

# **MTC Local Parking Management Program: Implementation/Capital Grant Stage 2 Application**

**Jurisdiction/Agency Name:** Port of San Francisco (“Port”)

**Project Title:** Port of San Francisco – San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Parking Management Pilot *(Note that original title submitted in the 2022 LOI was “Port-SFMTA Parking Cooperative Parking Management Pilot”)*

**Project Manager:** Jennifer Gee, Port of SF Real Estate and Development  
jennifer.a.gee@sfport.com

**Project Partner(s), if any:** San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (“SFMTA”)

## **A. Project Description**

### ***1. MOU Between the Port and the SFMTA***

This project is supported by a Memorandum of Understanding (“MOU”) establishing a partnership between the Port, which owns and operates select pay parking lots along the San Francisco Waterfront and the SFMTA, which will manage revenue-collection and enforcement of the parking on these lots through its “smart” multi-space metering program. Prior to this MOU, these parking lots were managed by separate, independent private parking management operators instead of by SFMTA’s staff and equipment.

### ***2. Why the MOU is Needed***

The Port’s parking facilities serve a very diverse customer base, including visitors to such waterfront attractions as the Exploratorium and Alcatraz, local business patrons who are dining, shopping or using services, attendees of special events hosted on such Port properties as at Oracle Park or the James R. Herman Cruise Terminal, tenants of fishing and recreational boat-slips, employees who work on Port property, and local business owners who manage trucks and shuttles.

In response to the greater need for fiscal performance and accountability tailored to the greater needs for reliable management and revenue-collection from its parking resources, especially in light of the shifting demands of the Post-COVID economy, the Port desires to align its parking operations on at least two dozen of its lots to better meet the needs of its diverse customer base and to make safer and more efficient use of the transportation options serving the waterfront. Accordingly, the Port undertook the drafting of a Request for Proposal (“RFP”) in April 2022 to engage with one or more parking facility operator(s) in response to multiple Strategic Plan-based objectives, including:

- Improving the overall financial performance of the parking facilities through efficient revenue management and demand-based pricing;
- Enhancing the overall customer and visitor parking experience through appropriate staffing and improved technology, signage and infrastructure that include pay stations and/or meters that comply with the SFMTA’s PARCS program and revenue-capture tracking programs;
- Collecting and sharing information with the SFMTA to better understand the needs, trip purposes, trip origins and other information that can help the Port enhance its customer services and meet its policy goals; and

- Exploring opportunities to expand parking capacity consistent with the Port’s overall transportation objectives.

In consultations with the SFMTA, which has recently expanded its own agreements with peer agencies and with private and third-party parking operators, the Port learned about SFMTA’s state-of-art Parking Access Revenue Control System (PARCS) “smart” meter technology and experience, including its capacity to share real-time information with customers and to responsive adjust pricing to meet shifting demand. In consultation with SFMTA and with staff at peer agencies (such as San Francisco’s Recreation and Parks Department, which contracts almost exclusively with SFMTA for parking management of its expensive parking lots and garages), the Port reviewed the depth and breadth of SFMTA’s staffing and experience managing public agencies’ parking through “smart” metering and considered how SFMTA might be ideally-suited to expand its current, successful meter management at one Port lot (Pier 52 Boat Launch) to additional Port-owned lots.

The Port’s conversations with SFMTA soon expanded beyond guidance for the Port’s draft Parking Management and Operations RFP for its 24-26 lots to a newly-expanded partnership between the Port and SFMTA wherein SFMTA would assume the metering and management responsibilities of 670 additional Port parking spaces on six Port lots that were reviewed and conferred upon by SFMTA staff, and shown in the Table under **B-1** below. The anticipated gains in efficiency, accountability and revenue-production through this partnership with SFMTA became obvious over the status quo of the differing and sometimes disincentivizing revenue-sharing strategies with multiple contracting operators. In July 2022, the Port and SFMTA began discussion to enter into a new set of agreements via a renewed and expanded Parking MOU between the two agencies for nine lots, including the six that would receive the new SFMTA meters. The clarification of this new strategy for better managing the Port’s parking lots thus created two projects on separate but parallel tracks: the RFP that would cover the Port’s parking lots that would not be under current consideration for metering management by SFMTA, and the MOU for the balance of these 24-26 Port lots that would.

### ***3. How SFMTA’s “Smart” Meters on Port Lots Will Help Reduce GHGs***

Through the renewed/expanded Parking MOU, the Port benefits from the installation on select lots of 670 SFMTA state-of-art PARCS metering, featuring Mackay’s Tango solar-powered multi-space meter stations. The Port retains the meter revenues and fares from this arrangement, and in return, the Port supports the SFMTA labor needed to oversee the meters, including the more rigorous enforcement needed to curtail the current problem of parking scofflaws. These meters provide real-time information about availability and usage.

This helps reduce the GHGs in the following ways:

- a) Reduces local congestion caused by drivers by searching for parking without the benefit of real-time meter occupancy information,
- b) Reduces delays to transit caused by local congestion, improving transit reliability and increasing transit patronage,
- c) Incentivizes the use of alternative zero-emission transportation (public transit and bicycles) with adjustable meter pricing designed by SFMTA to manage demand and promote these alternatives
- d) The enhanced revenues to the Port via improved parking turnover and enforcement support its capital campaign to achieve its 2019-2023 Strategic Plan Sustainability Goal (“Advance Environmental Stewardship to Limit Climate Change”), which includes converting natural gas power to electricity, expanding electric vehicle charging stations throughout Port facilities,

converting its vehicle fleet to be emission free, and piloting a hydrogen fueling station for ferry and vehicle use.

- e) The enhanced revenues to SFMTA through the MOU help the SFMTA achieve the 2021-2024 Strategic Plan Goal 6 (“Eliminate Pollution and Greenhouse Gas Emissions by Increasing Use of Transit, Walking and Bicycling”), for which the agency’s use smart parking meters is an explicit goal per its 2023 Climate Roadmap

#### **4. How This Grant Helps: Removing a Financial Barrier**

While the maintenance of the new meters would be supported through parking revenues, the Port would be required to pay for the installation cost of \$8313 per meter station. The \$200,000 in grant funds would mitigate this impact on the Port by funding up to 24 multi-space meters that can manage the 670 parking spaces on the six lots from Fisherman’s Wharf to the vicinity of Pier 70/India Basin.

## **B. Project Scale and Anticipated Effectiveness**

### **1. Project Scale**

\$200,000 will fund the acquisition and installation of up to 24 multi-space meters (see highlighted section in table below). Each lot would have between 2 and 8 meter stations (assuming 25-30 meters per station. For a model and reference, the Port’s Pier 52 Boat Launch lot has 56 spaces which are already controlled by two SFMTA “smart” meter stations and managed with successful efficiency by the SFMTA.

<b>Lots to be managed by SFMTA per MOU</b>	<b># spaces</b>	<b># stations</b>	<b>Management</b>	<b>Status</b>
<b>SWL 314</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>new meters</b>	<b>proposed</b>
<b>SWL 323-324</b>	<b>227</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>new meters</b>	<b>proposed</b>
<b>SWL 330</b>	<b>140</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>new meters</b>	<b>proposed</b>
<b>SWL 328 (the Gap)</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>new meters</b>	<b>proposed</b>
<b>501-601 Cesar Chavez</b>	<b>90</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>new meters</b>	<b>proposed</b>
<b>Parcel K South</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>new meters</b>	<b>proposed</b>
Pier 52 Boat Launch	56	2	Exist’g meters	already installed
Crane Cove Park	-	-	operator	proposed
Pier 70 Illinois & 20th	-	-	operator	proposed
<b>Total # Meters to be installed per MOU</b>	<b>667</b>	<b>23</b>		

## **2. Project Effectiveness**

### **GHG reductions through elimination of local congestion:**

The reduced local Vehicle-Miles Traveled (VMT) based on the implementation of “smart” PARCS meters by SFMTA (Source: “SFMTA - SFPark Pilot Evaluation,” 2014). In 2014, SFMTA conducted a pilot-project evaluation of how its new SFPark meters – with their real-time availability information - reduced VMT in the immediate vicinity of where these on- and off-street parking meters were installed. The evaluation included 18,250 meters, and showed that VMT was reduced by 24%, representing a 43% reduction in time drivers spent searching for parking and an 8% reduction in local traffic congestion. SFMTA calculated that this translated to a VMT-based reduction in GHG from 7 metric tons a day to 4.9, or a total reduction of 2.1 metric tons a day of GHG, or 766 metric tons/year.

Transferring this quantitative benefit to the Waterfront area, which experiences weekend congestion equal to the rate of weekday, we estimate that including the 670 spaces of the Port’s surface lots in the SFMTA’s SFPark metering program could represent **a total reduction of 30.1 metric tons of GHG/year.**

### **GHG reductions through improved reliability of local transit post-congestion elimination:**

Muni estimates a ridership gain of up to 10% where Muni improved travel times of congestion impacted-routes (source: “Double Down for Double-Digit Transit Growth,” SFMTA’s *Muni Forward Report to the Board*, 2019). In this Waterfront area, the Muni lines that could benefit from this congestion relief include approximately 5% of respective segments of F-Market (19,000), 8-Bayshore (22,000), 15-Bayview HP Express (5,000) T-Third (8,000) representing 5% of total combined daily ridership of 54,000 = 2700. Translated to VMT, an increase in ridership of 10% would represent 270 riders per day, or 100 vehicles/day. Using the “Community Greenhouse Gas Emissions Technical Report” prepared by PVPC in 2021, this portion of VMT represents 40,000 kg/year of CO<sub>2</sub>, 200 kg/yr of CO and 40 kg/yr of NO<sub>x</sub>, **or a total reduction of 40.24 metric tons of GHG/year.**

### **GHG reductions through increased revenues to Port (minus annual support to SFMTA):**

The Port’s 10-year Capital Plan (2020-2029) identifies an ongoing need to renew facilities at Pier 27 (the Cruise Terminal) and Pier 70 of about \$10.8 million. At both of these sites are power-source infrastructure designed service large vessels that were converted from GHG-producing fuels to electricity in 2010, and represent a **GHG-reduction of over 21 tons annually of GHG** (NO<sub>x</sub>, Sox, CO<sub>2</sub>x and particulate matter (Source: “Shoreside Power Project, Port of San Francisco” 2010). While we do not tie the expected increase in revenues from our parking enforcement partnership with SFMTA to any specific project, they certainly represent better allocation potential to maintaining our zero-emission shoreside power source compared to the status-quo, unmetered parking management strategy.

### **GHG reductions through increased revenues to SFMTA:**

As described above, the expansion of the “smart” meters to the Port’s parking lots in this congested, transit-rich and bicycle-friendly part of San Francisco is expected to shift current trips made by from driving and parking to trips made by transit, walking and bicycling.

The SFMTA’s “Climate Roadmap” described in **A-2-e** above identify implementation the actions that will help realize the goals and the vision established by San Francisco’s Climate Action Plan. Four such actions identified by the SFMTA include:

#### **1-Build a fast and reliable transit system that will be everyone’s preferred way to get around.**

*As noted above, the smart meters will help “unblock” congested streets near parking lots and improve Muni operation. GHG reductions for that benefit are calculated above.*

**2-Create a complete and connected active transportation network that shifts trips from automobiles to walking, biking and other active transportation modes.**

*The meters will be operated by SFMTA and pricing will be set to encourage this shift, which is a SFMTA priority.*

**3-Expand programs to communities that shift trips to transit, walking and bicycling.**

*The Port's partnership with SFMTA includes the 670 currently unmetered spaces on its lots, representing a true expansion of the "smart" parking program that helps shift transportation modes.*

**4-Manage parking resources more efficiently over time to charge the right price for every space.**

SFMTA anticipates that conversion of its 27,000 pay meters to "smart" meter technology with right-size pricing capacity will reduce GHG emissions by 69,000 metric tons/year (*source: SFMTA's "Climate Roadmap for a Healthier San Francisco," 2023*). The 670 meters represented in this expansion represent 2% of the total meters SFMTA controls, ***thus potentially representing an additional reduction of 1,380 metric tons of GHG/year.***

**C. Scope of Work**

Upon Finalization of Port-SFMTA MOU, these are the tasks necessary to installing and operating the 24 MacKay Tango multi-space meters on 6 selected Port parking lots totaling 670 spaces:

**TASK 1 : Finalization of MOU agreements between the Port and SFMTA for the "smart" metering of up to six (6) Port-owned parking lots**

Task includes finalizing the MOU wherein the Port will renew and expand its existing partnership with the SFMTA to include the site-specific parking meter installation and management strategy for six parking lots (see Table under B-1). Provisions of this MOU will include agreements between both agencies for how to incorporate meter performance monitoring in terms of occupancy, enforcement and revenue collection efficiency over the benchmark of the "status quo" operations (based on years 2022 and/or 2023, and how this information is included in reporting each agency's efforts to accomplish its respective Climate Action plans, specifically per GHG emissions reductions. Note: this task will be developed in conjunction with the Port's drafting and publishing a Request for Proposal (RFP) to contract with one or more private operator(s) to manage parking on other Port-owned parking lots that both the Port and SFMTA determined are not yet conducive to "management by meter" by SFMTA, although in the future this consideration could be revisited.

**Task 1 Deliverables:**

- This task is a necessary precursor to Tasks 2 and 3 below in that the respective staff and Boards of both the Port and SFMTA formally recognize and concur through the signing of the MOU on or before December 2023 that the subject lots are to be monitored and managed by SFMTA's state-of-art "smart" multi-space meter technology and staff.

**Task 1 Estimated Completion:** The MOU draft is currently under development by Port and SFMTA staff, with the target of definitively establishing the projected metering and staffing needs ***by September 2023 (five months)*** as the parallel efforts of concurrently drafting the RFP and defining the management strategies for the approximately twenty other Port parking lots *not* included as part of this MOU and thus subject to management by private contractors. ***The ultimate milestone for this Task will be the MOU progressing through the respective staff and Board reviews of the Port and SFMTA by end of year***

**December 2023 (three months after the draft MOU reaches review-ready status in September).** The end of this agency processing period is marked by the signing of the MOU by both agencies.

**TASK 2: Purchase of 24 MacKay Tango multi-space meters and foundation/signage infrastructure**

Task includes purchase of foundation materials, signs, decals, bollards and Tango machine per SFMTA specifications in preparation for installation of the 24 multi-space meter stations. This Task represents the first portion of the project that is proposed to be supported funded by the MTC grant, matched by the Port's locally-derived funds to support SFMTA expertise in the procurement process.

**Task 2 Deliverables:**

- This task results in the procurement and installation of 24 multi-space meters per SFMTA standards on the six lots owned by the Port.

**Task 2 Estimated Completion:** While SFMTA describes a current 6 – 12 month backlog (from today's date) in its ability to procure the meters and related infrastructure described in this grant application addendum current, the ongoing efforts between SFMTA and the Port in developing the MOU and the related certainty in establishing project readiness likely grant award will accordingly inform any revisions to prioritization and scheduling of the procurements.

**TASK 3: Site preparation and installation of 24 meters per MOU on six (6) Port properties containing 670 spaces**

Task includes preparation of site, construction of 2 – 8 individual foundations to accommodate meters, and installation of meters and supporting signage and decals.

**Task 3.1: Coordination between the Port, SFMTA and San Francisco Public Works for the construction of 24 foundations on Port parking lots subject to the MOU.** Task represents SFMTA-led coordination with Public Works and the Port for design, scheduling and site preparation for the construction of 24 multi-space meter stations on six Port lots per SFMTA standards. Task includes defining metrics for coordination between the sharing of meter utilization, pricing and revenue information reports with the respective "Climate Action" teams of the Port and SFMTA to include documenting measurable reductions in GHG emissions as a goal of the Port-SFMTA partnership per the MOU.

**Task 3.2: Completion of 24 multi-space meter stations on six Port lots, including signage and expansion of SFMTA-based online/mobile applications to reflect the addition of 670 spaces to the SFMTA PARCS metering program.** Completion of this Task represents the customer-ready utilization of the meters subject to SFMTA and Port standards per the MOU. Task includes the completion of public-facing metering information per the Port's customer-service standards as applicable to the site-specific functions of each subject lot.

**Task 3 Deliverables:**

- Twenty-four (24) MacKay Tango multi-space meter stations available to meet the diverse needs of Port customers on six (6) Port-owned parking lots, with availability, utilization and pricing information readily accessible to the diverse Port customer service needs as established in the MOU.
- Summary of GHG reduction benefits of the installation and operation of the 24 meters over the "status quo" (2022 and/or 2023) management strategy and performance of the parking and related traffic conditions of the subject parking lots, prepared for inclusion in each agency's standard Climate Action plan reporting protocols.

**Task 3 Estimated Completion:** While SFMTA describes a current 6 -12 month backlog (from today's date) in its ability with Public Works to construct the meters described in this grant application addendum current, the ongoing efforts between SFMTA and the Port in developing the MOU and the related certainty in establishing project readiness likely grant award will accordingly inform any revisions to prioritization and scheduling of the meter station constructions.

**TASK 4: Inclusion of the Port's six lots in the SFMTA's routine monitoring, maintenance and enforcement of parking compliance per SFMTA standards**

Includes up to three (3) SFMTA staff committed to meter/meter technology monitoring, price adjustment and customer messaging, signage maintenance, fare collection, and managing meter enforcement and violation abatement per SFMTA Parking Control Officer ("PCO") standard procedures. This portion of work will be "match" funded by Port's locally-derived sources (e.g., meter revenues and fees collected via SFMTA enforcement).

**Task 4.1: Define work program and meet hiring needs of staffing requirements of additional SFMTA PCOs per MOU.**

SFMTA and Port to collaborate on scoping responsibilities and hiring SFMTA staff to meet the monitoring and enforcement needs of the additional 670 parking spaces on the six Port lots per the MOU.

**Task 4.2: Define Port and SFMTA strategies to monitor the capture GHG-reduction benefits per the MOU** (this Task led by the Port's and SFMTA's Climate Action monitoring teams).

**Task 4 Deliverables:**

- Provision of up to three (3) SFMTA PCO staff allocated to manage monitoring, enforcement, revenue collection, abatement and online/mobile platform, public-facing information sharing. Inclusion of the GHG-reduction benefits of this meter expansion in the regular Port and SFMTA Climate Action reporting per the provisions of the MOU.

**Task 4 Estimated Completion:** 6 - 8 months after MOU completion. While SFMTA describes a current 6 – 9 month backlog in its ability to hire and train staff necessary to managing the meters described in this grant application addendum current, the ongoing efforts between SFMTA and the Port in developing the MOU and the related certainty in establishing project readiness likely grant award will inform the revisions to prioritization and scheduling of the staff procurement accordingly and can progress concurrently with meter procurement and installation.

**D. Budget**

<b>Total Project Cost</b>	<b>Grant Request</b>	<b>Match Amount</b>	<b>Match Source</b>
\$868,000 (initial year) \$668,000/year for ongoing meter operation (which will be more than covered by parking meter revenues)	\$200,000	The Port's annual contribution to SFMTA as the manager of the meters is estimated to be \$668,000 per year. This figure is 334% of the project's \$200K costs, and it is 100% locally-sourced as meter revenues will help the Port cover meter management, "gateway" and equipment maintenance, and the labor costs of meter installation and enforcement.	Port revenues from its Paid Parking program

**Itemized List of Anticipated Expenses (figures provided by SFMTA)**

Meter cost = \$6k per meter

Bollard = \$1,000

Foundation (by DPW) = ~\$6,000 (typically \$5,000-\$7,000)

Total purchase plus Installation cost = \$8,313 per meter

Task #	Expense	Quantity	Cost per Unit	Total Cost
Task 1	Purchase meters (MacKay “Tango” multi-space parking meters)	24	\$6,110 (includes Tango machine, posts, signs, decals, cement, dump fees, etc. - per SFMTA)	<b>\$146,640</b>
Task 2	Provide foundation and install meters (includes SFMTA and DPW labor)]	24	\$2,203 (includes Admin analyst, surveyor, machinist, PMR, sign workers - per SFMTA)	<b>\$52,872</b>
Task 3	Maintain 24 meters, set and adjust pricing and enforce parking compliance	3 SFMTA FTE	\$222,300 (annual costs includes meter maintenance & enforcement staff, admin overhead - <b>paid by Port</b> )	<i>\$668,000</i>
	<b>Total Costs: Year One</b>	-	Includes purchase & installation of 24 meters plus SFMTA staffing	\$868,000
	<b>Total Costs: meter purchase and installation only</b>	24	See Tasks 1 & 2 above. This is project portion <b>eligible for MTC grant</b>	<b>\$199,512</b>

**E. Support and Readiness**

As noted above, the finalization of the draft MOU now underway between the SFMTA and the Port is key to project readiness and as a submittal to further support the award of this grant will include any or all resolutions adopted by both the Port and the SFMTA.

NOTE: schedules included above are established to allow for earlier accomplishments of milestones. Port staff contacts Peter Albert ([peter.albert@sfport.com](mailto:peter.albert@sfport.com)) and Jennifer Gee ([jennifer.a.gee@sfport.com](mailto:jennifer.a.gee@sfport.com)) are available to assist with updates and refinements to the schedules as needed and upon request.

**F. Response to Project-Specific Requests for Information**

This information is provided per request for information by email from James Choe of MTC received March 10, 2023. (PDF of email is attached)

**G. Map and Additional Attachments with Supporting Information**

See attached PDF of maps and tables that illustrate Port-owned Parking Lots subject to future MOU and RFPO, and which Port lots subject to SFMTA MOU will be subject to meters and meter expansion: