

BOARD of SUPERVISORS




City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

MEMORANDUM

Date: December 20, 2021

To: Jeffrey Tumlin, Executive Director, Municipal Transportation Agency
Christine Silva, Secretary, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors

From:  Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board, Board of Supervisors

Subject: Urging the MTA to Promote Unobstructed Pedestrian Access for Riders Boarding Public Transit (File No. 211210)

On November 30, 2021, the Board of Supervisors adopted Resolution No. 537-21, sponsored by Supervisor Dean Preston (File No. 211210, Urging the MTA to Promote Unobstructed Pedestrian Access for Riders Boarding Public Transit) enacted on December 10, 2021.

Please find the attached courtesy copy of the Resolution for your office's information and consideration.

If you have any questions or concerns, please contact the Office of the Clerk of the Board at (415) 554-5184.

c: Members of the Board of Supervisors, Supervisors Dean Preston, Myrna Melgar, Gordon Mar, Rafael Mandelman
Tom Paulino, Liaison to the Board of Supervisors, Mayor's Office
Andres Power, Mayor's Policy Director
Susanna Conine-Nakano, Mayor's Office
Kate Breen, Municipal Transportation Agency
Janet Martinsen, Municipal Transportation Agency
Joel Ramos, Municipal Transportation Agency
Viktoriya Wise, Municipal Transportation Agency

ll:jw:ams

1 [Urging the MTA to Promote Unobstructed Pedestrian Access for Riders Boarding Public
2 Transit]

3 **Resolution urging the Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) to develop and**
4 **implement a plan to promote unobstructed pedestrian access for boarding public**
5 **transit by eliminating parking in bus stops and making other necessary infrastructure**
6 **improvements.**

7
8 WHEREAS, There are approximately 3,000 bus stops in the City and County of San
9 Francisco, and some bus stop curbs are painted red (prohibiting parking) while others are not
10 painted red and allow vehicle parking in the bus stop, thereby obstructing pedestrian access
11 to the bus and preventing buses from pulling into bus stops; and

12 WHEREAS, In July 2021, Marcel E. Moran, a Ph.D. Candidate at the University of
13 California, Berkeley, published 'Are Shelters in Place? Mapping the Distribution of Transit
14 Amenities via a Bus-Stop Census of San Francisco' in the Journal of Public Transportation,
15 Volume 23, Number 3; the report was based on an in-person census of 2,964 San Francisco
16 Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) street-level bus stops across San Francisco; and

17 WHEREAS, Moran's study attempts to analyze two important empirical questions on
18 what bus stop amenities -- such as places to sit, clear signage, shelters for inclement weather,
19 and unobstructed curbs -- are present, and how are they distributed across systems, which
20 may reveal neighborhood or route-specific disparities; and

21 WHEREAS, Moran's study also found that census tracts with a higher than average
22 share of white residents were more likely to feature clear curbs in comparison to tracts with
23 higher than average populations of people of color; and

24 WHEREAS, Moran's study also found that routes with the most frequent service, or
25 shorter "headways" (10 minutes or less between arrivals), had the highest share of

1 unobstructed curbs (88%); in contrast, routes with the least frequent service (20 to 30 minutes
2 between bus arrivals or the longest headways) had the lowest percentage of stops with
3 unobstructed curbs (44%); and

4 WHEREAS, Moran also found that 32% of bus stops were obstructed by on-street
5 parking, meaning that there was not enough space for buses to pull up or riders to board
6 safely from the curb, which forces riders to step into the street to board, and often navigate
7 through parked cars; and

8 WHEREAS, Allowing parking in bus stops and failing to provide unobstructed access to
9 public transit undermine San Francisco's transit-first policy, and pose particular hardship for
10 seniors and people with disabilities; and

11 WHEREAS, SFMTA is aware of Moran's report with respect to parking in bus stops,
12 but has not developed a comprehensive plan to address this public access issue; now,
13 therefore, be it

14 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the SFMTA to promptly develop and
15 implement a plan to promote unobstructed Muni access, including painting bus stop curbs red
16 where parking is currently obstructing access, and, be it

17 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the SFMTA to consult
18 with vulnerable communities, including communities of color, people with disabilities, and
19 seniors, all of whom are disproportionately impacted, in developing its plan to ensure
20 unobstructed access to Muni vehicles; and, be it

21 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the SFMTA should act with urgency in making bus stop
22 improvements to promote unobstructed Muni access; and, be it

23 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the SFMTA should report back to the Board of
24 Supervisors within 90 days with data on the number of bus stops citywide where curbs are not
25 painted red and where there is unobstructed Muni access, the number by district, the history

1 regarding why parking is allowed in bus stops, and any plans or policies to make prompt
2 improvements to promote unobstructed Muni access; and be it

3 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Clerk of the Board shall transmit a copy of this
4 Resolution to the SFMTA and the SFMTA Board.

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25



City and County of San Francisco

Tails
Resolution

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

File Number: 211210

Date Passed: November 30, 2021

Resolution urging the Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) to develop and implement a plan to promote unobstructed pedestrian access for boarding public transit by eliminating parking in bus stops and making other necessary infrastructure improvements.

November 30, 2021 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Chan, Haney, Mandelman, Mar, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani and Walton

File No. 211210

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was ADOPTED on 11/30/2021 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

f Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board

Unsigned

London N. Breed
Mayor

12/10/2021

Date Approved

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution, not being signed by the Mayor within the time limit as set forth in Section 3.103 of the Charter, or time waived pursuant to Board Rule 2.14.2, became effective without her approval in accordance with the provision of said Section 3.103 of the Charter or Board Rule 2.14.2.

Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board

12/10/2021

Date