

SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY
 TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$ 76,382	\$ 92,825
Track Maintenance Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395	77,126	93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					3,247	5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					4,345	5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Total Salary Costs		3.0			161,099	197,791

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable					55,247	60,156
Fixed					40,125	40,125
Total Fringe Benefits					95,372	100,281

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Materials & Supplies (5)					140,000	140,000
Safety Equipment (6)					5,000	5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)					1,000	1,000
Total Capital & Operating					146,000	146,000

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

402,472 444,072

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)

360,266 363,889

Contract Monitoring

10,634 13,852

Total Contract Cost

370,900 377,741

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 31,572 \$ 66,331

% of Savings to City Cost

8% 15%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.
6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.
7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.
8. Additional City Costs, assumes a 3% 2013-14.

SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY
 TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate		Low	High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$ 76,382	\$ 92,825
Track Maintenance Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395	77,126	93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					3,247	5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					4,345	5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Total Salary Costs		3.0			161,099	197,791

FRINGE BENEFITS

Variable					52,668	57,488
Fixed					41,424	41,424
Total Fringe Benefits					94,092	98,912

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Materials & Supplies (5)					140,000	140,000
Safety Equipment (6)					5,000	5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)					1,000	1,000
Total Capital & Operating					146,000	146,000

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

401,192 442,703

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)

367,471 371,167

Contract Monitoring

10,624 13,824

Total Contract Cost

378,095 384,991

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 23,097 \$ 57,712

% of Savings to City Cost

6% 13%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.
6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.
7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.
8. Additional City Costs, assumes a 3% 2013-14.