



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Mills Act Contracts Case Report

Hearing Date: October 5, 2015

- a.** *Filing Date:* May 1, 2015
Case No.: 2016-006192MLS
Project Address: **101-105 Steiner**
Landmark District: Duboce Park Landmark District
Zoning: RTO (Residential Transit Oriented District)
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0866/009
Applicant: Jason Monberg & Karli Sager
56 Potomac Street
San Francisco, CA94117
- b.** *Filing Date:* May 1, 2015
Case No.: 2016-006185MLS
Project Address: **361 Oak Street**
Landmark District: Individually listed in the California Register of Historical Resources
Zoning: RTO (Residential Transit Oriented District)
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0839/023
Applicant: Christopher J. Ludwig and Liesl Ludwig
361 Oak Street
San Francisco, CA 94102
- c.** *Filing Date:* May 1, 2015
Case No.: 2016-006181MLS
Project Address: **1036 Vallejo Street**
Landmark District: Russian Hill-Vallejo Street Crest National Register Historic District
Zoning: RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family)
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0127/007
Applicant: Kian Beyzavi & Hamid Amiri
227 14th Ave
San Francisco, CA 94118
- d.** *Filing Date:* May 1, 2015
Case No.: 2016-006229MLS
Project Address: **1338 Filbert Street**
Landmark District: San Francisco Landmark No 232, 1338 Filbert Cottages
Zoning: RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family)
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0524/031, 0524/032, 0524/033, 0524/034

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Applicant: Dominique Lahaussais & David N. Low
30 Blackstone Court
San Francisco, CA 94123

PROPERTY DESCRIPTIONS

- a. **101-105 Steiner Street:** The subject property is located on the west side of Steiner Street between Hermann and Waller streets; the south elevation abuts Duboce Park. Assessor's Block 0866, Lot 009. The subject property is within a RTO (Residential Transit Oriented District) Zoning District and a 40-X Height and Bulk District. The property is a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District. It is a three-story plus basement, wood frame, multiple family building designed in the Edwardian style and constructed in 1903.
- b. **361 Oak Street:** The subject property is located on the south side of Oak Street between Laguna and Octavia streets. Assessor's Block 0839, Lot 023. The subject property is located within a RTO (Residential Transit Oriented District) and a 40-X Height and Bulk District. The property is individually listed on the California Register of Historical Resources, located in the Hayes Valley Residential Historic District. It is a two-story, wood frame, single-family dwelling designed in the Italianate style and built in 1885.
- c. **1036 Vallejo Street:** The subject property is located on the north side of Vallejo Street between Jones and Taylor streets. Assessor's Block 0127, Lot 007. The subject property is located within a RH-2 (Residential – House, Two Family) and a 40-X Height and Bulk District. The property is a contributor to the Russian Hill-Vallejo Street Crest National Register of Historic Places District. It is a two and half-story, wood frame, single-family dwelling designed in the Shingle style and built in 1906.
- d. **1338 Filbert Street:** The subject property is located on the north side of Filbert Street between Polk and Larkin streets. Assessor's Block 0524/031, 0524/032, 0524/033, 0524/034. The subject property is located within a RH-2 (Residential – House, Two Family) and a 40-X Height and Bulk District. The property is San Francisco Landmark No. 232, 1338 Filbert Cottages. It consists of four, two-story, wood frame, single family dwellings designed in a vernacular post-earthquake period style with craftsman references and built in 1907 with a 1943 addition.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

This project is a Mills Act Historical Property Contract application.

MILLS ACT REVIEW PROCESS

Once a Mills Act application is received, the matter is referred to the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) for review. The HPC shall conduct a public hearing on the Mills Act application, historical property contract, and proposed rehabilitation and maintenance plan, and make a recommendation for approval or disapproval to the Board of Supervisors.

The Board of Supervisors will hold a public hearing to review and approve or disapprove the Mills Act application and contract. The Board of Supervisors shall conduct a public hearing to review the Historic Preservation Commission recommendation, information provided by the Assessor's Office, and any other information the Board requires in order to determine whether the City should execute a historical property contract for the subject property.

The Board of Supervisors shall have full discretion to determine whether it is in the public interest to enter into a Mills Act contract and may approve, disapprove, or modify and approve the terms of the contract. Upon approval, the Board of Supervisors shall authorize the Director of Planning and the Assessor-Recorder's Office to execute the historical property contract.

MILLS ACT REVIEW PROCEDURES

The Historic Preservation Commission is requested to review and make recommendations on the following:

- The draft Mills Act Historical Property Contract between the property owner and the City and County of San Francisco.
- The proposed rehabilitation and maintenance plan.

The Historic Preservation Commission may also comment in making a determination as to whether the public benefit gained through restoration, continued maintenance and preservation of the property is sufficient to outweigh the subsequent loss of property taxes to the City.

APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

Ordinance No. 191-96 amended the San Francisco Administrative Code by adding Chapter 71 to implement the California Mills Act, California Government Code Sections 50280 *et seq.* The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with private property owners who will rehabilitate, restore, preserve, and maintain a "qualified historical property." In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. The property tax reductions must be made in accordance with Article 1.9 (commencing with Section 439) of Chapter 3 of Part 2 of Division 1 of the California Revenue and Taxation Code.

TERM

Mills Act contracts must be made for a minimum term of ten years. The ten-year period is automatically renewed by one year annually to create a rolling ten-year term. One year is added automatically to the initial term of the contract on the anniversary date of the contract, unless notice of nonrenewal is given or the contract is terminated. If the City issues a notice of nonrenewal, then one year will no longer be added to the term of the contract on its anniversary date and the contract will only remain in effect for the remainder of its term. The City must monitor the provisions of the contract until its expiration and may terminate the Mills Act contract at any time if it determines that the owner is not complying with the terms of the contract or the legislation. Termination due to default immediately ends the contract term. Mills Act contracts remain in force when a property is sold.

ELIGIBILITY

San Francisco Administrative Code Chapter 71, Section 71.2, defines a “qualified historic property” as one that is not exempt from property taxation and that is one of the following:

- (a) Individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places;
- (b) Listed as a contributor to an historic district included on the National Register of Historic Places;
- (c) Designated as a City landmark pursuant to San Francisco Planning Code Article 10;
- (d) Designated as contributory to a landmark district designated pursuant to San Francisco Planning Code Article 10; or
- (e) Designated as significant (Categories I or II) or contributory (Categories III or IV) to a conservation district designated pursuant to San Francisco Planning Code Article 11.

All properties that are eligible under the criteria listed above must also meet a tax assessment value to be eligible for a Mills Act Contract. The tax assessment limits are listed below:

Residential Buildings

Eligibility is limited to a property tax assessment value of not more than \$3,000,000.

Commercial, Industrial or Mixed Use Buildings

Eligibility is limited to a property tax assessment value of not more than \$5,000,000.

Properties may be exempt from the tax assessment values if it meets any one of the following criteria:

- The qualified historic property is an exceptional example of architectural style or represents a work of a master architect or is associated with the lives of persons important to local or national history; or
- Granting the exemption will assist in the preservation and rehabilitation of a historic structure (including unusual and/or excessive maintenance requirements) that would otherwise be in danger of demolition, deterioration, or abandonment;

Properties applying for a valuation exemption must provide evidence that it meets the exemption criteria, including a historic structure report to substantiate the exceptional circumstances for granting the exemption. The Historic Preservation Commission shall make specific findings in determining whether to recommend to the Board of Supervisors that the valuation exemption should be approved. Final approval of this exemption is under the purview of the Board of Supervisors.

PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT

The Department has not received any public comment regarding the Mills Act Historical Property Contract.

STAFF ANALYSIS

The Department received six Mills Act applications by the May 1, 2015 filing date. One application, 166 Geary (Block/Lot: 0127/007), was incomplete. 53-57 Potomac Street (0865/009) did not receive a first year

reduction and the application was withdrawn by the Project Sponsor. The Project Sponsors, Planning Department Staff, and the Office of the City Attorney have negotiated the remaining five attached draft historical property contracts, which include a draft rehabilitation and maintenance plan for the historic building. Department Staff believes the draft historical property contracts and plans are adequate.

- a. **101-105 Steiner Street:** As detailed in the Mills Act application, the applicant proposes to rehabilitate and maintain the historic property. Staff determined that the proposed work, detailed in the attachments, is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Preservation and Restoration.

The subject property is currently valued by the Assessor's Office as under \$3,000,000 (see attached Market Analysis and Income Approach reports) and did not require a Historic Structure Report. The subject property qualifies for an exemption as a contributor to the Duboce Park Historic District under Article 10 of the Planning Code.

The applicant has already completed a partial foundation improvement to the enclosed porch at the rear of the building. The proposed Rehabilitation Plan includes repair and in-kind replacement of double-hung, wood sash windows; roof repair and replacement; seismic upgrade; replacement of non-original siding with compatible wood siding on enclosed rear porch; siding repair; and painting.

The proposed Maintenance Plan includes annual inspection of the roof and drainage systems; attic; exterior wood siding; windows; porch; basement and foundation with in-kind repair of any deteriorated elements as necessary. Any needed repairs will be made in kind and will avoid altering, removing or obscuring character-defining features of the building.

No changes to the use of the property are proposed. Please refer to the attached Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan for a full description of the proposed work. The attached draft historical property contract will help the applicant mitigate these expenditures and will induce the applicant to maintain the property in excellent condition in the future.

- b. **361 Oak Street:** As detailed in the Mills Act application, the applicant proposes to rehabilitate and maintain the historic property. Staff determined that the proposed work, detailed in the attachments, is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Preservation and Restoration.

The subject property is currently valued by the Assessor's Office as under \$3,000,000 (see attached Market Analysis and Income Approach reports) and did not require a Historic Structure Report. The subject property qualifies for an exemption as an individually listed property on the California Register of Historic Resources, located in Hayes Valley Residential Historic District.

The proposed Rehabilitation Plan includes consultation with a structural engineer on possible need for seismic upgrade; new compatible wood windows; new roof; and painting.

The proposed Maintenance Plan includes annual inspection siding, windows, and gutters; and inspection of the roof and cast iron fencing every five years with in-kind repair of any deteriorated elements as necessary. Any needed repairs will be made in kind and will avoid altering, removing or obscuring character-defining features of the building.

No changes to the use of the property are proposed. Please refer to the attached Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan for a full description of the proposed work. The attached draft historical property contract will help the applicant mitigate these expenditures and will induce the applicant to maintain the property in excellent condition in the future.

- c. **1036 Vallejo Street:** As detailed in the Mills Act application, the applicant proposes to rehabilitate and maintain the historic property. Staff determined that the proposed work, detailed in the attachments, is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Preservation and Restoration.

The subject property is currently valued by the Assessor's Office as under \$3,000,000 (see attached Market Analysis and Income Approach reports) and did not require a Historic Structure Report. The subject property qualifies for an exemption as a contributor to the Russian Hill-Vallejo Crest National Register Historic District.

The proposed Rehabilitation Plan includes repair and in-kind replacement of multi-pane, double-hung, wood sash windows; seismic upgrade; in-kind repair to wood trim and shingles; roof and gutter repair; and in-kind repair to front stairs.

The proposed Maintenance Plan includes annual inspection of the windows, wood siding and shingles, and gutters; as well as inspection of the roof every five years with in-kind repair of any deteriorated elements as necessary. Any needed repairs will be made in kind and will avoid altering, removing or obscuring character-defining features of the building.

No changes to the use of the property are proposed. Please refer to the attached Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan for a full description of the proposed work. The attached draft historical property contract will help the applicant mitigate these expenditures and will induce the applicant to maintain the property in excellent condition in the future.

- d. **1338 Filbert Street:** As detailed in the Mills Act application, the applicant proposes to rehabilitate and maintain the historic property. Staff determined that the proposed work, detailed in the attachments, is consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, Preservation and Restoration.

The subject property is currently valued by the Assessor's Office as over \$3,000,000 (all four parcels; see attached Market Analysis and Income Approach reports). The subject property qualifies for an exemption as it is designated San Francisco Landmark No. 232, 1338 Filbert Cottages. A Historic Structure Report was required in order to demonstrate that granting the exemption would assist in the preservation of a property that might otherwise be in danger of demolition or substantial alterations.

The applicant has already completed a substantial rehabilitation work to the property, including historic resource protection during construction; seismic upgrade; in-kind roof replacement; and in-kind gutter replacement. The proposed Rehabilitation Plan includes retention and in-kind replacement of siding; structural reframing; retention and in-kind replacement of doors and windows; exterior painting; and restoration of the garden.

The proposed Maintenance Plan includes annual inspection of the garden, downspouts, gutters and drainage; inspection of doors and windows, millwork every two years; inspection of wood siding and trim every three years; selected repainting every four years; and inspection of the roof every five years with in-kind repair of any deteriorated elements as necessary. Any needed repairs will be made in kind and will avoid altering, removing or obscuring character-defining features of the building.

No changes to the use of the property are proposed. Please refer to the attached Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan for a full description of the proposed work. The attached draft historical property contract will help the applicant mitigate these expenditures and will induce the applicant to maintain the property in excellent condition in the future.

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

Based on information received from the Assessor-Recorder, 101-105 Steiner Street will receive an estimated 44.5% first year reduction; 361 Oak Street will receive an estimated 55.0% first year reduction; 1036 Vallejo Street will receive an estimated 28.1% first year reduction; and 1338 Filbert Street #1 will not receive a first year reduction, 1338 Filbert Street #2 will receive a 22.7% first year reduction, 1338 Filbert Street #3 will receive a 12.2% first year reduction, and 1338 Filbert Street #4 will receive a 0.5% reduction as a result of the Mills Act Contract.

The Planning Department recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt a resolution recommending approval of these Mills Act Historical Property Contracts and Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plans to the Board of Supervisors.

ISSUES AND OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Mills Act Contract property owners are required to submit an annual affidavit demonstrating compliance with Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plans.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTIONS

Review and adopt a resolution for each property:

1. Recommending to the Board of Supervisors the approval of the proposed Mills Act Historical Property Contract between the property owner(s) and the City and County of San Francisco;
2. Approving the proposed Mills Act Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan for each property.

Attachments:

a. 101-105 Steiner Street

Draft Resolution
Draft Mills Act Historical Property Contract
Draft Rehabilitation Program & Maintenance Plan
Draft Mills Act Valuation provided by the Assessor-Recorder's Office
Mills Act Application

b. 361 Oak Street

Draft Resolutions
Draft Mills Act Historical Property Contract
Draft Rehabilitation Program & Maintenance Plan
Draft Mills Act Valuation provided by the Assessor-Recorder's Office
Mills Act Application

c. 1036 Vallejo Street

Draft Resolution
Draft Mills Act Historical Property Contract
Draft Rehabilitation Program & Maintenance Plan
Draft Mills Act Valuation provided by the Assessor-Recorder's Office
Mills Act Application

d. 1338 Filbert Street

Draft Resolution
Draft Mills Act Historical Property Contract
Draft Rehabilitation Program & Maintenance Plan
Draft Mills Act Valuation provided by the Assessor-Recorder's Office
Mills Act Application and Historic Structure Report

SITE PHOTO



AERIAL PHOTO



SUBJECT PROPERTY