



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Citations Processing Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_

Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Diana Hammons, Senior Manager

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Citations (18730)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

**FISCAL YEAR 2024-25**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	4.70	\$ 959,921	\$ 1,180,123
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	5.30	\$ 1,156,835	\$ 1,419,330
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.96	\$ 302,543	\$ 370,993
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C_MTA	4.00	\$ 566,374	\$ 692,705
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C_MTA	4.40	\$ 736,447	\$ 905,458
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C_MTA	3.30	\$ 632,889	\$ 779,449
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.49	\$ 106,407	\$ 130,579
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 145,695	\$ 176,121
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	2.38	\$ 410,150	\$ 497,481
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.20	\$ 1,082,339	\$ 1,270,857
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 652,472	\$ 772,851
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.10	\$ 358,423	\$ 423,114
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.30	\$ 1,192,137	\$ 1,412,047
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 165,828	\$ 197,453
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.23	\$ 945,348	\$ 1,124,492
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.10	\$ 19,930	\$ 24,686
Permit and Citation Clerk	9504_C_MTA	8.05	\$ 947,632	\$ 1,120,385
Senior Permit and Citation Clerk	9506_C_MTA	6.05	\$ 771,447	\$ 913,767
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>77.76</b>	<b>\$ 11,152,817</b>	<b>\$ 13,411,891</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates
Workstation	60	Price: \$3592; Useful Life: 5	\$ 43,104	\$ 43,104
Computers	60	Price: \$1500; Useful Life: 5	\$ 18,000	\$ 18,000
Tough Book Laptops	5	Price: \$3000; Useful Life: 5	\$ 3,000	\$ 3,000
Printers	35	Price: \$600; Useful Life: 5	\$ 4,200	\$ 4,200
Postage	0		\$ 369,951	\$ 369,951
Merchant Fees	0		\$ 790,405	\$ 790,405
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	0		\$ 24,759	\$ 24,759
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	0		\$ 7,576	\$ 7,576
Handheld Devices	0		\$ 144,639	\$ 144,639
Tickets/Envelopes	0		\$ 37,262	\$ 37,262
MTA Overhead	0		\$ 11,063,594	\$ 13,304,596
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 12,506,490</b>	<b>\$ 14,747,492</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 23,659,307 \$ 28,159,383**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 23,659,307	\$ 28,159,383
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 7,362,919	\$ 7,653,450
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 16,296,388</b>	<b>\$ 20,505,933</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>68.88%</b>	<b>72.82%</b>

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Citations (18730)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2025-26

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 211,455	\$ 260,160
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 225,929	\$ 277,388
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.94	\$ 310,427	\$ 380,303
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 146,850	\$ 179,424
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 173,437	\$ 213,053
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C_MTA	0.50	\$ 99,305	\$ 122,307
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.14	\$ 32,477	\$ 39,831
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 151,078	\$ 182,458
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 178,737	\$ 216,620
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.20	\$ 1,125,164	\$ 1,319,587
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 677,052	\$ 801,209
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.10	\$ 372,121	\$ 438,843
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.30	\$ 1,236,889	\$ 1,463,695
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 171,840	\$ 204,457
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.25	\$ 983,670	\$ 1,169,138
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.10	\$ 20,667	\$ 25,611
Senior Permit and Citation Clerk	9506_C_MTA	8.08	\$ 1,068,578	\$ 1,264,519
Principal Permit and Citation Clerk	9508_C_MTA	6.08	\$ 864,294	\$ 1,024,713
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>58.89</b>	<b>\$ 8,049,970</b>	<b>\$ 9,583,316</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COST**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26 Low Estimate	FY 2025-26 High Estimates
Postage	0		\$ 379,458	\$ 379,458
Merchant Fees	0		\$ 810,718	\$ 810,718
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	0		\$ 25,395	\$ 25,395
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	0		\$ 7,770	\$ 7,770
Handheld Devices	0		\$ 148,356	\$ 148,356
Tickets/Envelopes	0		\$ 38,220	\$ 38,220
Workstation	60	Price: \$3,685; Useful Life: 5	\$ 44,220	\$ 44,220
Computers	60	Price: \$1,538; Useful Life: 5	\$ 18,456	\$ 18,456
Tough Book Laptops	5	Price: \$3,077; Useful Life: 5	\$ 3,077	\$ 3,077
Printers	35	Price: \$615; Useful Life: 5	\$ 4,305	\$ 4,305
MTA Overhead	0		\$ 7,985,570	\$ 9,506,649
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 9,465,545</b>	<b>\$ 10,986,624</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 17,515,515 \$ 20,569,940**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 17,515,515	\$ 20,569,940
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 7,844,471	\$ 8,051,418
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 9,671,044</b>	<b>\$ 12,518,522</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>55.21%</b>	<b>60.86%</b>