



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

June 4, 2019

Ms. Angela Calvillo  
Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
City Hall, Room 244  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

RE: File Numbers 190518-190535, 190539-190542, 190544: Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) between the City and County of San Francisco and various Unions representing City bargaining units

Dear Ms. Calvillo,

In accordance with Ordinance 92-94, I submit a cost analysis of 23 MOUs and one MOU amendment between the City and County of San Francisco and various Unions representing employee bargaining units. The MOUs for all the unions except the Firefighters Union Local 798, Unit 2 cover the period July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2022. The MOU amendment for the Firefighters Union Local 798, Unit 2 amends the existing MOU, which covers the period July 1, 2018 through June 30, 2020.

The MOUs and MOU amendment affect approximately 20,000 authorized positions with an overall salary and benefits base of approximately \$2.6 billion. Our analysis finds that the MOUs will result in increased costs to the City of \$102.2 million (or 3.9%) of base wage and benefit cost in FY 2019-20, \$210.4 million (or 8.0%) of base wage and benefit cost in FY 2020-21, and \$314.1 million (or 11.9%) of base wage and benefit cost in FY 2021-22. Approximately 60% of the increased cost is supported by the General Fund.

Our cost estimates assume that premiums, overtime, and other adjustments grow consistently with wage changes. Some wage and premium increases in FY 2020-21 and FY 2021-22 could be delayed if the Joint Report projects a budget deficit greater than \$200 million. These cost estimates assume that those increases will take place as scheduled. If the increases were delayed, the estimated cost would be reduced to approximately \$159.5 million and \$260.0 in FY 2020-21 and FY 2021-22, respectively. See Attachments A and B for a detailed listing and analysis of costs for the affected MOUs.

If you have additional questions or concerns, please contact me at 554-7500 or Carol Lu of my staff at 554-7647.

Sincerely,



Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

cc: Carol Isen, ERD  
Harvey Rose, Budget Analyst

## Attachment A

| Combined Costs for All MOUs and Amendments |    | FY 2019-20         | FY 2020-21            | FY 2021-22            |
|--|----|--------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Wages                                      | \$ | 78,019,000         | \$ 163,885,000        | \$ 245,792,000        |
| Wage-Related Fringe Benefits               |    | 20,084,000         | 42,364,000            | 63,796,000            |
| Premiums                                   |    | 1,902,000          | 1,992,000             | 2,014,000             |
| Other Benefits                             |    | 2,209,000          | 2,206,000             | 2,555,000             |
| <b>MOU Total \$</b>                        |    | <b>102,214,000</b> | <b>\$ 210,447,000</b> | <b>\$ 314,157,000</b> |
| <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>         |    | <i>3.9%</i>        | <i>8.0%</i>           | <i>11.9%</i>          |

### Union Detail\*

#### File Number Union

| 190518                             | Unrepresented Employees      | FY 2019-20     | FY 2020-21        | FY 2021-22          |
|------------------------------------|------------------------------|----------------|-------------------|---------------------|
|                                    | Wages                        | \$ 289,000     | \$ 610,000        | \$ 919,000          |
|                                    | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits | 78,000         | 165,000           | 249,000             |
|                                    | Internal Adjustment Fund     | 16,000         | 0                 | 0                   |
| <b>Union Total \$</b>              |                              | <b>383,000</b> | <b>\$ 775,000</b> | <b>\$ 1,168,000</b> |
| <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> |                              | <i>3.7%</i>    | <i>7.4%</i>       | <i>11.2%</i>        |

| 190519                             | Fire Fighters Union Local 798, Unit 2 | FY 2019-20    | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22  |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------|------------------|-------------|
|                                    | Wages                                 | \$ 30,000     | \$ 19,000        | \$ 0        |
|                                    | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits          | 4,000         | 4,000            | 0           |
| <b>Union Total \$</b>              |                                       | <b>34,000</b> | <b>\$ 23,000</b> | <b>\$ 0</b> |
| <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> |                                       | <i>N/A</i>    | <i>N/A</i>       | <i>N/A</i>  |

| 190520                             | Municipal Attorney's Association | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21          | FY 2021-22           |
|------------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|---------------------|----------------------|
|                                    | Wages                            | \$ 3,223,000     | \$ 6,799,000        | \$ 10,240,000        |
|                                    | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits     | 857,000          | 1,807,000           | 2,722,000            |
|                                    | California Bar Dues              | 196,000          | 196,000             | 196,000              |
|                                    | Standby Pay                      | 140,000          | 140,000             | 140,000              |
| <b>Union Total \$</b>              |                                  | <b>4,416,000</b> | <b>\$ 8,942,000</b> | <b>\$ 13,298,000</b> |
| <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> |                                  | <i>3.8%</i>      | <i>7.7%</i>         | <i>11.5%</i>         |

| 190521                             | Machinists Union, Local 1414  | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21          | FY 2021-22          |
|------------------------------------|---|------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|                                    | Wages   | \$ 540,000       | \$ 1,140,000        | \$ 1,716,000        |
|                                    | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 150,000          | 316,000             | 476,000             |
|                                    | Job Class Equity Adjustments  | 235,000          | 244,000             | 252,000             |
|                                    | Lead Person Premium   | 115,000          | 115,000             | 115,000             |
|                                    | One-Time Payment for Job Classes 7258, 7337, 7332, 7331, 7327, 7434 | 83,000           | 0                   | 0                   |
|                                    | Acting Assignment   | 27,000           | 28,000              | 29,000              |
|                                    | Weekend Differential  | 25,000           | 26,000              | 27,000              |
|                                    | Protective Clothing   | 8,000            | 8,000               | 8,000               |
|                                    | Wage Increase for Tool Allowance                                    | 7,000            | 7,000               | 7,000               |
|                                    | Safety Eyewear  | 7,000            | 7,000               | 7,000               |
|                                    | Life Insurance  | 7,000            | 7,000               | 7,000               |
|                                    | Safety Footwear   | 7,000            | 7,000               | 7,000               |
| <b>Union Total \$</b>              |   | <b>1,211,000</b> | <b>\$ 1,905,000</b> | <b>\$ 2,651,000</b> |
| <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> |   | <i>6.2%</i>      | <i>9.7%</i>         | <i>13.5%</i>        |

| 190522                             | International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21 | FY 2019-20        | FY 2020-21           | FY 2021-22           |
|------------------------------------|--|-------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
|                                    | Wages  | \$ 18,088,000     | \$ 38,161,000        | \$ 57,472,000        |
|                                    | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits   | 5,083,000         | 10,723,000           | 16,150,000           |
|                                    | Job Class Equity Adjustments   | 618,000           | 1,468,000            | 1,715,000            |
|                                    | Floating Holidays  | 272,000           | 279,000              | 289,000              |
|                                    | Employee Development Fund  | 250,000           | 250,000              | 250,000              |
|                                    | TechHire Program   | 100,000           | 100,000              | 100,000              |
|                                    | Extended Ranges  | 86,000            | 172,000              | 258,000              |
|                                    | Bilingual Pay Premium  | 48,000            | 48,000               | 48,000               |
|                                    | Geotechnical Engineer Premium  | 38,000            | 39,000               | 41,000               |
|                                    | Construction Inspector Premium   | 5,000             | 6,000                | 6,000                |
| <b>Union Total \$</b>              |  | <b>24,588,000</b> | <b>\$ 51,246,000</b> | <b>\$ 76,329,000</b> |
| <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> |  | <i>3.7%</i>       | <i>7.8%</i>          | <i>11.6%</i>         |

|        |   |                  |                  |                   |
|--------|---|------------------|------------------|-------------------|
| 190523 | <b>Laborers International Union, Local 261</b>                  | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|        | Wages   | \$ 3,141,000     | \$ 6,627,000     | \$ 9,981,000      |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits                                    | 835,000          | 1,761,000        | 2,652,000         |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments                                    | 215,000          | 222,000          | 231,000           |
|        | Health Insurance Cost Sharing                                   | 160,000          | 340,000          | 360,000           |
|        | Protective Clothing   | 77,000           | 77,000           | 77,000            |
|        | Lead Person Premium   | 52,000           | 52,000           | 52,000            |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>4,480,000</b> | <b>9,079,000</b> | <b>13,353,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                              | <i>4.0%</i>      | <i>8.0%</i>      | <i>11.8%</i>      |
| 190524 | <b>International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 6</b> | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|        | Wages   | \$ 1,264,000     | \$ 2,666,000     | \$ 4,015,000      |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits                                    | 333,000          | 703,000          | 1,058,000         |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments                                    | 103,000          | 134,000          | 194,000           |
|        | Shift Differential  | 28,000           | 29,000           | 30,000            |
|        | Airport Standby Pay   | 24,000           | 24,000           | 24,000            |
|        | Safety Shoes  | 20,000           | 20,000           | 20,000            |
|        | Certification Premiums  | 20,000           | 20,000           | 21,000            |
|        | Overtime During Rest Period                                     | 10,000           | 10,000           | 10,000            |
|        | Tuition Reimbursement   | 3,000            | 3,000            | 3,000             |
|        | Meals at Hetch Hetchy   | 1,000            | 1,000            | 1,000             |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>1,806,000</b> | <b>3,610,000</b> | <b>5,376,000</b>  |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                              | <i>4.0%</i>      | <i>8.0%</i>      | <i>11.8%</i>      |
| 190525 | <b>San Francisco Deputy Probation Officers' Association</b>     | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|        | Wages   | \$ 514,000       | \$ 1,084,000     | \$ 1,632,000      |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits                                    | 164,000          | 346,000          | 521,000           |
|        | CalPERS Waiver  | 132,000          | 0                | 0                 |
|        | Life Insurance  | 6,000            | 6,000            | 6,000             |
|        | Bilingual Pay Premium   | 0                | 0                | 0                 |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>816,000</b>   | <b>1,436,000</b> | <b>2,159,000</b>  |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                              | <i>4.2%</i>      | <i>7.5%</i>      | <i>11.2%</i>      |
| 190526 | <b>Operating Engineers, Local 3</b>                             | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|        | Wages   | \$ 211,000       | \$ 446,000       | \$ 671,000        |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits                                    | 55,000           | 116,000          | 174,000           |
|        | Crane Certification Premium                                     | 25,000           | 34,000           | 38,000            |
|        | Lead Person Premium   | 1,000            | 1,000            | 1,000             |
|        | Commercial Driver's License Premium                             | 1,000            | 1,000            | 1,000             |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>293,000</b>   | <b>598,000</b>   | <b>885,000</b>    |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                              | <i>3.9%</i>      | <i>7.9%</i>      | <i>11.7%</i>      |
| 190527 | <b>Teamsters, Local 856 (Multi-Unit)</b>                        | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|        | Wages   | \$ 337,000       | \$ 712,000       | \$ 1,072,000      |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits                                    | 94,000           | 198,000          | 298,000           |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments                                    | 55,000           | 81,000           | 110,000           |
|        | Night Duty Premium for Job Class 2496                           | 12,000           | 13,000           | 13,000            |
|        | Officer of the Day Premium                                      | 6,000            | 6,000            | 6,000             |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>504,000</b>   | <b>1,010,000</b> | <b>1,499,000</b>  |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                              | <i>4.1%</i>      | <i>8.2%</i>      | <i>12.2%</i>      |
| 190528 | <b>Transport Workers Union of America, Local 250-A (7410)</b>   | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|        | Wages   | \$ 83,000        | \$ 174,000       | \$ 263,000        |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits                                    | 24,000           | 50,000           | 76,000            |
|        | Protective Clothing   | 2,000            | 2,000            | 2,000             |
|        | Life Insurance  | 1,000            | 1,000            | 1,000             |
|        | Emergency Road Repair Premium                                   | 1,000            | 1,000            | 1,000             |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>111,000</b>   | <b>228,000</b>   | <b>343,000</b>    |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                              | <i>3.7%</i>      | <i>7.5%</i>      | <i>11.3%</i>      |

|        |   |                   |                   |                    |
|--------|---|-------------------|-------------------|--------------------|
|        | <b>Transport Workers Union of America, Local 250-A (Multi-Unit)</b> | <b>FY 2019-20</b> | <b>FY 2020-21</b> | <b>FY 2021-22</b>  |
| 190529 | Wages   | \$ 410,000        | \$ 864,000        | \$ 1,302,000       |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 116,000           | 245,000           | 370,000            |
|        | Tuition Reimbursement   | 5,000             | 5,000             | 5,000              |
|        | Bilingual Pay Premium   | 8,000             | 8,000             | 8,000              |
|        | Environmental Health Temporary Events Premium                       | 7,000             | 7,000             | 0                  |
|        | One-Time Retroactive Schedule Differential                          | 7,000             | 0                 | 0                  |
|        | Vector Control Certified Technician Premium                         | 1,000             | 1,000             | 1,000              |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>554,000</b>    | <b>1,130,000</b>  | <b>1,686,000</b>   |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                  | <i>3.7%</i>       | <i>7.6%</i>       | <i>11.3%</i>       |
|        | <b>Transport Workers Union of America, Local 200</b>                | <b>FY 2019-20</b> | <b>FY 2020-21</b> | <b>FY 2021-22</b>  |
| 190530 | Wages   | \$ 122,000        | \$ 257,000        | \$ 387,000         |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 34,000            | 71,000            | 107,000            |
|        | Officer Involved Shooting Standby Pay                               | 83,000            | 86,000            | 89,000             |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>239,000</b>    | <b>414,000</b>    | <b>583,000</b>     |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                  | <i>5.4%</i>       | <i>9.4%</i>       | <i>13.2%</i>       |
|        | <b>Service Employees International Union, Local 1021</b>            | <b>FY 2019-20</b> | <b>FY 2020-21</b> | <b>FY 2021-22</b>  |
| 190531 | Wages   | \$ 33,031,000     | \$ 69,685,000     | \$ 104,949,000     |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 8,827,000         | 18,622,000        | 28,045,000         |
|        | Extended Steps  | 1,404,000         | 2,746,000         | 4,439,000          |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments  | 217,000           | 832,000           | 854,000            |
|        | Bilingual Pay Premium   | 554,000           | 554,000           | 554,000            |
|        | Lead Person Premium   | 322,000           | 322,000           | 322,000            |
|        | Work Training Program   | 200,000           | 200,000           | 200,000            |
|        | CalPERS Waiver  | 80,000            | 0                 | 0                  |
|        | Certification Premium   | 72,000            | 75,000            | 77,000             |
|        | Public Safety Communications Premium                                | 9,000             | 10,000            | 10,000             |
|        | Uniforms  | 14,000            | 14,000            | 14,000             |
|        | Pressure Washing Premium  | 8,000             | 9,000             | 9,000              |
|        | Workplace Improvement Committee                                     | 5,000             | 6,000             | 6,000              |
|        | Eliminate Training Funds  | (10,000)          | (10,000)          | (10,000)           |
|        | Union Pays Administrative Fees                                      | (27,000)          | (27,000)          | (27,000)           |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>44,706,000</b> | <b>93,038,000</b> | <b>139,442,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                  | <i>3.9%</i>       | <i>8.0%</i>       | <i>12.0%</i>       |
|        | <b>Supervising Probation Officers</b>                               | <b>FY 2019-20</b> | <b>FY 2020-21</b> | <b>FY 2021-22</b>  |
| 190532 | Wages   | \$ 122,000        | \$ 257,000        | \$ 387,000         |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 41,000            | 86,000            | 129,000            |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>163,000</b>    | <b>343,000</b>    | <b>516,000</b>     |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                  | <i>3.5%</i>       | <i>7.4%</i>       | <i>11.2%</i>       |
|        | <b>San Francisco City Workers United</b>                            | <b>FY 2019-20</b> | <b>FY 2020-21</b> | <b>FY 2021-22</b>  |
| 190533 | Wages   | \$ 364,000        | \$ 768,000        | \$ 1,157,000       |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 97,000            | 205,000           | 309,000            |
|        | Industrial Coatings Premium   | 11,000            | 11,000            | 11,000             |
|        | Taping Premium  | 2,000             | 2,000             | 2,000              |
|        | Sand Blast Premium  | 2,000             | 2,000             | 2,000              |
|        | Thermo Plastic Truck Premium  | 15,000            | 15,000            | 15,000             |
|        | Correctional Facility Premium                                       | 1,000             | 1,000             | 1,000              |
|        | Hydro Washer Truck Premium  | 4,000             | 4,000             | 4,000              |
|        | Work Clothing   | 8,000             | 8,000             | 8,000              |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>504,000</b>    | <b>1,016,000</b>  | <b>1,509,000</b>   |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                  | <i>3.8%</i>       | <i>7.8%</i>       | <i>11.5%</i>       |
|        | <b>Municipal Executives Association</b>                             | <b>FY 2019-20</b> | <b>FY 2020-21</b> | <b>FY 2021-22</b>  |
| 190534 | Wages   | \$ 6,337,000      | \$ 13,370,000     | \$ 20,136,000      |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits  | 1,698,000         | 3,582,000         | 5,395,000          |
|        | Management Classification/Compensation Plan (MCCP) Funds            | 343,000           | 356,000           | 614,000            |
|        | Safety Equipment  | 4,000             | 4,000             | 4,000              |
|        | Life Insurance  | 0                 | 29,000            | 88,000             |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>   | <b>8,382,000</b>  | <b>17,341,000</b> | <b>26,237,000</b>  |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                  | <i>3.7%</i>       | <i>7.6%</i>       | <i>11.5%</i>       |

International Union of Operating Engineers Stationary Engineers, Local 39

|        |                                    | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22        |
|--------|------------------------------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|
| 190535 | Wages                              | \$ 2,610,000     | \$ 5,506,000     | \$ 8,293,000      |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits       | 701,000          | 1,479,000        | 2,227,000         |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustment        | 565,000          | 1,180,000        | 1,843,000         |
|        | Certification Premium              | 89,000           | 93,000           | 96,000            |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>              | <b>3,965,000</b> | <b>8,258,000</b> | <b>12,459,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> | <i>4.2%</i>      | <i>8.8%</i>      | <i>13.2%</i>      |

United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices - Plumbing and Fitting

|        |  | FY 2019-20       | FY 2020-21       | FY 2021-22       |
|--------|--|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| 190539 | <b>Industry, Local 38</b>              |                  |                  |                  |
|        | Wages                                  | \$ 1,260,000     | \$ 2,658,000     | \$ 4,003,000     |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits           | 328,000          | 692,000          | 1,042,000        |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments           | 54,000           | 80,000           | 107,000          |
|        | Lead Worker Pay                        | 45,000           | 45,000           | 45,000           |
|        | Cross Connection Certification Premium | 11,000           | 56,000           | 58,000           |
|        | Acting Assignment Pay                  | 25,000           | 26,000           | 27,000           |
|        | Night Shift Pay                        | 23,000           | 24,000           | 25,000           |
|        | Safety Equipment                       | 15,000           | 15,000           | 15,000           |
|        | Life Insurance                         | 15,000           | 15,000           | 15,000           |
|        | Asbestos Certification Premium         | 7,000            | 7,000            | 7,000            |
|        | Boat/Barge Premium                     | 6,000            | 6,000            | 6,000            |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>                  | <b>1,789,000</b> | <b>3,624,000</b> | <b>5,350,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>     | <i>4.0%</i>      | <i>8.0%</i>      | <i>11.9%</i>     |

San Francisco Institutional Police Officers' Association

|        |                                    | FY 2019-20   | FY 2020-21    | FY 2021-22    |
|--------|------------------------------------|--------------|---------------|---------------|
| 190540 | Wages                              | \$ 6,000     | \$ 13,000     | \$ 20,000     |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits       | 1,000        | 3,000         | 4,000         |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>              | <b>7,000</b> | <b>16,000</b> | <b>24,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> | <i>3.3%</i>  | <i>7.6%</i>   | <i>11.3%</i>  |

San Francisco District Attorney Investigators' Association

|        |                                      | FY 2019-20     | FY 2020-21     | FY 2021-22     |
|--------|--------------------------------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
| 190541 | Wages                                | \$ 172,000     | \$ 363,000     | \$ 547,000     |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits         | 43,000         | 90,000         | 135,000        |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments         | 92,000         | 257,000        | 266,000        |
|        | Eliminate Funds for Training         | (41,000)       | (41,000)       | (41,000)       |
|        | Wage Adjustments to Pay for Training | 64,000         | 66,000         | 68,000         |
|        | Jury Duty Pay                        | 4,000          | 4,000          | 4,000          |
|        | Bilingual Pay Premium                | 2,000          | 2,000          | 2,000          |
|        | Severance Pay                        | 2,000          | 2,000          | 2,000          |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>                | <b>338,000</b> | <b>743,000</b> | <b>983,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>   | <i>5.5%</i>    | <i>12.2%</i>   | <i>16.1%</i>   |

San Francisco Building Inspectors Association

|        |                                    | FY 2019-20     | FY 2020-21     | FY 2021-22       |
|--------|------------------------------------|----------------|----------------|------------------|
| 190542 | Wages                              | \$ 323,000     | \$ 681,000     | \$ 1,025,000     |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits       | 89,000         | 188,000        | 284,000          |
|        | Certification Premium              | 34,000         | 35,000         | 37,000           |
|        | Lead Worker Pay                    | 1,000          | 1,000          | 1,000            |
|        | <b>Union Total \$</b>              | <b>447,000</b> | <b>905,000</b> | <b>1,347,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i> | <i>3.8%</i>    | <i>7.7%</i>    | <i>11.5%</i>     |

|        |  | FY 2019-20          | FY 2020-21          | FY 2021-22          |
|--------|--|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| 190544 | <u>Crafts Coalition</u>  |                     |                     |                     |
|        | Wages  | \$ 1,614,000        | \$ 3,405,000        | \$ 5,128,000        |
|        | Wage-Related Fringe Benefits   | 432,000             | 912,000             | 1,373,000           |
|        | Job Class Equity Adjustments   | 125,000             | 125,000             | 126,000             |
|        | Clothing   | 74,000              | 74,000              | 74,000              |
|        | Lead Worker Pay  | 68,000              | 68,000              | 68,000              |
|        | Specialized Equipment Premium  | 46,000              | 46,000              | 46,000              |
|        | Acting Assignment Pay  | 31,000              | 43,000              | 48,000              |
|        | Boom Truck / Street Sweeper Premium                                  | 30,000              | 30,000              | 30,000              |
|        | Life Insurance   | 24,000              | 24,000              | 24,000              |
|        | Association of Diving Contractors International Certification (ACDI) | 18,000              | 24,000              | 27,000              |
|        | Asbestos Certification Premium                                       | 6,000               | 6,000               | 6,000               |
|        | Underwater Diving Pay  | 4,000               | 4,000               | 4,000               |
|        | Sewage Premium   | 3,000               | 3,000               | 3,000               |
|        | Waste Water Treatment Facility Premium                               | 3,000               | 3,000               | 3,000               |
|        | <b>Union Total</b>   | <b>\$ 2,478,000</b> | <b>\$ 4,767,000</b> | <b>\$ 6,960,000</b> |
|        | <i>% of Wage and Benefits Base</i>                                   | <i>4.3%</i>         | <i>8.2%</i>         | <i>12.0%</i>        |

\* Costs or savings less than \$500 are not shown individually but are reflected in the Union Total values.

## Attachment B

In accordance with Ordinance 92-94, the Office of the Controller conducted a cost analysis of 23 MOUs and one MOU amendment between the City and County of San Francisco and various Unions representing employee bargaining units. The attached analysis reviews the MOUs and one MOU amendment listed below:

- 190518 – Compensation for Unrepresented Employees
- 190519 – Fire Fighters Union Local 798, Unit 2
- 190520 – Municipal Attorneys' Association
- 190521 – Machinists Union, Local 1414
- 190522 – International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21
- 190523 – Laborers International Union, Local 261
- 190524 – International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 6
- 190525 – San Francisco Deputy Probation Officers' Association
- 190526 – Operating Engineers, Local 3
- 190527 – Teamsters, Local 856 (Multi-Unit)
- 190528 – Transport Workers' Union, Local 250-A – Automotive Service Workers (7410)
- 190529 – Transport Workers Union of America, Local 250-A (Multi-Unit)
- 190530 – Transport Workers Union of America, Local 200
- 190531 – Service Employees International Union, Local 1021
- 190532 – Supervising Probation Officers
- 190533 – San Francisco City Workers United
- 190534 – Municipal Executives Association
- 190535 – International Union of Operating Engineers Stationary Engineers, Local 39
- 190539 – United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices - Plumbing and Pipe Fitting Industry, Local 38
- 190540 – San Francisco Institutional Police Officers' Association
- 190541 – San Francisco District Attorney Investigators' Association
- 190542 – San Francisco Building Inspectors' Association
- 190544 – Crafts Coalition

The MOUs and MOU amendment affect approximately 20,000 authorized positions with an overall salary and benefits base of approximately \$2.6 billion. Our analysis finds that the MOUs will result in increased costs to the City of \$102.2 million (or 3.9%) of base wage and benefit cost in FY 2019-20, \$210.4 million, (or 8.0%) of base wage and benefit cost in FY 2020-21, and \$314.1 million (or 11.9%) of base wage and benefit cost in FY 2021-22. Approximately 60% of the increased cost is supported by the General Fund.

Our cost estimates assume that premiums, overtime, and other adjustments grow consistently with wage changes. Some wage and premium increases in FY 2020-21 and FY 2021-22 could be delayed if the Joint Report projects a budget deficit greater than \$200 million. These cost estimates assume that those increases will take place as scheduled. If the increases were delayed, the estimated cost would be reduced to approximately \$159.5 million and \$260.0 in FY 2020-21 and FY 2021-22, respectively.

The MOUs share the following key provisions:

- **Citywide Wage Increases.** With the exception to the Fire Fighters Union Local 798, Unit 2 MOU amendment, the MOUs increase base wages by 3.0% on July 1, 2019; 1.0% on December 28, 2019; 3.0% on July 1, 2020; 0.5% on December 26, 2020; 3.0% on July 1, 2021; 0.5% on January 8, 2022. As noted above, these mid-year wage increases could be delayed by six months in FY 2020-21 and FY 2021-22 if the Joint Report projects a budget deficit of greater than \$200 million. The Fire Fighters Union Local 798, Unit 2 has an existing MOU for FY 2018-19 through FY 2020-21.
- **Job Class Equity Adjustments.** Eleven MOUs contain provisions to adjust pay scales for select job classes to align with similar job classes.

Overall, more than 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to citywide wage increases and job class equity adjustment increases. In addition, most of the MOUs contain provisions to add or change premium pay for certain skills and certifications. Several of the MOUs also adjust compensatory time, floating holidays, and jury duty pay; in most cases, we did not find an additional cost for these provisions.

The MOUs are discussed in more detail below.

#### **File Number 190518 – Compensation for Unrepresented Employees**

The MOU for Unrepresented Employees affects 60 authorized positions with a base salary of \$8.2 million and an overall pay and benefits base of approximately \$10.4 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.4 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.8 million in FY 2020-21, and \$1.2 million in FY 2021-22. More than 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement.

#### **File Number 190519 – Fire Fighters Union Local 798, Unit 2**

The MOU amendment for the Fire Fighters Union Local 798, Unit 2 affects 1 authorized position (H-42 Assistant Fire Marshal) with a base salary of \$0.2 million and an overall pay and benefits base of approximately \$0.2 million. We project the amendment will increase costs to the City by \$34,000 in FY 2019-20 and \$23,000 in FY 2020-21, should the budgeted position be filled.



**File Number 190520 – Municipal Attorneys’ Association**

The MOU for the Municipal Attorneys’ Association affects 429 authorized positions with a base salary of \$91.0 million and an overall pay and benefits base of approximately \$115.9 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$4.4 million in FY 2019-20, \$8.9 million in FY 2020-21, and \$13.3 million in FY 2021-22. More than 90% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for standby pay and California Bar dues account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to floating holidays, administrative leave, life insurance, and jury duty are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File Number 190521 – Machinists Union, Local 1414**

The MOU for the Machinists Union, Local 1414 affects 149 authorized positions with a base salary of \$14.6 million and an overall pay and benefits base of approximately \$19.6 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$1.2 million in FY 2019-20, \$1.9 million in FY 2020-21, and \$2.7 million in FY 2021-22. More than 75% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity, equipment, life insurance, and various adjustments to pay account for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190522 – International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21**

The MOU for the International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, Local 21 affects 4,206 authorized positions with a base salary of \$507.2 million and an overall pay and benefits base of approximately \$658.5 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$24.6 million in FY 2019-20, \$51.3 million in FY 2020-21, and \$76.3 million in FY 2021-22. About 95% of the total cost increase is due to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity adjustments, floating holidays, employee development, TechHire, extended ranges, and premiums account of the remainder of the cost. Changes to compensatory time are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File Number 190523 – Laborers International Union, Local 261**

The MOU for the Laborers International Union, Local 261 affects 1,076 authorized positions with a base salary of \$83.6 million and an overall pay and benefits base of approximately \$113.0 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$4.5 million in FY 2019-20, \$9.1 million in FY 2020-21, and \$13.3 million in FY 2021-22. About 85% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity, health insurance cost sharing, protective clothing, and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190524 – International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 6**

The MOU for International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 6 affects 275 authorized positions with a base salary of \$32.2 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$45.4 million. We

project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$1.8 million in FY 2019-20, \$3.6 million in FY 2020-21, and \$5.4 million in FY 2021-22. About 85% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity, shift differentials, standby pay, equipment, employee development, and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190525 – San Francisco Deputy Probation Officers’ Association**

The MOU for San Francisco Deputy Probation Officers’ Association affects 128 authorized positions with a base salary of \$14.4 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$19.3 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.8 million in FY 2019-20, \$1.4 million in FY 2020-21, and \$2.2 million in FY 2021-22. About 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for CalPERs forgiveness, life insurance, and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190526 – Operating Engineers, Local 3**

The MOU for Operating Engineers, Local 3 affects 49 authorized positions with a base salary of \$5.5 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$7.6 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.3 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.6 million in FY 2020-21, and \$0.9 million in FY 2021-22. About 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to compensatory time are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File Number 190527 – Teamsters, Local 856 (Multi-Unit)**

The MOU for Teamsters, Local 856 (Multi-Unit) affects 90 authorized positions with a base salary of \$9.0 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$12.3 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.5 million in FY 2019-20, \$1.0 million in FY 2020-21, and \$1.5 million in FY 2021-22. About 90% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job equity and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190528 – Transport Workers’ Union, Local 250-A – Automotive Service Workers (7410)**

The MOU for Transport Workers’ Union, Local 250-A – Automotive Service Workers (7410) affects 31 authorized positions with a base salary of \$2.3 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$3.0 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.1 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.2 million in FY 2020-21, and \$0.3 million in FY 2021-22. About 98% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for protective clothing, life insurance, and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to compensatory time and floating holidays are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File Number 190529 – Transport Workers Union of America, Local 250-A (Multi-Unit)**

The MOU for Transport Workers Union of America, Local 250-A (Multi-Unit) affects 97 authorized positions with a base salary of \$11.6 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$14.9 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.5 million in FY 2019-20, \$1.1 million in FY 2020-21, and \$1.7 million in FY 2021-22. More than 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for premiums and employee development account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to compensatory time and floating holidays are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File Number 190530 – Transport Workers Union of America, Local 200**

The MOU for Transport Workers Union of America, Local 200 affects 28 authorized positions with a base salary of \$3.2 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$4.4 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.2 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.4 million in FY 2020-21, and \$0.6 million in FY 2021-22. About 80% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for officer-involved shooting standby pay accounts for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190531 – Service Employees International Union, Local 1021**

The MOU for Service Employees International Union, Local 1021 affects 10,465 authorized positions with a base salary of \$859.5 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$1,158.3 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$44.7 million in FY 2019-20, \$93.0 million in FY 2020-21, and \$139.4 million in FY 2021-22. About 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity, extended steps, premiums, employee development, and benefits account for the remainder of the cost increase.

**File Number 190532 – Supervising Probation Officers**

The MOU for Supervising Probation Officers affects 29 authorized positions with a base salary of \$3.5 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$4.6 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.2 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.3 million in FY 2020-21, and \$0.5 million in FY 2021-22. The entire cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Changes to compensatory time, floating holidays, and premiums are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File Number 190533 – San Francisco City Workers United**

The MOU for San Francisco City Workers United affects 101 authorized positions with a base salary of \$9.5 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$13.1 million. We project the MOU will

increase costs to the City by \$0.5 million in FY 2019-20, \$1.0 million in FY 2020-21, and \$1.5 million in FY 2021-22. About 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for premiums, and equipment account for the remainder of the cost increase.

#### **File Number 190534 – Municipal Executives Association**

The MOU for Municipal Executives Association affects 1,092 authorized positions with a base salary of \$179.8 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$228.3 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$8.4 million in FY 2019-20, \$17.3 million in FY 2020-21, and \$26.2 million in FY 2021-22. More than 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for equipment, life insurance, and M CCP funds account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to compensatory time and jury duty pay are estimated to have no change in cost.

#### **File Number 190535 – International Union of Operating Engineers Stationary Engineers, Local 39**

The MOU for International Union of Operating Engineers Stationary Engineers, Local 39 affects 626 authorized positions with a base salary of \$67.3 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$94.1 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$4.0 million in FY 2019-20, \$8.3 million in FY 2020-21, and \$12.5 million in FY 2021-22. About 85% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase.

#### **File 190539 – United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices - Plumbing and Pipe Fitting Industry, Local 38**

The MOU for United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices - Plumbing and Pipe Fitting Industry, Local 38 affects 267 authorized positions with a base salary of \$31.3 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$45.2 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$1.7 million in FY 2019-20, \$3.6 million in FY 2020-21, and \$5.3 million in FY 2021-22. About 95% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity, premiums, life insurance, and equipment account for the remainder of the cost increase.

#### **File 190540 – San Francisco Institutional Police Officers' Association**

The MOU for San Francisco Institutional Police Officers' Association affects 1 authorized position with a base salary of \$0.1 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$0.2 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$7,000 in FY 2019-20, \$16,000 million in FY 2020-21, and \$24,000 million in FY 2021-22. The entire cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage

increases in each year of the agreement. Changes to premiums are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File 190541 – San Francisco District Attorney Investigators’ Association**

The MOU for San Francisco District Attorney Investigators’ Association affects 36 authorized positions with a base salary of \$4.6 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$6.1 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.4 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.7 million in FY 2020-21, and \$1.0 million in FY 2021-22. About 70% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for job class equity, employee development, and premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to compensatory time are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File 190542 – San Francisco Building Inspectors’ Association**

The MOU for San Francisco District Attorney Investigators’ Association affects 66 authorized positions with a base salary of \$8.8 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$11.7million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$0.4 million in FY 2019-20, \$0.7 million in FY 2020-21, and \$1.0 million in FY 2021-22. About 60% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases premiums account for the remainder of the cost increase. Changes to compensatory time are estimated to have no change in cost.

**File 190544 – Crafts Coalition**

The MOU for the Crafts Coalition affects 436 authorized positions with a base salary of \$42.7 million and an overall pay and benefits base of about \$58.1 million. We project the MOU will increase costs to the City by \$2.5 million in FY 2019-20, \$4.8 million in FY 2020-21, and \$7.0 million in FY 2021-22. About 90% of the total cost increase is attributable to the citywide wage increases in each year of the agreement. Increases for premiums, life insurance, clothing, and employee education account for the remainder of the cost increase.