				
Custodian	2708	33,037				
Total Fringe Benefits		<table border="0"> <tr><td align="right">Low</td><td align="right">High</td></tr> <tr><td align="right">\$ 7,521,188</td><td align="right">\$ 8,349,409</td></tr> </table>	Low	High	\$ 7,521,188	\$ 8,349,409
Low	High					
\$ 7,521,188	\$ 8,349,409					

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating Expenses	643,125	662,419
Credit Card Processing Fees	2,489,637	2,564,326
	0	0
	0	0
Total Capital & Operating	3,132,762	3,226,745

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,841,348	\$ 30,089,277
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	23,685,292	24,422,919
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 2,156,056</u>	<u>\$ 5,666,358</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	8%	19%

Comments/Assumptions:

- 1971 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
- Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs, where applicable.
- Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- Operating costs include operating expenses & credit card fees. FTEs are based on Contractor FTEs.