

File No. 230193

Committee Item No. 4

Board Item No. 23

# COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

## AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Rules Committee

Date April 17, 2023

Board of Supervisors Meeting

Date April 25, 2023

### Cmte Board

- Motion
- Resolution
- Ordinance
- Legislative Digest
- Budget and Legislative Analyst Report
- Youth Commission Report
- Introduction Form
- Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report
- Memorandum of Understanding (MOU)
- Grant Information Form
- Grant Budget
- Subcontract Budget
- Contract/Agreement
- Form 126 - Ethics Commission
- Award Letter
- Application
- Form 700
- Information/Vacancies (Boards/Commissions)
- Public Correspondence

### OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____

Completed by: Victor Young Date April 13, 2023

Completed by: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

1 [Annual Surveillance Report Regarding Surveillance Technology]

2

3 **Resolution accepting Annual Surveillance Reports under Administrative Code, Section**  
4 **19B.6 for the following departments: Airport, Arts Commission, Asian Art Museum,**  
5 **Child Support Services, City Administrator’s Office – Real Estate Division, Department**  
6 **of Emergency Management, Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing,**  
7 **Department of Human Resources, Department of Public Health, Department of Public**  
8 **Works, Department of Technology, Fire Department, Human Services Agency,**  
9 **Municipal Transportation Agency, Police Department, Port of San Francisco, Public**  
10 **Library, Public Utilities Commission, Recreation and Park Department, Rent**  
11 **Stabilization and Arbitration Board, and War Memorial Department.**

12

13 WHEREAS, Administrative Code, Section 19B.6 requires each City department that  
14 obtains approval for the acquisition of Surveillance Technology to submit to the Board of  
15 Supervisors and the Committee on Information Technology (COIT) an Annual Surveillance  
16 Report for each Surveillance Technology used by the department; and

17 WHEREAS, Departments must submit those reports within 12 months of Board  
18 approval of the applicable Surveillance Technology Policy, and annually thereafter on or  
19 before November 1; and

20 WHEREAS, By no later than February 15 of each year, each department that has  
21 obtained approval for the acquisition of Surveillance Technology under Section 19B.2 must  
22 submit to the Board an Annual Surveillance Report; and

23 WHEREAS, COIT has received and compiled Annual Surveillance Reports from the  
24 following City departments, and each of those reports is available for review in Board File No.  
25 230193: Airport, Arts Commission, Asian Art Museum, Child Support Services, City

1 Administrator’s Office – Real Estate Division, Department of Emergency Management,  
2 Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing, Department of Human Resources,  
3 Department of Public Health, Department of Public Works, Department of Technology, Fire  
4 Department, Human Services Agency, Municipal Transportation Agency, Police Department,  
5 Port of San Francisco, Public Library, Public Utilities Commission, Recreation and Park  
6 Department, Rent Stabilization and Arbitration Board, War Memorial Department; and

7 WHEREAS, The Police Department reported that in addition to its use of Surveillance  
8 Technology, the Department requested certain face recognition data from a state and local  
9 law enforcement fusion center on three separate occasions dating May 20, 2020, May 28,  
10 2020, and June 17, 2021, and from the Daly City Police Department on June 23, 2021, but did  
11 not receive or use the data, and the Department reported that it is taking steps to prevent  
12 such requests in the future through improved training; and

13 WHEREAS, Section 19B.6 requires departments to submit a Resolution to the Board to  
14 accept the Annual Surveillance Reports; now, therefore, be it

15 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco  
16 accepts the Annual Surveillance Reports described in this Resolution under Administrative  
17 Code, Section 19B.6.



To: Angela Calvillo  
Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
From: Jillian Johnson  
Committee on Information Technology  
Date: February 13, 2023  
Subject: Annual Surveillance Report Summary, Analysis and Resolution

---

In compliance with Administrative Code Section 19B.6, the Committee on Information Technology (COIT) is pleased to submit Annual Surveillance Reports for the following technologies and from the following departments to the Board of Supervisors:

- Audio Recorders
  - Police Department
- Automated License Plate Readers
  - Airport
  - Department of Public Works
  - Police Department
  - Recreation and Park Department
- Drones
  - Fire Department
  - Department of Technology
  - Port
  - Public Utilities Commission
  - Department of Public Works
  - Recreation and Park Department
- Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) Circulation and Security Gate System
  - Public Library
- Security Cameras
  - Airport
  - Arts Commission
  - Asian Art Museum
  - Child Support Services
  - City Administrator's Office – Real Estate Division
  - Department of Emergency Management
  - Fire Department
  - Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing
  - Department of Human Resources
  - Human Services Agency
  - Municipal Transportation Agency
  - Port
  - Department of Public Health
  - Public Library
  - Public Utilities Commission
  - Recreation and Park Department
  - Rent Arbitration and Stabilization Board

- Department of Technology
- War Memorial Department
- Face Recognition Addendum
  - Police Department

On behalf of the departments listed above, COIT is submitting a summary of each report and a resolution to accept all reports listed and attached to this document.

### **Brief Description of the Ordinance Requirements**

Under San Francisco Administrative Code Section 19B.6 any “Department that obtains approval for the acquisition of Surveillance Technology under Section 19B.2 must submit to the Board of Supervisors and COIT, and make available on its website, an Annual Surveillance Report for each Surveillance Technology used by the City Department within 12 months of Board approval... and annually thereafter on or before November 1”. The ordinance also states that Departments must submit their Annual Surveillance Reports to the Board of Supervisors with a resolution to accept the report by February 15.

Each report should contain the following, per Admin Code Section 19.B.1:

1. Description of how the Surveillance Technology is used
2. Description of whether and how often data from the technology was shared with outside entities
3. Summary of complaints or concerns from the public about the technology
4. Results of any internal audits of the technology required by the policy
5. Information, including crime statistics, to help the Board of Supervisors assess whether the effectiveness of the technology at achieving its identified purposes
6. Information on any related Public Records Act requests
7. Annual costs attributed to the technology and the source of funding
8. Any requested modifications to the Surveillance Technology Policy and a detailed basis for the request
9. If the technology is hardware, a description of the physical objects the technology was installed upon, or in the case of software, a description of the data sources the technology was applied to
10. Description of products and services acquired or used in the preceding year that are not already included in the Surveillance Technology Policy
11. Summary of all requests for Board of Supervisors’ approval for a Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance

Section 19B.2.(e) also stipulates that Departments report any accidental receipt of data obtained from facial recognition technology data. Departments were asked to note any receipt of face recognition as a part of their Annual Surveillance Report process.

### **Background on the Reporting Process**

This is the inaugural year for the Annual Surveillance Report submission process, as the first Surveillance Technology Policies were approved by the Board of Supervisors on July 27, 2021 and signed by the Mayor on August 4, 2021. In recognition of the novelty of this process and to support Departments in complying with the requirements of the ordinance, COIT standardized the reporting format for all Departments. COIT also granted an extension to all Departments, permitting them to submit their reports by November 1, 2022.

This allowed COIT staff adequate time for citywide outreach and education on the centralized reporting format.

Annual Surveillance Reports submitted to COIT were posted on the COIT website and departments were directed to link to these reports on their own websites, as required by Administrative Code Section 19B. Departments also emailed their submissions to the Clerk and the Board of Supervisors.

The following sections provide a summary of the submitted Annual Surveillance Reports, including whether Departments requested a change to their Board-approved Surveillance Technology Policy, and whether there were any violations of the policy or complaints received from the public. All submitted Annual Surveillance Reports are also attached to this document.

If you have questions on the report process, please direct questions to Jillian Johnson, Director of the Committee on Information Technology (COIT).

# Annual Surveillance Report Summary

## *Reports with no major changes*

The Annual Surveillance Report submitted for the following Departments for the associated surveillance technology policies reported no proposed changes to their approved surveillance technology policy and reported no complaints or violations.

<b>Department</b>	<b>Technology</b>
Police Department	Audio Recorders
Airport	Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR)
Police Department	Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR)
Public Works	Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR)
Fire Department	Drones
Technology	Drones
Port	Drones
Public Works	Drones
Airport	Security Cameras
Child Support Services	Security Cameras
Emergency Management	Security Cameras
Fire Department	Security Cameras
Homelessness and Supportive Housing	Security Cameras
Municipal Transportation Agency	Security Cameras
Public Health	Security Cameras
Rent Arbitration and Stabilization Board	Security Cameras

## ***Reports indicating a change to policy***

There were notable changes to the authorized use cases, authorized job titles or in the replacement, addition, or cessation of technology provided in the Annual Surveillance Report for the following Departments and associated technologies.

### **Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR)**

<b>Department</b>	<b>Notable Changes</b>
Recreation and Park	The department added two authorized job titles including Chief Park Ranger (0951) and Deputy Chief Park Ranger number (0922), because the department recently established these positions to lead the Park Ranger Division.

### **Drones**

<b>Department</b>	<b>Notable Changes</b>
Public Utilities Commission	<p>The department provided an updated list of job titles which would have access to the data captured by the technology. The department updated its list of authorized job titles to include the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• 1770 Photographer</li><li>• 1774 Head Photographer</li><li>• 5241 Engineer</li><li>• 5203 Assistant Engineer</li><li>• 5211 Senior Engineer</li><li>• 5212 Principal Engineer</li><li>• 5508 Project Manager IV</li><li>• 5201 Jr. Engineer</li><li>• 5130 Sewage Treatment Plant Superintendent</li><li>• 0943 Manager VIII</li><li>• 1824 Principal Admin Analyst</li><li>• 7252 Chief Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant</li><li>• 0942 Manager VII</li><li>• 5506 Project Manager III</li><li>• 0933 Manager V</li><li>• 1844 Senior Management Assistant</li><li>• 6319 Senior Construction Inspector</li><li>• 0955 Deputy Director V</li><li>• 0941 Manager VI</li><li>• 0932 Manager IV</li><li>• 1446 Secretary II</li></ul> <p>Additionally, the department noted that, although it only owns one drone and has not had to replace it, it has access to the data from nine different models of drones used by its contractors, Multivista and Minilab Factory LLC.</p>



Recreation and Park	The department reported that they will use a third-party contractor to conduct drone surveys in the future.
---------------------	---

## Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) Circulation and Security Gate System

Department	Notable Changes
Public Library	The department requested to strike the name “Michael Liang” from the policy, so that the authorized job title will be listed as “Chief Information Officer” only.

## Security Cameras

Department	Notable Changes
Arts Commission	<p>The department submitted an updated list of authorized job titles as a more accurate list of staff that would be involved in the case of a security incident and because the Commission secretary was no longer in an office administrative role. These are the authorized job titles:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Deputy Director of Finance and Administration (0951)</li> <li>• Deputy Director of Programs (0923)</li> <li>• Director of Community Investments (0922)</li> <li>• Capital Program Manager (1823)</li> <li>• Office/Operations Manager (1842)</li> <li>• Director of Galleries and Public Programs (0922)</li> </ul> <p>The department also reported that one of their cameras has ceased operating in the San Francisco Arts Commission Main Gallery.</p>
Asian Art Museum	A total of five cameras were replaced, four along the museum perimeter and one in the museum gallery. Because of this, five cameras were also taken out of service in those locations.
City Administrator’s Office – Real Estate Division	<p>One manager position in the department was added to the list of authorized job titles, which is currently as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 1777 Media Security Systems Specialist</li> <li>• 1781 Media Security Systems Supervisor</li> <li>• 0922 Media Security Systems Manager</li> </ul> <p>Additionally, 20 cameras owned by the department reached end of life and were replaced. Three additional cameras were added at the Animal Care and Control facility managed by the department.</p>
Human Resources	The department noted that the same staff members have access to the data but one of the staff members was promoted to the 1043 job class from the 1042 job class.

Human Services Agency	The department noted that they replaced 43 cameras which reached end of life and added 13 additional cameras. Additionally, the department purchased and implemented a video management software.
Port	The department noted that the Deputy Director of Maintenance, the Assistant Deputy Director of Maritime, and the IT Director should be added to the authorized job titles list.
Public Library	<p>The department provided an updated list of authorized job titles because of staffing changes within the department security division:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 8207 Grounds and Patrol Officers (26.5 FTE)</li> <li>• 8211 Ground and Patrol Supervisors (3 FTE)</li> <li>• 1822 Administrative Analyst</li> <li>• 0923 Manager of Security Operations and Emergency Planning</li> <li>• 0932 Director of Facilities</li> <li>• 0953 Chief Operating Officer</li> <li>• 0964 City Librarian</li> </ul>

<p>Public Utilities Commission</p>	<p>The department added job titles for sheriff personnel and critical infrastructure-related staff.</p> <p>The department added an updated list of authorized job titles:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• SFPUC Emergency Planning &amp; Security Staff: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 0931 Director of Security</li> <li>○ 0932 Emergency Planning Director</li> <li>○ 1844 Senior Management Assistant</li> <li>○ 1820 Jr. Admin Analyst</li> <li>○ 1054 Principal IS Business Analyst;</li> </ul> </li> <li>• SF Sheriff Dept. Personnel at SFPUC Headquarters: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 8304 Deputy Sheriff</li> <li>○ 8300 Sheriff Cadet</li> </ul> </li> <li>• SFPUC Staff at City Distribution Division, Water Supply and Treatment Division, and WasteWater Enterprise: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 7120 Building and Grounds Supt.</li> <li>○ 7343 Senior Stationary Engineer ○ 7245 Chief Stationary Engineer</li> <li>○ 7372 Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant</li> <li>○ 7334 Stationary Engineer</li> <li>○ 0933 Programs &amp; Maintenance Manager</li> <li>○ 1406 Senior Clerk;</li> <li>○ 1844 Senior Management Assistant;</li> </ul> </li> <li>• SFPUC Staff at Hetch Hetchy Facility in Mocassin: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 7364 Power System Operator</li> <li>○ 5602 Utility Specialist</li> <li>○ Contractor</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Additionally, 85 cameras have been added in the last year by the department.</p>
------------------------------------	---

Recreation and Park	<p>The department requested that job classification numbers 1050, 1090, and 1820 be removed. The department provided an updated list of authorized job titles:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Chief Park Ranger (0951)</li> <li>• Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922)</li> <li>• Head Park Ranger (8210), Park Ranger (8208)</li> <li>• Communications Dispatcher 1 (1704)</li> </ul>
Technology	<p>Three cameras were replaced due to reaching end of life.</p>
War Memorial	<p>The department reported an updated list of authorized job titles. The current list adds the managing director and assistant managing director authorized job titles:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 8207 - Building and Grounds Patrol Officers</li> <li>• 8211 - Supervisor Building and Grounds Patrol Officer</li> <li>• 0922 - Director of Security</li> <li>• 1093 - IT Manager</li> <li>• 1844 - Facilities Administrator</li> <li>• 0962 - Managing Director</li> <li>• 0952 - Assistant Managing Director</li> </ul> <p>Additionally, the department updated software, replaced camera sensor lenses, and replaced a camera which reached end of life.</p>

## ***Reports containing violations or complaints***

The following department reported that it solicited face recognition data from cooperating law enforcement agencies in several incidents, which did not relate to a technology owned by a City and County of San Francisco government department. COIT staff asked the department to create an addendum to their reports which listed: (a) the date of each incident, (b) a summary of what happened in each incident, and (c) any actions taken after the incident. The addendum submitted by the department detailing these incidents has been attached to this document.

<b>Department</b>	<b>Details of Violations and/or Complaints</b>
Police Department	Data was processed by technology owned by entities outside of the City and County of San Francisco, but requested by San Francisco Police Department employees.

## Upcoming Surveillance Technology Policies

The following technologies have been identified as surveillance technologies as defined by SF Admin Code Sec 19B.1, and still require a Surveillance Technology Policy to be reviewed and approved by the Board of Supervisors. These are predominantly technologies acquired by departments before Chapter 19B took effect in July 2019. This list includes 137 technologies and reflects the current Surveillance Technology Inventory as of January 31, 2023.

Technology Category	Department Name	Technology Name
Alert System Software	Police Department	Dataminr First Alert
Audio Recorder	Airport	Airport Gunshot Detection - proof of concept
	Department of Emergency Management	ShotSpotter
	Human Services Agency	Monet Call Recording Software
	Police Department	Lil Ears Microphone
Biometric Processing Software and/or System	Adult Probation	Alcohol Monitoring Ankle Bracelet
	Police Department	Cogent ABIS (Automatic Biometric Identification System)
	Police Department	DataWorksPlus Digital Crime Scene system
	Police Department	DataWorksPlus Digital Photo Manager system
	Police Department	Microblink Software
Camera	Animal Care & Control	Security Cameras
	City Planning	Time-lapse Camera
	Department of Emergency Management	Public Safety Crime Cameras
	Department of Technology	Community Safety Cameras
	Fine Arts Museum	Closed-circuit television cameras (CCTVs), connected to recording devices
	Fire Department	360-Degree Cameras on Department Apparatus (Fire Trucks)
	Fire Department	Mounted Cameras on Mobile Command Vehicle
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Antiterrorism analytic software for Muni subway (Occupancy Sensors & Motion Detectors)
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Video analytics for SFMTA passenger vehicles
	Office of Economic and Workforce Development	Public Safety Crime Cameras

	Police Department	Andros Robotics w/ Camera and Audio
	Police Department	Avatar Robot
	Police Department	Body Worn Cameras (Axon)
	Police Department	City Department Surveillance Cameras
	Police Department	CommPort Tech (Under Vehicle Camera)
	Police Department	Fiber Optic Camera
	Police Department	HNT Throw Phone / Camera
	Police Department	IP Cameras (Digital Cameras)
	Police Department	Irobot
	Police Department	Non-City Entity/ Third-Party Surveillance Cameras with financial agreement
	Police Department	Pole Camera
	Police Department	QinetiQ Robotics w/ Camera and Audio
	Police Department	Recon Scout
	Police Department	Security Cameras
	Police Department	SWAT Camera
	Police Department	Tactical Electronics Fiber Scope
	Police Department	Under Door Camera
	Police Department	Under Vehicle Camera
	Police Department	Vertmax Camera
	Police Department	Wolstenholme HazProbe
	Recreation and Park Department	Numina
	Recreation and Park Department	Sensource People Counters
	Recreation and Park Department	Web Camera
Data Analytics Software	Police Department	Blackbag BlackLight
Data Forensics Software	Juvenile Probation	GoGuardian Safety & Security Software
	Police Department	Cellebrite
	Police Department	DVR Recorder
	Police Department	Forensic Toolkit
	Police Department	Gray Key Forensic Tool (used with Magnetic Forensics)
	Police Department	MacQuisition
	Police Department	Magnetic Forensics
	Police Department	OpenText EnCase Forensic
DNA and Genomics Software and/or Hardware	Police Department	DNA Analysis Software
	Police Department	LifeTech 7500 or RT-PCR instrument
	Police Department	LifeTechnology 3500 and 3130xl
	Police Department	Capillary Electrophoresis instruments
	Police Department	Qiagen Qiacubes
Drone	Police Department	Drone
Local Area Network	Airport	Media Access Control (MAC) Address

	Department of Technology	Local Area Networks in City-Owned Housing
	Fine Arts Museum	Meraki
	Public Library	Meraki WiFi
Location Management System	Adult Probation	GPS Monitoring Ankle Bracelet
	Airport	App-Based Commercial Transportation Management System
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Data feeds from station less bicycle and powered scooter share programs
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Electronic Taxi Access System (ETAS)
	Police Department	CellHawk
	Police Department	GPS Tracking Device
	Police Department	Non-City Entity Drone Detection System
Marketing Analytics and Automation Platform	Asian Art Museum	AdRoll
	Asian Art Museum	Google Tag Manager
	Asian Art Museum	MailChimp
	Asian Art Museum	Steelhouse
	Asian Art Museum	Survey Gizmo
	Asian Art Museum	Survey Monkey
	City Administrator (Committee on Information Technology)	MailChimp
	City Administrator (Committee on Information Technology)	Survey Monkey
	City Administrator (Digital Services)	Survey Monkey
	Adult Probation	Survey Monkey
	Airport	Survey Monkey
	Arts Commission	Constant Contact
	Arts Commission	Survey Monkey
	City Attorney	MailChimp
	Controller's Office	Emma
	Controller's Office	Survey Monkey
	City Planning	BuildingEye
	City Planning	Google Web Analytics
	City Planning	GovDelivery
	City Planning	MailChimp
	City Planning	Microsoft IIS Access Log
	City Planning	Survey Monkey
	Department of Building Inspection	Survey Monkey



	Department of Public Health	Survey Monkey
	Department of Public Works	Survey Monkey
	Department of Technology	Emma
	Fine Arts Museum	Bidtellect
	Fine Arts Museum	Data Studio
	Fine Arts Museum	Datorama
	Fine Arts Museum	Flashtalking
	Fine Arts Museum	Google Adwords
	Fine Arts Museum	Google Analytics
	Fine Arts Museum	MailChimp
	Fine Arts Museum	Optmyzr
	Fine Arts Museum	The Trade Desk
	Fire Department	Constant Contact
	Fire Department	Survey Monkey
	Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development	Prompt.io
	Port	MailChimp
	Public Utilities Commission	Salesforce Marketing Cloud
	Recreation and Park Department	Survey Monkey
	Department of Elections	ConstantContact
	Department of Elections	Cooler Email
	Department of Elections	Survey Monkey
	War Memorial	Survey Monkey
RFID/Toll Reader	Airport	Electronic Toll Readers
	Police Department	RFID Scanner
Smart City Sensors	Airport	ParkAssist Parking Guidance System
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Connected Streets sensors
	Public Utilities Commission	anyCOMM SmartCity Node
Social Media Monitoring Software	Asian Art Museum	Mobile Fuse
	City Administrator (311)	Buffer
	Airport	Hootsuite
	Arts Commission	Hootsuite
	Arts Commission	Meltwater
	Department of Building Inspection	ForcePoint

	Department of Emergency Management	Hootsuite
	Department of Emergency Management	Tweetdeck (freeware)
	Department of Technology	Archive Social
	Fine Arts Museum	Facebook Business Manager
	Fine Arts Museum	Falcon
	Fire Department	Critical Mention
	Human Services Agency	Meltwater
	Human Services Agency	Sprout Social
	Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development	Critical Mention
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Social media monitoring software
	Police Department	Penlink
	Port	Hootsuite Social Media Monitoring
	Public Utilities Commission	Hootsuite
Temporary ID and Contact Tracing System	Department of Public Health	Lobby Track

## **Board of Supervisors-Approved Surveillance Technology Policies**

These Surveillance Technology Policies were approved by the San Francisco Board of Supervisors prior to January 31, 2023. This list includes 48 technology policies.

<b>Technology Category</b>	<b>Department Name</b>	<b>Technology Name</b>	<b>BOS Approval Date</b>
ALPR	Municipal Transportation Agency	Transit-only lane enforcement (TOLE) cameras	10/25/2022
Audio Recorder	Police Department	ShotSpotter	7/27/2021
Automated License Plate Reader	Airport	License Plate Recognition System	7/27/2021
	Department of Public Works	Automatic License Plate Reader	7/27/2021
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Automated License Plate Reader	10/25/2022
	Police Department	Automated License Plate Reader (ALPR)	7/27/2021
	Recreation and Park Department	License Plate Readers	7/27/2021
Biometric Processing Software and/or System	Juvenile Probation	SCRAM CAM	10/25/2022
Camera	Asian Art Museum	Security Camera System	7/27/2021
	City Administrator (Real Estate Division)	Security Camera Systems	7/27/2021
	Airport	Pre-security Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Cameras	7/27/2021
	Airport	Third-Party Cameras	11/15/2022
	Arts Commission	Surveillance Cameras	7/27/2021
	CSS	Sonitrol Security Cameras	7/27/2021
	Department of Emergency Management	Closed Circuit Television Cameras	7/27/2021
	DHR	Security Cameras	7/27/2021
	Department of Public Health	CCTV Security Cameras	7/27/2021
	Department of Technology	Outdoor Facility Cameras	7/27/2021
	Fire Department	Body-Worn Cameras	10/25/2022
	Fire Department	Surveillance Cameras	7/27/2021

	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing	Security Camera System	7/27/2021
	Human Services Agency	Client Lobby Cameras	7/27/2021
	Public Library	Security Cameras	7/27/2021
	Public Library	Sensource People Counters	10/25/2022
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Genetec video management software	7/27/2021
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Red light cameras and no right-turn cameras	7/27/2021
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Security cameras inside SFMTA-regulated taxi cabs	10/25/2022
	Municipal Transportation Agency	Video cameras	7/27/2021
	Police Department	Non-City Entity/ Third-Party Surveillance Cameras without financial agreement	9/27/2022
	Port	Closed Circuit Television Camera (CCTV)	7/27/2021
	Port	Network Video Recorder	7/27/2021
	Public Utilities Commission	Surveillance Cameras	7/27/2021
	Recreation and Park Department	Body-Worn Cameras	11/15/2022
	Recreation and Park Department	Security Cameras	7/27/2021
	Department of Elections	Nest Cameras	11/15/2022
	Rent Board	Security Cameras - Lobby	7/27/2021
	War Memorial	Third-Party Cameras	10/25/2022
Drone	Department of Public Works	Aerial Drone	7/27/2021
	Department of Technology	Aerial Drone	7/27/2021
	Fire Department	Drone	7/27/2021
	Port	Unmanned Aerial Vehicle	7/27/2021

	Public Utilities Commission	Unmanned Aerial Vehicles (aka UAVs, Drones)	7/27/2021
	Recreation and Park Department	UAV Drones	7/27/2021
Local Area Network	Public Library	TBS - Today's Business Solutions (MyPC, Papercut, ePrintIt, Easy Booking, ScanEZ) - Computer Time and Print Management System	10/25/2022
Location Management System	Juvenile Probation	"Electronic Monitoring Ankle Bracelet (GPS)"	10/25/2022
Network Server	Port	Network Server	7/27/2021
RFID/Toll Reader	Public Library	RFID (Radio Frequency Identification) Tags	7/27/2021
Social Media Monitoring Software	Public Library	Hootsuite	10/25/2022

## ***Discontinued Surveillance Technology Policy***

This surveillance technology was presented to the San Francisco Board of Supervisors, but the Board of Supervisors declined to approve the policy. This list includes one surveillance technology.

<b>Technology Category</b>	<b>Department Name</b>	<b>Technology Name</b>	<b>BOS Action</b>	<b>BOS Action Date</b>
Location Management System	Recreation and Park Department	Spotery Application with GPS feature	Rules Committee did not forward to full board for consideration.	10/31/2023

# **Annual Surveillance Reports**

*Audio Recorder: Police Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** ShotSpotter

**Respondent** Asja Turner-Steeves

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

Shotspotter, Inc.

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals





8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The technology helps the San Francisco Police Department locate gunshots fired resulting in faster response by officers. in 2021, There were 1,997 recorded alerts published.

Zones

Bayview: 617

Visitation: 404

Western: 293

Mission: 215

Potrero: 156

SoMa: 141

Bernal: 96

SanJoseAve: 75

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.5 **List which non-city entities received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

Northern California Regional Intelligence Center (NCRIC). They are a CGIC Partner.

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**



11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

0

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes

14.16 Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?

**Response**

No

14.18 Are there annual Software costs?

**Response**

Yes



14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$550,896

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

General Fund

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

There was a nominal 2% increase built in to the ShotSpotter contract that was not captured in the Impact Report

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*



15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Automated License Plate Reader: Airport*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR) - Ground Transportation Management System (GTMS)

**Respondent** Guy Clarke Jr, Annie.Chung@flysfo.com (External)

**Date Completed** 11/02/2022 04:03 PM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

SFO Landside Operations; SFO GTU Ground Transportation Unit; Contractors - IBI and Transcore.

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The ALPR - GTMS has been effective as a fail-safe should the Automated Vehicle Identification (AVI) readers malfunction and fail to read the transponder which the Airport affixes to certain types of permitted vehicles. The technology assists in dispute resolution in the event that the operator challenges the transponder data (i.e., number of trips the operator has made to the Airport) collected from the AVI.

The technology is also effective in tracking permitted operators that are not issued transponders, such as TNC vehicles and long distance bus carriers; tracking unpermitted operators who solicit passengers for rides; and assisting public safety agencies in investigations.

The technology enables the Airport to assess trip fees on permitted Commercial ground transportation operators. Specifically, in 2021, the Airport collected a total of \$ 22,373,523 in trip fees from ground transportation operators.

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

SFPD-AB: License Plate #; image of car; list of time & location of when the vehicle was on Airport property. Vehicles that did not have a permit to operate at the Airport.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.5 **List which non-city entities received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

CPUC: License Plate #; image of car; list of time & location of when the vehicle was on Airport property. Vehicles that did not have a permit to operate at the Airport.

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**



10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

SFO:

TechShop Existing (.10 of FTE)

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes





14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$20,000

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$340,000 = Total Annual Cost of Software & Hardware Support

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

See 14.19 Note Above.

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Operating Expense

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No



14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Automated License Plate Reader: Department of Public Works*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Automatic License Plate Reader

**Respondent** Bruce Robertson

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

n/a

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

No

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

We cannot make a determination regarding the success of this program or not, since we have not been successful in the procurement of cameras outlined in this policy. The OnSight Portable License Plate Reader's goal was to reduce illegal dumping by having a license plate reader that will allow us to capture illegal dumping and follow up with the bad actors. We have not been successful in finding a vendor that can meet our requirements.

## **9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## **10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## **11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No



**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

Currently, the FTE for this are around the procurement of the equipment. When procured the FTE are the same as those identified in the policy document.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

Yes

14.3 **Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

No

14.5 **Are there one-time Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.6 **List total one-time Software costs for FY 2022-2023.**

**Response**

The costs associated with the procurement if it can happen this fiscal year.

14.7 **Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.8 **List total one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023.**

**Response**

The costs associated with the procurement if it can happen this fiscal year.

14.9 **Are there one-time Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.11 **Are there one-time Training costs?**

**Response**

No



14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

We have a Board of Supervisors addback that we will spend in FY2022-2023.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

n/a

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

No

15.3 **Are there any technologies which need to be removed from the inventory because the department no longer uses the technology?**

**Response**

No

15.5 **Are there any technologies which need to be added to the inventory because they are non-exempt surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No



15.7 **Are there any other inaccuracies with your department's inventory which has not already been addressed?**

**Response**

No

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*



*Automated License Plate Reader: Police Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** ALPR

**Respondent** Asja Turner-Steeves

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

NCRIC hosts the ALPR data repositories accessed by SFPD Network approved users.

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Partially

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Currently there is only one operable ALPR unit on a marked vehicle. SFPD needs additional ALPR units to make the use of ALPR more effective. The purchase of additional units is in progress, but will take time due to procurement and administrative requirements.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.5 **List which non-city entities received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

NCRIC

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations



12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

Yes

13.2 **How many public records requests have been made regarding this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

One

13.3 **Please summarize what has been requested via public records requests, including the general type of information requested and disclosed, as well as the number or requests for each general type of information.**

**Response**

The public information request was submitted to the Department on March 15, 2022 for the "ALPR Annual Report"

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

0

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

General Fund/SFPD Operational Budget



14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Automated License Plate Reader: Recreation and Parks Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR)

**Respondent** Marcus Santiago

**Date Completed** 10/28/2022 09:26 AM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

Chief Park Ranger (0951) or Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922)

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

RecPark recently established new positions (0951, 0922) to lead the Park Ranger Division.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

- 5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No



## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

Microbiz provides training and support of the hardware.

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

we have not had many cases using this technology

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No





## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

Chief Park Ranger (0951)  
Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922)

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes

14.16 Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?

**Response**

Yes

14.17 List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:

**Response**

Costs will be incurred by Chief Park Ranger (0951) and Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922).  
Costs expended only when data is requested. RPD expects max of \$5k (total of 70 hours) in annual costs if required.

14.18 Are there annual Software costs?

**Response**

No



14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Operational funds

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes



15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Drone: Fire Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** SFFD Assessment - Drone Policy

**Respondent** Mark Corso

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

N/A

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The technology has been used according to policy, and the Department is in the process of procuring an additional unit. We have used the drone video for training purposes.

## **9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## **10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## **11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

## **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**



13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

This is shared amongst a group of members. The Department does not have someone assigned to the drone.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

Yes

14.3 **Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

No

14.5 **Are there one-time Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.7 **Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.8 **List total one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023.**

**Response**

\$17,000 has been allocated to the Department from a UASI grant for the purchase of an additional unit

14.9 **Are there one-time Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.11 **Are there one-time Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No



14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

FY20 UASI grant

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*



*Drone: Department of Technology*



---

### Report Summary Information

**Name** Unmanned Aircraft Systems (Drones)

**Respondent** Brian Roberts

**Date Completed**

---

### Report Question Responses

#### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

#### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

#### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

#### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

#### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

---

#### Comments

**Brian Roberts**

DT has not yet purchased a drone. We intend to in the future. The technology is not yet in use.

10/26/2022 02:24  
PM

#### 7 Services or Equipment Sources



7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

N/A

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

No

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The aerial drone technology has not been effective, because it has not yet been purchased.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No



12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

N/

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

N/A

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Not Answered

### **15 Annual Inventory Check**



15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Drone: Port*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** UAV/Drone

**Respondent** Joseph Reilly, Julia Chrusciel

**Date Completed** 01/11/2023 11:13 AM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your "approved use cases" in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of "authorized job titles" in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

None

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

No

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

It is not currently in use at the Port.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests





13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

There are no FTE's assigned to this technology at the moment. The Port does not own UAV/Drone technology.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

At this time there is no funding for this technology

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Drone: Public Utilities Commission*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Annual Surveillance Report - Unmanned Aerial Vehicles (aka UAVs, Drones)

**Respondent** Amanda Higgins

**Date Completed** 10/31/2022 12:39 PM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 **In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?**

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 **Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)**

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 **Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.**

**Response**

1770 Photographer, 1774 Head Photographer, 5241 Engineer, 5203 Assistant Engineer, 5211 Senior Engineer, 5212 Principal Engineer, 5508 Project Manager IV, 5201 Jr. Engineer, 5130 Sewage Treatment Plant Superintendent, 0943 Manager VIII, 1824 Principal Admin Analyst, 7252 Chief Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant, 0942 Manager VII, 5506 Project Manager III, 0933 Manager V, 1844 Senior Management Assistant, 6319 Senior Construction Inspector, 0955 Deputy Director V, 0941 Manager VI, 0932 Manager IV, 1446 Secretary II

- 2.3 **Why have the job titles changed?**

**Response**

The 1774 Head Photographer and 1770 Photographer in SFPUC's Infrastructure Division use drones to create records of documentation for infrastructure capital projects.

The remaining above job titles have access to drone footage related to SFPUC's Southeast Treatment Plant (750 Phelps St). This site is currently undergoing construction as part of an extensive Biosolids Sewer System Improvement Project. MWH Constructors/Webcor Builders, Malcolm Drilling Co. are the SFPUC contractors awarded this Capital Project. These contractors decided to hire Multivista, a company providing UAV services, to help monitor their own construction progress for this project.

Additionally, SFPUC WasteWater Enterprise uses Minilab Factory LLC / SF Drone School for documenting construction progress at SFPUC Southeast Treatment Plant (750 Phelps St).

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 **Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.**

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 **Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?**

**Response**

No



## 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

Yes

5.2 Why has the technology been added?

**Response**

SFPUC continues to only own one DJI Phantom 4 Pro unit that was purchased on 10/31/18.

Multivista uses DJI Phantom 4 Pro V2.0, DJI Inspire 2, DJI Mavic 2 Pro Model L1P, and DJI Phantom 4.

Minilab Factory LLC / SF Drone School uses DJI Phantom 3 Pro, DJI Mavic Pro, DJI Matrice M 100, and DJI Matrice M 600.

5.3 Please list technology which was added (include manufacturer and model information).

**Response**

see above

5.4 Please list how many units have been added.

**Response**

n/a

## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

Minilab Factory LLC / SF Drone School and Multivista are entities that provide drone services related to SFPUC's Biosolids Improvement Project at Southeast Treatment Plant.

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes



8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Since August 2021, 188 drone flights have been made. 113 were for construction management. 58 were for environmental monitoring and documentation. 13 were for inspection, and 4 were for disaster relief.

Drones are flown within the confines of SFPUC property and not over residential zones. SFPUC property includes Southeast and Oceanside Treatment Plant located within San Francisco and the Peninsula, Alameda and Hetch Hetchy Watersheds.

As noted in the Business Justification Section of our Policy, SFPUC continues to find that using drones offers significant time and financial savings; it is much more cost effective to capture data aerially versus on the ground.

Additionally, using drones to document construction progress at capital projects, such as the Southeast Treatment Project Biosolids Sewer System Improvement Project, keeps staff out of safety-compromising situations.

Drones also improve data quality as locations (such as large watersheds or construction sites) can be difficult to canvas/access on the ground. The drone footage can even provide video and stills of areas that cannot be reached at street level.

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

The 1770 Photographer and 1774 Head Photographer in SFPUC Infrastructure Division upload the drone footage from SFPUC's one drone to SFPUC's photo collection/digital asset management system (DAM), viewable to all users with a 'sfwater.org' (SFPUC) email address. The SFPUC does not anticipate any privacy risks from using a drone. The SFPUC's Photographer and Head Photographer use professional editing software (e.g. Adobe Premiere) to edit and blur personal identifiable information before uploading to DAM.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.5 **List which non-city entities received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

As mentioned previously, MWH Constructors/Webcor Builders, Malcolm Drilling Co. have used drone services from Multivista for construction management of the Biosolids Improvement Project at Southeast Water Treatment Plant. This footage from Multivista has been shared with the Improvement Project's Design Team (Jacobs, Brown and Caldwell, ENGE0, Structus), CM Consultants (Arcadis, ECS, Thier Group, Parsons, RDH Building Science), HDR, Subcontractors (DN Tanks, Sachs Electric, VMA Communications, Malcolm Drilling, Smartvid)

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**



10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## **11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

Yes

12.5 **Please provide general aggregate information about the result of your department's internal audits.**

**Response**

SFPUC requires SFPUC personnel to document planned drone flights from both contractors and SFPUC employees using a "flight summary form" that is routed to our SFPUC Emergency Planning & Security Team (EPS). EPS ensures that the planned flight is in compliance with the SFPUC Drone Policy and then uploads the flight information into the COIT Open Data Portal. Since EPS reviews flight information for Policy compliance before a flight occurs, there are no Policy violations.

12.6 **If the audits revealed violations, please list any actions taken in response to the violations.**

**Response**

n/a

## **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

It collectively takes the 0931 Emergency Planning Director and 1820 EPS Jr. Admin Analyst about 2 hours a week to review planned flights and upload the info into the COIT Portal. The 1774 Head Photographer and 1770 Photographer operate drones on a as-needed basis throughout the year. The Number of FTE is approximately 4 employees at a collective 15-20 labor hours a month.



14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

about \$31,882

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

SFPUC hires Minilab Factory LLC / SF Drone School for documenting construction progress at SFPUC Southeast Treatment Plant (750 Phelps St). The expense is expected to be \$7,664 this FY22-23. This expense may reoccur annually until project completion.

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**



The SFPUC funds this technology use and maintenance through its operating budget.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

14.30 **Why have the one-time costs changed?**

**Response**

One-time costs for Hardware/Equipment has decreased to \$1,500 in FY22-23. In comparison, the approved Impact Report has this cost at \$4,000. SFPUC has hardware and equipment in existing inventory that was purchased during prior fiscal years.

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Labor costs increased from \$30,364 in the Impact report to about \$31,882 due to annual SFDHR labor compensation CPI adjustment.

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*



*Drone: Department of Public Works*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Annual Surveillance Report: Aerial Drone-Unmanned Aircraft Systems

**Respondent** Patrick Rivera

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

N/A

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

---

**Comments**

**Patrick Rivera**

The drones have not been used during this reporting period.

10/25/2022 02:24 PM

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The drones have not been used during this reporting period.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No



12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

N/A

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Capital Project funding.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

n/a

**15 Annual Inventory Check**



15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Drone: Recreation and Park Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Drones

**Respondent** Christine Nath

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

The department has decided to contract out our UAV services so the vendor will vary.

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

RPD conducted one drone flight. Drone was effectively used for project inspection and documentation (use case 4). Specifically, the drone was used to develop digital documentation of the exterior of Kezar Pavilion. This was used to generate a 3D model to assist in the ongoing retrofit project.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

DPW Architecture Division received the drone data.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations





12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

1 5500 Project Manager coordinated the flight with the drone operator.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Capital funding

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Annual costs have not changed.



## 15 Annual Inventory Check

### 15.1 Note:

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

### 15.2 Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?

#### Response

Yes

### 15.9 You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) Circulation and  
Security Gate System: Public Library*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** SFPL Annual Report - RFID

**Respondent** Randle McClure

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your "approved use cases" in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of "authorized job titles" in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

---

#### Comments

**Randle McClure**

10/27/2022 03:38

We would like to remove the name "Michael Liang" from the report because he no longer works<sup>PM</sup> for SFPL. The CIO will remain the responsible party.

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources



7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**  
Bibliotheca

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**  
 Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

SFPL patrons save considerable time when physically checking out library materials through self-check because they can now check out multiple items at once using RFID technology. Further, library staff have reported ergonomic conditions have improved in check-out processes since they no longer need to grasp materials and hold them while using a barcode scanner. The implementation of RFID in SFPL check-out procedures has been very effective.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**  
 No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**  
 No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**  
 No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**  
 No

## 12 Violations



12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

0

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

No

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$209,893

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No



14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Library Preservation Fund.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

---

**Comments**

**Randle McClure**

\$0 spent on tags this year because SFPL has left over tags from original purchase.

10/27/2022 03:33  
PM

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

\$0 spent on tags this year because SFPL has left over tags from original purchase.

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes



15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*





## *Security Camera: Airport*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Pre-Security Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Cameras

**Respondent** abedoon.jamal@flysfo.com (External), Guy Clarke Jr

**Date Completed** 11/02/2022 10:44 AM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your "approved use cases" in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of "authorized job titles" in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

Cognyte (formerly Verint); Airport Tech Shop & ITT Teams.

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Within the public areas of the Airport, the pre-security CCTV camera monitoring has been very effective in providing vital/critical information regarding Safety and Security at the Airport (e.g., passenger accidents, customer service and law enforcement incidents), including supporting Situational Awareness for first responders.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

- Police (SFPD - Airport Bureau)
- City Attorney (assigned to SFO)
- Recorded video footage of the incidents
- Safety, Security and Legal matters.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.5 **List which non-city entities received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

- Outside law enforcement agencies, with the public when the data is subject to disclosure pursuant to a Public Records Act request for the data.

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No



## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

Yes

13.2 How many public records requests have been made regarding this surveillance technology?

**Response**

From 07/01/2021 to 06/30/2022 = 38

13.3 Please summarize what has been requested via public records requests, including the general type of information requested and disclosed, as well as the number or requests for each general type of information.

**Response**

Video footage of various incidents from safety to customer service.

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

Equivalent to 2.95 Existing.

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes



14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$573,000 based upon July 2022 salary expense.

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Maintenance & Support (annual Software Cost) - \$ 506,659

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Hardware - \$ 5,000

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Professional Services - \$146,413

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No



14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Operational Expense

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Increase in Compensation (Salary & Fringe) Costs.

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Security Camera: Arts Commission*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Annual Surveillance Report

**Respondent** Lisa Zayas-Chien

**Date Completed** 10/27/2022 04:58 PM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

Deputy Director of Finance and Administration (0951)  
Deputy Director of Programs (0923)  
Director of Community Investments (0922)  
Capital Program Manager (1823)  
Office/Operations Manager (1842)  
Director of Galleries and Public Programs (0922)

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

More accurate list of staff that would be involved in the case of a security incident. Commission Secretary no longer in an office administrative role.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology





5.1 **Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?**

**Response**

No

## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 **Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?**

**Response**

Yes

6.2 **Why is the technology no longer used?**

**Response**

Camera not working properly in Arts Commission Main Gallery.

6.3 **Please list how many units have ceased operation.**

**Response**

1 camera has ceased operation (no longer working properly) in SF Arts Commission Main Gallery.

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 **List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):**

**Response**

Department of Technology (DT) - SF Arts Commission Main Gallery  
Microbiz Security Company - Cultural Centers (Tenant funded - not funded with City dollars)

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Yes, a break-in occurred in the SF Arts Commission gallery and review of the video was able to clarify where the break-in occurred.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes



9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

SF War Memorial Security Team (SF Arts Commission is a tenant at WAR). Camera footage was reviewed after break-in. No data was shared. Allowed under authorized use policy.  
Mission Cultural Center reported sharing video footage with law enforcement. Allowed under authorized use policy.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## **10** Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## **11** Complaints

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12** Violations

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

## **13** Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No



**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

N/A

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

Yes

14.3 Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?

**Response**

No

14.5 Are there one-time Software costs?

**Response**

Yes

14.6 List total one-time Software costs for FY 2022-2023.

**Response**

Waiting for Department of Technology (DT) recommendations and quote.

14.7 Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?

**Response**

Yes

14.8 List total one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023.

**Response**

Waiting for Department of Technology (DT) recommendations and quote.

14.9 Are there one-time Professional Services costs?

**Response**

Yes

14.10 List total one-time Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:

**Response**

Waiting for Department of Technology (DT) recommendations and quote.

14.11 Are there one-time Training costs?

**Response**

Yes



14.12 **List total one-time Training costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Waiting for Department of Technology (DT) recommendations and quote.

14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

General Fund

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Not Answered

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Security Camera: Asian Art Museum*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** AAM Surveillance Report

**Respondent** Calen Mceldowney

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your "approved use cases" in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of "authorized job titles" in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

Yes

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.2 Why has the technology been added?

**Response**

We replaced 4 Arecont 10mp cameras located along the perimeter of the museum and one Hikvision 4mp camera in one of the museum galleries.

5.3 Please list technology which was added (include manufacturer and model information).

**Response**

The 4 10mp cameras were replaced with Axis 4K cameras, the Hikvision camera was replaced with an Axis fisheye camera.

5.4 Please list how many units have been added.

**Response**

Not Answered

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

Yes



6.2 **Why is the technology no longer used?**

**Response**

The cameras that were replaced have been taken out of service.

6.3 **Please list how many units have ceased operation.**

**Response**

5 cameras

**7 Services or Equipment Sources**

7.1 **List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):**

**Response**

Pacific Technology CCTV, Inc  
3721 Santa Rosa Ave. Suite B1  
Santa Rosa, CA 95407

**8 Surveillance Technology Goals**

8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The security camera system has been successful in reducing risk to artwork by allowing control room staff the ability to view a large area of the museum, identify potential issues, and dispatch security staff. We have also been able to review safety issues and accidents reducing liability. The camera system has also supported efforts by law enforcement to investigate criminal activity and vehicle accidents. While we have not seen a decrease in negative criminal activity we have assisted in investigations related to this activity.

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

Video recordings have been shared with SFPD and SFSD to support active criminal and accident investigations.



9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

Yes

12.5 Please provide general aggregate information about the result of your department's internal audits.

**Response**

Internal audits were solely to ensure effective operation of the system.

12.6 If the audits revealed violations, please list any actions taken in response to the violations.

**Response**

NA

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology





14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

We do not have FTE's dedicated to only the camera system. We do have two security staff 24 hours a day who have access to the camera system in addition to other duties. We also have 3 supervisors and the director of security who have access to the camera system.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

Yes

14.3 **Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

No

14.5 **Are there one-time Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.7 **Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.9 **Are there one-time Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.11 **Are there one-time Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Operational as well as capital. This was to replace some cameras that were not working correctly.



14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Security Camera: Child Support Services*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Child Support Services Surveillance Cameras Assessment

**Respondent** Caroline Beckett

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

Sonitrol Security Services

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The technology provides 24/7 monitoring of the building as required by state and federal entities to secure sensitive customer information and keep employees safe.

## **9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## **10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## **11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

Yes



12.5 **Please provide general aggregate information about the result of your department's internal audits.**

**Response**

The department conducted periodic reviews to ensure cameras are working as intended. No errors in camera performance were detected.

12.6 **If the audits revealed violations, please list any actions taken in response to the violations.**

**Response**

n/a

**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

61.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$132,500.

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No



14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$6,925.00

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

State and federal grants.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: City Administrator's Office–Real Estate Division*





---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Real Estate Department

**Respondent** Rohan Lane

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

---

#### Comments

**Rohan Lane**

Media Security Systems Manager. Real Estate Department (RED) internally re-assigned a manager position to the RED Media Security Systems Division.

10/26/2022 11:05 PM

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

1777 Media Security Systems Specialist  
1781 Media Security Systems Supervisor  
0922 Media Security Systems Manager (NEW\*)  
Real Estate Division (RED) internally re-assigned a manager position to the RED Media Security Systems Division .

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

Real Estate Division (RED) internally re-assigned an 0922 manager position to the RED Media Security Systems Division .

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

Yes



## 5 Addition of New Technology

### 5.2 Why has the technology been added?

**Response**

Broken or aging cameras have been replaced

### 5.3 Please list technology which was added (include manufacturer and model information).

**Response**

Avigilon 8.0-H4A-D01-IR Camera  
Avigilon 6.0 H4F D01-IR  
Arecont 12176-DN-08

### 5.4 Please list how many units have been added.

**Response**

20 broken or aging/degraded cameras have been replaced. 3 new cameras have been added at Animal Care and Control Facility.

## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

### 6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

### 7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

DTIS - Replace older coax cable, pull new camera cables.  
Paganini Corp - Replace old coax cable, pull new camera cables.  
Micro Biz Corp - Replace old coax cable, pull new camera cables, mount replacement cameras.

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

### 8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

### 8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Technology has protected City facilities against vandalism and crime, and has aided Law Enforcement in the prevention and prosecution of criminal acts against, or in, City facilities.

## 9 Data Sharing

### 9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

Yes



9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) Video data, ongoing criminal investigation.  
San Francisco Sheriff's Department (SFSD) Video data, ongoing criminal investigation or exigent operational circumstances.  
SF Department of Human Resources, video data, workplace conduct.  
SF Office of the Controller, video data, workplace conduct.  
Real Estate Division, video data, property damage  
Animal Care and Control, video data, property damage, exigent operational circumstances.  
City Administrator's Office/City Attny, video data, workplace conduct.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.5 **List which non-city entities received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

(1) Incident. (City Administrator's Office/City Attny authorization.) Video data was retrieved and shared with press/media/public in response to a public records/Sunshine request for a workplace incident. City Attny Office approved release of video.

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No



12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

Yes

13.2 **How many public records requests have been made regarding this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

(1) public records request/sunshine request has been received.

13.3 **Please summarize what has been requested via public records requests, including the general type of information requested and disclosed, as well as the number or requests for each general type of information.**

**Response**

(1) incident seeking disclosure of video footage related to an incident in a City facility regarding City employees. Multiple (10+) public records requests from public and Media Outlets for same incident. Release of footage approved by City Attny Office, faces of any individuals -other than those involved in the incident- were redacted/blurred.

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

(2) 1777 Media Security Systems Specialist  
(1) 1781 Media Security Systems Supervisor  
(1) 0922 Media Security Systems Manager

\* NOTE: all FTE, but have multiple daily responsibilities not related to security systems.

\*\* NOTE (2 additional) 1777 as needed positions with multiple daily responsibilities not related to security system/security tasks.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes



14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

1777 \$390,327 Fringe \$159,357  
1781 \$258,623 Fringe \$102,622  
1781 Standby pay -off hours 24/7 response to critical systems \$12,000  
0922 \$142,000 Fringe \$ 59,000  
TOTAL \$1,123,929

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Individual camera software license cost (\$23,000 ) for 2-4 year term.  
Video management Software Support Agreement (2 year term) \$24,000 for 2 year term

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Replacement of broken or aging cameras. \$80,000

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$90,000 replacement of cameras in challenging/inaccessible locations and re-pulling/replacement of outdated wiring

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Real Estate Division, allocation of departmental funds received from City Administrators office General Fund Budget.



14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Department of Emergency Management*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Security Cameras

**Respondent** Eric Gornitsky

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

San Francisco Department of Technology

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals





8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The surveillance technology allows the deputies that are on-site to remotely screen and see all visitors before they access the building. In addition, we have not had any break-ins to the building. We did have one security breach in the 21-22 fiscal year and the video camera system assisted with the sheriff's response.

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

data is shared with both the San Francisco Sherriff's department and the San Francisco Police Department. The Sherriff's department provides security for the building, so they have access to live video as well as stored video for any investigations. Video has also been shared with the San Francisco Police Department in the past for any investigations that occurred outside of the building but under the San Francisco Police Department jurisdiction.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No



## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

.02

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes

14.16 Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?

**Response**

No

14.18 Are there annual Software costs?

**Response**

No

14.20 Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?

**Response**

No



14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

We have as needed costs for maintenance through the department of technology.

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

San Francisco DEM General Funds.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Not Answered

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes



15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*



*Security Camera: Fire Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** SFFD Assessment - Surveillance Cameras

**Respondent** Mark Corso

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

N/A

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

It is being used as directed in the policy. These are security cameras for Departmental facilities

## **9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## **10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## **11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

## **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**



13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

No FTEs dedicated

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

N/A - already installed in bui

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes





15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*



*Security Camera: Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Daniel Quach

**Respondent** Wei Li

**Date Completed** 10/26/2022 01:37 PM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

Microbiz Security Company  
444 Jessie Street  
San Francisco, CA 94103  
415-777-1151  
service@mbiz.com



## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Our security camera has been effective in providing security for the safety of our shelter clients. As an extension to our shelter security staff, it has also been effective in helping us providing service while keeping cost manageable.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

Yes



12.5 **Please provide general aggregate information about the result of your department's internal audits.**

**Response**

HSH Facilities team audited the sites and checked DVR login for abnormality.

12.6 **If the audits revealed violations, please list any actions taken in response to the violations.**

**Response**

No violation

**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

4 existing employees  
Total expected staff hours (all): 15 hrs/mo

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Security camera and DVR rarely break down. When they do, HSH uses general fund to address small break-fix. Alternatively, if the camera and DVR were procured as part of the provider contract, then break fix cost will be part of said contract.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No



14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Not Answered

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Department of Human Resources*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Annual Surveillance Report

**Respondent** Grace Enriquez

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

Same employee staff, but new class is 1043 (promotion form 1042 job class)

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

promotion. It is still the same person/employee responsible for the security of the cameras

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

- 5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No





## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

n/a

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

It still serves the main purpose of protecting and providing safety to our staff, patrons and our facility.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints



11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12** Violations

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

## **13** Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **14** Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

still the same employee staff but the new job class is 1043 (promotion from 1042)

1FTE (1043) that has access to the surveillance cameras.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

General Funding

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No



14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Not Answered

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Security Camera: Human Services Agency*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** HSA - Client Lobby Cameras

**Respondent** Kevin Li

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

Yes

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.2 Why has the technology been added?

**Response**

Aging equipment needed to be replaced.

5.3 Please list technology which was added (include manufacturer and model information).

**Response**

Quantity 56 : VIVOTEK USA, INC. : FD9187-HT-A, 5mp, fixed lens, H.265, H.264, MJPEG

5.4 Please list how many units have been added.

**Response**

13 - replaced 43 old cameras and added 13 new

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

Yes



6.2 **Why is the technology no longer used?**

**Response**

We replaced with existing technology that we currently use at 170 Otis. NAS (VM) – RECORDER WIN SERVER 2019 / VAST VIDEO MANAGEMENT SOFTWARE (VMS)

6.3 **Please list how many units have ceased operation.**

**Response**

43 camera's have ceased operation

**7 Services or Equipment Sources**

7.1 **List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):**

**Response**

Xtech - Technology Marketplace Vendor who resold the Vivotek products

Vivotek - Manufacturer

**8 Surveillance Technology Goals**

8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

We monitor the camera's in order insure a safe and secure environment at HSA buildings. We do not collect any quantitative data.

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No



## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

4.2 FTE

8226 and 8202 for monitoring. 8228 and 0922 for review

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

Yes

14.3 Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?

**Response**

No

14.5 Are there one-time Software costs?

**Response**

No

14.7 Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?

**Response**

Yes



14.8 **List total one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023.**

**Response**

\$45596.33 for the new camera's at 1235 Mission

14.9 **Are there one-time Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.10 **List total one-time Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$16,200 in wiring costs was completed by Department of Technology.

14.11 **Are there one-time Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

13% Federal, 12% State, and 75% General Fund

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A





15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Municipal Transportation Agency*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Annual Video Surveillance Report

**Respondent** Robert Miller

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your "approved use cases" in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of "authorized job titles" in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

NA

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The technology has made us more efficient through live monitoring and helped us get ahead of security issues on revenue vehicles and SFMTA Facilities. This helps to keep the Transit system safe. It has deterred crime on buses and assaults on employees and customers. Furthermore, technology was utilized to respond to 985 inquiries from the public through 311 as well as 7 sunshine requests and 56 inquires related to Title VI of the Civil Rights Act.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

SFMTA shared security camera video with SFPD, the City Attorney's Office, and SF Sheriff. No legal standard applies; the data was not confidential. These city departments required the data to support criminal and other investigations.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No



## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

Yes

13.2 How many public records requests have been made regarding this surveillance technology?

**Response**

Department received approx. 150 requests in the past year, all requesting video from the vehicles or platforms.

13.3 Please summarize what has been requested via public records requests, including the general type of information requested and disclosed, as well as the number or requests for each general type of information.

**Response**

Generally, most of the inquiries were received through 311, sunshine request and Title VI.

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

10 - 7318 Electronic Maintenance Tech

1 - 1044 IS Engineer-Principal

3 - 14xx Surveillance Clerks

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes

14.16 Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?

**Response**

No



14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$100,000

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$100,000

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$50,000-\$100,000

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.27 **List total annual "Other" costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$5,000

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

The Department funds its use and maintenance of the surveillance technology through general operations budget and occasional grants.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes



14.30 **Why have the one-time costs changed?**

**Response**

Added Genetec Clearance. (For request tracking moved from SharePoint)

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Security Camera: Port*





---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Port of San Francisco

**Respondent** Joseph Reilly, Julia Chrusciel

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

Deputy Director of Maintenance  
Assistant Deputy Director of Maritime  
IT Director

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

To provide redundancy in access to the system.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

- 5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No



## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

City of San Francisco Department of Technology

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Partially

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Due to fixed location of CCTV cameras the Port cannot review or document incidents that are not recorded via camera.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints



11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

Yes

13.2 How many public records requests have been made regarding this surveillance technology?

**Response**

1

13.3 Please summarize what has been requested via public records requests, including the general type of information requested and disclosed, as well as the number or requests for each general type of information.

**Response**

Request for camera footage at a specific intersection on Port property. Port was not able to provide footage/data due to camera orientation.

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

1.5

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

Yes



14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$500,000.00

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.27 **List total annual "Other" costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$63,689.00

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

FEMA Port Security Grant Program and Port Operating budget

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No



**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Department of Public Health*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** DPH CCTV Security Cameras

**Respondent** Marc Upchurch

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

Comtel Systems Technology, Inc., and Johnson Controls, Inc.

### 8 Surveillance Technology Goals



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The Department's use of the surveillance technology is applied as a security safeguard for managing vulnerabilities, a psychological deterrence against criminal activity, and support and benefit San Francisco residents, while minimizing and mitigating all costs and potential civil rights and liberties impacts of residents. The Department's in this regard has been very effective and continues to meet the specified goals and objectives.

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

9.3 **List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

The Police Department, District Attorney's Office, and the Public Defender's Office.

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**12 Violations**





12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

Yes

12.5 **Please provide general aggregate information about the result of your department's internal audits.**

**Response**

Audit results identified six critical items requiring remediation.

12.6 **If the audits revealed violations, please list any actions taken in response to the violations.**

**Response**

All audit remediation items were related to password management. Our password policies and procedures were implemented and enforcement was initiated.

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

Twelve including the Director.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$1,946,563



14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$3,690,575

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$354,950

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

City and County of San Francisco General Fund.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No



14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Public Library*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** SFPL Annual Report - JCI Security Cameras

**Respondent** Randle McClure

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

8207 Grounds and Patrol Officers (26.5 FTE)  
8211 Ground and Patrol Supervisors (3 FTE)  
1822 Administrative Analyst  
0923 Manager of Security Operations and Emergency Planning  
0932 Director of Facilities  
0953 Chief Operating Officer  
0964 City Librarian.

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

Minimal changes related to staffing needs within SFPL security division and corresponding supervision.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology



5.1 **Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?**

**Response**

No

## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 **Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?**

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 **List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):**

**Response**

Johnson Controls, Inc.

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

FY22 Level 1 (high) and Level 2 (moderate) security incidents have reduced by 49.2% from the last full year of library service (FY19) in part because of security cameras posted around the system and commensurate improved patrols/staffing by security. Cameras are used in specific situations where identification of an individual is necessary to ensure patron and staff safety within SFPL facilities.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

9.2 **Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes



9.3 List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.

**Response**

**Sheriff's Office** (partnership with SFPL at the Main Library for purposes of security) - camera footage, per request. Justification of SFPL Surveillance Technology Policy - Security Cameras.

**SFPD** - camera footage, per request. Justification of SFPL Surveillance Technology Policy - Security Cameras.

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

**12 Violations**

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

0.10



14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$36,242

---

**Comments**

**Randle McClure**

Minimal SFPL staff support required. 8% cost escalator over 18 months since original submission.

10/27/2022 04:13  
PM

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$36,913

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$16,687

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.23 **List total annual Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$25,972





14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Library Preservation Fund.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

---

**Comments**

**Randle McClure**

Standard contractual and employee cost escalations.

10/27/2022 04:15  
PM

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Standard contractual and employee cost escalations

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Public Utilities Commission*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Surveillance Cameras Annual Surveillance Report

**Respondent** Amanda Higgins

**Date Completed** 10/31/2022 12:38 PM

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

SFPUC Emergency Planning & Security Staff: 0931 Director of Security, 0932 Emergency Planning Director, 1844 Senior Management Assistant, 1820 Jr. Admin Analyst, 1054 Principal IS Business Analyst;

SF Sheriff Dept. Personnel at SFPUC Headquarters: 8304 Deputy Sheriff; 8300 Sheriff Cadet

SFPUC Staff at City Distribution Division, Water Supply and Treatment Division, and WasteWater Enterprise: 7120 Building and Grounds Supt., 7343 Senior Stationary Engineer, 7245 Chief Stationary Engineer, 7372 Stationary Engineer, Sewage Plant, 7334 Stationary Engineer, 0933 Programs & Maintenance Manager, 1406 Senior Clerk; 1844 Senior Management Assistant;

SFPUC Staff at Hetch Hetchy Facility in Mocassin: 7364 Power System Operator; 5602 Utility Specialist; Contractor

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

Sheriff Personnel are responsible for security at the SFPUC Headquarters (525 Golden Gate Ave). Additionally, SFPUC Stationary Engineers, Power System Operators, and Utility Specialists use Critical Infrastructure Cameras to monitor water/sewer/power asset functionality.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

Yes



## 5 Addition of New Technology

### 5.2 Why has the technology been added?

#### **Response**

It was found that some SFPUC Hetchy Hetchy Facilities in Mocassin, California have cameras manufactured by Interlogix installed (in addition to cameras manufactured by Axis)

### 5.3 Please list technology which was added (include manufacturer and model information).

#### **Response**

Interlogix / UTC - TVD-3201 - TruVision IP Mini-Dome Cameras

### 5.4 Please list how many units have been added.

#### **Response**

Approximately 85 new cameras have been added in the last year. These are cameras in new SFPUC facilities - 58 in Southeast Community Center (in SF), 7 at Yerba Buena Island Pump Station (SF County), 12 at Water Quality Division (Burlingame, CA), 6 at Mariposa Pump Station (in SF)

## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

### 6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

#### **Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

### 7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

#### **Response**

Camera integrators and suppliers that we work with include Allied Universal Technology Services, Convergent, and Netronix. We also rely on Milestone Video Management and Lenel Access Control Software to view footage from the cameras. SFPUC also contracts camera-related services from the Citywide Technology Marketplace Contracts developed by SFOCA. Xtech, a vendor in the Marketplace, has been our Marketplace supplier.

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

### 8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

#### **Response**

Yes



**8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Camera footage has been useful in resolving incidents related to safety and security. SFPUC maintains an internal security incident log to capture crime and law enforcement incidents such as assault, theft, threats, trespassing, and vandalism. For reference, in 2021, there were 184 incidents and in 2020, there were 247 incidents. Camera footage is routinely used to investigate these incidents.

For example, footage from cameras was useful in the following incidents: On 3/25/2022, there was a trespasser who breached our SFPUC headquarters. SF Sheriff personnel utilized our security cameras to identify the suspect. Additionally, on 5/31/2022, SFPUC noted a broken security gate at the SFPUC Tesla Water Treatment Facility in Tracy, California. Security camera footage identified that a vendor's chemical tanker leaving the facility was responsible for the damage. We are using the footage to aid in a formal claim against the company to recover costs for the gate's repair.

While the footage is imperative to the SFPUC's security and operations, the procurement process for the technology could be improved. SFPUC is continually repairing and replacing broken cameras. The current process of using the SFOCA Technology Marketplace to contract repair and replacement services is lengthy. Therefore, SFPUC is working on an SFPUC-wide Master As-Needed Construction Contract to streamline the procurement of SFPUC camera repairs.

**9 Data Sharing**

**9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

Yes

**9.2 Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?**

**Response**

Yes

**9.3 List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.**

**Response**

Camera footage is only shared to Law Enforcement Agencies as requested. This includes Law Enforcement both in SF City and County and Law Enforcement in other counties where our SFPUC facilities are located - San Mateo, Alameda, San Joaquin, Stanislaus, Tuolumne, and Santa Clara counties.

**9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

**10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**



11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **12** Violations

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No

12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

Yes

12.5 **Please provide general aggregate information about the result of your department's internal audits.**

**Response**

SFPUC is constantly performing audits to assessing the functionality of our SFPUC security system to see if any cameras need to be repaired or replaced.

12.6 **If the audits revealed violations, please list any actions taken in response to the violations.**

**Response**

No violations were revealed from the audits.

## **13** Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

## **14** Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

Two SFPUC Emergency Planning and Security Personnel work on the Camera Security System - the 0931 Director of Security & Asset Protection and the 1054 Principal IS Business Analyst. Both spend about 20 hours a week on the Camera Security System.

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

Yes

14.3 **Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

No



14.5 **Are there one-time Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.7 **Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.8 **List total one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023.**

**Response**

Cameras are installed as new facilities are added to the SFPUC organization or as needed to replace broken cameras. It costs about \$2,500 per camera. In FY 22-23, we expect to install 10-15 cameras, so we expect to spend approximately \$25,000 to \$37,500 on cameras.

14.9 **Are there one-time Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.10 **List total one-time Professional Services costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

As needed, SFPUC hires integrators (companies authorized to work on our Milestone and Lenel Security Systems) to install/replace cameras, integrate those new cameras into the SFPUC security system, and troubleshoot and remedy problems with our camera security system.

SFPUC plans to spend about \$100K this year on professional services related to our camera security system.

14.11 **Are there one-time Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$176,000



14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.19 **List total annual Software costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

The cost to renew our Milestone license SFPUC-wide is \$20,050 annually. The vast majority of our cameras connect to the Milestone's XProtect Video Management System.

A small number of our cameras are connected to Lenel Network Video Recorders. The cost to annually renew our Lenel software SFPUC-wide is \$60,275 annually. However, this Lenel software is mainly used for SFPUC Access Control to buildings and facilities (not our main camera system).

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.25 **List total annual Training costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

SFPUC Emergency Planning & Security has an annual reoccurring budget for training related to our security systems to keep our team abreast of the software. We expect to spend about \$1,995 on Milestone training and \$6,000 on Lenel training this year.

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

SFPUC Annual Operating Budget will fund maintenance and use of this technology.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

14.30 **Why have the one-time costs changed?**

**Response**

The approved Impact Report listed as an annual cost "One Camera: \$2,517.00". In FY22-23, we expect to install 10-15 cameras, so we expect to spend approximately \$25,000 to \$37,500 on cameras (hardware) as a one time expense this FY.





14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

Yes

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Both labor and software costs have increased. The Director of Security and Principal IS Business Analyst both spend about 20 hours a week working on the camera security system, more than the hours previously listed on the Impact Report. Since the Impact Report was approved, SFPUC has added additional cameras to our system as new facilities were added to the SFPUC portfolio. Additionally, SFPUC is continually working on replacement and repair of existing aging cameras. The increased quantity of cameras in our security system has also led our software costs to increase.

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Recreation and Park Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Security Cameras

**Respondent** Marcus Santiago

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

Remove IT support staff (1050, 1090, 1820).

The following Park Ranger staff support Security Cameras: Chief Park Ranger (0951), Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922), Head Park Ranger (8210), Park Ranger (8208), Communications Dispatcher 1 (1704)

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

IT staff no longer support Security Cameras.

RecPark recently established new positions (0951 and 0922) to lead the Park Ranger Division.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

*Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.*

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

- 4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

- 5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No



## 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

## 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

Microbiz Security, AVS Video

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The cameras have captured in progress crimes and supported numerous cases resulting in arrests and court convictions. This has prevented illegal behavior in our parks due to the presence of the cameras.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

Yes

9.2 Was the data shared with city and county departments or other entities associated with city and county government?

**Response**

Yes

9.3 List which departments received surveillance technology data from your department, what type of data was disclosed, under what legal standard the information was disclosed, and a justification for the disclosure.

**Response**

SF Police - Video of crimes on park property - Ongoing investigations  
SF Sheriffs - Report of vehicles stolen - Ongoing Investigation  
SFDA - Prosecution of criminal cases - for Court presentation  
Public Defenders Office - By subpoena for cases assigned to defendants.



9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No

## 13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

The following Park Ranger staff support Security Cameras:  
1 - Chief Park Ranger (0951), 1 - Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922), 7-Head Park Rangers (8210), 37-Park Rangers (8208), 5-Communications Dispatchers (1704)

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

Yes



14.3 **Are there one-time Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

No

14.5 **Are there one-time Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.7 **Are there one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.8 **List total one-time Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023.**

**Response**

Will depend on new equipment installed.

14.9 **Are there one-time Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.11 **Are there one-time Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.13 **Are there one-time "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Approx 153k based on the following:

- 1 Chief Park Ranger (0951) - 1% of time
- 1 Deputy Chief Park Ranger (0922) - 25% of time
- 7 Head Park Rangers (8210) - 10% of time
- 37 Park Rangers (8208) - 1% of time
- 5 Communications Dispatcher 1 (1704) - 1% of time



14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

No

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Operational Funds

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Rent Arbitration and Stabilization Board*





---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Annual Surveillance Policy

**Respondent** Christina Varner

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources

7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list “N/A” if not applicable):

**Response**

N/A



## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

Use of the technology continues to protect the safety of staff, patrons and facilities while promoting an open and welcoming environment; and allows the department to review video footage after a security incident, provide video evidence to law enforcement or to the public upon request by formal process, order, or subpoena.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No

12.4 Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?

**Response**

No



**13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

**14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 List the number of FTE (new & existing).

**Response**

1- 0.05 FTE

14.2 Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?

**Response**

No

14.15 Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:

**Response**

No

14.28 What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?

**Response**

N/A - maintained using existing equipment

14.29 Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?

**Response**

No

14.31 Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?

**Response**

No

14.32 Why have the annual costs changed?

**Response**

N/A

**15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*



15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

*Security Camera: Department of Technology*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** Security Cameras

**Respondent** Brian Roberts

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

No

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology

4.1 Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?

**Response**

No

---

#### Comments

**Brian Roberts**

3 cameras have been replaced due to failure, but they are a like to like replacement

10/26/2022 02:44  
PM

### 5 Addition of New Technology

5.1 Has any technology been added which is not listed in the policy?

**Response**

No

### 6 Ceased Operation of Technology

6.1 Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?

**Response**

No

### 7 Services or Equipment Sources



7.1 List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):

**Response**

N/A

## 8 Surveillance Technology Goals

8.1 Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?

**Response**

Yes

8.2 In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The security cameras have allowed for the efficient monitoring of DT's facilities.

## 9 Data Sharing

9.1 Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?

**Response**

No

9.4 Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?

**Response**

No

## 10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data

10.1 Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?

**Response**

No

## 11 Complaints

11.1 Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?

**Response**

No

## 12 Violations

12.1 Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?

**Response**

No



12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

---

**Comments**

**Brian Roberts**

As part of routine maintenance.

10/27/2022 02:11  
PM

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

0.5

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

Yes

14.16 **Are there annual Salary and Fringe costs?**

**Response**

Yes

14.17 **List total annual Salary and Fringe costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$86,000

14.18 **Are there annual Software costs?**

**Response**

No

14.20 **Are there annual Hardware/ Equipment costs?**

**Response**

Yes





14.21 **List total annual Hardware/ Equipment costs for FY 2022-2023:**

**Response**

\$10,000

---

**Comments**

**Brian Roberts**

Materials and supplies for replacing non-functioning equipment.

10/27/2022 02:26  
PM

14.22 **Are there annual Professional Services costs?**

**Response**

No

14.24 **Are there annual Training costs?**

**Response**

No

14.26 **Are there annual "Other" costs?**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

Department operational funds.

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

Not Answered

## **15 Annual Inventory Check**

15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*



15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

Yes

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**  
*Congratulations and see you next year!*

## *Security Camera: War Memorial Department*



---

## Report Summary Information

**Name** VB Security Camera

**Respondent** Karen Burke-Hill

**Date Completed**

---

## Report Question Responses

### 1 Change in Authorized Use Cases

- 1.1 In the last year, did your department have use cases which differed from your “approved use cases” in your BOS-approved policy?

**Response**

No

### 2 Change in Authorized Job Titles

- 2.1 Does the list of “authorized job titles” in your BOS-approved policy need to change? (i.e. Do you need additional job titles to be authorized to access the data, or do you need to remove any current job titles?)

**Response**

Yes

- 2.2 Please provide an updated list of authorized job titles.

**Response**

8207 - Building and Grounds Patrol Officers  
8211 - Supervisor Building and Grounds Patrol Officer  
0922 - Director of Security  
1093 - IT Manager  
1844 - Facilities Administrator  
0962 - Managing Director  
0952 - Assistant Managing Director

---

### Comments

**Karen Burke-Hill**

Adding the Managing Director and Assistant Managing Director to the list of authorized job titles.

10/26/2022 12:36  
PM

- 2.3 Why have the job titles changed?

**Response**

The job titles of Managing Director and Assistant Managing Director have been added. These titles were omitted from the original policy in error.

### 3 Change in Number and/or Type of Technology

- 3.1 Sections 4-6 cover changes in the number or type of technology addressed by the Surveillance Technology Policy.

Please review and respond according to your department's current situation.

### 4 Replacement of Old Technology



4.1 **Has any technology listed in the policy been replaced?**

**Response**

Yes

**Comments**

**Karen Burke-Hill**

10/17/2022 04:44 PM

Upgraded Avigilon Control Center Server software from version 6.8.6.4 to version 7.  
Camera sensors (lenses) are being replaced with narrower angle models to improve image quality.  
A Mobotix S15 model camera controller failed and needed to be replaced. The original model controller is no longer available and so the replacement is a model S16.  
No changes to the system alter the functionality or use of the Veterans Building Security Camera System.  
The purchases for software and hardware were submitted for Surveillance Technology review and all were deemed exempt.

**5 Addition of New Technology**

5.2 **Why has the technology been added?**

**Response**

Security Camera Server software needed to be upgraded to latest version.  
Mobotix 103-degree and 90-degree sensor modules (lenses) have been purchased to replace Mobotix wide-angle sensor modules which provide distorted views.  
A Mobotix S15 Flex Mount camera module failed and was replaced with an S16 model. The original model is no longer available.

5.3 **Please list technology which was added (include manufacturer and model information).**

**Response**

Avigilon ACC 7 Server Software upgrade  
MOBOTIX - Sensor module (lens) S16/M16, S15/M15 with HD premium lens (103 degree 6MP)  
MOBOTIX - Sensor module (lens) S16/M16, S15/M15 with HD premium lens B041 (9 degree 6MP)  
Mobotix S16 Camera Module (controller)

Note: A Surveillance Technology Ordinance review deemed each of these acquisitions as exempt.

5.4 **Please list how many units have been added.**

**Response**

No units have been added. Only an upgrade to the software and replacements for existing equipment have been made.

**6 Ceased Operation of Technology**

6.1 **Is any technology listed in the policy no longer in use?**

**Response**

No

**7 Services or Equipment Sources**

7.1 **List any and all entities, companies or individuals which provide services or equipment to the department which are essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology (list "N/A" if not applicable):**

**Response**

N/A

**8 Surveillance Technology Goals**



8.1 **Has the surveillance technology been effective at achieving its identified purpose?**

**Response**

Yes

8.2 **In 3-5 sentences, please explain how the technology has or has not been effective**

*Provide quantitative data to support your response. This should include crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates if that was a motivating factor in acquiring the surveillance technology.*

**Response**

The Veterans Building Security Camera System has been effective in enhancing Security staff's ability to monitor and respond to incidents in the Veterans Building. Monitoring of live views increases situational awareness. This allows Security Officers at the Security Camera Workstation or Supervisors to radio roving staff to investigate suspicious or problematic activities detected on the premises.

Access to recorded footage has been useful in the investigation of incidents by the Director of Security.

A system log listing access to recorded Security Camera data for the period of 10/1/21 through 9/30/22 is attached. This log indicates times and dates when recorded footage was accessed for investigation purposes following an incident. (Crime statistics for the radius where the technology operates was not a motivating factor in acquiring this surveillance technology.)

**9 Data Sharing**

9.1 **Has data acquired through the surveillance technology been shared with entities outside of the department?**

**Response**

No

9.4 **Was the data shared with entities outside of city and county government?**

**Response**

No

**10 Accidental Receipt of Face Recognition Data**

10.1 **Did your department inadvertently or unintentionally receive, retain, access or use any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology?**

**Response**

No

**11 Complaints**

11.1 **Has your department received any complaints and/or concerns from community members about this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

**12 Violations**

12.1 **Were there any violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy or Surveillance Impact Report, reported through community members, non-privileged internal audits, or through other means in the last year?**

**Response**

No



12.4 **Has your department conducted any internal audits of the technology?**

**Response**

No

### **13 Statistics and Information about Public Records Act Requests**

13.1 **Has your department received any public records act requests for this surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

### **14 Total Annual Costs for the Surveillance Technology**

14.1 **List the number of FTE (new & existing).**

**Response**

.025 of a 1093 IT Operations Support Administrator III-IT Manager's time

14.2 **Are there one-time costs for Fiscal Year 2022-23?**

**Response**

No

14.15 **Are there annual costs for Fiscal Year 2022-2023:**

**Response**

No

14.28 **What source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology for FY 2022-2023?**

**Response**

War Memorial Operating Budget

14.29 **Have there been any changes to the one-time costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.31 **Have there been any changes to the annual costs from your department's approved Surveillance Impact Report?**

**Response**

No

14.32 **Why have the annual costs changed?**

**Response**

N/A

### **15 Annual Inventory Check**



15.1 **Note:**

*In 2019, all departments were asked to compile a list of surveillance technologies which their department uses. Since then, departments have been asked to contact COIT about new technologies for a surveillance technology review via the Surveillance Technology Ordinance Form in ServiceNow. Please feel free to reference the current Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department to help you answer the following questions.*

15.2 **Is the Surveillance Technology Inventory for your department current and accurate?**

**Response**

No

---

**Comments**

**Karen Burke-Hill**

Software has been upgraded and one camera module (controller) has been replaced with a new model and two more camera modules of the new type are pending.

10/26/2022 03:08  
PM

Updated inventory is below:

Cameras: Mobotix S15D and S16 FlexMount Dual Cameras

Server: Rasilient ApplianceStor90

Software: Avigilon Control Center Server Std Smart Plan (Current version: ACC7)

15.3 **Are there any technologies which need to be removed from the inventory because the department no longer uses the technology?**

**Response**

No

15.5 **Are there any technologies which need to be added to the inventory because they are non-exempt surveillance technology?**

**Response**

No

---

**Comments**

**Karen Burke-Hill**

All changes to the system - upgraded software and new model sensor modules (lenses) - were deemed exempt under Surveillance Technology Ordinance review.

10/26/2022 03:19  
PM

15.7 **Are there any other inaccuracies with your department's inventory which has not already been addressed?**

**Response**

No

15.9 **You have completed the Annual Surveillance Report:**

*Congratulations and see you next year!*



## *Face Recognition Addendum: Police Department*



**LONDON N. BREED**  
MAYOR

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO  
**POLICE DEPARTMENT**  
HEADQUARTERS  
1245 3<sup>RD</sup> Street  
San Francisco, California 94158



**WILLIAM SCOTT**  
CHIEF OF POLICE

February 10, 2023

Board of Supervisors  
City and County of San Francisco  
City Hall, Room 244  
1 Dr. Carlton B Goodlett Pl.  
San Francisco, CA 94102

President Peskin and Members:

**Re: Addendum to the Inaugural San Francisco Police Department Annual Surveillance Report to the Board of Supervisors: Facial Recognition Technology**

On December 30, 2022, the San Francisco Police Department (“SFPD” or “Department”) submitted two Annual Surveillance Reports to comply with requirements relating to existing approved policy ordinances. The two reports addressed the following technologies:

- Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPR)
- ShotSpotter (gunshot detection technology)

The SFPD did not request, receive, retain, access, or use Face Recognition Technology relating to ALPR and ShotSpotter, however, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code 19B.2(d) and (e), the Department is submitting an addendum to the annual surveillance report to document requests for use of Face Recognition Technology after SF Admin Code 19B went into effect.

The following is a summary of four separate requests made by two officers during their investigations of three criminal incidents.

- 1) During an investigation of a robbery with force of an adult female victim that occurred on May 13, 2020, a member of the SFPD Task Force (“MTF”) — hereafter referred to as “Officer A”, received photos of the incident including stills of the suspect. On May 20, 2020, Officer A sent photos of the incident to a forensic analyst with a state and local law enforcement fusion center to request a facial recognition search to aid with the identification of the suspect. No matches were received. This request for facial recognition was investigated by the SFPD Internal Affairs Division (IAD).
- 2) During an investigation of a robbery with force of a female victim that occurred on February 25, 2020, and a separate aggravated assault of an elderly male victim that occurred on March 10, 2020, Officer A received photos of the incidents and the suspects. On May 28, 2020, Officer A sent photos of each incident to a forensic analyst with a state and local law enforcement fusion center to request a facial recognition search to aid with the identification of the suspect. No matches were received. These requests for facial recognition were investigated by the SFPD IAD.

- 3) During an investigation of a stabbing incident that occurred on June 10, 2021, a member from the SFPD MTF—hereafter referred to as “Officer B”, received surveillance footage and still photos of the suspect in the case. On June 17, 2021, Officer B sent the surveillance footage and photos to a Special Investigator with a state and local law enforcement fusion center to request a facial recognition search to aid with the identification of the suspect in the stabbing case. No matches were received. This request for facial recognition was investigated by the Department of Police Accountability (“DPA”).
- 4) On June 23, 2021, Officer B sent the surveillance footage and still photos relating to the June 10th stabbing incident to the Daly City Police Department with the request for a facial recognition search to aid with the identification of the suspect. No matches were received. After having sent three broadcast alerts (requests for identification within the Department and to other law enforcement agencies) an SFPD officer recognized the suspect in the stabbing case and notified Officer B on July 3, 2021. The suspect was arrested, and the District Attorney subsequently charged that individual with the stabbing. This request for facial recognition was included in the DPA investigation listed in number 3 of this summary.

SF Admin Code 19B went into effect July 15, 2019. The first Department training relating to SF Admin Code 19B was held at an All Hands meeting on September 17, 2020. On January 28, 2021, the Department’s Written Directives Unit (WDU) disseminated Department Bulletin 21-011 to all SFPD members, confirming that it “is unlawful for SFPD to obtain, retain, access or use information obtained from Facial Recognition Technology from city or non-city entities unless very narrow exceptions apply.” SFBOS ordinance 205-22 approving SFPD’s use of non-city entity cameras went into effect on November 6, 2022. The ordinance, the use policy, and the impact report re-state the prohibition on the use of facial recognition. The Department is issuing Bureau Orders and training to coincide with ordinance 205-22. The training will roll out to all Operations Captains and Lieutenants first and will reconfirm the prohibition to request facial recognition technology data.

The Department has over forty technologies that fall under SF Admin Code 19B and each will require BOS approval. This will provide over forty additional opportunities to notify members on the approved uses of each technology and reaffirm the SF Admin Code 19B facial recognition prohibition.

This written report summarizes the Department’s requests for use of Face Recognition Technology data between the SF Admin Code 19B effective date and the date of this addendum.

Respectfully submitted,



**David Lazar**  
Assistant Chief of Operations

cc: Police Commission  
SF Committee on Information Technology



# San Francisco Office of the City Administrator

Committee on Information Technology

# Annual Surveillance Reports

Resolution to Accept, per Admin Code Sec 19B.6

COIT Director Jillian Johnson

Presentation to Board of Supervisors (BOS) Rules Committee

April 17, 2023

# Overview of 19B.6 Annual Surveillance Report

- Chapter 19B on the "Acquisition of Surveillance Technology" requires City Departments with BOS-approved Surveillance Technology Policies to complete an Annual Surveillance Report for each policy.
- All Departments must submit their Annual Surveillance Reports to the Board of Supervisors for acceptance via resolution by February 15.
- The Annual Report offers Departments an opportunity to report any proposed changes to their policies, any violations that have occurred, any complaints received from the public, as well as the overall effectiveness of the technology in achieving its stated purpose.

# List of Annual Reports Being Submitted

In compliance with Administrative Code Section 19B.6, the Committee on Information Technology (COIT) is pleased to submit Annual Surveillance Reports for the following technologies on behalf of their associated Departments:

- **Audio Recorders:** POL
- **Automated License Plate Readers (“ALPR”):** AIR, DPW, POL, REC
- **Drone:** FIRE, DT, PRT, PUC, DPW, REC
- **Radio Frequency Identification (“RFID”) Circulation and Security Gate System:** LIB
- **Security Cameras:** AIR, ART, AAM, CSS, ADM-RED, DEM, FIR, HOM, DHR, HSA, MTA, PRT, LIB, PUC, REC, RNT
- **Face Recognition Addendum:** POL

# **Annual Surveillance Report Process and Summary**

# Background on Reporting Process

- This is the inaugural year for Annual Surveillance Reporting process– first policies approved by BOS on July 27, 2021
- Two deadlines provided by Chapter 19B:
  1. Report to COIT and Clerk of the Board within a year of policy approval and then by November 1<sup>st</sup> each year thereafter
  2. Submit to Board of Supervisors for acceptance via Resolution by February 15<sup>th</sup>
- COIT standardized reporting format for all Departments and offered deadline extension to November 1, 2022
- All required Annual Surveillance Reports were submitted to COIT and the Clerk of the Board and are publicly posted on COIT's website



# Reports with no Changes

Many Departments proposed no changes and reported no violations or complaints with regards to their approved Surveillance Technology Policy and associated technology:

- **Audio Recorders**
  - Police Department
- **Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR)**
  - Airport, Police Department, Public Works
- **Drones**
  - Fire Department, Department of Technology, Port, Public Works, Recreation and Parks
- **Security Cameras**
  - Airport, Child Support Services, Emergency Management, Fire Department, Homelessness and Supportive Housing, Municipal Transportation Agency, Public Health, Rent Arbitration and Stabilization Board

# Reports with Proposed Changes

Several Departments proposed changes to their Surveillance Technology Policies:

- **Change in Authorized Job Titles**
  - Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR) - Recreation and Park
  - Drones - Public Utilities Commission
  - Radio Frequency Identification (RFID) - Public Library
  - Security Cameras - Human Resources, Human Resources, Port, Public Library, Recreation and Park
- **Change in Technology (units added, replaced or ceased operation)**
  - Security Cameras – Asian Art Museum, Human Services Agency, Department of Technology
- **Change in Authorized Job Titles and Change in Technology (units added, replaced or ceased operation)**
  - Security Cameras – Arts Commission, City Administrator Office – Real Estate Division, Public Utilities Commission, War Memorial

# Reports with Violations or Complaints

- Per Sec 19B.2.(d) “It shall be unlawful for any Department to obtain, retain, access, or use... any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology”
- The Police Department informed COIT that it solicited face recognition data from external, cooperating law enforcement agencies in four separate incidents since July 2019, though no matches were received.
- COIT asked the Department to create an addendum to their reports which listed:
  - (a) the date of each incident
  - (b) a summary of what happened in each incident, and
  - (c) any actions taken after the incident to ensure future compliance.

# Two Corrections to COIT Summary Memo

- **Page 6:** Recreation and Park is not proposing a change to their Drone policy– use of a third-party contractor this was noted in the original policy.
- **Page 19:** Recreation and Park’s Surveillance Technology Policy for their Spotery Application was discontinued on 10/31/2022, not 10/31/2023.

**Thank you!**

**Questions?**