

File No. 210666

Committee Item No. 10

Board Item No. 28

# COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

## AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget & Appropriations Committee

Date June 21, 2021

Board of Supervisors Meeting

Date July 20, 2021

### Cmte Board

- |                                     |                                     |  |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Motion                                       |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Resolution                                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Ordinance                                    |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Legislative Digest                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Budget and Legislative Analyst Report        |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Youth Commission Report                      |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Introduction Form                            |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | MOU  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Grant Information Form                       |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Grant Budget                                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Subcontract Budget                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Contract/Agreement                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Form 126 – Ethics Commission                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Award Letter                                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Application                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Public Correspondence                        |

### OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

- |                                     |                                     |  |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <u>Mayor's Office Budget Submission Memo</u> |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | _____  |

Completed by: Linda Wong

Date June 17, 2021

Completed by: Linda Wong

Date July 7, 2021

1 [Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services Previously Approved]

2

3 **Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services**  
4 **previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than**  
5 **similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services:**  
6 **budget and legislative analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services**  
7 **(excluding City Hall), citywide security services, fleet security, convention facilities**  
8 **management (General Services Agency - City Administrator); mainframe system**  
9 **support (General Services Agency - Technology); security services (Public Works);**  
10 **security services (Human Services Agency); security services (Department of**  
11 **Homelessness and Supportive Housing); security services (Mayor's Office of**  
12 **Housing and Community Development); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff's**  
13 **Department); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); security**  
14 **services (Public Utilities Commission); security, information and guest services,**  
15 **parking operations, shuttle bus services (Airport); and custodial and security**  
16 **services (Port).**

17

18 WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed  
19 Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with  
20 private companies for specific services that can be performed for a lower cost than similar  
21 work by City and County employees (Charter Section 10.104.15); and,

22 WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services  
23 listed below; and,

24

25

1 WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for  
 2 the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve substantial cost  
 3 savings for the City; and,

4 WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be  
 5 performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of  
 6 the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 210666,  
 7 which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now, therefore  
 8 be it;

9 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's  
 10 certification and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of  
 11 a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2021,  
 12 through June 30, 2022.

13

14 Fiscal Year 2021-2022

15

16	City Cost	Contract Cost	\$	
17	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
18 Board of Supervisors (BOS)				
19	Budget Analyst	2,856,057	2,459,757	396,300 12.5
20 General Services Agency–City Administrator (ADM)				
21	Fleet Security Services	455,667	242,900	212,767 3.6
22	Real Estate Division Custodial Services	3,825,299	2,189,238	1,636,061 28.2
23	Real Estate Division Security Services	5,433,534	2,706,741	2,726,793 42.5
24	Convention Facilities Management	38,101,901	30,376,911	7,724,990 227.7

25 General Services Agency–Technology (TIS)

1		City Cost	Contract Cost	\$	
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Mainframe System Support	1,692,131	1,150,766	541,365	6.0
4	General Services Agency--Public Works (DPW)				
5					
6	Security Services	259,088	178,776	80,312	2.2
7	Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HOM)				
8	Security Services	3,912,675	2,302,470	1,610,205	31.2
9	Human Services Agency (HSA)				
10	Security Services	9,295,785	4,259,024	5,036,761	73.7
11	Sheriff (SHF)				
12	Food Services for Jail Inmates	2,513,880	1,269,171	1,244,709	19.0
13	Elections (REG)				
14	Assembly of Vote by Mail Ballots	4,366,699	739,223	3,627,476	44.4
15	Airport (AIR)				
16	Information and Guest Services	9,494,000	6,003,351	3,490,650	68.2
17	Security Services	5,889,320	3,673,062	2,216,258	45.1
18	Parking Operations	26,833,851	23,006,818	3,827,033	178.75
19	Shuttle Bus	12,930,263	9,582,506	3,347,757	74.1
20	Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development (MOHCD)				
21	Security Services	2,084,050	997,737	1,086,313	15.7
22	Port (PRT)				
23	Security Services	3,447,736	1,651,626	1,796,110	24.0
24	Janitorial Services	2,118,449	1,810,577	307,872	18.0
25					

1 PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION (PUC)

2	Security Services	2,931,826	1,320,713	1,611,113	22.2
---	-------------------	-----------	-----------	-----------	------

---

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Honorable Board of Supervisors  
City Hall - Room 244  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

RE: Budget and Legislative Analyst Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-2022 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Junko Laxamana, Deputy Director of Finance & Administration

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
**FISCAL YEAR 2021-22**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	6,814	\$ 8,180	\$ 177,851	\$ 213,507	
Manager III	0931	1.0	5,483	\$ 6,582	\$ 143,094	\$ 171,781	
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	3.0	4,725	5,673	\$ 370,004	\$ 444,183	
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	4.0	4,082	4,900	\$ 426,123	\$ 511,552	
Performance Analyst III	1830	2.0	5,498	6,600	\$ 286,998	\$ 344,536	
Executive Secretary I	1450	1.0	2,965	3,560	\$ 77,388	\$ 92,903	
Temp	1823	0.5	4,900	4,900	\$ 50,000	\$ 50,000	
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
<b>Total FTE</b>			<b>12.5</b>				
					<b>Total Salary Costs--&gt;</b>	<b>\$ 1,531,459</b>	<b>\$ 1,828,462</b>
					<b>Total of Other Compensation--&gt;</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953	\$ 76,945	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	\$ 68,085	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824	\$ 57,424	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823	\$ 52,598	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1830	\$ 62,650	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1450	\$ 42,245	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>		<b>\$ 610,447</b>	<b>\$ 695,239</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Operating expenses (materials & supplies, travel & training, membership, copier lease, off-site storage, telephone, etc.)	\$ 65,586	\$ 65,586
Space rental	\$ 215,469	\$ 215,469
Equipment & furniture	\$ 24,827	\$ 24,827
Email & software licenses	\$ 26,474	\$ 26,474
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>	<b>\$ 332,356</b>	<b>\$ 332,356</b>

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 2,474,261	\$ 2,856,057
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 2,456,753	\$ 2,459,757
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 17,509</b>	<b>\$ 396,300</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>1%</b>	<b>14%</b>

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1979 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Classifications based on current configuration of Budget and Legislative Analyst services.
6. Full time equivalent (FTE) positions include 11 managers and analyst staff and 1 administrative staff. The staff level of 11 managers and analysts is based on the number of staff required to provide 16,860 hours of services not including paid leaves (legal holidays, vacation, sick, etc.) and other non-productive administrative hours such as training and staff meetings consistent with Association of Local Government Auditors standards.
7. Space rental cost is calculated using the Real Estate Division's appraisal review for 1390 Market Street (Fox Plaza).
8. Calculations do not include liability for retiree health. Based on the CAFR for year ending June 30, 2017, the City's annual liability for post retirement employee health benefits is \$421 million. If the Budget and Legislative Analyst services were provided by City employees, the annual liability for retiree health benefits would be \$171,992 (equal to 0.04 percent of the City's total annual retiree health liability based on FTE count.)
9. Estimated total contract cost includes a 3.25% COLA requested by the contractor. If the COLA is not approved by the Board of Supervisors, the total estimated contract cost would be \$2,363,745 in FY 2021-22.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 28, 2021

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Real Estate Custodial Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Adam Nguyen, Finance and Planning Director



ADM - City Administrator  
 296644 ADM Internal Services - Real Estate Division  
 Custodial Services at Real Estate Division Buildings  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE  
 SERVICES (1) (2)  
**FISCAL YEAR 2021-22**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Custodian	2708	25.0	\$ 2,262	\$ 2,715	1,475,707	1,771,557
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	2.0	2,489	2,988	129,921	155,967
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,744	3,294	71,614	85,972
Management Assistant	1842	0.1	3,223	3,870	8,413	10,100
Manager II	0923	0.05	5,085	6,104	6,636	7,966
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					3,732	4,480
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					109,183	131,072
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		28.2				
Total Salary Costs-->					1,692,291	2,031,562
Total of Other Compensation-->					112,914	135,551

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2708	36,006		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2716	38,022		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2718	40,283		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1842	44,537		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0923	65,440		
Total Fringe Benefits		923,671	1,024,196

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Materials and Supplies	238,827	238,827
Uniform	13,441	15,737
As-Needed Custodial and est. MFB	316,061	379,425
	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	568,330	633,990

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	3,297,206	3,825,299
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	2,183,555	2,189,238
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	1,113,651	1,636,061
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	34%	43%

Comments/Assumptions:

- FTE level assumes that one custodian can cover 35,000 square feet at 25 Van Ness and 555 7th Street. Total square feet of two facilities is 154,000.
- FTE level for 1650 Mission and 1 South Van Ness is assumed identical to the FTE specified on the current janitorial contracts for 1650 Mission and 1 South Van Ness. (1650 Mission: 6.5, 1SVN: 13.75)
- Supervision level is 1 FTE per 15 custodians, with 1 supervisor overseeing two assistant supervisors.
- If work were brought in house, instead of monitoring contracts, 0923 and 1842 would supervise custodial staff at a reduced levels, primarily on trainings and time record reporting.
- Service Level during hours eligible for night/shift differential is 80% of service level during day.
- City would purchase same level of consummables if work was not contracted out.
- As negotiated by SEIU and the City, 8 as-needed custodians cover 25 PCS custodians during sick and vacation time at a ratio of 1 TEX per 2.8 PCS employees. (2.8 PCS each consumes 11 days LHP, 13 days SP, 15 days VAC, and 4 days FH – 2.8 FTE X 43 days X 8 hours = 963.2 hours or 344 hours per FTE. Assuming as-needed custodians take 80 hours of leave per year, this would require 9 TEX employees. (8600/(1040-80)).
- New city custodial staff (25 FTE - each receives 5 work shirts, 5 work pants, and 1 work jacket, 8 TEX A/N - each receives 3 work shirts, 3 work pants, and 1 work jacket) will receive uniform procured by the department.
- Holiday Pay - 8 hours of holiday pay needed on each City Holiday for services provided at 1SVN



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Real Estate Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Adam Nguyen, Finance and Planning Director

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
**FISCAL YEAR 2021-22**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	39.4	\$ 2,526	\$ 3,031	\$ 2,594,649	\$ 3,113,591
Supervising Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8211	3.0	2,795	\$ 3,354	\$ 218,854	\$ 262,626
Manager I	0922	0.1	4,739	\$ 5,686	\$ 12,368	\$ 14,841
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			66,952	80,343
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			77,272	92,727
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		42.5				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 2,825,871	\$ 3,391,059
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 144,224	\$ 173,070

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211	40,728	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	922	63,123	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 1,470,301	\$ 1,637,405

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Cellular Phones (\$2800 per year + \$509.50 one-time cost), (\$4500 a year + \$700 one-time cost)	\$ 132,380	\$ 208,000
Uniform pay (\$600 per FTE)	\$ 24,000	\$ 24,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 156,380	\$ 232,000

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 4,596,777	\$ 5,433,534
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 2,423,228	\$ 2,706,741
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>\$ 2,173,549</u>	<u>\$ 2,726,793</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	47%	50%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FTE level assumes 1784 hours (2088 hours - 80 hours vacation pay - 32 hours floating holiday pay - 104 hours sick pay - 88 hours holidays and is divided by total hours in contracts
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. See table on next page for assumptions
6. Each 15 security guards require 1 security guard supervisor FTE



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 28, 2021

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Fleet Security – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Adam Nguyen, Finance and Planning Director

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	3.50	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$230,751	\$277,012	
City Shops Assistant Superintendent	7277	0.05	\$ 4,755	\$ 5,708	\$ 6,205	\$ 7,449	
	-	-			-	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			12,500	15,006	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			14,079	16,902	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			0	0	
Uniform Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			2,101	2,101	
	Total FTE	3.6					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$236,956	\$284,461
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 28,680	\$ 34,008

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	\$ 38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7277	\$ 59,033	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$123,181	\$137,197

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ -	\$ -

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$388,817	\$455,667
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$202,538	\$242,900
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$186,279	\$212,767
% of Savings to City Cost	48%	47%

Comments/Assumptions:

- 1983 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 7 hours each day eligible for 8% shift-differential pay; 7 hours each day eligible for 10% shift-differential pay (Local 1021 MOU items 293,294, & 426)
- 5% of 7277's time would be spent supervising security guard employees.
- Hours per FTE is 1784. (2,088 hours - 80 hours vacation pay - 88 hours holiday pay - 32 hours floating holiday pay - 104 hours sick pay)



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Carmen Chu, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management– FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Adam Nguyen, Finance and Planning Director

ADM - General Services Agency – City Administrator

278641 ADM Convention Facilities Mgmt

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING

VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL Year 22-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager I	0922	10.0	\$4,719	\$5,665	\$1,236,278	\$1,484,127
Manager II	0923	3.0	\$5,066	\$6,081	\$398,153	\$477,975
Manager III	0931	1.0	\$5,462	\$6,557	\$143,093	\$171,781
Manager IV	0932	8.0	\$5,863	\$7,038	\$1,228,834	\$1,475,191
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$6,324	\$7,592	\$165,694	\$198,913
Deputy Director III	0953	2.0	\$6,788	\$8,149	\$355,703	\$427,015
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	\$8,227	\$9,876	\$215,542	\$258,754
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	\$3,337	\$4,006	\$48,084	\$57,724
IS Manager	1071	0.6	\$6,788	\$8,149	\$97,818	\$117,429
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	\$3,881	\$4,659	\$101,681	\$122,066
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	\$3,027	\$3,634	\$79,306	\$95,205
Personnel Analyst	1241	0.0	\$3,425	\$4,112	\$ -	\$ -
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	\$4,291	\$5,151	\$112,417	\$134,954
Senior Clerk	1406	1.0	\$2,713	\$3,257	\$71,073	\$85,322
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$2,954	\$3,546	\$77,389	\$92,903
Secretary I	1444	0.0	\$2,193	\$2,633	\$ -	\$ -
Secretary II	1446	1.0	\$2,713	\$3,257	\$71,073	\$85,322
Executive Secretary 3	1454	0.0	\$3,304	\$3,966	\$ -	\$ -
Accountant III	1654	2.0	\$3,913	\$4,697	\$205,031	\$246,136
Storekeeper	1934	0.0	\$2,209	\$2,652	\$ -	\$ -
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	\$2,516	\$3,020	\$65,908	\$79,121
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	\$4,168	\$5,004	\$218,429	\$262,220
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$5,450	\$6,542	\$142,778	\$171,402
Custodian	2708	109.0	\$2,253	\$2,705	\$6,434,081	\$7,723,987
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$2,733	\$3,281	\$71,614	\$85,972
Fire Safety Inspector 2	6281	0.5	\$5,215	\$6,260	\$68,313	\$82,008
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	6.0	\$4,374	\$5,251	\$687,583	\$825,429
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	\$4,460	\$5,354	\$116,857	\$140,285
Painting Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$3,805	\$4,568	\$99,696	\$119,683
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	2.0	\$3,341	\$4,010	\$175,046	\$210,139
Stationary Engineer	7334	10.5	\$3,516	\$4,221	\$967,170	\$1,161,068
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	\$3,984	\$4,783	\$313,179	\$375,965
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$3,452	\$4,144	\$90,448	\$108,581

Plumber	7345	1.0	\$3,881	\$4,659	\$101,681	\$122,066
Painter	7346	1.5	\$3,177	\$3,814	\$124,846	\$149,875
Electrician	7347	1.0	\$4,019	\$4,824	\$105,290	\$126,399
Security Guard	8202	23.0	\$2,516	\$3,020	\$1,515,878	\$1,819,782
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	6.0	\$3,275	\$3,931	\$514,811	\$618,021
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Ofcr	8211	3.0	\$2,783	\$3,341	\$218,768	\$262,626
Parking Control Officer	8214	15.1	\$2,510	\$3,013	\$990,193	\$1,188,707
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	\$2,999	\$3,600	\$157,123	\$188,623
Public SafetyComm Supv	8239	1.0	\$4,194	\$5,035	\$109,891	\$131,922
Pub Safety Communication Coord	8240	0.0	\$4,122	\$4,948	\$ -	\$ -
Public Relations Mgr	9251	0.0	\$4,763	\$5,718	\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			259,224	311,193
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			213,978	256,876
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			267,472	321,095
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			282,790	339,484
Total FTE		227.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					17,896,754	21,484,699
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$1,023,464	\$1,228,648

#### FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922 63,123
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923 65,440
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 68,085
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932 70,764
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0933 73,846
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953 76,945
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0955 86,553
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062 46,114
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1071 76,945
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1218 50,501
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222 42,897
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1241 47,959
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1244 53,140
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406 40,099
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408 42,245
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1444 36,280
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1446 40,099
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1454 46,777
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1654 51,235
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1934 36,433
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936 38,344
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1956 52,876
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1958 62,462
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708 36,006
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718 40,283



Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	6281	60,868		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7203	56,425		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205	57,180		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7242	51,386		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7333	47,888		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334	49,448		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7335	53,621		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7344	48,819		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7345	53,955		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7346	45,790		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7347	56,042		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38,344		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8210	45,104		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211	40,728		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8214	38,290		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8216	42,644		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8239	52,654		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8240	55,052		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9251	65,653		
			Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits			\$8,781,026	\$9,856,828

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Contractual Services	\$4,232,046	\$4,232,046
Workers' Compensation	\$1,299,680	\$1,299,680
Total Capital & Operating	\$5,531,726	\$5,531,726

### COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$33,232,970.03	\$38,101,900.95
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$30,328,564.67	\$30,376,910.86
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$2,904,405	\$7,724,990
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	9%	20%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1997 was the first year these services were contracted out.
  2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
  3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
  4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Linda Gerull, CIO  
Department of Technology  
One South Van Ness Ave, 2nd Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: ChiaYu Ma, Deputy Director, Finance & Administration, CFO/CAO

RE: Mainframe System Support – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

                                /s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Elaine Benvenuti, Budget Manager

Department of Technology  
 232339 - DT SD Service Delivery  
 Mainframe System Support  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
**FISCAL YEAR 2021-22**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Information Systems Manager	0941	0.50	\$ 6,814	\$ 8,180	\$ 88,926	\$ 106,754	
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	2.00	\$ 5,329	\$ 6,397	\$ 278,156.88	\$ 333,921.83	
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	3.00	\$ 6,174	\$ 7,412	\$ 483,413.74	\$ 580,328.62	
Clerk Typist	1424	0.50	\$ 2,723	\$ 3,269	\$ 35,536.50	\$ 42,660.87	
-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (Standby)	n/a	n/a			183,858	220,718	
Total FTE		6.0					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 886,033	\$ 1,063,665
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 183,858	\$ 220,718

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0941	76,945	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043	61,504	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044	67,220	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1424	40,099	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 334,228	\$ 383,191

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

IBM Z Workschedulder Training	\$ 24,558	\$ 24,558
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 24,558	\$ 24,558

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 1,428,677	\$ 1,692,131
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 999,964	\$ 1,150,766
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 428,713	\$ 541,365
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	30%	32%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY FY 2004/2005 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. In-house mainframe systems operations require contract services for specialized and as-needed services that cannot be met by existing staffing and expertise levels. It is estimated, City staff would need 6 months training to be able to operate the system independently.
6. Trident Services, Inc. provides installation, configuration, maintenance and support of systems, collection of data for billing, and management of staff and projects for the City's mainframe equipment.
7. The services are 24 hours/day, 7 days/week that requires Trident Services, Inc. employees to standby during the non regular business hours for emergency incidents.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Alaric Degrafinried, Acting Director  
Department of Public Works  
City Hall – 1. Dr. Carlton B Goodlett Place, Room 348  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Acting Deputy Director of Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Devin Macaulay, Budget Manager

Public Works - Yard Operations

207990 DPW Operations

Security Guard Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	2.00	\$ 1,648	\$ 3,031	\$ 86,009	\$ 158,242
Security Guard - As Needed	8202	0.11	1,538	3,031	\$ 4,499	\$ 8,870
Operations Manager	0923	0.04	5,085	6,104	\$ 5,309	\$ 6,373
	-	-			-	-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		2.2				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 95,817	\$ 173,485
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ -	\$ -

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923	65,440	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		\$ 75,033	\$ 83,603

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Uniforms (\$600 each for 8202's)	\$ 1,800	\$ 1,800
Radios (\$100 each, excluding as needed 8202)	\$ 200	\$ 200
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 2,000	\$ 2,000

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 172,849	\$ 259,088
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 161,940	\$ 178,776
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 10,909	\$ 80,312
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	6%	31%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Trent Rhorer, Director  
City and County of San Francisco Human Services Agency  
170 Otis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Esperanza Zapien, Director of Contracts and Facilities

RE: HSA Security – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Emily Gibbs, Budget Director

Human Services Agency Admin/Central Management  
 Site Security

Insert name of the contract's main purpose here

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Security Guard	8202	68.7	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$ 4,530,442	\$ 5,438,705	
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	4.0	4,767	\$ 5,723	\$ 497,669	\$ 597,442	
Manager I	0922	1.0	4,737	\$ 5,686	\$ 123,628	\$ 148,413	
	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a	3,628	4,356	94,695	113,680	
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE		73.7					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 5,151,738	\$ 6,184,560
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 94,695	\$ 113,680

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	\$ 38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205	\$ 59,681	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922	\$ 63,123	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits			\$ 2,631,699 \$ 2,937,554

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Uniform	\$ 44,643	\$ 44,643
Radios (\$200 per staff)	\$ 14,748	\$ 14,748
Metal detecting wands	\$ 600	\$ 600
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 59,991	\$ 59,991

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 7,938,124	\$ 9,295,785
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 4,254,918	\$ 4,259,024
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>\$ 3,683,206</u>	<u>\$ 5,036,761</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	46%	54%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. According to limited records, these services were contracted out prior to FY00/01 (Black Bear), at least to FY97/98 (McCoy Patrol Svcs).
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. Salary step 5 is used as the high for budgeting purposes.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. To operate a 24/7 program, there may be additional overtime and night weekend coverage for limited 24 hour
6. FTE has to account for time off (vac, sp, etc) on city positions - contract provides straight hours.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Shireen McSpadden, Director  
Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing  
440 Turk Street  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Gigi Whitley, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: HSH Security – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_  
/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Leo Levenson, Fiscal and Budget Advisor



**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	28.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$1,845,417	\$ 2,215,387
Security Supervisor	8228	3.0	\$ 2,811	\$ 3,375	\$ 220,121	\$ 264,251
Manager II	923	0.2	\$ 5,085	\$ 6,104	\$ 26,544	\$ 31,865
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			39,038	46,864
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			48,165	57,822
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			46,135	55,385
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE:		31.2				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$2,092,082	\$ 2,511,503
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 133,338	\$ 160,070

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8228	40,881	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	923	65,440	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$1,085,546	\$ 1,209,352

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

supplies and uniforms	\$ 25,550	\$ 25,550
radios/communication equipment	\$ 6,200	\$ 6,200
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 31,750	\$ 31,750

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$3,342,717	\$ 3,912,675
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$2,087,709	\$ 2,302,470
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$1,255,008	\$ 1,610,205
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	38%	41%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2022 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. With a 28 members crew, will need at least 3 supervisors to arrange shift and manage the crew as most of the security coverage will be longer than 8 to 5 operation.
6. Will need a 1244 to manage recruitment for 31 FTEs
7. Since these are frontline workers, need additional supplies cost for PPEs



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Eric Shaw, Director  
Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development  
One South Van Ness Ave, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Benjamin McCloskey, Director of Finance and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_  
/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard (minimum staffing with PTO)	8202	13.7	2,525	3,031	\$ 902,936	\$ 1,083,957
Security Guard (supervision)	8204	2.0	2,944	3,535	\$ 153,695	\$ 184,507
0	-	-			\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			27,088	32,519
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			63,206	75,877
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		15.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 1,056,631	\$ 1,268,464
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 90,294	\$ 108,396

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	\$ 38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8204	\$ 42,061	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 546,984	\$ 609,430

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Vehicles (2 vehicles and maintenance)	\$ 80,000	\$ 80,000
Parking for 2 vehicles	\$ 4,800	\$ 4,800
Supplies estimates at \$800 per officer	\$ 9,820	\$ 9,820
Radios/ communication equipment	\$ 3,140	\$ 3,140
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 97,760	\$ 97,760

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 1,791,668	\$ 2,084,050
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 906,719.11	\$ 997,737.25
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 884,949	\$ 1,086,313
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	49%	52%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2019-20 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Paul Miyamoto, Sheriff  
City Hall, Room 456  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Crispin Hollings, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Food Service at County Jails – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_  
/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Mylan Luong

**06 - Sheriff  
Jail Food Services**

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Food Service Manager Administrator	2620	1.0	\$ 3,710	\$ 4,454	\$ 96,832	\$ 116,244	
Senior Food Service Supervisor	2619	4.0	\$ 2,797	\$ 3,357	\$ 291,961	\$ 350,493	
Food Service Supervisor	2618	3.0	\$ 2,536	\$ 3,044	\$ 198,535	\$ 238,338	
Cook	2654	9.0	\$ 2,625	\$ 3,151	\$ 616,515	\$ 740,114	
Assistant Cook	2650	2.0	\$ 2,106	\$ 2,528	\$ 109,936	\$ 131,977	
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	0.1	\$ 4,082	\$ 4,900	\$ 10,653	\$ 12,789	
-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	\$ -	
-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 29,351	\$ 35,235	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 26,182	\$ 31,431	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE		19.0					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 1,313,779	\$ 1,577,166
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 52,895	\$ 64,258

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2620	\$ 55,042	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2619	\$ 35,415	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2618	\$ 40,014	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2654	\$ 52,664	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2650	\$ 38,813	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823	\$ 41,071	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits			\$ 774,350 \$ 872,456

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the	\$ -	\$ -
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ -	\$ -

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 2,141,025	\$ 2,513,880
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 1,266,600	\$ 1,269,171
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 874,425	\$ 1,244,709
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	40%	49%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. These services have been contracted out since 1980.
2. CCSF and contract costs are presented as annualized costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, Employer Retirement, Employee Retirement, Pick-up and Long-Term Disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Assumes that capital, operating and supply cost are the same for either the City or the Contractor.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

John Arntz, Director  
Department of Elections  
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 48  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Nataliya Kuzina, Deputy Director

RE: Assembly of Vote by Mail Envelope Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Fisher Zhu, Budget Manager

**080-Department of Elections**

Assembly and mailing of vote-by-mail ballot packets for FY22 elections  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Junior Clerk	1402	44.0	\$ 1,988	\$ 2,386	\$ 2,282,650	\$ 2,740,276	
Chief Clerk	1410	0.2	\$ 3,400	\$ 4,081	\$ 17,747	\$ 21,305	
Junior Management Assistant	1840	0.2	\$ 2,840	\$ 3,409	\$ 14,824	\$ 17,795	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
0					\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE			44.4				
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 2,315,220	\$ 2,779,376
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ -	\$ -

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1402	35679	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1410	46101	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1840	41134	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 1,433,462	\$ 1,587,323

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the	\$ -	\$ -
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ -	\$ -

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 3,748,682	\$ 4,366,699
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 618,446	\$ 739,223
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 3,130,236	\$ 3,627,476
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	84%	83%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 0708 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Eric Sandler, Chief Financial Officer  
San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
525 Golden Gate Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Laura Busch, Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Andrea Gremer, Operating Budget Manager



SFPUC Power Enterprise  
 298650 Power Enterprise  
 Security Services - Golden Gate site  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Security Guard	8202	1.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$ 65,908	\$ 79,121	
Management Assistant	1842	0.05	\$ 3,223	\$ 3,870	\$ 4,207	\$ 5,050	
-	-				-	-	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a	947	1,137	24,715	29,670	
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE		1.1					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 70,114	\$ 84,171
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 24,715	\$ 29,670

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	44537	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 36,425	\$ 40,570

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location)- One (1) needed.	\$ 200	\$ 200
Uniforms (600/year per person) - One (1) needed	\$ 600	\$ 600
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 800	\$ 800

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 132,055	\$ 155,212
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 73,787	\$ 108,950
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 58,268	\$ 46,262
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	44%	30%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2021-22 would be the second year these services are contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective FY 2021-22. Costs are represented as annual 12
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Overtime of 20 hrs per pay period for for 7am-5:30pm daily security shifts

Wastewater Enterprise WWE  
 229281 WWE Maintenance, 292649 WWE Source Control, 229268 Admin SE Community Facility  
 Security Services  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	2.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	131,816	158,242
Security Guard As-Needed M-F (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Security Guard As-Needed Sa-Su (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	0.7	2,525	3,031	46,135	55,385
Security Guard (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	6.0	2,525	3,031	395,447	474,726
Security Guard As-Needed (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Security Guard - Saturday (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	0.2	2,525	3,031	13,182	15,824
Security Guard (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	5.0	2,525	3,031	329,539	395,605
Security Guard As-Needed (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Security Guard - Saturday (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	0.2	2,525	3,031	13,182	15,824
Security Guard (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	4.0	2,525	3,031	263,631	316,484
Security Guard As-Needed (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Administrator/Manager	0931	1.0	5,483	6,582	143,093	171,781
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			-	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			135,784	163,007
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
		<b>Total FTE</b>	<b>21.1</b>			
					<b>Total Salary Costs--&gt;</b>	
					<b>1,467,839</b>	<b>1,762,112</b>
					<b>Total of Other Compensation--&gt;</b>	
					<b>135,784</b>	<b>163,007</b>

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	76,687
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	26,841
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	230,062
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	7,669
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	191,718
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	7,669
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	153,375
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 \$ 68,085	68,085
<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>		<b>Low 751,569 High 838,792</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location) - Four (4) needed.	\$ 2,504	\$ 2,504
Uniforms (\$600 per year per person) - Seventeen (17) needed.	\$ 10,200	\$ 10,200
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>	<b>\$ 12,704</b>	<b>\$ 12,704</b>

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 2,367,897	\$ 2,776,614
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 1,208,008	\$ 1,211,763
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 1,159,889</b>	<b>\$ 1,564,851</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>49%</b>	<b>56%</b>

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2012 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective December 28, 2019. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. 0931 Manager III will be needed fulltime to manage security program and supervise security personnel.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

**027 AIRPORT COMMISSION**  
**109699 AIR Operations & Security**

General Airport Security Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	37.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$ 2,438,587	\$ 2,927,475
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	8.0	0	3,031	\$ -	\$ 632,968
Aviation Security Operations Supervisor	9220	0.1	4,171	5,007	\$ 5,443	\$ 6,534
Aviation Security Manager	0931	0.1	5,483	6,582	\$ 7,155	\$ 8,589
-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			108,852	130,675
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			131,931	159,817
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			213,064	255,779
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		45.1				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 2,451,184	\$ 3,575,566
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 453,847	\$ 546,271

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	38,344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9220	52,308	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	68,085	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits			\$ 1,248,552 \$ 1,731,483

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

cell phones (\$200 per 8202 and 8207 FTE)	\$ 9,000	\$ 9,000
uniforms (\$600 per 8202 and 8207 FTE)	\$ 27,000	\$ 27,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 36,000	\$ 36,000

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 4,189,583	\$ 5,889,320
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 3,669,781	\$ 3,673,062
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 519,802	\$ 2,216,258
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	12%	38%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Information Booth & Guest Assistance – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

027-Airport Commission  
 Customer Care  
 Airport Information and Guests Assistance Services  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Senior Operations Manager	9143	0.0	\$ 6,239	\$ 7,489	-	-
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.7	3,694	4,435	163,924	196,787
Management Assistant	1842	7.0	3,223	3,870	586,405	703,968
Accountant I	1650	0.0	2,931	3,518	-	-
Principal Account Clerk	1634	5.0	3,039	3,648	396,529	476,025
Senior Account Clerk	1632	54.1	2,689	3,229	3,797,459	4,558,775
Account Clerk	1630	0.0	2,323	2,789	-	-
Training Officer	1232	0.5	3,970	4,766	46,629	55,978
	-				-	-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			158,367	190,116
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			141,269	169,590
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		68.2				
Total Salary Costs-->					4,990,947	5,991,533
Total of Other Compensation-->					299,635	359,706

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1232	51610	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630	36550	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1632	39800	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634	42897	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1650	42402	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	44537	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	48715	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9143	73116	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1827	52973	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		2,664,817	2,993,909

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Office Equipment and Technical Support	46,552	46,552
Reward & Recognition	10,000	10,000
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	58,800	58,800
ADM Guest Support Supplies	30,000	30,000
Fringe Benefit	3,500	3,500
Total Capital & Operating	148,852	148,852

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	8,104,252	9,494,000
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	5,996,371	6,003,351
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	2,107,881	3,490,650
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	26%	37%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. The estimated Contract Cost includes 0.25 FTE for contract monitoring.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Parking Operations – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

## COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)(2)

## FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 5,885	\$ 7,065	\$ 153,604	\$ 184,399
Manager II	0923	1.0	\$ 5,085	\$ 6,104	\$ 132,718	\$ 159,325
Manager I	0922	1.0	\$ 4,737	\$ 5,686	\$ 123,628	\$ 148,413
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,888	\$ 5,868	\$ 127,575	\$ 153,151
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	\$ 3,694	\$ 4,435	\$ 96,426	\$ 115,757
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 3,039	\$ 3,648	\$ 79,306	\$ 95,205
Clerk	1404	1.0	\$ 2,165	\$ 2,599	\$ 56,502	\$ 67,830
Senior Clerk	1406	4.0	\$ 2,723	\$ 3,269	\$ 284,292	\$ 341,287
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 2,965	\$ 3,560	\$ 77,389	\$ 92,903
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	\$ 3,223	\$ 3,870	\$ 84,133	\$ 101,000
Accountant II	1652	1.0	\$ 3,245	\$ 3,896	\$ 84,697	\$ 101,677
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	\$ 3,232	\$ 3,880	\$ 84,358	\$ 101,270
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334	2.0	\$ 3,603	\$ 4,325	\$ 188,069	\$ 225,774
Customer Service Agent Sup	1326	19.75	\$ 3,343	\$ 4,013	\$ 1,723,098	\$ 2,068,544
Customer Service Agent	1324	2.5	\$ 2,953	\$ 3,545	\$ 192,682	\$ 231,311
Cashier III	4322	31.25	\$ 2,704	\$ 3,246	\$ 2,205,524	\$ 2,647,688
Electronic Maintenance Tech	7318	1.0	\$ 4,320	\$ 5,186	\$ 112,756	\$ 135,361
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	\$ 3,529	\$ 4,237	\$ 184,223	\$ 221,156
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	\$ 4,477	\$ 5,375	\$ 116,857	\$ 140,285
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	1.0	\$ 5,574	\$ 6,691	\$ 145,469	\$ 174,632
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	\$ 4,767	\$ 5,723	\$ 373,252	\$ 448,081
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	54.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$ 3,559,019	\$ 4,272,531
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,744	\$ 3,294	\$ 71,614	\$ 85,972
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	\$ 2,489	\$ 2,988	\$ 194,881	\$ 233,951
Custodian	2708	42.25	\$ 2,262	\$ 2,715	\$ 2,493,944	\$ 2,993,931
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			410,787	493,142
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			366,437	439,900
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		178.75				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 12,946,015	\$ 15,541,434
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 777,223.95	\$ 933,041.96

## FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932 70,764
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923 65,440
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922 63,123
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1657 58,523
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844 48,715
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222 42,897
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404 35,147
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406 40,099
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408 42,245
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842 44,537



Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1652	45,188
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4366	44,614
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4334	47,902
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1326	45,595
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1324	42,138
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322	39,930
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7318	57,065
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334	49,448
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205	57,180
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8310	119,740
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205	59,681
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	38,344
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	40,283
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2716	38,022
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	36,006
		Low                      High
Total Fringe Benefits		\$    6,552,934    \$    7,329,130

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating Expenses	\$    1,180,245	\$    1,180,245
Credit Card Processing Fees	\$    1,250,000	\$    1,250,000
Training	\$        300,000	\$        300,000
Parking/Billing Technology	\$        300,000	\$        300,000
Total Capital & Operating		\$    3,030,245    \$    3,030,245

### COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$    23,306,417	\$    26,833,851
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$    22,944,525	\$    23,006,818
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>\$        361,892</u>	<u>\$        3,827,033</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	2%	14%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. 1971 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Operating costs include operating expenses & credit card fees. FTEs are based on Contractor FTEs.
6. In addition to the costs outlined above, the City would have to incur additional expenses to provide the following no cost value added services that are offered by the contractor:
  - Management of parking specific marketing campaigns
  - Legal services for subcontracted contracts
  - Parking data analyses
  - Increased parking facility insurance premiums and increased claim settlement costs to the City due to the loss of contractor's liability insurance coverage
  - An automated and proprietary software that reconciles general ledger revenue entries against location-specific bank deposits to identify anomalies, including: missing deposits, out-of-balance entries, deposits to wrong location, etc.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

**027 AIRPORT COMMISSION**  
**109699 AIR Operations & Security**

Airport Shuttle Bus Service

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Transit Operators	9163	56.0	\$ 2,671	\$ 3,207	\$ 3,904,301	\$ 4,687,036	
Transit Supervisor	9139	5.0	3,649	4,380	\$ 476,150.81	\$ 571,609.61	
Transit Manager II	9141	1.0	4,865	5,841	\$ 126,988.59	\$ 152,447.28	
Transit Manager I	9140	2.0	4,309	5,173	\$ 224,925.43	\$ 270,018.53	
Automotive Mechanic	7381	4.1	3,267	3,922	\$ 349,568.22	\$ 419,649.73	
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	2.0	2,512	3,016	\$ 131,138.83	\$ 157,429.57	
Transit Spotters	7454	4.0	1,875	2,251	\$ 195,783.47	\$ 235,034.18	
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
-	-	-			\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			171,627	206,035	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			153,098	183,791	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a					
Total FTE			74.1				
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 5,408,857	\$ 6,493,225
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 324,725	\$ 389,826

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	40,786	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	49,993	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9141	59,616	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	55,198	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	46,954	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	38,229	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7454	34,564	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 2,777,258	\$ 3,111,209

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities	\$ 430,680	\$ 430,680
Bus Maintenance (same as contractor)	1,065,009	1,065,009
Liability Insurance (same as contractor)	414,821	414,821
Worker's Compensation (same as contractor)	205,533	205,533
Property Insurance (same as contractor)	7,002	7,002
Unanticipated Operational Expenses (same as contractor)	168,882	168,882
Emergency Contingency	322,038	644,076
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 2,613,965	\$ 2,936,003

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 11,124,804	\$ 12,930,263
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 9,579,128	\$ 9,582,506
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 1,545,676	\$ 3,347,757
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	14%	26%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Elaine Forbes, Executive Director  
Port of San Francisco  
Pier 1, The Embarcadero  
San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: Contracting for Port Janitorial Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Nate Cruz, Port Finance Director

Port of San Francisco  
 210648 REAL ESTATE & DEVELOPMENT - Custodial services  
 Tyrone Navarro, Real Estate & Development Division  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)(2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Custodial Supervisor	2718	3.0	\$ 2,744	\$ 3,294	\$ 214,843	\$ 257,915	
Custodian	2708	12.0	\$ 2,262	2,715	\$ 708,339	\$ 850,347	
Porter	2736	3.0	\$ 2,262	2,715	\$ 177,085	\$ 212,587	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					34,912	41,912	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					31,143	37,387	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	-	
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-	
Total FTE		18.0					
					Total Salary Costs--->	\$1,100,267	\$1,320,849
					Total of Other Compensation--->	\$ 66,055	\$ 79,298

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	\$ 40,283	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	\$ 36,006	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2736	\$ 36,795	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		597,621	663,302

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the	\$ 35,000	\$ 55,000
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 35,000	\$ 55,000

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	1,798,943	2,118,449
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	1,208,936	1,810,577
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>\$ 590,007</u>	<u>\$ 307,872</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	33%	15%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2020 will about the 23rd year these services have been contracted out.
  2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month
  3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up
  4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Elaine Forbes, Executive Director  
Port of San Francisco  
Pier 1, The Embarcadero  
San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: Contracting for Port Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_  
/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Nate Cruz, Port Finance Director

Port of San Francisco  
232115 EXECUTIVE

Provide security services to Port staff and tenants

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 21-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	\$ 4,767	5,723	373,252	\$ 448,081
Institutional Police Officer	8204	21.0	2,944	3,535	1,613,793	1,937,326
Night Shift & Overtime Differential					-	-
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch					-	-
Holiday Pay					-	-
Premium Pay					-	-
Total FTE		24.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					1,987,044	2,385,407
Total of Other Compensation-->					0	0

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205	\$ 59,681	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8204	\$ 42,061	
Total Fringe Benefits			945,040 1,062,328

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Insert all additional costs, with a description, that the City would incur if providing the	-	-
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	-	-
Vehicles	-	-
	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	-	-

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	2,932,084	3,447,736
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	1,649,509	1,651,626
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	1,282,575	1,796,110
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	44%	52%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY16-17 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



TO: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
FROM: Sophia Kittler  
RE: Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services  
Previously Approved  
DATE: June 1, 2021

---

**Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget and legislative analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, fleet security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency–City Administrator); mainframe system support (General Services Agency–Technology); security services (Public Works); security services (Human Services Agency); security services (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); security services (Mayor’s Office of Housing and Community Development; food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); security services (Public Utilities Commission); security, information and guest services, parking operations, shuttle bus services (Airport); custodial and security services (Port).**

Should you have any questions, please contact Sophia Kittler at 415-554-6153.





To: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
From: Ashley Groffenberger, Mayor's Budget Director  
Date: June 1, 2021  
Re: Mayor's FY 2021-22 and FY 2022-23 Budget Submission

---

Madam Clerk,

In accordance with City and County of San Francisco Charter, Article IX, Section 9.100, the Mayor's Office hereby submits the Mayor's proposed budget by June 1<sup>st</sup>, corresponding legislation, and related materials for Fiscal Year (FY) 2021-22 and FY 2022-23.

In addition to the Mayor's Proposed FY 2021-22 and FY 2022-23 Budget Book, the following items are included in the Mayor's submission:

- The Annual Appropriation Ordinance and Annual Salary Ordinance, along with Administrative Provisions, physical copies of which will be delivered by the Controller's Office
- The proposed budget for the Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure for FY 2021-22
- 22 separate pieces of trailing legislation (see list attached)
- A Transfer of Function letter detailing the transfer of positions from one City department to another
- An Interim Exception letter
- A letter addressing funding levels for nonprofit corporations or public entities for the coming two fiscal years
- Memo to the Board President requesting for 30-day rule waivers on ordinances
- Request for release of Budget and Appropriations Committee Reserve

Please note the following:

- Technical adjustments to the budget are being prepared, but are not submitted with this set of materials.

Sincerely,

Ashley Groffenberger  
Mayor's Budget Director

cc: Members of the Board of Supervisors  
Budget & Legislative Analyst's Office  
Controller

<b>DEPT</b>	<b>Item</b>	<b>Relevance to Budget</b>	<b>Type of Legislation</b>
ADM	Critical Repair/Recovery Stimulus COPs	Authorizes COPs to finance or refinance the capital plan in the budget.	Ordinance
CON	Prop J Certification - new	Costs related to Prop J services assumed in budget.	Resolution
CON	Prop J Certification - previously approved	Costs related to Prop J services assumed in budget.	Resolution
CON	Access Line Tax	Sets Access Line Tax. Revenues assumed in budget.	Resolution
CON	Neighborhood Beautification Fund	Neighborhood Beautification Fund contribution levels assumed in budget.	Ordinance
CON	Supplemental Enterprise Budget - AAO	Amendment to the AAO for the Airport, Port, and the PUC	Ordinance
CON	Supplemental Enterprise Budget - ASO	Amendment to the ASO for the Airport, Port, and the PUC	Ordinance
DPH	Annual Update to Patient Rates	Fee revenue assumed in budget.	Ordinance
DPH	Recurring State Grants	Grant revenue assumed in budget.	Resolution
DPH	DPH City Option Payouts	Approves the execution of a payment agreement assumed in budget.	Resolution
DPH	Emergency Medical Services Fee Transfer of Function	Transfer of function for positions reflected in the budget	Ordinance
HSH	Annual HSH Fund Expenditures	Expenditure plan assumed in budget.	Resolution
LIB	In-Kind Grant of Friends of San Francisco Public Library	Grant assumed in budget.	Resolution
LIB	In-Kind Grant of Friends of San Francisco Public Library Mission Branch	Grant assumed in budget.	Resolution
PUC	Hetch Hetchy Capital Budget	Appropriates funds to support PUC Hetch Hetchy capital budget expenditures.	Ordinance
PUC	Wastewater Capital Budget	Appropriates funds to support PUC Wastewater Enterprise capital budget expenditures.	Ordinance
PUC	Hetch Hetchy Debt Authorization	Authorizes bond issuance to finance Hetch Hetchy capital projects.	Ordinance
PUC	Wastewater Debt Authorization	Authorizes bond issuance to finance Wastewater capital projects.	Ordinance
REC	Continuing Flexible Pricing Model for REC Owned Gardens	Continues current pricing model for REC-owned gardens-- revenues reflected in budget.	Ordinance
REC	Parking Rates and Codes Revision	Authorizes SFMTA to implement paid parking and revise existing rates at certain parking lots-- revenues reflected in budget.	Ordinance
RNT	Direct Administration of the Rent Board Fee	Legislation that allows the Rent Board to directly collect the annual fee on rent-controlled units-- revenues reflected in budget.	Ordinance
TTX	Street Artist Fee	Lowers the fee of a street artist certificate— revenues reflected in budget.	Ordinance

**From:** [Kittler, Sophia \(MYR\)](#)  
**To:** [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)  
**Cc:** [Lynn, Andrea \(MYR\)](#); [Campbell, Severin \(BUD\)](#); [Peacock, Rebecca \(MYR\)](#)  
**Subject:** Mayor -- [Resolution] -- [Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services Previously Approved]  
**Date:** Tuesday, June 1, 2021 3:07:35 PM  
**Attachments:** [Prop J Existing.zip](#)

---

Attached for introduction to the Board of Supervisors is a **Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget and legislative analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, fleet security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency–City Administrator); mainframe system support (General Services Agency–Technology); security services (Public Works); security services (Human Services Agency); security services (Homelessness and Supportive Housing); security services (Mayor’s Office of Housing and Community Development; food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); security services (Public Utilities Commission); security, information and guest services, parking operations, shuttle bus services (Airport); custodial and security services (Port).**

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Sophia Kittler  
Liaison to the Board of Supervisors  
Office of Mayor London N. Breed  
(415) 554 6153 | [Sophia.kittler@sfgov.org](mailto:Sophia.kittler@sfgov.org)