BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

June 28, 2023

The Honorable Anne-Christine Massullo Presiding Judge Superior Court of California, County of San Francisco 400 McAllister San Francisco, CA 94102

Subject:

2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System" (Board File No. 190785).

Dear Judge Massullo:

The following is a status update on the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System" (Board File No. 190785).

The Board of Supervisors' Government Audit and Oversight Committee conducted a public hearing on June 1, 2023, to update the responses offered during the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury season; the Board of Supervisors adopted Motion No. M23-089 on June 13, 2023.

Motion No. M23-089 updated the Board of Supervisors responses to:

• Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7 and R8.

Please accept this copy of Motion No. M23-089 for the Civil Grand Jury records. If you have any questions, please contact me at (415) 554-5184.

Sincerely,

Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board

- 4 Calvitto

sc:jec:ams

cc:

Members, Board of Supervisors
Tom Paulino, Office of the Mayor
Anne Pearson, Office of the City Attorney
Alisa Somera, Legislative Deputy
Ben Rosenfield, City Controller, Office of the Controller
Todd Rydstrom, Office of the Controller
Michelle Allersma, Office of the Controller
Carol Lu, Office of the Controller
Natasha Mihal, Office of the Controller
Janice Levy, Office of the Controller
Mark dela Rosa, Office of the Controller
Helen Vo, Office of the Controller
Ted Egan, Office of the Controller
Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Office of the City Administrator
Vivian Po, Office of the City Administrator

Severin Campbell, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Nicholas Menard, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Dan Goncher, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Amanda Guma, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Peter Brastow, Department of the Environment
Charles Sheehan, Department of the Environment
Jeanine Nicholson, Chief, Fire Department
Theresa Ludwig, Fire Department
Maureen Conefrey, Fire Commission
Dennis Herrera, General Manager, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Masood Ordikhani, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Jeremy Spitz, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Donna Hood, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission

Harvey Rose, Budget Analyst, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst

PREPARED IN COMMITTEE 06/01/2023

[Follow-Up Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Act Now Before it is Too Late:

FILE NO. 190785

MOTION NO. M23-089

Motion responding to the Civil Grand Jury's request to provide a status update on the Board of Supervisor's response to Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7, and R8 contained in the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System."

Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System]

WHEREAS, The 2018-2019 San Francisco Civil Grand Jury published a report, entitled "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System" ("Report") on July 17, 2019; and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors' Government Audit and Oversight Committee ("GAO") conducted a public hearing to hear and respond to the Report on September 19, 2019; and, the Board of Supervisors adopted Resolution No. 422-19 on October 1, 2019, reflecting the GAO responses to the Report; a copy of which is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 190786; and

WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R1 states "By no later than December 31, 2020, the Mayor, the SFPUC, the SFFD, and Office of Resilience and Capital Planning should jointly present to the Board of Supervisors a detailed plan to ensure the City is well prepared to fight fires in all parts of San Francisco in the event of a 1906-magnitude (7.8) earthquake;" and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R1 "has not been implemented but will be implemented no later than December 31, 2021, and urges the Mayor, the SFPUC, the SFFD, and Office of Resilience and Capital Planning to jointly present a detailed plan to the Board of Supervisors by no later than December 31, 2021;" and

WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R2 states "The plan discussed in Recommendation R1 should include a detailed proposal, including financing sources, for the installation within 15 years of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system for those parts of the City that don't currently have one, i.e., by no later than June 30, 2034;" and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R2 "has not been implemented but will be implemented by December 31, 2021, and urges the Departments to include in its detailed plan a detailed proposal, including financing sources, for the installation within 15 years of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system for those parts of the City that don't currently have one by no later than June 30, 2034;" and

WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R3 states "The Board of Supervisors should direct the Budget and Legislative Analyst to study through an equity lens and issue a report to the Board regarding (a) which areas of the City do not have sufficient water supplies for the anticipated demand for water to fight fires following a major earthquake similar in magnitude to the 1906 earthquake, and (b) options to address the issue in both the short term and the long term. The Board should issue its request by no later than December 31, 2019, and the Budget and Legislative Analyst should complete its report by no later than December 31, 2020;" and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R3 "has not been implemented but will be implemented in the future, and Supervisor Gordon Mar will issue a request for a Budget and Legislative Analyst report no later than December 31, 2019, and will direct the Budget and Legislative Analyst to issue the completed report no later than December 31, 2020;" and

WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R6 states "The SFPUC, the SFFD, and the SF Department of the Environment should study adding salt-water pump stations to improve the redundancy of water sources, especially on the west side. Findings and recommendations from this study should be presented to the Board of Supervisors by no later than June 30, 2021;" and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R6 "has not been implemented but will be implemented in the future, and urges the completion of a study for adding a salt-water pump stations to be presented to the Board of Supervisors by no later than June 30, 2021;" and

WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R7 states "The SFPUC should (a) continue its efforts to complete a more detailed analysis of emergency firefighting water needs (including above-the-median needs) by neighborhood, and not just by FRA, and (b) present a completed analysis to the Board of Supervisors by no later than June 30, 2021;" and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R7 "has not been implemented but will be implemented in the future, and urges that a completed analysis be presented to the Board of Supervisors by no later than June 30, 2021;" and

WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R8 states "By no later than June 30, 2022, the Mayor and Board of Supervisors should analyze whether to propose a separate bond for the development of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system for those parts of the City that don't currently have one, with a target date of completing construction by no later than June 30, 2034;" and

WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R8 "has not been implemented but will be implemented in the future, and will analyze by June 30, 2022, in coordination with the Mayor, whether to

propose a separate bond for the development of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system for those parts of the City that don't currently have one, with a target date of completing construction by no later than June 30, 2034;" and

WHEREAS, The GAO Committee conducted an additional hearing on July 16, 2020, to receive an update from City departments on Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7 and R8; now, therefore, be it

MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R1 has been implemented, as the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), San Francisco Fire Department (SFFD), and Office of Resilience and Capital Planning (ORCP) jointly presented such report to the Government Audit and Oversight (GAO) Committee on July 16, 2020; and be it

FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R2 has been implemented, as the Budget and Legislative Analyst submitted a policy analysis report analyzing potential financing sources to the file on November 17, 2021, and on December 19, 2021, the SFPUC submitted its Emergency Firefighting Water System (EFWS) 2050 Planning Study, which included analysis of potential costs, uses of saltwater or freshwater, and various timing options for implementation of EFWS improvements; and be it

FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R3 has been implemented, as the Board requested that the BLA report on this issue through Resolution No. 484-19, approved on November 27, 2019, and the BLA issued its report for the file on November 17, 2021; and be it

FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R6 has been implemented, as the SFPUC submitted its EFWS Seawater Supply study to address this recommendation on June 4, 2021, and later submitted its EFWS 2050 Planning Study, which included further analysis of possible EFWS improvements; and be it

	2	
	3	
	4	
	5	
	6	
	7	
	8	
	9	
1	0	
1	1	
1	2	
1	3	
1	4	
1	5	
1	6	
1	7	
1	8	
1	9	
2	0	
2	1	
2	2	
2	3	
2	4	

1

FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R7 has been implemented, as the SFPUC submitted its Earthquake Water Requirements report to address this recommendation on June 7, 2021, and later submitted its EFWS 2050 Planning Study, which included further analysis of possible EFWS improvements; and be it FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R8 has been implemented, as ORCP published its EFWS Financing Study, which analyzed potential uses of bonds to finance EFWS improvements, on April 3, 2022, and performed further analysis of such bonds in its 10-Year Capital Plan, which was approved by the Board of Supervisors on May 9, 2023.



City and County of San Francisco Tails

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Motion: M23-089

File Number: 190785 Date Passed: June 13, 2023

Motion responding to the Civil Grand Jury's request to provide a status update on the Board of Supervisor's response to Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7, and R8 contained in the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System."

September 19, 2019 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

July 16, 2020 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

January 21, 2021 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

November 18, 2021 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

June 01, 2023 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION

June 01, 2023 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - RECOMMENDED

June 13, 2023 Board of Supervisors - APPROVED

Ayes: 11 - Chan, Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani and Walton

File No. 190785

I hereby certify that the foregoing Motion was APPROVED on 6/13/2023 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board