



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

To: Members of the Board of Supervisors

From: Carmen Chu, City Administrator

Matthias Jaime, Director, Committee of Information Technology

Taraneh Moayed, Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration, Chair of Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board

Date: March 30, 2021

Subject: Legislation introduced for Acquisition of Surveillance Technology Approvals: Audio Recorder, Automatic License Plate Readers, Drones, Security Cameras, Radio Frequency Identification.

In compliance with Section 19B of the City and County of San Francisco's Administrative Code, the City Administrator's Office is pleased to submit the following Surveillance Technology Policies and Impact Reports for review by the Board of Supervisors.

- Audio Recorder (ShotSpotter)
- Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPR)
- Drones (a.k.a. Unmanned Aircraft Systems)
- Security Cameras
- Radio Frequency Identification (RFID)

In an effort to maintain the spirit of the legislation to engage the public discussion on the role of government surveillance, the Committee on Information Technology (COIT) and its subcommittee the Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB) held public meetings over the course of the last two years to review and approve the policies. All details of these discussions are available at sf.gov/coit.

The following sections provides more specific detail on the departments seeking Board of Supervisors approval for their Surveillance Technology Policy, and the COIT recommended course of action.

If you have questions on the review process, please direct all questions to Matthias Jaime, Director of the Committee on Information Technology (COIT).

Audio Recorder (ShotSpotter)

Department	Authorized Uses
Police Department	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Gunshot detection: Record gunshot sounds and use sensors to locate the origin of the gunshots. Patrol Officers receive gunshot alerts to respond to crime scene. 2. Investigators use ShotSpotter Investigative Portal reports to find shell casing evidence on scene and to further analyze the incident.

ShotSpotter Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
August 28, 2020	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
October 9, 2020	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
October 23, 2020	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
November 13, 2020	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
January 21, 2021	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT recommends the following action be taken on the policies:

- Approve the ShotSpotter Surveillance Technology Policy for the Police Department for review by the Mayor, City Attorney, and Board of Supervisors.

Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPR)

Department	Authorized Uses
Airport	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To track the activity of permitted commercial ground transportation at the Airport. Also used as a secondary method for collecting trip fees in the event an operator's transponder fails to read. 2. To support the Airport and local, state, federal, and regional public safety departments in the identification of vehicles associated with targets of investigations, including locating stolen, wanted, and or other vehicles that are the subject of investigation; and/or locating victims, witnesses, suspects, and others associated with a law enforcement investigation.
Police Department	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Locate stolen, wanted, and or other vehicles that are the subject of investigation 2. To apprehend wanted persons subject to arrest warrants or who are otherwise lawfully sought by law enforcement. 3. To locate victims, witnesses, suspects, missing children, adults, and/or elderly individuals, including in response to Amber Alerts and Silver Alerts and others associated with a law enforcement investigation. 4. To assist with criminal investigations initiated by local, state and regional public safety departments by identifying vehicles associated with targets of criminal investigations. 5. Counter-terrorism: Identify potential threats to critical infrastructure sites. 6. For other law enforcement purposes as authorized by law: Investigations of major crimes.
Public Works	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Discourage illegal dumping onto City Streets.
Recreation & Parks	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To support local, state, federal, and regional public safety departments in the identification of vehicles associated with targets of criminal investigations, including investigations of serial crimes 2. To protect the public and our staff at special events from misconduct and/or violent confrontations. 3. To protect critical infrastructure sites from vandalism, theft and damage.

ALPR Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting	Departments
July 24, 2020	PSAB	Public Works
August 14, 2020	PSAB	Police
August 28, 2020	PSAB	Recreation & Parks
September 11, 2020	PSAB	Police, Public Works
September 17, 2020	COIT	Police, Public Works
September 25, 2020	PSAB	Airport, Recreation & Parks
November 13, 2020	PSAB	Airport
January 21, 2021, 2020	COIT	Police
February 4, 2021, 2020	COIT	Airport, Recreation & Parks

COIT recommends the following action be taken on the policies:

Airport, Public Works, Recreation & Parks

- Approve the ALPR Surveillance Technology Policies for the Airport, Public Works, and Department of Recreation and Parks.

Police

- Approve the ALPR Surveillance Technology Policy for the Police Department with the additional recommendation to conduct a quantitative impact analysis on the use of ALPR for review by the Board of Supervisors.

Drones (Unmanned Aircraft Systems)

Department	Authorized Uses
Fire	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disaster Response: Assessment and District Surveys 2. Emergency Response: Building Fire Reconnaissance 3. Search & Rescue: Aerial or water borne drones. 4. Training: Assessment and evaluation of emergency response
Port	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disaster response and recovery: Provide DOC with high resolution images during response and recovery operations after a disaster. 2. Facility Inspections: Provide high resolution images during engineering and environmental surveys and assessments of Port properties. 3. Marketing: Capture Drone footage to be used in marketing materials for the promotion of activities and opportunities at the Port.
Public Works	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disaster preparedness and response 2. Environmental monitoring and documentation 3. Inspect/Survey properties & assets 4. Project inspection and documentation 5. Surveying/Mapping data collection
Public Utilities	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Construction Management: Examples include inspection of project sites for contract and environmental compliance. 2. Environmental Monitoring & Documentation: Examples include monitoring of vegetation type and health, wildlife, and streams/reservoirs. 3. Inspections: Conducting surveys and assessments of SFPUC properties and assets. Examples include survey of bay and ocean outfalls, inspection of large wastewater collections and power line surveys. 4. Disaster Relief: Drones may be used in disaster relief to record footage of damage and assess the role PUC may play in responding to such disasters. 5. Marketing and Public Education: Drones may be used to capture footage of the watershed, as an example, to be used in public education and/or marketing materials.
Recreation & Parks	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disaster preparedness and response: In times of disaster preparedness or post-disaster mitigation, drones will provide critical emergency response functions such as logistical

	<p>support for emergency routing, life safety, and cleanup efforts, not only assisting in protecting physical assets and public spaces but human life as well</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Environmental monitoring and documentation 3. Inspect/Survey properties & assets 4. Project inspection and documentation 5. Surveying/Mapping data collection
Technology	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Drone technology is authorized for use during Video production, specifically the capture of video stills and photographs as elements of SFGovTV's video productions. The completed videos will be broadcast on SFGovTV's cable channels and made available on the station's YouTube account. Marketing and promotional videos created for other City departments may also feature drone footage or photographs.

Drones Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting	Departments
April 16, 2015	COIT	All
September 17, 2015	COIT	All
April 20, 2017	COIT	All
May 5, 2017	COIT	All
March 21, 2019	COIT	All
September 19, 2019	COIT	All
February 28, 2020	PSAB	All
June 12, 2020	PSAB	Public Works
June 26, 2020	PSAB	Fire, Public Utilities, Tech
July 10, 2020	PSAB	Port, Recreation & Parks
July 17, 2020	COIT	All

COIT recommends the following action be taken on the policies:

- Approve the Drone Surveillance Technology Policies for the Fire, Port, Public Works, Public Utilities, Recreation and Parks, and Technology Departments.

Security Cameras

Departments Using Consolidated Policy	Authorized Uses
Airport Arts Commission Asian Art Museum Child Support Services City Administrator Emergency Management Fire Homelessness and Supportive Housing Human Resources Human Services Agency Port Public Health Recreation and Parks Rent Board Technology War Memorial	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Live monitoring. 2. Recording of video and images. 3. Reviewing camera footage in the event of an incident. 4. Providing video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident or upon request.
Department Specific Security Policies	Authorized Uses
Municipal Transportation Agency	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Live monitoring. 2. Recording of video, images and review in the event of an incident. 3. Reviewing camera footage and/or images. 4. Providing video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident. 5. Enforcing parking and driving violations.
Public Library	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Live monitoring to protect safety of SFPL staff, patrons and facilities. 2. Recording of video and images.

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Reviewing camera footage in the event of an incident. 4. Providing video footage/images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident or upon request.
Public Utilities Commission	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Deter malicious behavior to SFPUC facilities, employees, or personnel working on behalf of the SFPUC; 2. Capture potential or actual malicious behavior by or against SFPUC facilities, employees, or personnel working on behalf of the SFPUC; 3. Provide evidence to support incident investigations; 4. Provide real-time monitoring of operations and critical equipment at SFPUC facilities; and 5. Support SFPUC health and safety requirements and objectives.

Security Cameras Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting	Departments
November 13, 2020	PSAB	War Memorial
January 22, 2021	PSAB	ADM, DHR, FIR, MOHCD, REG, WAR
February 12, 2021	PSAB	AIR, AAM, DT, HSA, HSH, MTA, SFPL
February 26, 2021	PSAB	ART, CSS, DEM, OEWD, PRT, RNT, MOHCD, WAR, REG, PUC, REC
March 12, 2021	PSAB	DPH, PUC, REC
March 18, 2021	COIT	All

COIT recommends the following action be taken on the policies:

- Approve the Security Camera Technology Policies for the 19 departments,

In addition, COIT urges the Board to consider the following policy items in their review:

- Data Retention Standard: State Government Code section 34090.6 requires all local government camera footage to be stored for a minimum of 1 year. This presents significant privacy, security risks and also requires significant funds to comply. Current storage practices are typically 30 days or less. COIT recommends advocating to state law to reflect modern privacy and cybersecurity considerations.
- Sharing with Law Enforcement: Currently only the Homelessness and Supportive Housing, Human Services Agency, and Public Library require a subpoena before sharing camera footage with public safety. The Board of Supervisors should determine if a similar requirement should be on all departments.

Radio Frequency Identification (RFID)

Department	Authorized Uses
Public Library	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Passive RFID tags applied to library material – For use in inventory management and circulation functions. 2. Staff workstation RFID pads – For use by staff to check in and out material and trigger holds. 3. Self-check machines – For use by patrons to check out material. 4. Inventory wand – For use by staff to confirm the current inventory on the library’s shelves. 5. Sorting machine – For use in checking in material and sorting the items into carts and bins for delivery to other floors and branches.

RFID Public Meeting Dates:

Date	Meeting
January 24, 2020	Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB)
February 20, 2020	Committee on Information Technology (COIT)

COIT recommends the following action be taken on the policies:

- Approve the RFID Technology Policy for the Public Library.