



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Paratransit Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_

Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Diana Hammons, Senior Manager

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Paratransit (18731)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2024-25

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS					
Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High	
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 246,479	\$ 296,482	
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 184,143	\$ 223,741	
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 256,373	\$ 303,665	
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 267,860	\$ 377,061	
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 696,825	\$ 965,826	
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 250,951	\$ 297,250	
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 346,859	\$ 409,463	
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.00	\$ 563,464	\$ 668,099	
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,920	\$ 225,520	
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.00	\$ 2,201,601	\$ 2,591,919	
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.00	\$ 3,313,667	\$ 3,912,111	
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 122,929	\$ 145,517	
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 300,524	\$ 353,209	
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 125,357	\$ 148,243	
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.00	\$ 1,971,645	\$ 1,971,645	
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 387,062	\$ 387,062	
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.00	\$ 897,210	\$ 1,060,985	
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 770,216	\$ 908,186	
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 609,680	\$ 721,627	
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.00	\$ 2,294,889	\$ 2,721,494	
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 1,233,168	\$ 1,467,465	
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	299.00	\$ 22,521,684	\$ 29,618,911	
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 597,924	\$ 740,604	
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 184,436	\$ 219,652	
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 861,012	\$ 1,033,628	
Premium Pay - Platform			\$ 959,760	\$ 1,152,173	
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>438.00</b>	<b>\$ 42,354,658</b>	<b>\$ 52,921,558</b>	

ADDITIONAL CITY COST					
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates	
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	FY25: Unit Cost \$28,742, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$29,481, Replacement Years 4	\$ 1,437,100	\$ 1,437,100	
Van, Type A, lift equipped	49	FY25: Unit Cost \$57,484, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$58,961, Replacement Years 4	\$ 704,179	\$ 704,179	
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	FY25: Unit Cost \$61,590, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$63,173, Replacement Years 4	\$ 985,440	\$ 985,440	
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	FY25: Unit Cost \$46,192.50, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$47,380, Replacement Years 4	\$ 288,703	\$ 288,703	
2 way radios	338	FY25: Unit Cost \$51.33, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$52.64, Replacement Years 4	\$ 4,337	\$ 4,337	
Tablets	200	FY25: Unit Cost \$1,950.35, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$2,000.47, Replacement Years 4	\$ 97,518	\$ 97,518	
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.1 at \$5.20 per gallon)	0		\$ 2,001,235	\$ 2,001,235	
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)	0		\$ 898,993	\$ 898,993	
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system	0		\$ 271,821	\$ 271,821	
CabConnect	0		\$ 395,440	\$ 395,440	
Claims Est.	0	3.9% of Total Salary	\$ 1,429,918	\$ 1,429,918	
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 136,987	\$ 164,450	
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$660/person/year)	0		\$ 7,697	\$ 9,240	
Other Pay: 7382/7381/7410 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 11,087	\$ 13,310	
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 962	\$ 1,155	
2905_C Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility Worker	4		\$ 550,394	\$ 621,481	
2907_C Eligibility Worker Supervisor	1		\$ 152,525	\$ 172,225	
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 2,062	\$ 2,475	
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 9,376,398</b>	<b>\$ 9,499,020</b>	

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 51,731,056 \$ 62,420,578**

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY			
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 51,731,056	\$ 62,420,578
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 35,978,101	\$ 36,043,415
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 15,752,955	\$ 26,377,163
	% of Savings to City Cost	30.45%	42.26%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Paratransit (18731)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2025-26

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26	
			Personnel Cost Low	Personnel Cost High
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 255,837	\$ 307,410
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 190,730	\$ 231,570
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 265,999	\$ 314,773
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 277,833	\$ 390,462
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 724,224	\$ 1,001,663
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 260,404	\$ 308,156
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 360,115	\$ 424,686
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.00	\$ 584,394	\$ 692,310
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 195,655	\$ 233,402
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.00	\$ 2,287,262	\$ 2,689,848
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.00	\$ 3,440,573	\$ 4,057,801
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 127,575	\$ 150,872
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 312,326	\$ 366,662
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 130,102	\$ 153,705
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.00	\$ 2,044,465	\$ 2,044,465
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 401,054	\$ 401,054
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.00	\$ 931,215	\$ 1,100,127
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 799,922	\$ 942,219
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 632,760	\$ 748,218
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.00	\$ 2,380,499	\$ 2,820,476
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 1,278,183	\$ 1,519,831
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	299.00	\$ 22,899,990	\$ 29,968,879
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 619,991	\$ 768,299
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 191,128	\$ 227,448
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 883,140	\$ 1,060,192
Premium Pay - Platform			\$ 984,426	\$ 1,181,783
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>438.00</b>	<b>\$ 43,459,802</b>	<b>\$ 54,106,311</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26	
			Low Estimate	High Estimates
Sedan, 4 door midsize	0	FY25: Unit Cost \$28,742, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$29,481, Replacement Years 4	\$ 1,511,916	\$ 1,511,916
Van, Type A, lift equipped	0	FY25: Unit Cost \$57,484, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$58,961, Replacement Years 4	\$ 740,839	\$ 740,839
Van, Type B, lift equipped	0	FY25: Unit Cost \$61,590, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$63,173, Replacement Years 4	\$ 1,036,742	\$ 1,036,742
Minivans, ramp equipped	0	FY25: Unit Cost \$46,192.50, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$47,380, Replacement Years 4	\$ 303,733	\$ 303,733
2 way radios	0	FY25: Unit Cost \$51.33, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$52.64, Replacement Years 4	\$ 4,563	\$ 4,563
Tablets	0	FY25: Unit Cost \$1,950.35, Replacement Years 4 FY26: Unit Cost \$2,000.47, Replacement Years 4	\$ 102,594	\$ 102,594
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.1 at \$5.20 per gallon)	0		\$ 2,052,667	\$ 2,052,667
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)	0		\$ 922,097	\$ 922,097
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system	0		\$ 278,807	\$ 278,807
CabConnect	0		\$ 405,603	\$ 405,603
Claims Est.	0	3.9% of Total Salary	\$ 1,466,667	\$ 1,466,667
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 136,987	\$ 164,450
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$660/person/year)	0		\$ 7,697	\$ 9,240
Other Pay: 7382/7381/7410 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 11,087	\$ 13,310
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 962	\$ 1,155
2905_C Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility Worker	0		\$ 564,539	\$ 637,453
2907_C Eligibility Worker Supervisor	0		\$ 156,445	\$ 176,651
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 2,062	\$ 2,475
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 9,706,007</b>	<b>\$ 9,830,962</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 53,165,809 \$ 63,937,273**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 53,165,809	\$ 63,937,273
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 36,905,874	\$ 36,973,772
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 16,259,935	\$ 26,963,501
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>30.58%</b>	<b>42.17%</b>