



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Leo Levenson, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Paratransit Services – FY 2020-21 & FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2020-21 and 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Timothy Manglicmot, Budget Manager

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operator	9163	173.0	\$ 2,500	\$ 3,001	\$ 11,287,496	\$ 13,550,415
Transit Operator	9163	117.0	\$ 2,500	\$ 3,001	\$ 7,633,740	\$ 9,164,154
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,680	\$ 4,418	\$ 192,106	\$ 230,620
Automotive Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,057	\$ 3,670	\$ 957,487	\$ 1,149,444
Automotive Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$ 2,462	\$ 2,956	\$ 514,138	\$ 617,213
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931	1.0	\$ 2,708	\$ 3,251	\$ 70,681	\$ 84,851
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 429,478	\$ 515,579
Transit Supervisor	9139	15.0	\$ 3,414	\$ 4,099	\$ 1,336,764	\$ 1,604,759
Manager III, MTA	9177	3.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 372,624	\$ 447,328
Transit Manager I	9140	7.0	\$ 4,033	\$ 4,841	\$ 736,747	\$ 884,451
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520	1.0	\$ 4,245	\$ 5,096	\$ 110,794	\$ 133,006
Communications Dispatcher II	1705	28.0	\$ 2,482	\$ 2,980	\$ 1,814,094	\$ 2,177,784
Communications Dispatcher I	1704	20.0	\$ 2,238	\$ 2,687	\$ 1,168,377	\$ 1,402,614
Planner I	5277	1.0	\$ 2,756	\$ 3,308	\$ 71,920	\$ 86,339
Executive Secretary I	1450	2.0	\$ 2,775	\$ 3,331	\$ 144,841	\$ 173,878
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124	5.0	\$ 2,683	\$ 3,221	\$ 350,144	\$ 420,341
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222	2.0	\$ 2,844	\$ 3,414	\$ 148,450	\$ 178,211
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,254	\$ 5,107	\$ 111,033	\$ 133,293
Accountant II	1652	4.0	\$ 3,037	\$ 3,646	\$ 317,075	\$ 380,642
Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility V	2905	4.0	\$ 2,885	\$ 3,463	\$ 301,160	\$ 361,537
Eligibility Worker Supervisor	2907	1.0	\$ 3,198	\$ 3,839	\$ 83,465	\$ 100,198
Senior Clerk	1406	7.0	\$ 2,103	\$ 2,525	\$ 384,277	\$ 461,318
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	\$ 2,516	\$ 3,021	\$ 197,041	\$ 236,544
Human Resources Analyst	1241	2.0	\$ 3,438	\$ 4,128	\$ 179,476	\$ 215,457
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					\$ 518,168	\$ 621,670
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					\$ 674,532	\$ 809,550
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					\$ -	\$ -
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 95,150	\$ 95,150
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 64,350	\$ 64,350
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)					\$ 2,000	\$ 2,000
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$600/person/year)					\$ 8,400	\$ 8,400
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 1,050	\$ 1,050
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 2,250	\$ 2,250
Total FTE		426.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 28,913,409	\$ 34,709,974
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,365,900	\$ 1,604,420

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 40,299
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 40,299
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7382	\$ 52,920
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	\$ 46,966
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7410	\$ 38,932
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1931	\$ 41,182
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	\$ 37,723
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	\$ 49,520
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177	\$ 65,485
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	\$ 54,893
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9520	\$ 56,916
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1705	\$ 38,997
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1704	\$ 36,635
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	5277	\$ 42,319
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1450	\$ 41,827
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9124	\$ 40,940
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222	\$ 42,496
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1657	\$ 56,162
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1652	\$ 45,040
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2905	\$ 43,535
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2907	\$ 46,567
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406	\$ 35,329
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1632	\$ 39,328
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1241	\$ 47,959
Total Fringe Benefits		
	Low	High
	\$ 15,654,440	\$ 17,511,777

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years		
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	28,000	4	\$	1,446,340
Van, Type A, life equipped	49	56,000	4	\$	708,707
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	60,000	4	\$	991,776
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	45,000	4	\$	290,559
2 way radios	338	50	4	\$	4,365
Mobile Data Computers	200	1,900	4	\$	98,145
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.9 at \$3.57 per gallon)				\$	1,502,082
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)				\$	861,446
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)				\$	1,127,623
Total Capital & Operating				\$	7,031,043
				\$	7,257,109

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 52,964,792	\$ 61,083,280
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 31,636,493	\$ 31,682,916
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 21,328,298	\$ 29,400,364
% of Savings to City Cost	40%	48%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1984 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. MTA originally proposed using a job class, Chauffeur, that does not currently exist. CON replaced with the most similar existing job class, Transit Operator.

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operator	9163	178.0	\$ 2,500	\$ 3,001	\$ 11,613,724	\$ 13,942,046
Transit Operator	9163	121.0	\$ 2,500	\$ 3,001	\$ 7,894,723	\$ 9,477,458
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,680	\$ 4,418	\$ 192,106	\$ 230,620
Automotive Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,057	\$ 3,670	\$ 957,487	\$ 1,149,444
Automotive Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$ 2,462	\$ 2,956	\$ 514,138	\$ 617,213
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931	1.0	\$ 2,708	\$ 3,251	\$ 70,681	\$ 84,851
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 429,478	\$ 515,579
Transit Supervisor	9139	15.0	\$ 3,414	\$ 4,099	\$ 1,336,764	\$ 1,604,759
Manager III, MTA	9177	3.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 372,624	\$ 447,328
Transit Manager I	9140	7.0	\$ 4,033	\$ 4,841	\$ 736,747	\$ 884,451
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520	1.0	\$ 4,245	\$ 5,096	\$ 110,794	\$ 133,006
Communications Dispatcher II	1705	29.0	\$ 2,482	\$ 2,980	\$ 1,878,883	\$ 2,255,562
Communications Dispatcher I	1704	21.0	\$ 2,238	\$ 2,687	\$ 1,226,796	\$ 1,472,745
Planner I	5277	1.0	\$ 2,756	\$ 3,308	\$ 71,920	\$ 86,339
Executive Secretary I	1450	2.0	\$ 2,775	\$ 3,331	\$ 144,841	\$ 173,878
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124	5.0	\$ 2,683	\$ 3,221	\$ 350,144	\$ 420,341
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222	2.0	\$ 2,844	\$ 3,414	\$ 148,450	\$ 178,211
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	\$ 4,254	\$ 5,107	\$ 111,033	\$ 133,293
Accountant II	1652	4.0	\$ 3,037	\$ 3,646	\$ 317,075	\$ 380,642
Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility V	2905	4.0	\$ 2,885	\$ 3,463	\$ 301,160	\$ 361,537
Eligibility Worker Supervisor	2907	1.0	\$ 3,198	\$ 3,839	\$ 83,465	\$ 100,198
Senior Clerk	1406	7.0	\$ 2,103	\$ 2,525	\$ 384,277	\$ 461,318
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	\$ 2,516	\$ 3,021	\$ 197,041	\$ 236,544
Human Resources Analyst	1241	2.0	\$ 3,455	\$ 4,148	\$ 180,373	\$ 216,535
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					\$ 589,367	\$ 707,635
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					\$ 791,963	\$ 950,884
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					\$ -	\$ -
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 97,900	\$ 97,900
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 66,550	\$ 66,550
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)					\$ 2,000	\$ 2,000
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$600/person/year)					\$ 8,400	\$ 8,400
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 300	\$ 300
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 300	\$ 300
Total FTE		437.0			\$ 29,624,725	\$ 35,563,895
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,556,780	\$ 1,833,969

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 41,504
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 41,504
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7382	\$ 54,371
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	\$ 48,323
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7410	\$ 40,064
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1931	\$ 42,348
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	\$ 38,835
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	\$ 50,865
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177	\$ 67,602
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	\$ 56,941
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9520	\$ 58,387
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1705	\$ 40,129
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1704	\$ 37,730
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	5277	\$ 43,526
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1450	\$ 43,003
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9124	\$ 42,103
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222	\$ 43,683
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1657	\$ 57,596
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1652	\$ 46,291
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2905	\$ 44,759
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2907	\$ 47,838
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406	\$ 36,404
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1632	\$ 40,465
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1241	\$ 49,389
Total Fringe Benefits		
		Low \$ 16,491,742 High \$ 18,483,862

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years		
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	28,000	4	\$ 1,491,177	\$ 1,491,177
Van, Type A, life equipped	49	56,000	4	\$ 730,677	\$ 730,677
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	60,000	4	\$ 1,022,521	\$ 1,022,521
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	45,000	4	\$ 299,567	\$ 299,567
2 way radios	338	50	4	\$ 4,500	\$ 4,500
Mobile Data Computers	200	1,900	4	\$ 101,187	\$ 101,187
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.9 at \$3.57 per gallon)				\$ 1,548,647	\$ 1,548,647
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)				\$ 888,151	\$ 888,151
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in pratt)				\$ 1,155,364	\$ 1,386,992
Total Capital & Operating				\$ 7,241,790	\$ 7,473,418

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 54,915,037	\$ 63,355,144
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 32,426,559	\$ 32,473,401
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 22,488,478	\$ 30,881,744
% of Savings to City Cost	41%	49%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1984 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. MTA originally proposed using a job class, Chauffeur, that does not currently exist. CON replaced with the most similar existing job class, Transit Operator.