FILE NO. 061635 MOTION NO. M06-135

[Adopting findings related to disapproving the categorical exemption issued for 2564 Sutter Street.]

Motion adopting findings related to disapproving the determination by the Planning Department that the 2564 Sutter Street project is categorically exempt from environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act.

On June 29, 2006, the Environmental Review Office of the San Francisco Planning Department issued a certificate of determination of exemption/exclusion from environmental review (the "determination") for a proposal to alter and add to an existing 29-foot tall, one-and-a-half-story over basement single-family residence to create an approximately 40-foot tall, four-story over basement, three-unit residential building, located at 2564 Sutter Street (the "Project"). A copy of said document is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 061327, and is incorporated by reference herein.

By letter to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors dated September 22, 2006, Stephen Williams ("Appellant"), filed an appeal of the determination to the Board of Supervisors, which the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors received on or around September 22, 2006.

On November 14, 2006, this Board held a duly noticed public hearing to consider the appeal of the determination and following the public hearing disapproved the determination of the Planning Department that the Project is categorically exempt from CEQA.

In reviewing the appeal of the categorical exemption determination, this Board reviewed and considered the written record before the Board and all of the public comments made in support of, and opposition to the appeal. Following the conclusion of the public hearing, the Board disapproved the Planning Department's categorical exemption determination for 2564 Sutter Street based on the written record before the Board as well as

all of the testimony at the public hearing in support of and opposed to the appeal. Said Motion and written record is in the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors File No. 061327 and is incorporated herein as though set forth in its entirety.

In regard to said decision, this Board made certain findings specifying the basis for its decision to disapprove the Planning Department's approval of the determination for 2564 Sutter Street based on the whole record before the Board including the written record in File No. 061329, which is hereby declared to be a part of this motion as if set forth fully herein; the written submissions to and official written records of the Planning Department determination related to the 2564 Sutter Street Project; the official written and oral testimony at and audio and video records of the public hearing in support of and opposed to the appeal and deliberation of the oral and written testimony at the public hearing before the Board of Supervisors by all parties and the public in support of and opposed to the appeal of the categorical exemption.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco finds that the 2564 Sutter Street property is an acknowledged historic resource, described in *Here Today* as a "one-story stick style cottage with floriated frieze."

FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors finds that replacing the existing 1,200 square foot 1-and-a-half-story single-family cottage with a proposed 9,400 square foot 4-story, 3-unit condominium building (including three off-street parking spaces) materially impairs the historic significance of the cottage in these ways: the building is being expanded from 1-and- a-half-stories to 4-stories; the façade will be altered by the addition of a garage, changes to the stairs, changes to the windows, removal of the front yard area and the addition of floors; over 7,000 square feet will be added to the structure; a nearly 35-foot extension will be added to the rear of the structure; thousands of cubic feet of soil will be removed; the

structure will be lifted nearly 2 feet above its current grade; and the interior will be gutted to create the 3 new condominiums, effectively resulting in a demolition of the structure.

FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors finds that the Project is inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitation, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings* in that the Project has a size, scale, proportion and massing that is inappropriate to the size, scale and massing of the historic resource, will result in a massive "alteration" which increases this building's square footage by 100% or more, will result in the removal of distinctive materials and will alter the relationship of the historic resource with its setting.

FURTHER MOVED, that the Board of Supervisors finds that in consideration of the above, the Project is not eligible for a categorical exemption and the proposal should be returned to the Planning Department for further environmental review in accordance with CEQA and these findings.

City and County of San Francisco

Tails

Motion

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

File Number: 061635 **Date Passed:** December 5, 2006

Motion adopting findings related to disapproving the determination by the Planning Department that the 2564 Sutter Street project is categorically exempt from environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act.

November 20, 2006 Board of Supervisors — REFERRED: Board of Supervisors

December 5, 2006 Board of Supervisors — APPROVED

Ayes: 10 - Alioto-Pier, Ammiano, Daly, Elsbernd, Jew, Maxwell, McGoldrick, Mirkarimi, Peskin, Sandoval
Excused: 1 - Dufty

File No. 061635

I hereby certify that the foregoing Motion was APPROVED on December 5, 2006 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

Gloria L. Young
Clerk of the Board