



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Leo Levenson, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Towing Services – FY 2020-21 & FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2020-21 and 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Timothy Manglicmot, Budget Manager

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
1023_C IS Administrator III		1.0	\$ 3,942	\$ 4,792	\$ 102,896	\$ 125,071
1222_C Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk		1.0	\$ 2,809	\$ 3,414	\$ 73,307	\$ 89,105
1657_C Accountant IV		1.0	\$ 4,202	\$ 5,107	\$ 109,660	\$ 133,293
1824_C Principal Administrative Analyst		1.0	\$ 4,368	\$ 5,309	\$ 113,998	\$ 138,565
1404_C Clerk		3.0	\$ 2,001	\$ 2,432	\$ 156,664	\$ 190,426
1630_C Account Clerk		3.0	\$ 2,147	\$ 2,610	\$ 168,130	\$ 204,363
1634_C Principal Account Clerk		1.0	\$ 2,809	\$ 3,414	\$ 73,307	\$ 89,105
1652_C Accountant II		1.0	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,646	\$ 78,289	\$ 95,161
1704_C Communications Dispatcher I		7.0	\$ 2,211	\$ 2,687	\$ 403,877	\$ 490,915
1705_C Communications Dispatcher II		1.0	\$ 2,452	\$ 2,980	\$ 63,988	\$ 77,778
1844_C Senior Management Assistant		1.0	\$ 3,414	\$ 4,150	\$ 89,111	\$ 108,315
4321_C Cashier II		7.0	\$ 2,229	\$ 2,709	\$ 407,184	\$ 494,934
4322_C Cashier III		3.0	\$ 2,499	\$ 3,038	\$ 195,701	\$ 237,875
1926_C Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor		2.0	\$ 2,254	\$ 2,740	\$ 117,669	\$ 143,028
1934_C Storekeeper		10.0	\$ 2,190	\$ 2,662	\$ 571,599	\$ 694,782
1936_C Senior Storekeeper		3.0	\$ 2,334	\$ 2,837	\$ 182,753	\$ 222,137
1942_C Assistant Materials Coordinator		1.0	\$ 3,682	\$ 4,476	\$ 96,111	\$ 116,824
1952_C Purchaser		2.0	\$ 3,180	\$ 3,865	\$ 165,983	\$ 201,753
8202_C Security Guard		6.0	\$ 1,919	\$ 2,333	\$ 300,573	\$ 365,348
4366_C Collection Supervisor		1.0	\$ 2,987	\$ 3,631	\$ 77,967	\$ 94,769
7355_C Truck Driver		50.0	\$ 3,031	\$ 3,684	\$ 3,955,241	\$ 4,807,620
7382_C Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor		1.0	\$ 3,635	\$ 4,418	\$ 94,866	\$ 115,310
7381_C Automotive Mechanic		5.0	\$ 3,019	\$ 3,670	\$ 394,021	\$ 478,935
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			27,081	32,917
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		112.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 7,992,893.33	\$ 9,715,411.80
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 27,080.86	\$ 32,916.95

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1023	54268
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222	42496
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1657	56162
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824	57763
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404	34579
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630	36014
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634	42496
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1652	45040
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1704	36635
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1705	38997
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	48430
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321	36812
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322	39465
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1926	37062
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1934	36433
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936	37844
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1942	51724
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1952	46804
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	35837
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4366	44246
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7355	46920
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7382	52920
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	46966
Total Fringe Benefits		
	Low	High
	\$ 4,295,857.77	\$ 4,820,285.44

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Postage+supplies+uniforms	\$ 68,361.89	\$ 68,362
Specialized Software	\$ 380,353.84	\$ 380,354
Vehicles - tow trucks (65 *\$75,000/7 years)	\$ 719,480.36	\$ 719,480
Fuel (15 miles/day/truck, assume 10mi/gal at \$3.58/gallon)	\$ 131,620.30	\$ 131,620
Communications (handheld devices 360; protective cases 81.23; tax 37.50 / 2 years)	\$ 16,073.90	\$ 16,074
Utilities	\$ 43,390.20	\$ 43,390
Dues and Subscriptions	\$ 52,961.87	\$ 52,962
Auction Fees	\$ 586,495.68	\$ 586,496
Lien Fees	\$ 165,156.50	\$ 165,156
Dolly and Flatbed Equipment Use Fees	\$ 1,474,937	\$ 1,474,937
Credit card fees	\$ 305,777	\$ 305,777
Overhead, at 90.0% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	\$ 11,059,876	\$ 13,082,128
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 15,004,485	\$ 17,026,736

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 27,320,317	\$ 31,595,350
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 14,262,892	\$ 14,302,927
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 13,057,424	\$ 17,292,423
% of Savings to City Cost	48%	55%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2005 would be the first year these services were contracted out.
 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where
 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

		PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS		Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High	
1023 C IS Administrator III	1023	1.0	\$ 3,942	\$ 4,792	\$ 102,896	\$ 125,071	
1222 C Senior Payroll And Personnel Cleri	1222	1.0	\$ 2,809	\$ 3,414	\$ 73,307	\$ 89,105	
1657 C Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,202	\$ 5,107	\$ 109,660	\$ 133,293	
1824 C Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	1.0	\$ 4,368	\$ 5,309	\$ 113,998	\$ 138,565	
1404 C Clerk	1404	3.0	\$ 2,001	\$ 2,432	\$ 156,664	\$ 190,426	
1630 C Account Clerk	1630	3.0	\$ 2,147	\$ 2,610	\$ 168,130	\$ 204,363	
1634 C Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	\$ 2,809	\$ 3,414	\$ 73,307	\$ 89,105	
1652 C Accountant II	1652	1.0	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,646	\$ 78,289	\$ 95,161	
1704 C Communications Dispatcher I	1704	7.0	\$ 2,211	\$ 2,687	\$ 403,877	\$ 490,915	
1705 C Communications Dispatcher II	1705	1.0	\$ 2,452	\$ 2,980	\$ 63,988	\$ 77,778	
1844 C Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,414	\$ 4,150	\$ 89,111	\$ 108,315	
4321 C Cashier II	4321	7.0	\$ 2,229	\$ 2,709	\$ 407,184	\$ 494,934	
4322 C Cashier III	4322	3.0	\$ 2,499	\$ 3,038	\$ 195,701	\$ 237,875	
1926 C Senior Materials And Supplies Sup	1926	2.0	\$ 2,254	\$ 2,740	\$ 117,669	\$ 143,028	
1934 C Storekeeper	1934	10.0	\$ 2,190	\$ 2,662	\$ 571,599	\$ 694,782	
1936 C Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	\$ 2,334	\$ 2,837	\$ 182,753	\$ 222,137	
1942 C Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942	1.0	\$ 3,682	\$ 4,476	\$ 96,111	\$ 116,824	
1952 C Purchaser	1952	2.0	\$ 3,180	\$ 3,865	\$ 165,983	\$ 201,753	
8202 C Security Guard	8202	6.0	\$ 1,919	\$ 2,333	\$ 300,573	\$ 365,348	
4366 C Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	\$ 2,987	\$ 3,631	\$ 77,967	\$ 94,769	
7355 C Truck Driver	7355	50.0	\$ 3,031	\$ 3,684	\$ 3,955,241	\$ 4,807,620	
7382 C Automotive Mechanic Assistant St	7382	1.0	\$ 3,635	\$ 4,418	\$ 94,866	\$ 115,310	
7381 C Automotive Mechanic	7381	5.0	\$ 3,019	\$ 3,670	\$ 394,021	\$ 478,935	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			27,081	32,917	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE		112.0					
Total Salary Costs-->					7,992,893	9,715,412	
Total of Other Compensation-->					27,081	32,917	

		FRINGE BENEFITS				
Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High			
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1023	55663				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222	43683				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1657	57596				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824	59222				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404	37786				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630	37100				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634	43683				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1652	46291				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1704	37730				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1705	40129				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	49710				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321	37910				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322	40604				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1926	38164				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1934	37525				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936	38958				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1942	53078				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1952	48082				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	36888				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4366	45460				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7355	48252				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7382	54371				
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	48323				
Total Fringe Benefits				4,416,392	4,964,984	

		ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	
Postage+supplies+uniforms		70,481	70,481
Specialized Software		392,145	392,145
Vehicles - tow trucks (65 *\$75,000/7 years)	\$	741,784.25	\$ 741,784
Fuel (15 miles/day/truck, assume 10mi/gal at \$3.58/gallon)	\$	135,700.53	\$ 135,701
Communications (handheld devices 360; protective cases 81.23; tax 37.50 / 2 years)	\$	16,572.19	\$ 16,572
Utilities	\$	44,735.30	\$ 44,735
Dues and Subscriptions	\$	54,603.69	\$ 54,604
Auction Fees	\$	604,677.04	\$ 604,677
Lien Fees	\$	170,276.35	\$ 170,276
Dolly and Flatbed Equipment Use Fees	\$	1,520,660	\$ 1,520,660
Credit card fees	\$	315,256	\$ 315,256
Overhead, at 90.0% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	\$	11,168,357	\$ 13,212,357
Total Capital & Operating	\$	15,235,248	\$ 17,279,248

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$	27,671,615	\$	31,992,561
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$	14,700,221	\$	14,740,575
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$	<u>12,971,394</u>	\$	<u>17,251,986</u>
% of Savings to City Cost		47%		54%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2005 would be the first year these services were contracted out.
 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where
 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>