

**From:** [Carroll, John \(BOS\)](#)  
**To:** [BOS-Supervisors](#)  
**Cc:** [Board of Supervisors \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation \(BOS\)](#)  
**Subject:** FW: Follow-Up Email: CBD/BIDs and Public Realm Trash - File No. 201153 - BOS Agenda No. 35 - December 1, 2020  
**Date:** Tuesday, December 1, 2020 10:54:00 AM

---

Forward FYI.

---

**From:** Corgas, Christopher (ECN) <[christopher.corgas@sfgov.org](mailto:christopher.corgas@sfgov.org)>  
**Sent:** Monday, November 30, 2020 5:15 PM  
**To:** Mar, Gordon (BOS) <[gordon.mar@sfgov.org](mailto:gordon.mar@sfgov.org)>; Peskin, Aaron (BOS) <[aaron.peskin@sfgov.org](mailto:aaron.peskin@sfgov.org)>; Haney, Matt (BOS) <[matt.haney@sfgov.org](mailto:matt.haney@sfgov.org)>  
**Cc:** Wright, Edward (BOS) <[edward.w.wright@sfgov.org](mailto:edward.w.wright@sfgov.org)>; Mahogany, Honey (BOS) <[honey.mahogany@sfgov.org](mailto:honey.mahogany@sfgov.org)>; Hepner, Lee (BOS) <[lee.hepner@sfgov.org](mailto:lee.hepner@sfgov.org)>; Pagan, Lisa (ECN) <[lisa.pagan@sfgov.org](mailto:lisa.pagan@sfgov.org)>; Carroll, John (BOS) <[john.carroll@sfgov.org](mailto:john.carroll@sfgov.org)>  
**Subject:** Follow-Up Email: CBD/BIDs and Public Realm Trash

Good afternoon Chair Mar, Vice Chair Peskin, and Supervisor Haney,

During Yerba Buena Community Benefit District's FY 18-19 Annual Report hearing before the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on 11/19/2020 questions were raised regarding how Recology and Public Works work with the Community Benefit/Business Improvement Districts in respect to the collection and removal of public realm trash.

This has been a longstanding concern for the CBD/BIDs and has raised its head over the years. Usually it relates to the formation of new CBDs and the respective district receiving a bill from Recology for trash that they collect from the public realm and place in dumpsters for pick up.

I would like to thank Larry Stringer, formerly of Public Works, and Minna Tao, from Recology, for working with me in the past on addressing these concerns. Through their partnership we were able to address many of these issues as they developed, but the expansion of CBD/BIDs in recent years has made it clear that piecemeal solutions no longer work.

Since Director Degrafinried has taken charge of Public Works he has been incredibly attentive and understanding in addressing CBD/BID concerns and working to address them. In summer 2020 Director Degrafinried attended a San Francisco PBID Consortium meeting and listened to some of these, including the charging of CBD/BIDS for the removal of public realm trash they had collected. From my understanding, he immediately reached out to Recology to begin working on solutions.

In late September 2020, Recology staff reached out to OEWD to provide a preliminary presentation on how to address this issue. The proposed solution was a credit system in which Recology would send a bill to each CBD/BID, but credit them an amount per block with the objective that each CBD/BID would pay \$0. Upon inquiry, Recology informed OEWD that the billing was needed as part of their accounting process and to demonstrate the value of the service the districts were receiving. Additionally, the presentation indicated certain types of trash that CBD/BIDs would be prohibited from picking up, such as abandoned waste, illegal dumping, and bulky items left in the public realm.

Following the 11/19/2020 GAO Committee meeting I immediately reached out to Director Degrafinried and Recology representatives to inform them what had taken place and to work with them on developing a path forward before the 12/1/2020 Board of Supervisors meeting.

On 11/25/2020 a meeting was held between representatives from Recology, Director Degrafinried, most of the CBD/BIDs (East Cut and Castro were missing), and myself. Director Degrafinried led the conversation by listening and learning from the CBD/BIDs.

Specifically, the CBD/BIDs were concerned about the following issues:

1. Being charged for the collection and removal of public realm trash
2. Lack of historic partnership between Public Works, Recology, and the CBD/BIDs
3. CBD/BID disagreements between being given Recology “credit” and a bill vs. just providing service
4. Recology specifying which items that CBD/BIDs could remove from the public realm, the reasoning behind it, and impact it will have on CBD/BID constituents

There was broad commitment and agreement from both Recology and Public Works on addressing these issues in partnership with the CBD/BIDs. Specifically, positive movement was made to address CBD/BID concerns regarding charges for public realm trash and to increase communication and partnership between all entities.

OEWD will continue to work with all parties to ensure that equitable and acceptable solutions to these issues are adopted.

Regards,

**Chris Corgas, MPA**

Senior Program Manager

Office of Economic and Workforce Development

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 448

San Francisco, CA 94102

O: 415-554-6661

[christopher.corgas@sfgov.org](mailto:christopher.corgas@sfgov.org)