



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Leo Levenson, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Citation Processing Services – FY 2020-21 & FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2020-2021 and 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Timothy Manglicmot, Budget Manager

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
IS Business Analyst	1052	2.0	\$ 3,630	\$ 4,358	\$ 189,497	\$ 227,488
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	\$ 3,819	\$ 4,585	\$ 99,684	\$ 119,669
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093	2.0	\$ 3,349	\$ 4,021	\$ 174,844	\$ 209,896
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094	1.0	\$ 4,071	\$ 4,887	\$ 106,250	\$ 127,551
IS Engineer-Senior	1043	1.0	\$ 4,986	\$ 5,986	\$ 130,143	\$ 156,235
IS Engineer-Principal	1044	1.0	\$ 5,365	\$ 6,440	\$ 140,014	\$ 168,084
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	2.0	\$ 3,135	\$ 3,763	\$ 163,625	\$ 196,429
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063	3.0	\$ 3,812	\$ 4,576	\$ 298,465	\$ 358,301
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064	1.0	\$ 4,437	\$ 5,326	\$ 115,794	\$ 139,009
IS Project Director	1070	1.0	\$ 5,365	\$ 6,440	\$ 140,014	\$ 168,084
Clerk	1404	1.0	\$ 2,026	\$ 2,432	\$ 52,875	\$ 63,475
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,775	\$ 3,331	\$ 72,420	\$ 86,939
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	\$ 2,174	\$ 2,610	\$ 170,234	\$ 204,363
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	\$ 2,844	\$ 3,414	\$ 74,225	\$ 89,105
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,457	\$ 4,150	\$ 90,226	\$ 108,315
Cashier II	4321	27.0	\$ 2,257	\$ 2,709	\$ 1,590,224	\$ 1,909,032
Cashier III	4322	3.0	\$ 2,531	\$ 3,038	\$ 198,150	\$ 237,875
Manager III, MTA	9177	1.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 124,208	\$ 149,109
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		53.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 3,930,892	\$ 4,718,958
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1052	\$ 50,774
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823	\$ 52,602
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1093	\$ 48,060
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1094	\$ 54,418
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043	\$ 62,134
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044	\$ 64,998
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062	\$ 45,983
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1063	\$ 52,529
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1064	\$ 57,898
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1070	\$ 64,998
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404	\$ 34,579
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408	\$ 41,827
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630	\$ 36,014
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634	\$ 42,496
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	\$ 48,430
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321	\$ 36,812
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322	\$ 39,465
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177	\$ 65,485
Total Fringe Benefits		Low \$ 2,013,217 High \$ 2,257,445

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Software and Data Conversion		\$ 790,000 \$ 1,045,000
Handheld Ticket Writing Devices and Printers		\$ 140,905 \$ 140,905
\$3,500 workstation x 60=\$210K/5 contract yrs		\$ 42,000 \$ 42,000
\$1,000 computers x 60=\$60K/5		\$ 12,000 \$ 12,000
\$2,500 tough book laptops x5=\$12.5K/5		\$ 2,500 \$ 2,500
\$500 printers x 35=\$17.5K/5		\$ 3,500 \$ 3,500
MTA overhead		5,034,661 5,909,014
Tickets/Envelopes \$0.025 x \$1.32 M x 1.1 (10% spoilage)		\$ 36,300 \$ 36,300
Total Capital & Operating		\$ 6,061,866 \$ 7,191,219

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 12,005,975	\$ 14,167,623
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 6,305,116	\$ 6,323,538
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 5,700,859	\$ 7,844,085
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	55%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1998 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. For the SFMTA to provide this service utilizing city staff it will require the utilization of a broad range of IT classes. These classes would have distinct roles that will need to be provided. The rapid advancement of technology and cost saving opportunities that are associated with those advancements necessitates a dedicated technology team to this effort.
6. The shown 1823 and 1052 Analysts will be needed to map the business requirements to process design and software requirements for the development team. This is an iterative process that continues for the life of the system.
7. The shown 109x System administrators and 104x System Engineers would be required to perform the maintenance and oversee operation the citations system. The number of staff is representative for the critical business function this system provides to the SFMTA.
8. The shown 106x Programmer analysts would be need to implement a software solution to meet the needs of the SFMTA citation unit. The number of developers is potentially understated for the initial ramp up of getting a base application in place for this business need. The 1070 Is Project Director would manage and direct this team.
9. The shown Citations Processing would be need to perform operational tasks of citations issuance, mailing, late notices (various:late fees, tow), payment receipts, payment processing, payment application, research, responding to inquiries, manual input and tracking of manual citations, and account audit.

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS							
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
IS Business Analyst	1052	2.0	\$ 3,630	\$ 4,358	\$ 189,497	\$ 227,488	
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	\$ 3,819	\$ 4,585	\$ 99,684	\$ 119,669	
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093	2.0	\$ 3,349	\$ 4,021	\$ 174,844	\$ 209,896	
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094	1.0	\$ 4,071	\$ 4,887	\$ 106,250	\$ 127,551	
IS Engineer-Senior	1043	1.0	\$ 4,986	\$ 5,986	\$ 130,143	\$ 156,235	
IS Engineer-Principal	1044	1.0	\$ 5,365	\$ 6,440	\$ 140,014	\$ 168,084	
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	2.0	\$ 3,135	\$ 3,763	\$ 163,625	\$ 196,429	
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063	3.0	\$ 3,812	\$ 4,576	\$ 298,465	\$ 358,301	
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064	1.0	\$ 4,437	\$ 5,326	\$ 115,794	\$ 139,009	
IS Project Director	1070	1.0	\$ 5,365	\$ 6,440	\$ 140,014	\$ 168,084	
Clerk	1404	1.0	\$ 2,026	\$ 2,432	\$ 52,875	\$ 63,475	
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,775	\$ 3,331	\$ 72,420	\$ 86,939	
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	\$ 2,174	\$ 2,610	\$ 170,234	\$ 204,363	
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	\$ 2,844	\$ 3,414	\$ 74,225	\$ 89,105	
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,457	\$ 4,150	\$ 90,226	\$ 108,315	
Cashier II	4321	27.0	\$ 2,257	\$ 2,709	\$ 1,590,224	\$ 1,909,032	
Cashier III	4322	3.0	\$ 2,531	\$ 3,038	\$ 198,150	\$ 237,875	
Manager III, MTA	9177	1.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 124,208	\$ 149,109	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE			53.0				
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 3,930,892	\$ 4,718,958
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS			
Job Class		\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1052	\$ 52,113	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823	\$ 53,970	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1093	\$ 49,357	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1094	\$ 56,440	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043	\$ 63,993	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044	\$ 66,914	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062	\$ 47,247	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1063	\$ 53,896	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1064	\$ 59,359	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1070	\$ 66,914	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404	\$ 37,786	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408	\$ 43,003	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630	\$ 37,100	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634	\$ 43,683	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	\$ 49,710	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321	\$ 37,910	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322	\$ 40,604	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177	\$ 67,602	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		\$ 2,069,643	\$ 2,325,183

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS			
Software and Data Conversion		\$ 814,490	\$ 1,077,395
Handheld Ticket Writing Devices and Printers		\$ 145,273	\$ 145,273
\$3,500 workstation x 60=\$210K/5 contract yrs		\$ 43,302	\$ 43,302
\$1,000 computers x 60=\$60K/5		\$ 12,372	\$ 12,372
\$2,500 tough book laptops x5=\$12.5K/5		\$ 2,578	\$ 2,578
\$500 printers x 35=\$17.5K/5		\$ 3,609	\$ 3,609
MTA overhead		\$ 5,082,453	\$ 5,966,388
Tickets/Envelopes	\$0.025 x \$1.32 M x 1.1 (10% spoilage)	\$ 37,425	\$ 37,425
Total Capital & Operating		\$ 6,141,501	\$ 7,288,341

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 12,142,036	\$ 14,332,483
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 6,430,061	\$ 6,448,652
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 5,711,975	\$ 7,883,831
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	55%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1998 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. For the SFMTA to provide this service utilizing city staff it will require the utilization of a broad range of IT classes. These classes would have distinct roles that will need to be provided. The rapid advancement of technology and cost saving opportunities that are associated with those advancements necessitates a dedicated technology team to this effort.
6. The shown 1823 and 1052 Analysts will be needed to map the business requirements to process design and software requirements for the development team. This is an iterative process that continues for the life of the system.
7. The shown 109x System administrators and 104x System Engineers would be required to perform the maintenance and oversee operation the citations system. The number of staff is representative for the critical business function this system provides to the SFMTA.
8. The shown 106x Programmer analysts would be need to implement a software solution to meet the needs of the SFMTA citation unit. The number of developers is potentially understated for the initial ramp up of getting a base application in place for this business need. The 1070 Is Project Director would manage and direct this team.
9. The shown Citations Processing would be need to perform operational tasks of citations issuance, mailing, late notices (various:late fees, tow), payment receipts, payment processing, payment application, research, responding to inquiries, manual input and tracking of manual citations, and account audit.
10. Inflation assumed at 3.1% for all items purchased outside of contract.