

*London N. Breed, Mayor*  
*Recreation and Park Commission*  
**Minutes**  
**December 19, 2019**

**Commission President Mark Buell** called the Recreation and Park Commission meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. on Thursday, December 19, 2019.

**ROLL CALL**

**Present**

Mark Buell  
Allan Low  
Kat Anderson  
Gloria Bonilla  
Tom Harrison  
Larry Mazzola, Jr.  
Eric McDonnell

**Absent**

None

**Commissioner Buell:** Thank you. I will be very brief and simply wish to all of the public and all of my fellow Commissioners and all of the staff and Recreation and Park a very happy holiday season. Thank you.

**Commissioner McDonnell:** Thank you for setting a great example for the General Manager. [laughs]. Sorry, did I say that out loud?

**General Manager Ginsburg:** I only have 37 items for you Commissioners.

**Commissioner Buell:** Thank you very much.

**General Manager Ginsburg:** I too will extend a happy holiday and I'm so excited in this holiday season just to share with you just a wee bit about what's happening in your Department.

We've got some good news to end 2019. The Controller's Office released its annual park maintenance standards this week which shows that San Francisco's parks were better maintained across the City over the past fiscal year with less disparity between neighborhoods and continued improvements to formerly lower-scoring parks. Overall our Department met 92% of its park maintenance standards in fiscal year 18-19, exceeding our target of 90% and the score also represents a three-point increase from the previous two years and six-point increase over the past four. So we're doing well. Significantly, the report also shows continued improvements in the conditions of formerly lower-scoring parks. In 2015, the lowest scoring park got a 60%. In 2019 that score climbed 17% to 77%. Earlier this year the Controller's Office published a new interactive dashboard that shows all park maintenance related data. Users can explore the dashboard to see the highest and lowest-scoring parks, how the scores have changed over time or look up a favorite park and get feature-level details on the maintenance. The dashboard can be found on the Controller's website at [sfcontroller.org](http://sfcontroller.org).

The results of this latest report are certainly a testament to the commitment of our staff including our custodians, our gardeners, our park maintenance crews. They also reflect the continued guidance and investment that we're making into our deferred maintenance needs that you all help us with each year and they certainly reflect the results of the confidence of San Francisco voters as we've been able to renovate almost a hundred projects in the last ten years. So all in all very good news and I think that the biggest takeaway for me is over the last three or four years with both head and heart and wallet our focus on equity and narrowing the gap between our highest and lowest-scoring parks, prioritizing our deferred maintenance in our equity zones is really starting to show and pay off, so we're very pleased about that.

I wanted to invite everyone to yet one more awesome holiday party. This one is going to be at 900 Innes at India Basin, the future park site that we've all been working on. This Saturday, December 21<sup>st</sup> from noon to 5:00 p.m. The event is an India Basin project, collectively hosted by the Recreation and Park Department, the A. Phillip Randolph Institute, the San Francisco Parks Alliance, and the Trust for Public Land and will include visits from Santa, live entertainment, cookie decorating, rock climbing, and toy giveaways to kids. Folks can preregister their children for the giveaway by calling 415-421-8777. To find out more about the India Basin Shoreline project please visit [ibwaterfrontparks.com](http://ibwaterfrontparks.com).

Just right down the path from 900 Innes is the Heron's Head Ecocenter and if you're looking for ways to get active this holiday season the Ecocenter at Heron's Head Park has a couple of new, unique activities this month in addition to its regular programming. Adaption Investigation Workshop where you can test your athletic skills against insects. If you're insect-curious December 26<sup>th</sup> and January 2<sup>nd</sup> from 10:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. And then a tiny but mighty workshop where you can learn about microorganisms that live in the local wetlands on December 27<sup>th</sup> and January 3<sup>rd</sup> from 10:00 a.m. to 3:00 p.m. So the last weekend of December, first weekend of January all had some really cool awesome programming at Heron's Head. For more information on regular recurring activities like Zumba, bird watching, hiking and volunteerism, visit our website at [sfrecpark.org](http://sfrecpark.org).

It is winter and so registration for our winter programs is going on now online and in person at 14 locations throughout the City. This winter get the entire family out and into our parks and rec centers. We have something for everyone including fishing, canoeing and kayaking at Lake Merced. Our Junior Warriors Basketball League for kids and drop-in Zumba and Boot Classes for adults.

With an eye on January two quick announcements. Applications for our summer 2020 Workrecreation program are being accepted now through January 10<sup>th</sup>. The program is open to teens 14-18 who live or go to school in San Francisco and offers a valuable opportunity for them to enter the workforce, earn money, have fun, make new friends and wear cool Recreation and Park sweatshirts. This past summer Recreation and Park hosted 430 youth workers in our parks nearly half of whom were in this Workrecreation program. They were recruited, interviewed and hired directly by Recreation and Park staff. The celebration is in its 58<sup>th</sup> year this year. The Workrecreation program has seen many of its former workers go on to have long and successful careers here at the Recreation and Park Department including Staci White and Toby Wiley who is now Santa. Those interested in applying or folks who know teens who may be interested in applying can visit our website at [sfrecpark.org](http://sfrecpark.org).

Lastly, join us for our 36<sup>th</sup> annual luncheon in honor of Dr. Martin Luther King on Friday, January 17<sup>th</sup> from 11:30 to 1:00 p.m. at the Minnie and Lovie Ward Rec Center. This year's keynote speaker is going to be Superior Court Judge Terry Jackson, the first African American woman to serve as a Superior Court Judge in San Francisco. Every year the luncheon offers the opportunity to meet community members, reconnect with retired Recreation and Park employees and reflect on the life of Dr. King. Commissioners give us a heads-up if you're able to attend so we make sure we reserve a seat for you.

With that we're going to take a quick look at all of the holiday events happening or that have happened in your beloved park system.

[video plays]

Thank you for the video Ryan. Not included in this one is I want to mention briefly is the Tenderloin Children's Rec Center Holiday Party which I attended last Friday night in which honest to God there were 500 to 600 people in there for toy giveaways, food giveaways, caroling, cookies and crafts in a community that doesn't have much space and needs the love and it was quite joyous. I want to thank my staff for all the work they do to give people a little bit of an extra holiday smile.

This concludes the General Manager's report.

**Albert Sandoval:** May I please have the overhead? Good morning. I'm here to talk about General Manager Ginsburg's General Manager's report. So if you look at this here this shows McLaren Park. I got this from Capital

Improvement. See it sways Louis Sutter and Mansell Courts. But if you look at every single map we're not on the San Francisco visitor's map. We don't get much respect. Literally, we are not on this map. See there? District 9, McLaren Park, they shut us off at Twin Peaks, Potrero Hill. And the reason I bring this up is because we want our fair share of the bonds so my question is is McLaren Park Louis Sutter Playground going to be on the next bond? Nobody can answer this question except maybe you guys. I can't get a straight answer. I can sit down if you don't have the answer.

**Commissioner Buell:** I don't think under public comment that there's going to be a response to particular questions but I can tell you that the bonds are sent out of the Mayor's Office so I would probably send you there.

**Albert Sandoval:** Okay, I'll go to the Audit, the Ethics, and I'll go to—the last few days I've been at the Controller's Office. But I need help under the Sunshine Law to understand a lot of these reports because you guys have an announcement but if you look at the back part of it, actually it's not even on here, all the paperwork you guys have I got a lot of the copies but the problem is I can't understand the financial reports and how can we follow the money if McLaren Park Louis Sutter Playground District 9 if we don't understand the literature. You guys have it too. I went right here I think on the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor where all the Supervisors and secretary office I guess they're called and they were very nice with me, helped me out. The Controller's is off the chart. I'm talking about very forthcoming. But I need Recreation and Park to sit down with me and help me understand these reports. That's all I'm asking and under the Sunshine Law I'm requesting this. Thank you.

#### **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

**David Burke:** Thank you. Good morning Commissioners. Good morning Phil. I'm here representing the Board of Buena Vista Neighborhood Association. I'm here with three other Buena Vista members to update you briefly on the currently Buena Vista Park Assessment project and also to express the importance of Buena Vista being a named project on the 2020 Parks Bond. First of all thank you very much for approving this project, the assessment project back in August, and thanks to Recreation and Park for helping fund and partnering on this project. Thanks also to Miller Company, the lead landscape architect firm that's putting a lot into this project. And finally thanks to Recreation and Park for including a member of Buena Vista Neighbors on the park working group, appreciate that. A lot of progress has been made on this project so far assessing the park's condition and estimating the cost to restore the park. We expect much of this to be completed in early 2020 and ask that an overview be presented to the Commission this February. This project is in follow-up to the 2015 Capital Improvement planning project that took place between Recreation and Park and BVNA. We don't yet have updated cost estimates but we expect those to be at the same level or larger than the \$25-30 million that came out in 2015. There are three points I'd like to end on. Number one the, importance of preserving San Francisco's natural resources. This is central to Recreation and Park's mission statement for the 2020 Parks Bond and Buena Vista is certainly one of the City's most precious natural resources. Number two, it's widely believed that many of Buena Vista's core features are in poor or deficient condition and this project will contribute to the overall assessment of Buena Vista's conditions. And number three, as part of the Park Bond selection process Buena Vista should be viewed as a leveraged funding. Over the last decade Buena Vista has received \$1.3 million in capital expenditures and of that BVNA has helped raise \$500,000 over the last five years through add-backs and private donations. BVNA has also applied to two state and two city grant programs over the last five years and is continuing to research and develop other funding sources. Again, we hope to have an overview of this project presented to the Commission in February and please note BVNA is committed to helping with the passage of the 2020 Parks Bond. Thank you.

**Jean Lamantanzsky:** For the past 30 years I've had the privilege of living on the east slope of Buena Vista Park in the Park Hill Condominiums, the old St. Joseph's Children's Hospital. I enjoy having breakfast every morning looking over the magnificent overstory of Buena Vista Park and I'm here to speak for our park on behalf of the 136 homeowners in my Park Hill community. Buena Vista Park is an urban wonder. It's a natural urban forest. It's the oldest park in San Francisco's park system. It's the highest, most inland sand dune in the State of California. It has 36 acres with winding paths and sweeping views that incorporate three bridges. Buena Vista Park nourishes us but Buena Vista Park is in decline. It's been under-maintained for decades. It's chronically understaffed and chronically underfunded. Historically it's been served by two to three gardeners. Only recently we did get an acting Supervisor and his staff is up to four gardeners and with their hard work and care they're only holding the park together. Buena Vista Park has received less than \$1 million in funding in the past decade. The Department's 2020 Parks Bond mission statement includes the statement about improving sustainability. A sustainable urban forest at

Buena Vista Park could thin the overstory, improve the understory, and add plantings that would regenerate. We could create design guidelines for reforestation over time to make the park healthy again. If we make the park healthy again then the ongoing maintenance costs could level off and be sustainable. If the park continues to degenerate, the maintenance costs will continue to spike in response to the state of emergency it's in. Emergency responses to floods, landslides, erosion and most recently fires. A healthy park will attract private philanthropy. Together with Recreation and Park our neighborhood association is working on a needs assessment and cost analysis to make Buena Vista Park project ready. Buena Vista Park needs to be adequately funded by the next Park Bond. We need to take care of the park so it can continue to take care of us. Thank you.

**Stephanie Kiriakopolus:** I'm on the Buena Vista Neighborhood Association Parks Committee and I would like to speak from the perspective of families. I am a mother of two young children under the age of three and we are avid users of the park, both the playground, the pathways, going out and just exploring, picking up sticks, looking at leaves. It's a wonderful resource for families. I've lived in the area for the past 20 years and I have seen just in the last ten years the eight houses flanking either side of me have converted completely from houses that had no children at all to every single house now has children in it. We also have three public elementary schools that are very walking distance to Buena Vista Park and we have two private schools that cover K-12 grades. So we have a lot of schools, a lot of families, and there's a growing need to make the park safe and to maintain it in a sustainable way so that it is accessible and safe for families to go to. Of the ten-plus entries that there are to the park there are only two that are really useful or you're able to get into without going over off the side of the path or having to wander, you basically can't get through with a stroller except for two entries, one at the top and one at the bottom. And that's due to the fact that they're just not maintained pathways at the entry points. A lot of the paths you have to veer off the side because the stairs are falling apart and people are creating their own pathways because the pathways that are there have completely deteriorated. We as part of our work we love to bring in public donation because there are so many families that would love to support the park but in order to do so these families also need to see that the city is committed to committing support, significant financial support with the bonds in 2020. We'd love to see that our weekend warriors, neighbors that are coming in and working on the park and that are committed Recreation and Park team are not just putting out fires but are actually getting the support from the city that they can just be maintaining a very sustainable, very healthy park that is safe for everyone to use. We'd love the park to be more welcoming to everyone. Some people have even mentioned that they're fearful to go in with their kids because of how things are. And we really cherish our 36-acre park and don't want to see it continue to deteriorate. So we ask the Commission to support Buena Vista Park with a significant financial allocation in the next park bond. Thank you.

**Craig Latker:** I have lived near Buena Vista Park for over 35 years and have walked a dog in the park every day for the last 18 years so I can say I'm firsthand witness to the great beauty of the park but also to its unfortunate steady decline. My message for the committee today is that the needs assessment project has been going on for decades and now is the time to act. The Buena Vista Neighborhood Association has been working with Recreation and Park since the late 1970s. I have seen the proposal for the Master Plan in 1987 and very little of that work seems to have been implemented and personally have been involved with BVNA and this issue since 2015 Capital Improvement Plan started and we're waiting for those recommendations that came out of that process to be funded. And now, with the current evaluation that the neighborhood association has helped fund that Miller and Company is doing some very good work on and their proposals are being priced and you will see them shortly. So this project is very ready to go assuming that the bond passes and the funds are made available. So I hope that this committee does not kick the can down the road and that the bond passes and the funding is delayed again the park will just continue to decline and it would be a tragedy to lose the unique forested environment that Buena Vista provides in the very center of the City. So I hope that now with the proposed bond the time has finally come to provide the resources that park so desperately needs. Thank you.

**Matthew Blain:** This is picture of the Twin Peaks area. So I'm here today for the Strategic Plan update reminded me that perhaps the Commission wanted to hear about some of the work which is happening just outside of the edge of Recreation and Park and since the Strategic Plan is not including some cooperative things. So I'm here wearing two hats today, one of them you're very familiar with, S.F. Urban Riders. I want to talk about our project at Laguna Honda Hospital Rehabilitation Center. We've been working for several years on that. I know at least some of you on the dais have seen it. This year we had over a thousand volunteer hours, about 200 volunteers, and we had a grand opening celebrating that we've restored, about two miles of trail there in addition to some habitat. Supervisor Yee

was there that was funded by participatory budgeting. It was actually the number one voted thing in its category in that participatory budgeting. So as part of how does this fit in with the other Twin Peaks area things which is what that blurry map showed, something you might be interested in thinking about. And the other hat I'll wear is the Crosstown Trail hat. You may have seen the Crosstown Trail show up in a lot of press this year. This is part of the City's Strategic Plan and the trail runs from Candlestick Park up to Lands End and it's kind of cool, it connects neighborhoods to all these open spaces and sort of the fact there's a route, you can look at a paper map or online map or whatever, it has brought people—we see dozens of people every weekend. Somebody mentioned earlier like the southeast part of the city is unknown, like the Visitacion Valley greenway. There's been more people this year to the Visitacion Valley greenway than in the past twenty years. So we're proud of that and so it's great to see all these things happening. Thank you.

**Albert Sandoval:** Merry Christmas and I can't wait until the new year because we're going to be seeing each other a lot. So can you see the projection? I got this from the neighborhoods place down on the 1<sup>st</sup> floor, San Francisco Supervisor Districts. You can see here McLaren Park, this is District 9, 10, and 11. So at first I was raised in 10 and then they switched it to 9. Here it is, important park maintenance standards and report, fiscal year 2018-19. This is very important. I request the audit teams to add ADA when the Controller's Officer measures and analyzes and improves city services. Strategic Planning, equity analysis and metrics for fiscal year 2019, equity zones, October 17<sup>th</sup>, 2019, Recreation and Park Department. San Francisco park evaluation program evaluation forms. I've been doing a lot of reading, it puts me to sleep. ADA walking asphalt paths, curb cutouts, pretty basic. You know here it is—look at this. You see this? This is a play area for ADA. I got this a little while ago. See here? This is what you need to use for metrics and I'm talking about the Recreation and Park and the Controller's. I will continue and bring lots of people in here with disabilities to demand that this becomes part of your metrics system, your analysis, your Strategic Plan. So here it is. It says new construction, alterations, barrier removal, evaluation project, path travel component triggered by the work, route of travel from public transit. Parking—the parking is so out of compliance it's not even funny. Drinking fountains, I have a problem with that. Passenger loading zones. So I know most people don't go out to McLaren Park, I understand that but it is where we live. It is where the community uses it. We need this to change. We need you to add this to the park standards annual report and we're requesting the audit teams at the Controller's Office which I've been dealing with them and McLaren Park Recreation and Park Department at the lodge to work together to accomplish this. This is critical. San Francisco is known as all are included, including the disabled.

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

On motion by **Commissioner McDonnell** and duly seconded the following resolutions were unanimously adopted:

**RES. NO. 1912-001**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does approve the minutes from the October 2019 Joint Planning Commission and Recreation and Park Commission meeting.

**RES. NO. 1912-002**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does approve the following animal transactions for the San Francisco Zoological Society, which were processed under Resolution No. 13572.

<b>DONATION TO:</b>	<b>ANIMAL SPECIES</b>	<b>PRICE</b>	<b>TOTAL DUE</b>
<b>Zoo Boise 355 Julia Davis Drive Boise, ID 83702 208/608-7751</b>	<b>0.1 Magellanic penguin <u>Spheniscus magellanicus</u></b>	<b>NIL</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b>Fresno Chaffee Zoo 894 W Belmont Avenue Fresno, CA 93728-2891 559/498-5914</b>	<b>2.0 Common squirrel monkeys <u>Saimiri sciureus</u></b>	<b>NIL</b>	<b>N/A</b>

**RES. NO. 1912-003**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does accept from the Tenderloin Housing Clinic, an in kind grant valued at approximately \$50,000 to support a decorative fence and a tile mosaic project in Sergeant John Macaulay Park; and to accept from Veritas Investment, an in kind grant valued at approximately \$25,000 to support a tile mosaic project in Turk Hyde Mini Park.

**RES. NO. 1912-004**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does approve a contract with ESA, Inc for environmental review for Portsmouth Square in an amount not to exceed \$240,169.

**RES. NO. 1912-005**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does amend the construction contract with CLW Builders, Inc. for the Willie “Woo Woo” Wong Playground Renovation Project (Contract No. 1000008750) to increase the contract amount by up to \$500,000, bringing the total to \$10,271,960, which is greater than 10% over the original approved contract amount of \$9,771,960; and to amend the design services contract with CMG Landscape Architecture for the Willie “Woo Woo” Wong Playground Renovation Project to increase the contract amount by \$250,000, bringing the total to \$1,550,000, which is greater than previously approved contract amount of \$1,300,000.

**RES. NO. 1912-006**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does amend the construction contract with JDB & Sons Construction, Inc, for Shoreview Park Renovation Project (Contract ID No. 1000013711 (R)), to increase the contract amount by up to \$478,400 bringing the total to \$2,262,400, which is greater than 10% over the original approved contract amount of \$1,784,000.

**RES. NO. 1912-007**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does approve the Operational Plan for FY21-22.

**RES. NO. 1912-008**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does approve the allocation of \$1,341,455 from the Open Space Fund Contingency Reserve (Deferred Maintenance Reserve sub-fund) for infrastructure deferred maintenance projects.

**RES. NO. 1912-009**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does allocate \$220,000 from the Open Space Fund Contingency Reserve – Commissioners’ Projects to fund the replacement of the safety surface of the Children's Play Area.

**SAN FRANCISCO ZOO**

**Vince Grubbs:** Good morning, I’m the CFO of the Zoo. Our yearlong 90<sup>th</sup> anniversary celebration concludes in December, highlighted this month by our Joy at the Zoo festivities that goes through the end of the year.

Our orangutans Judy and Beroni had the chance this week to explore the outdoor habitat of Great Ape Passage. While Judy has experienced the larger yard already this was Beroni’s first time. He was very tentative and shy at first but soon followed Judy into the yard. Animal staff will continue to provide access and a shared rotation with the chimpanzees as we continue to acclimate both species to their new habitat.

Earlier this month the Zoo hosted the San Francisco Fire Department and over 100 kids age 5-12 for a day of Hawaiian fun with food, hula, hip hop, and lei making. The rest of the day centered around cultural awareness and self-esteem. All kids went home with toys thanks to the SFFD and the toy drive. This is our third year to do this.

If you’re looking for the perfect holiday gift an annual membership to the Zoo is a gift that keeps on giving, offering unlimited year-around admission and how through Christmas all members gifting memberships will receive an additional bonus month added to their own memberships.

In honor Ugly Holiday Sweater Day on December 20<sup>th</sup> we invite you to show off your ugly holiday sweaters at the Zoo all weekend long. On the 20<sup>th</sup> the first 20 guests in their ugly holiday sweaters will receive a free zoo key. Also, make sure to tag us in any of your social media posts and we’ll share our favorite photos.

There's still time to meet Santa and his elves at Tinsel Town with extended hours Friday through Monday, December 20-23. Joy at the Zoo will continue daily through January 1<sup>st</sup> with Santa, reindeer, carolers, cookie making and other activities and yes, just like we're open Thanksgiving, New Years Day, Labor Day, and every other day of the year we're open on Christmas Day and Santa will be busy that day but some of his reindeer will be on site and we wanted to thank all of our staff for working the holidays. Thank you.

### **GOLDEN GATE PARK 150<sup>TH</sup> ANNIVERSARY – CELEBRATION EVENT AND GOLDEN GATE PARK 150<sup>TH</sup> ANNIVERSARY – TEMPORARY OBSERVATION WHEEL INSTALLATION**

**Lisa Bransten:** Good morning Commissioner and General Manager. I'm the Director of Partnerships at Recreation and Park. It's actually a pleasure to be here in the dead of winter but thinking forward to celebration and fun for next spring that we hope will inspire gratitude for what our forbearers created and also the spirit of community for the city.

So I'm going to take two items together. I'll read you the agenda language for both and then I'll walk through one and then the other and I'm happy to answer any questions at the end.

So the items before you today are discussion and possible action to authority the Department to grant a permit to the San Francisco Parks Alliance to produce a celebration of Golden Gate Park's 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary on April 4<sup>th</sup> 2020 with a variety of activation events including food, music, activities and the closure of all roads in Golden Gate Park except Kezar Drive, Crossover Drive, and the Great Highway, from 5:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. on April 4<sup>th</sup>, 2020.

And then the second item I'll ask you to consider is discussion and possible action to authorize the Department to enter into a permit with Skystar Wheel LLC for the temporary installation not to exceed one year of an observation wheel on the eastern side of the music concourse area located beyond the music concourse bowl, behind the Francis Scott Key monument and bordering Music Concourse Drive with terms substantially the same as the term sheet dated December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2019. Approval of this proposed action by the Commission is the approval action as defined by the San Francisco Administrative Code, Chapter 31.

So first, the event. I want to start by saying this event is truly a partnership with the San Francisco Parks Alliance and it's really been a pleasure to work with them for more than a year in planning this.

Golden Gate Park has always been a magical place. In its boundaries people have come together on momentous occasions including the aftermath of the 1906 earthquake and the Summer of Love or for annual concerts, races, and other events. It's also a place where people can come to experience nature right inside the city limits with a hike or picnic or to experience a special measure or garden. In 2020 we want to recreate, create, and celebrate the joy and magic of this San Francisco treasure past, present, and future.

While we're only talking about the permit for the event I just wanted to take you through a little bit of the plan for the celebration to put it in the context of the year.

So first a little history. The boundaries of the park were set by the State Legislature on April 4<sup>th</sup>, 1870. Luckily for us 150 years later April 4<sup>th</sup>, 2020, falls on a Saturday. So somebody wanted this to happen. The city founders with the designation of the park wanted a park like Central Park so they brought the designer of Central Park Frederick Law Olmstead out to San Francisco to design a park. He took one look at the sand dunes on offer for the park area said it can't be done and turned on his heels and left. Now, part of that story may be apocryphal but what is true is that horticulturalist John McLaren and engineer William Hammond Hall figured out a way to make things grow in the sand, really representing the creativity, determination and can-do spirit that has always embodied San Francisco.

Today the 1017 acres of parkland, about 175 acres bigger than Central Park, feature gardens, playgrounds, trails, athletic fields and an array of cultural venues. So, the event is being organized by the Department and our nonprofit partner the San Francisco Parks Alliance under the leadership of an honorary committee led by Mayor Breed and five distinguished co-chairs.

One of the primary goals of April 4<sup>th</sup> and the yearlong celebration is to celebrate Golden Gate Park as everybody's park. This includes partnering with the small groups that steward so much of the park and reaching beyond the park to ensure groups all over the City get to experience the park during this special year. We're planning free shuttles to the park on Saturdays, particularly from equity zone neighborhoods. And on April 4<sup>th</sup> and through the year we'll bring neighborhood cultural groups to perform on the band shell stage in the music concourse and elsewhere in the park.

So today we've formally partnered with more than 75 community groups, many of who will activate parts of the park and provide volunteers on April 4<sup>th</sup> and we are in process with dozens more and will certainly get to a 150 partners by April 4<sup>th</sup>.

We also have a wonderful list of the City's most important cultural institutions and sponsors. All of these partners will help create a year of celebration in the Park and around the City. Each event with its own special celebration flavor. Outside of the Park for example there will be a photograph exhibit at Terminal 3 of the Airport and the anniversary will be the focus of the public library's summer stride reading program at all 28 city branches.

Of course the cornerstone of the celebration will be the April 4<sup>th</sup> community day, exactly 150 years from the founding of the park. You'll see from the map of the event but we're planning to light up every corner of Golden Gate Park—I mean that figuratively because most of the activities will be in the day—but to activate every corner of Golden Gate Park from 10:00 a.m. to approximately 5:00 p.m. through the park with some events continuing into the evening in the Music Concourse. There will be lawn bowling, model yacht racing, casting at the Angler's Lodge, horseback rides, vintage baseball, soccer clinics and more. The event will feature a kids' carnival, musical performances, food, and as I said events at the music concourse including of course the wheel, which I'll get to in a moment.

So in order to deal with the enormity of what is available in Golden Gate Park and what Golden Gate Park represents we've divided the celebration into four basic tracks—history and people; science, technology and nature; recreation and wellness; and creativity and the arts.

Park visitors on April 4<sup>th</sup> will be able to plan their visit according to those tracks. As you'll see on the map there's different colors for different content areas so if you're interested in recreation and wellness you'll be able to find those activities. There will be arts activities, there will be science activities. One of the things that I'm excited about is we're going to take the irrigation project going on in Golden Gate Park right now which will ultimately be the largest urban water reclamation park in the country and we'll highlight that as part of the nature and environment track. We'll have a great blue heron watch. There will be a heritage picnic. The Museum of Craft and Design is going to come and help make flowered headbands for visitors. And there will be a kids' carnival at Robin Williams Meadow.

So, some of the more nitty-gritty planning pieces. In order to move people safely around the park and really to harkens back to the park's history before there were cars we'll close nearly all the roads in the park, leaving open Kezar Drive, Crossover Drive, and the Great Highway as important city arteries. We'll provide alternate transportation to help people in the park get around including shuttles, bike and adaptive bike rentals, scooter rentals, horse and carriage rides and more to come.

Then in terms of broader transportation planning we do recognize that this one-time celebration may affect the surrounding neighborhoods and we're working with the neighborhoods to reduce the affects. So some of the measures that we're taking right now is working with the MTA to provide alternative or increased MUNI service, to keep Kezar, Crossover and the Great Highway open, publicizing the event and any traffic changes in advance and then we'll be doing extensive publicity about the lack of parking and the need for people to take public transportation and we will highlight the limited available parking around the park and we'll also work with the MTA to reroute the 44 O'Shaughnessy which is the only MUNI line that would be impacted by the road closures.

I just wanted to add that as I mentioned we'll continue to do extensive outreach and engage but we've already done quite a lot and frankly the enthusiasm has been inspiring. So it's really helped up frame a lot of these plans. We've had two community meetings. One in May at the Koret Auditorium in an effort to have the planning meeting not be



in the park and continue the move to make sure this was something for the whole city and not just the neighbors of the park and then we had a community meeting in September at the Orchid Pavilion next to the Conservatory of Flowers. There were nearly 100 people at the September meeting. They generated 175 ideas for what they wanted to see in the celebration and out of that meeting and other outreach efforts came the work with groups who about 79 of whom have signed formal partnership agreements and those allow them to use our beautiful logo in their materials and also ask them to commit at least one volunteer to help us run the event. So it's been a really nice partnership with all of these groups so far, if only we could do every single idea that they suggested.

So onto the wheel which is of course going to be a central piece of the April 4<sup>th</sup> celebration and beyond. The 150-foot wheel that we're planning in the music concourse harkens back to the first wheel which was placed in Golden Gate Park in 1894 as part of the Midwinter Fair. Bringing the observation wheel to Golden Gate Park will enable the Department to highlight and celebrate the anniversary, drawing many visitors to Golden Gate Park during this yearlong celebration and will help visitors experience the fun and grandeur of the 1894 Midwinter Exposition.

On to the logistics of the wheel. I want to be very clear that the wheel there's no cost to the city or the Department for the wheel. In fact we expect it to generate funding that will help support these festivities. The operator will build out, operate and dismantle the wheel. The operator will reimburse the Department to restore the permit area to the pre-installation condition. The way that the wheel generates revenue for the Department is that the operator will pay \$1 per general admission ticket sold to the Department and 75 cents per senior or youth ticket sold to the Department. The pricing of the wheel is \$18 for a general admission ticket, \$12 for seniors and youth under 13 and there's a number of community benefits that we've negotiated with the wheel operator. So those include free rides to the public on the April 4<sup>th</sup> community day and also 500 complimentary tickets per month which we'll use to ensure that low income residents of the city have access to the ride. And then in addition they're offering us 25 VIP experience packages.

Just a little bit about the logistics of the installation. I know this map isn't super-easy to read but you'll see in the upper-right corner the proposed installation area which is at the north—excuse me, the east end of the music concourse. The installation is well away from the parts of the garage which are underneath the music concourse and those blue rectangles represent the parking garage underneath the music concourse with the tunnel between those two sections of the garage. The wheel is about 130 feet in diameter and 150 feet tall. The base is 72 feet by 57 feet and the installation will include temporary fencing, support, fixtures and lighting. In terms of seismic safety the support fixtures includes 24-inch piers at a depth to be finalized by the geotech report on an 8-foot by 8-foot platform. And in fact I believe we did just finish the geotech report and the piers are going to be 40 to 46 feet deep. We did have a categorical exemption issued and other approvals are in process. Construction won't begin until those other approvals happen. Just so you know what the other approvals are, the State needs to approve the amusement park ride through the Department of Industrial relations. The Department of Building Inspection will issue a foundation permit and since this is a landmarked area the Historical Preservation Commission will issue a certificate of appropriateness and that hearing is scheduled for January 15<sup>th</sup>.

I want to close with why we're doing this. So both the wheel and the community day are designed to celebrate the park's past, present, and future and it's important internationally, regionally, and to every neighborhood in San Francisco. We want to inspire at least 150,000 people to come to the park on April 4<sup>th</sup>, probably a lot more, and millions more to visit throughout this special year. And we want to build awareness and advocacy for the park and increase membership in all of the community groups in the park and around San Francisco that steward and support what the park means to the city.

Thank you very much and I'm happy to answer any questions.

**Drew:** (Support) Good morning. I would probably say this is one of my favorite things that I've ever spoken on because celebrating this amazing public space and park, cities don't get a chance to do that this much and as you can tell, every 150 years. It is truly going to be I think a remarkable experience for the city and for every single resident in San Francisco but also in the bigger Bay Area. I just want to say the narrative of San Francisco right now is not always happy when you hear about our public spaces and our public realm. I think next year we can use this celebration to help change and curate that narrative because we have one of the best parks in the whole world right here and that's Golden Gate Park. Next year having over 150 community groups, all of us focused on Golden Gate

Park, celebrating the amazing things that it has done with this city is really going to be truly remarkable. One of the things that we've been doing is going out and raising money for this with Lisa and other folks and people always ask what would be your sign of success for the Golden Gate Park 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary? One of the things you see the thing that makes this park so amazing is the actual things that happen in it, the things that people do every day, the groups that make this park special. Some of them are getting older or more mature and need to have the injection of some new life. One of the goals here is to introduce new people and ideas into the park so I'm going to take the model yacht basin. When Phil first showed me that and went to the model yacht club I was literally was like a little kid in a toy store and I just could not believe that people were building these boats and then they'd go out there and do it. I mean I go out there with my dog and watch those boats all the time and it is truly relaxing and great. So if I can find and we can find that next person through Golden Gate Park 150 that can help that organization for the next 10, 15, or 20 years to survive and transform itself we would have been a success with the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary. We also want to introduce the park to new things. Who knows, maybe we'll have a drone club. You never know what will happen and who will get inspired through the Golden Gate Park 150<sup>th</sup>. So I just want to say we are truly excited to partner with the Department on this. I think it's going to be a celebration of epic proportions that we're all going to have a lot of fun doing. I think next year 2020 is going to be an interesting year with everything going on in the national stage and parks are the biggest park of democracy that we have open to everyone and we should open that and be a part of that piece as part of the 150<sup>th</sup>. I would also like to say it is pretty amazing that we're going to close this park for one day to cars and I'm excited to have that happen.

**Michael Lambert:** (Support) I'm your City Librarian. As Department head for the San Francisco Public Library I want to thank all of you and the General Manager for the opportunity to partner with the Recreation and Park Department on Golden Gate Park 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary. The park, like the library, is a very special place for the community, enhancing quality of life for San Francisco's residents. It's a place where residents can be inspired, make connections, and enjoy the company of one another. Above all, as the previous speaker mentioned a place where all are welcome every day. For me Golden Gate Park is one of my happy places. I'm a big fan of the disk golf course. It is one of the finest such course in all of California. I can't thank you enough for the excellent stewardship of this park and all the neighborhood playgrounds, parks and facilities that make San Francisco so livable. It's a true testament to your leadership and dedication to the city. This coming year in celebration of Golden Gate Park's history we are tying the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary to our signature summer stride summer learning program. This is the single largest program that we do all year, all aimed at ensuring children in San Francisco keep reading and learning during the summer months. Last year we engaged more than 35,000 in this program and we open it up to all ages so that everyone in every neighborhood in San Francisco can benefit from the library's push towards more books, learning, free events, and amazing prizes. As part of our partnership we will be featuring Golden Gate Park on all of our materials including the game board that allows people to track their reading and the program guide, all of our advertising and bookmarks. We will be exhibiting displays at every one of our 28 library locations that highlight both the history of Golden Gate Park and all the amenities available in the park. We're continuing to work with the Recreation and Park team to see about how we can encourage families to take free shuttle busses from the farther flung library locations in our city straight to Golden Gate Park because we know that transportation can sometimes be a barrier to access. Finally, watch for the library to really commemorate the park in a special way with a limited edition Golden Gate Park library card coming this spring. We love our libraries and we love our parks and I know that all San Franciscans love them too. Thank you.

**Tom Steele:** (Support) I'm here to represent Flagging in the Park. We're a small grassroots group who organize community building gatherings in the National AIDS Memorial Grove five times a year which I assume most of you aren't familiar with except perhaps for Phil. These events started 23 years ago at the height of the AIDS epidemic when a small group of friends gathered in the newly established grove to celebrate still being alive in the face of a very uncertain future. As well as to remember those already lost to the plague these folks got together to do this by dancing together with a vibrant silk flags such as these. They look like this. Now to some it may seem inappropriate to have a throng of dancers swirling around brightly to music in the heart of this sanctuary of remembrance. But we believe those who've we've lost tragically so young would want to be remembered for their vibrant lives. Our events are always free and typically well-attended by regulars for whom we feel we provide an uplifting experience in these times of growing isolation in our society. To expand beyond our established crowd we're very excited to be embraced as part of the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary. I think we feel we do our own little thing in the park on our own and most people don't notice we do it and most of society is not aware of what we do. So we're very happy to arrange a special event that day to demonstrate the diverse vibrancy of our magnificent park and especially to showcase the

beautiful AIDS Memorial Grove to the broader public with whom we'll be happy to share basic tips and tricks on how to dance with flags, bands, and hoops. I hope we'll see some of you there.

**Audrey Ingalls:** (Support) I'm here on behalf of the Jamestown Community Center where I am the arts program manager. Our two organizations merged a couple of years ago and now as one are serving thousands of students and families in our afterschool programs and other programs throughout our community. When we heard about this possible historic celebration event we wanted to come support the bid and after seeing the presentation Lisa just gave I'm even more excited. One of our programs is a Loco Bloco performing ensemble that has been around for over 25 years now. This is our most dedicated group of high school and transitional aged youth performers who have not only performed all over San Francisco and the greater Bay Area but also around the world. These students meet once a week year around to hone their skills as what we call artifice. One of our core values as an organization is art-ivision which is a combination of the words art and activism. This is a use of our use of our skills and talents as artists to effect change in our world. These students are dancers and drummers and stilt performers and singers and music producers and costume designers who use their talents to bring awareness to different issues affecting our communities whether through drumming or direct actions or full-blown theater works on relevant issues written and performed by our youth and everything in between. Loco Bloco as an organization was also named this year to the YBCA 100 list celebrating the people, organizations and movement shifting culture through their idea, art, and activism. We strive to provide our performers with a variety of opportunities to perform within our community and greater city. Most if not all our students and art program staff have grown up their whole lives in San Francisco and I'm sure as I do have many memories of Golden Gate Park whether from going to the playground or different musical and other events or watching the infamous Hippy Hill drum circle or visiting the museums and other attractions throughout the park. This celebration of Golden Gate Park would not just be celebrating a park of land and tress but celebrating San Francisco and its long history of dedication to the arts as evidenced throughout Golden Gate Park and other parks throughout the city. Our performing ensemble just this past year performed at the Academy of Sciences themselves and perform at Jerry Garcia Amphitheater every year. Many of our students throughout the years have also made great use of the Recreation and Park Department's programs and have worked as student counselors. I was even just telling my own 14-year-old daughter that she should get a job with Recreation and Park because it would lead to great opportunities for her in the future. But we all as individuals and as community value our parks and the opportunities for enrichment they have provided us. It would mean a lot for our students to be able to perform at such a historic event as they watch their community shift and change to unfamiliar territory as their friends and families are displaced and they understand that as young folks of color performing musical and dance from Afro-Latino traditions their performance itself is an act of empowerment and the declaration that they are still here and that they matter. We would love for the city to say that to them themselves by inviting them to perform at such a historic event and I encourage you all to take the time later to actually look them up, to see their faces and see what it is that they do because they're my pride and joy in my work and I think you guys would feel the same.

**Bob Fiedler:** (Support) Good morning. I'm the Executive Director of the Stern Grove Festival and I'm simply here to indicate our support for intent to participate in the Golden Gate Park anniversary celebration. Given we plan to do that by providing local artists and musicians to perform in different locations at different times throughout the celebration and given that the theme is that it's everybody's part that really marries quite well with our ethos and we plan to provide a lot of diversity in those musicians and hopefully highlight some different neighborhoods and different things to welcome everybody to the park. So given our 83 years of partnership with the Recreation and Park Department for which we're extremely grateful we're just delighted and honored to be part of this celebration. Thank you.

**Commissioner Buell:** Commissioner Low.

**Commissioner Low:** I was just about to say I think we should take these up separately and each separate motions and for Item 7 I would move to approve.

On motion by **Commissioner Low** and duly seconded the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

**RES. NO. 1912-010**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does authorize the Department to grant a permit to the San Francisco Parks Alliance to produce a celebration of Golden Gate Park's 150th Anniversary on April 4, 2020 with a variety of activation events including food, music and activities and the closure of all roads in Golden Gate Park except Kezar Drive and the Great Highway from 5 am to 10 pm on April 4, 2020.

**Commissioner Low:** On Item 8 I think we should be in the practice of getting a Certificate of Appropriateness first before coming to this Commission and I understand that's not going to be heard until January 15<sup>th</sup>. I will move to advance this matter but I think that the better practice is that before coming to this Commission and when this Commission is the last stop of approval that we should have the certificate in front of us. Second, I wanted to note that in our Board packet that was attached was a term sheet, it wasn't the actual agreement. I understand there's an agreement to come later but again I think this should be a practice where if this is the authorizing act under Chapter 31 we should have the actual agreement, not the term sheet. On that basis I would like to first note that under Article 7 of the Park Code this does give this Commission the authority to approve the observation wheel and would move to approve advance to authorize the General Manager to enter into negotiations for the issuance of the permit but would want the General Manager to come back to us on our next Commission meeting and January to report back that one, the Certificate of Appropriateness was issued by the Historic Preservation Commission and two, to report back that indeed the agreement and permit that was issued to the operator is on the same terms and conditions that was in our Commission package.

On motion by **Commissioner Low** and duly seconded the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

**RES. NO. 1912-011**

**RESOLVED**, This Commission does authorize the Department to enter into a permit with SkyStar Wheel, LLC for the temporary installation (not to exceed one year) of an observation wheel on the eastern side of the Music Concourse area located beyond the Music Concourse Bowl behind the Francis Scott Key monument and bordering Music Concourse Drive with terms substantially the same as the term sheet dated October 22, 2019. Approval of this proposed action by the Commission is the Approval Action as defined by S.F. Administrative Code Chapter 31.

**PARK MAINTENANCE STANDARDS ANNUAL REPORT**

**Ben:** Good morning Commissioners, Phil. I am with the Recreation and Park Department and I am one of the administrators for the Park Maintenance Standards Program we have here that's running alongside with the Controller's Office and I'm here to introduce to you the 14<sup>th</sup> annual Park Maintenance Standards Report.

For me personally this is my second year as part of the program and I am very excited to present to you our scores. What's new this year is that we decided to take a deeper dive into the scores. We decided to dissect it to an additional layer so we could get more of the data. Also, we are during this presentation going to show you the Controller's Office online dashboard. It is interactive where members of the public and people such as yourselves can go online, look up your favorite parks and learn a little more about their scores.

I will now introduce to you Alice and Emily from the Controller's Office who will complete the rest of the presentation.

**Alice:** I am again very proud to present this report. It was a great team effort, as always a collaboration between the Controller and Recreation and Park. I'm going to go through quickly some high level summaries that we took out of the report and then Emily will spend most of the time walking you through this incredible new dashboard we have that allows everyone from RPD staff all the way to the public to explore the data as much as they want.

Before I get into the scores I did want to remind everyone how this program works. There is an evaluation form for every park. In fact some parks are so large they're split up into smaller sections. There's a set of standard criteria which needs to be met and each park is broken up into segments called features. For example children's play areas are one feature. Trees are another. And then an aggregate score is made and so we can look at overall scores for all parks. We can look at changing scores over time but we can also drill down deeper and say what about certain parks or in what sections or areas in certain parks are things going well or do things need improvement in.

This year in fiscal year 19 the average score was 92% which as you can see is an increase from prior years. We are increasing slowly every year. You can see one of the main drivers of this increase is actually just a decrease in the overall spread. So for several years we would have very outliers that were extreme lows, so I think 60% is one of our lowest scores, and this year we don't see any park making less than about 77%. So that's what's driving the increase in mean is that decrease of spread. So that means throughout the City wherever you are and whatever park you go to your experience will be more similar to someone else in a different part of the City.

However, as we've presented before we do continue to see a geographic disparity between the north and the south. So there are no top scoring parks really in the southern half of the city. This is a map of the ten top scoring and ten lowest scoring parks in the city.

What I want to talk about a little bit is something new that we've started to do this year, we've created a methodology to kind of group the kinds of criteria that we look at. So we look at things like is there a certain amount of litter or graffiti anywhere in certain features and that would be something we call cleanup maintenance. We can also see things like is a wooden slat loose on a bench which is dangerous. These are things that we consider routine maintenance that require specialized skills to clean up but we have those specialized staff and the resources to do so. And then the final category we've created is repair. These are repairs that are structural problems that are going to take a larger budget and a much longer timeframe to fix.

So we wanted to create these categories in order to help our staff determine not just which parks are struggling and where but what will it take to improve their response to these parks. It's a very different resource allocation to address problems of litter than cracks in asphalt.

So while we are still perfecting the methodology we were able to find some kind of interesting first takes, one of which we just looked at the extremes, which parks are on the kind of each end of the spectrum that need the most help with cleanup versus need the most help with repair and so we pulled out two examples of these extremes. We can compare Hilltop Park which is the majority needing cleanup help and repair and we've seen Hilltop Park has struggled a lot with graffiti in the past so that may be what's driving this category breakdown for Hilltop. And then McKinley Square on the other end it has more structural problems, so cracks in the asphalt for example. So when our staff looks at these or the RPD staff looks at these they can kind of approach it differently.

I'm now going to turn it over to Emily who will take you through the online dashboard.

**Emily:** Thanks Alice. I'm with the Controller's Office as well. We heard from you all actually last year and in previous years that you're really interested in the accessibility of this information. This is a really data-rich program and we produce a lot of reports but how can residents and operational staff as well kind of leverage this data. So that's what we really—that was the lens we were taking, we were updating our dashboard to make sure that this data was more accessible or understandable.

So I'm just going to walk you through the dashboard now so you all kind of will see exactly where you can find it and what you can expect to find there.

Our overall park maintenance scores site from the Controller's Office side is just [sfcontroller.org/parks-scores](http://sfcontroller.org/parks-scores). So on that page you'll find all of our reports from previous years including this one and then also a link to our dashboard right here in the middle. Once you follow that link you'll get to the dashboard and land on this landing page. We have an information just about the program itself, how these scores are calculated, which parks are included, etc. So that kind of program level information here at the front and then these tabs are really where you can dive into the data.

Let's take a look at the first one, the citywide trends tab. Within this tab you can see there's a further breakdown that you can follow, so you can look at citywide score, like look at the citywide park score. And here this is where the dashboard is interactive. So here we're seeing these are all the sites that are evaluated here on the map on the right and in this table in this graph you can see you're looking at the citywide average park score over time, over the last five fiscal years. You can change that graph to show how the minimum score has changed which Alice just highlighted. So by clicking minimum score you can see this now changes to represent the minimum score and

you've seen that increase over time. You could also look at the standard deviation which is a measure of how spread-out the scores are. We've seen that has decreased over the last five years as well.

You can also look on this same citywide trends tab the highest and lowest-scoring parks which we cover every single year and you can see all of the years of this data. So you can look back in a way that was more difficult just looking through PDF reports. Now you can look and easily click through the past five fiscal years and see where the top ten and bottom ten maintenance scored parks are. And then you can even click on those specific parks. So if you're interested in one of the highest or lowest scores—here we can click on Buchanan Street Mall, one of the lowest-scoring parks this year and it will not only adjust to zoom in on that park but will show you the feature scores at that park as Alice mentioned. Sites are divided into separate features like lawns, hardscape, etc. And you can actually see that kind of granular data for each park here for the highest and lowest-scoring parks.

So this is all within the citywide trends tab but I want to take you through the other tabs just briefly. Obviously you can explore this at your leisure at home. The park lookup I think is one of the most exciting new tabs because it's something that wasn't accessible in our other types of reporting but now you can look up any park and find information about that park. So you can just search a park by typing it in or just select one, for example Alice Chalmers. When you've selected a park you'll see that the map zooms in on where that site is and then you'll see over time how that park has been scoring in their annual scores as compared to the citywide average which is that gray line. And then below you'll see the feature scores at that selected park and how those feature scores compare to the citywide average feature scores for each feature. So where is my neighborhood park really shining compared to other parks in the city or where is it struggling as far as maintenance? I think this is an amazing resource for residence. My friends have already been using it to look up our neighborhood parks.

I'll quickly go through the other three tabs. The District tab is Supervisor Districts. This one has a map shaded by the average park maintenance score for each Supervisor District. You can just click on any District. So I'll click District 11 here to see its average score and then all of the parks that were within that Supervisor District their annual park score and how that compared to the citywide average. So a key finding here from the report was District 11 has been the lowest-scoring Supervisor District in terms of the average park maintenance score for the last five years. So you can see those trends over time and you can select the fiscal year here to track those.

The equity zone portion is another section of the report but now you can slice and dice and see this over time again by filtering by year. It will show you the different parks that were labeled as equity zone in that year and these histograms to the right show the score distribution for equity zones and non-equity zone parks.

Finally, this is—I'm not going to go into all of these because this is really where the dashboard is a choose your own adventure situation. Every single park's feature here is listed for users to interact with. So maybe I'm really interested in children's play areas in particular. We can click on children's play areas and then really go into a deep dive. This is showing fiscal year 19 data but you could select a different years. There's some quick statistics. So how many children's play areas did we evaluate? A 161. They had an average score of 84. The map down here shows all of those children's play areas plotted and then you can see all the score distribution for those children's play areas. There's a lot of different ways to interact at this point. I'm not going to go into it but you can scroll and see all the children's play areas ranked by score. You could try to click on them from the map or you could even see what are all the 100 percenters. You could click on the histogram and then the map will filter to show you all those 100 percenters. You could do that as well for lowest scores and again you could do this for every feature.

So this is a lot, I won't go through all of it but we're really excited with this new improvement this year and hope to make improvements in the future for usability.

I just have one more slide for you all which is next steps in our improvements to the program. So something we haven't spoken about is the data collection of this data, that's done by staff members both in the Controller's Office and in Recreation and Park. They're currently using more of an outdated app that's going to be transitioning over into a new mobile app through ESRI which is a very advanced mapping tool that we actually use to build the website that will be built, the data collection tool will be built in that app. Alice has been working on this with a lot of team members from Recreation and Park and they will be working to implement this tool in the next fiscal year. So that's kind of our biggest task of improving that. We'll also expand the maintenance type analysis Alice just

spoke about, that's kind of in the preliminary stages now but we think it's really promising to look at this data in a new way.

And then finally I wanted to highlight for you something that we highlighted in the report which is inter-rater reliability. So that's specifically looking at we have dozens of evaluators, over a hundred in both Departments, that are going out with the standards to be able to evaluate parks. It's crucial for the validity of this data that everyone is applying the standards in the same way and able to identify the same types of issues across time and across parks. So we're going to be looking at ways we can examine the data to test for that reliability to ensure that this data is valid over time. That's something we've been interested but we want to expand that analysis in the future.

We look forward to your questions. Thank you.

**Commissioner Buell:** Thank you. A very interesting presentation.

**Richard Fong:** (Neutral) This is interesting what she's talking about, standard deviations we've got to get into statistical mechanics. When I look at it it would be the application, how do you apply standard deviation. She just tried to explain to us. She's talking about how the numbers as it decreases there's less deviation but then there's another part to it. Of the averages there's also the tea statistics to it, of averages that can be thrown out. I've been looking it over and I kind of seem to come up with what's the lowest score such as McKinley it should be immediate attention but then it wouldn't be so much of a drag on the other scores. So to make it more useful of this type of Controller evaluation it would be probably something I would think about as money where they would be allocating from park maintenance, deferred maintenance, what are the fundings available to immediate deal with a stat location such as McKinley. Meanwhile as I looked through all this it looks great but there's been a continual increase of the park maintenance I would like to commend Operations Director Denny Kern to keep up the good work and hopefully we can get your scores up. Thank you.

**Albert Sandoval:** (Oppose) Good morning. So right here you're looking at the October 17<sup>th</sup>, 2019, Recreation and Park Commission, Taylor Emerson manager, Strategic Planning. Subject, equity analysis and metrics. So basically it's about the equity analysis and metrics, fiscal year 2019, discussion and possible action. So there's an issue with that I have and here we go. So this is change in park score, figure 5, the largest increases and decreases in park scores fiscal year 2018 and 2019. Well guess what? Table 4, largest decreases in park, not increases, decreases, decline in park scores. The young lady just mentioned the last five years in a row. But here it is, ranked park name, 165, Louis Sutter Playground. The scores are 85% for fiscal year 18 and fiscal year 19 is a 77%, the change is minus 7%. Here is what the young lady was talking about. This is actually Louis Sutter Playground and this is the playground scores, citywide scores, and this is useful for the public to look at this on the internet. It shows the decline. Here's a map. This map shows southeast district. This is the equity zones. The equity zones show Recreation and Park parks within equity zones, Recreation and Park Department parks and other parks. Basically your guys everything doesn't lie. It's all here. I'm not making this up, I'm just doing a lot of research. Here it is again, 2015, 81.19. I'm real suspect about these numbers. District 9, Park Service Area 3. I'm very concerned about the numbers. I think they're lower than what you guys are saying they are. So total managed assets with Louis Sutter Playground, equity metrics with fiscal year 19. Average parks evaluation score, annual appropriate ADA, and the fiscal year 20-24 updated initiatives, ADA compliance needed accessibility for the disabled. Equity deficiencies, equity analysis, equity metrics, subsection H1 and shall include strategies to mitigate any equity deficiencies identified in the plan. Is McLaren Park and Louis Sutter playground targeted fiscal year 2000? One more. San Francisco park maintenance scores fiscal year 19 evaluation data. I need to talk to somebody. I call. I want somebody from the lodge, thank you.

**General Manager Ginsburg:** I just wanted to thank the partnership with the Controller's Office, Emily and Alice. They're like the Moneyball Team of park scores. We've got data that we can slice and dice in any particular way. The project has evolved significantly over the last ten years. I also want to thank Ben for his management of our program and of course Denny and Lydia who have been around. This is a really good tool. So you know how it works this morning before I came here I was doing my park inspection in Section 1 in the fuchsia dell of Golden Gate Park and if anyone would ever like to take a walk and do a park inspection we've got the tool on our apps and we get to walk around the park and observe and evaluate. It's pretty cool.

**Commissioner Buell:** Seeing no other comments that was information only. Thank you, it is great information and a great app and we'll continue to enjoy it and congratulations to the staff, the numbers keep getting better.

#### **COMMISSIONERS' MATTERS**

**Commissioner Low:** Just one. I think I would want to direct the Commission secretary to work with the Permits and Reservations staff on updating the Permits and Reservation policy. I think it needs to be updated.

**Commissioner Buell:** Thank you Commissioners.

#### **COMMUNICATIONS**

**Albert Sandoval:** Again, Albert Sandoval, southeast district. Advocate for the ADA and Friends of McLaren Park. I've been here since 61 so it's been a long haul. You know, when I got this announcement and I went online the server doesn't work. So in other words I can't do it from home so I had to go to the actual where over here on the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor I believe it is where they have all—they put out these—I know you guys supply it but then there's the Commission documents. I really apologize, I'm really tired. And to get that information was extremely difficult. Even they had an extremely difficult time trying to navigate the computer. This is in City Hall. So I think under the Sunshine Law I'm requesting for this information that you guys use to make a decision, all you Commissioners—and I respect you guys. I know this is not an easy job. But the public has a right to be involved and to be heard. So I'm asking under the Sunshine Law to make this more accessible. You know, trying to deal with the law just is unbelievably difficult. So I would ask for more transparency. This is public funds, this is not your slush fund anymore. The bonds are public money, our tax dollar from the ballots. Thank you.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

The Recreation and Park Commission meeting  
adjourned at 11:35 a.m.  
Respectfully submitted,

Ashley Summers  
Commission Liaison