

From: [Carroll, John \(BOS\)](#)
To: [Erick Arguello; easton@zfplaw.com; chowder262@gmail.com](#)
Cc: [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\); Herrera, Ana \(BOS\); LaValley, Pilar \(CPC\); Melgar, Myrna \(BOS\); Low, Jen \(BOS\); Preston, Dean \(BOS\); Smeallie, Kyle \(BOS\); Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\); Angulo, Sunny \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: RE: Carnaval Mural File Number 231034 - LUT Meeting December 11, 2023
Date: Monday, December 11, 2023 10:14:00 AM
Attachments: [Carnaval Mural12082023_0001.pdf](#)
[image001.png](#)

Thank you for your comment letter.

I am forwarding your comments to the members of the LUT committee, and I will include your comments in the file for this ordinance matter.

I invite you to review the entire matter on our [Legislative Research Center](#) by following the link below:

- [Board of Supervisors File No. 231034](#)

John Carroll

Assistant Clerk

Board of Supervisors
San Francisco City Hall, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102
(415)554-4445



Click [here](#) to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The [Legislative Research Center](#) provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation and archived matters since August 1998.

***Disclosures:** Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.*

From: Erick Arguello <erick@calle24sf.org>
Sent: Friday, December 8, 2023 4:44 PM
To: easton@zfplaw.com; chowder262@gmail.com
Cc: Board of Supervisors (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>; Carroll, John (BOS) <john.carroll@sfgov.org>; Herrera, Ana (BOS) <ana.herrera@sfgov.org>; LaValley, Pilar (CPC) <pilar.lavalley@sfgov.org>
Subject: Carnaval Mural File Number 231034

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Please find attached letter for Carnaval Mural File Number 231034.

Let us know if there are any questions or concern. Will be happy to discuss. Looking forward to working with everyone.

In solidarity,

Erick

Erick Arguello
Founder, Council President
Calle 24 Latino Cultural District
3250 24th St.
San Francisco, Ca 94110
www.calle24sf.org



December 14, 2023

Easton S. Thodos
On behalf of Chris Chaudoir and Chaudoir Family
Zacks & Freedman, PC
601 Montgomery Street, Suite 400
San Francisco, CA 94111

Re: Carnaval Mural
File No. 231034
1311-1315 South Van Ness Ave
Assessor Parcel Block No. 6519
Lot. 039

To whom it may concern:

This letter is to confirm that Calle 24 Latino Cultural District will in 20 years from the date of historic designation will assess the status and condition of the Carnaval Mural.

If the condition of the mural is faded and requires restoration it will work with the original artist or other artist, notify owners, and begin the process of securing funds to restore the mural if needed at that time. If it's not needed at that time, we will re-evaluate every 5 years and continue the process for the life of the mural. We appreciate the past support of the property owners and look forward to working with them in the future.

The preservation and condition of the historic mural is of special interest to San Francisco, the Mission District's History, that of Calle 24 Latino Cultural District and the Latino community.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Erick Arguello", is written over the typed name.

Erick Arguello
President and Founder
Calle 24 Latino Cultural District
www.calle24sf.org

From: [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)
To: [BOS-Supervisors](#); [BOS-Legislative Aides](#)
Cc: [Calvillo, Angela \(BOS\)](#); [Mchugh, Eileen \(BOS\)](#); [Ng, Wilson \(BOS\)](#); [Somera, Alisa \(BOS\)](#); [De Asis, Edward \(BOS\)](#); [Carroll, John \(BOS\)](#); [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: FW: File No. 231034 - 1311-1315 South Van Ness Carnival Mural Objection to Characterization as Landmark
Date: Friday, December 8, 2023 9:43:00 AM

Dear Supervisors,

Please see below regarding:

File No. 231034 - Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Carnival Mural, located at 1311-1315 South Van Ness Avenue, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 6519, Lot No. 039, as a Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Regards,

Richard Lagunte
Office of the Clerk of the Board
San Francisco Board of Supervisors
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102
Voice (415) 554-5184 | Fax (415) 554-5163
richard.lagunte@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org

Pronouns: he, him, his

***Disclosures:** Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors' website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.*

From: Chris Chaudoir <chowder262@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, December 8, 2023 9:29 AM
To: Board of Supervisors (BOS) <board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org>
Subject: File No. 231034 - 1311-1315 South Van Ness Carnival Mural Objection to Characterization as Landmark

VIA EMAIL

Ms. Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board
City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlet Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102
(bos@sfgov.org)

Ms. Calvillio:

As the owners of the above referenced property, please accept this email as our objection to the designation of the Carnaval Mural as a Landmark and request that the Land Use and Transportation Committee of the Board of Supervisors of the City of San Francisco vote against the designation for the reasons set forth below.

This email will supplement that certain email dated November 7, 2023, sent to Ms. Ana Herrera by our counsel Easton Thodos of Zacks & Freedman, PC 601 Montgomery Street, Suite 400, San Francisco, CA 94111 (415) 956-8100 easton@zfplaw.com, copied below and incorporated in this objection by reference.

As discussed in Mr. Thodos' email, we have no issue with the mural on the side of the building. Indeed, we have worked with local community associations to preserve and update the mural in the past. We do, however, have an issue with the burdens placed on owners of property when they are designated Landmarks under the San Francisco ordinance without proper support of funding. In particular, the ordinance provides no support, no funding, and no assistance in covering any costs associated with its upkeep. We also note that, when we attempted to reach out to the city to obtain assurance that the city would assist in the maintenance and upkeep, that support was limited to a promise to "connect us" with various community groups that "may" provide assistance in the future. This is woefully insufficient, creates additional concern that the city will do nothing once the landmark designation is applied and will simply establish a burden on us as property owners.

We are also concerned that the Planning Department did not properly determine the applicability of the CEQA (specifically referencing Class 8 exceptions without analyzing whether maintenance, upkeep and new painting will have specific negative environmental impact), failed to properly notify the property owner of its initial actions and failed to provide sufficient notice to allow us to raise our concerns in the Planning Department. All of these are expressly preserved.

Respectfully, we request that the application to designate the mural a landmark be

refused and that the Board of Supervisors vote against such designation.

Chris Chaudoir on behalf of the Chaudoirs
310-962-2364

From: Easton Thodos <easton@zfplaw.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 7, 2023 12:54 PM
To: Herrera, Ana (BOS) <ana.herrera@sfgov.org>
Cc: Laura Dang <ldang@zfplaw.com>; Mark Chernev <mark@zfplaw.com>
Subject: Follow-up on Carnaval Mural Historic Landmark Discussion

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Ana Herrera,

Cc'd to this email is Mark Chernev and Laura Dang with Zacks & Freedman, PC.

I hope this email finds you well! Thank you so much for taking the time to discuss the implications of the Carnaval Mural's potential designation as a *historical landmark* by the city. As discussed, we are working with the owner to remedy the financial hardship imposed upon her once the designation process is finalized.

As previously discussed, the owner deeply values the mural yet is concerned about the financial obligation associated with its *preservation*, which includes any *deliberate or inadvertent neglect* as outlined in SF Planning Code Article 10 Section 1008.

We appreciate your understanding and willingness to assist in finding a solution that alleviates the owner's responsibilities. This could involve an agreement with a commission for future maintenance or a contract with the city to transfer these duties.

At the end of the day, we are open to collaborating with your office and the city attorney to reach an amicable resolution. We appreciate your time and commitment to resolving this matter. I will follow up with a phone call.

Sincerely,

Easton S. Thodos
Zacks & Freedman, PC
601 Montgomery Street, Suite 400
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: [\(415\) 956-8100](tel:(415)956-8100)
Facsimile: [\(415\) 288-9755](tel:(415)288-9755)
www.zfplaw.com