

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

MEMORANDUM

TO: Greg Wagner, City Controller, Office of the Controller

FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk, Rules Committee
Board of Supervisors

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Victor Young".

DATE: June 24, 2024

SUBJECT: INITIATIVE ORDINANCE INTRODUCED
November 5, 2024, Election

The Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee has received the following matter for the November 5, 2024, Election. This matter is being **referred** to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.3.

File No. 240692 (ver1)

Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, an Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff's Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators.

Please review and prepare a financial analysis of the proposed measure prior to the first Rules Committee hearing.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7723 or email: victor.young@sfgov.org. To submit documentation, please email or forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Todd Rydstrom, Office of the Controller
Natasha Mihal, Office of the Controller
Janice Levy, Office of the Controller



City and County of San Francisco

Master Report

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

File Number: 240692 **File Type:** Motion **Status:** 30 Day Rule

Enacted: _____ **Effective:** _____

Version: 1 **In Control:** Rules Committee

File Name: Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund **Date Introduced:** 06/18/2024

Requester: _____ **Cost:** _____ **Final Action:** _____

Comment: _____ **Title:** Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, an Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff's Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators.

Sponsors: Safai; Walton

History of Legislative File 240692

Ver	Acting Body	Date	Action	Sent To	Due Date	Result
1	Clerk of the Board	06/13/2024	RECEIVED			
1	President	06/18/2024	ASSIGNED UNDER 30 DAY RULE	Rules Committee	07/18/2024	

1 [Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund]

2

3 **Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024,**
4 **an Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder**
5 **Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans,**
6 **and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City,**
7 **for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or**
8 **Sheriff’s Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors,**
9 **or coordinators.**

10

11 MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby submits the following ordinance to the
12 voters of the City and County of San Francisco, at an election to be held on November 5,
13 2024.

14

15 **Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student**
16 **Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-**
17 **related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for**
18 **employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or**
19 **Sheriff’s Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors,**
20 **or coordinators.**

21

22

NOTE: **Unchanged Code text and uncodified text** are in plain font.
Additions to Codes are in *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.
Deletions to Codes are in *strikethrough italics Times New Roman font*.
Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Code
23 subsections or parts of tables.
24
25

1 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

2
3 Section 1. Article XIII of Chapter 10 of the Administrative Code is hereby amended by
4 adding Section 10.100-72.5, to read as follows:

5 **SEC. 10.100-72.5. FIRST RESPONDER STUDENT LOAN FORGIVENESS FUND.**

6 (a) Establishment of Fund. The First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund (the
7 “Fund”) is hereby established as a category four fund to receive any monies appropriated or donated
8 for the purpose of making student loan payments to or on behalf of Eligible Employees and reimbursing
9 Eligible Employees for the costs of job-related education and training they receive during their City
10 employment.

11 (b) Definitions. For the purpose of this Section 10.100-72.5, the following definitions shall
12 apply:

13 “Covered Position” shall mean a sworn member of the Police Department, Fire Department, or
14 Sheriff’s Department; paramedic; registered nurse; or 911 dispatcher, supervisor, or coordinator.

15 “Eligible Employee” shall mean a City employee who (1) was hired by the City on or after
16 January 1, 2025 in a Covered Position or who transitioned into a Covered Position on or after January
17 1, 2025, and (2) subsequently has worked full-time in a Covered Position for at least three consecutive
18 years.

19 **(c) Use and Administration of the Fund.**

20 (1) Subject to any required meet and confer processes or bargaining with employee
21 labor organizations, and after the Controller certifies that the Fund contains at least \$1,000,000, the
22 Department of Human Resources (the “Department”) may establish a program under which the City
23 may make payments to or on behalf of Eligible Employees to cover those employees’ outstanding
24 student loans or to reimburse those employees for the costs of job-related education and training they
25 receive during their City employment, up to a maximum of \$25,000 per Eligible Employee. The

1 Department shall adopt rules and procedures to govern the program, including but not limited to
2 additional eligibility criteria consistent with this Section 10.100-72.5 for Eligible Employees,
3 application processes, procedures for determining the amount of funds to pay to or on behalf of an
4 Eligible Employee, procedures for disbursing funds, and plans for informing Eligible Employees about
5 the program.

6 (2) After consultation with the Controller, the Department shall approve all
7 expenditures from the Fund, consistent with this Section 10.100-72.5 and the terms of any Memoranda
8 of Understanding between the City and employee labor organizations.

9 (d) Amendments. Notwithstanding the provisions of Charter Section 14.101, the Board of
10 Supervisors by ordinance may amend or repeal this Section 10.100-72.5.

11
12 APPROVED AS TO FORM:
13 DAVID CHIU, City Attorney
14

15 By: /s/
16 JON GIVNER
17 Deputy City Attorney

18 n:\legana\as2024\2400417\01765712.docx

LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

[Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund]

Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, an Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff's Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators.

Existing Law

The City currently does not have a specific fund into which the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor can appropriate money, or receive donations, to support the costs of a program to provide payments to cover City employees' student loans or job-related educational and training expenses, except where those expenses are reimbursable under labor agreements with employee unions or under existing City reimbursement policies. Current labor agreements between the City and employee labor organizations, which govern City employee benefits, do not require the operation of such a program.

Amendments to Current Law

The proposed initiative ordinance would establish a new fund. The Board of Supervisors and the Mayor could appropriate money into the fund in the future, or the City could receive donations to the fund in the future. Once the fund contains \$1,000,000, and after any necessary amendments to the City's labor agreements with employee unions, the Department of Human Resources could make payments from the fund to cover outstanding student loans or reimburse the costs of job-related education and training for the following City employees: sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff's Department; paramedics; registered nurses; and 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators. The Department of Human Resources could adopt rules and procedures for the program, but payments would be limited to a maximum of \$25,000 per employee.

The initiative ordinance does not create or require a loan forgiveness program or an education and training payment program, and it does not appropriate money for such a program. Any such program would need to be consistent with the terms of any labor agreements between the City and employee unions.

Introduction Form

(by a Member of the Board of Supervisors or the Mayor)



I hereby submit the following item for introduction (select only one):

- 1. For reference to Committee (Ordinance, Resolution, Motion or Charter Amendment)
- 2. Request for next printed agenda (For Adoption Without Committee Reference)
(Routine, non-controversial and/or commendatory matters only)
- 3. Request for Hearing on a subject matter at Committee
- 4. Request for Letter beginning with "Supervisor inquiries..."
- 5. City Attorney Request
- 6. Call File No. from Committee.
- 7. Budget and Legislative Analyst Request (attached written Motion)
- 8. Substitute Legislation File No.
- 9. Reactivate File No.
- 10. Topic submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the Board on

The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the following (please check all appropriate boxes):

- Small Business Commission Youth Commission Ethics Commission
- Planning Commission Building Inspection Commission Human Resources Department

General Plan Referral sent to the Planning Department (proposed legislation subject to Charter 4.105 & Admin 2A.53):

- Yes No

(Note: For Imperative Agenda items (a Resolution not on the printed agenda), use the Imperative Agenda Form.)

Sponsor(s):

Subject:

Long Title or text listed:

Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor:



From: [Carrillo, Lila \(BOS\)](#)
To: [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Gee, Natalie \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund
Date: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:26:26 PM
Attachments: [Introduction Form -Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund.pdf](#)
[Initiative ordinance - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund \(Final\).docx](#)
[Leg Digest - Initiative ordinance - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund.docx](#)
Importance: High

Dear Clerk Staff,

Attached please find **Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund** for introduction at the June 18th Board of Supervisor's meeting.

I am copying Natalie Gee from Supervisor Walton's office to confirm co-sponsorship.

Kindly,
Lila

Lila Carrillo, Legislative Aide
Supervisor Ahsha Safai, District 11
San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Office: 415.554.6975

Working from unceded Ohlone Territory

From: [Givner, Jon \(CAT\)](#)
To: [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Carrillo, Lila \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Gee, Natalie \(BOS\)](#); [PEARSON, ANNE \(CAT\)](#)
Subject: RE: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund
Date: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:32:56 PM

I approve as to form.

Jon

Jon Givner (he/him)
Deputy City Attorney
Office of City Attorney David Chiu
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
San Francisco, CA 94102
phone: (415) 554-4694
www.sfcityattorney.org

The information in this email is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client privilege and/or the attorney work product doctrine. If you are not the intended recipient of this email or received this email inadvertently, please notify the sender and delete it.

From: BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>
Sent: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:30 PM
To: Carrillo, Lila (BOS) <lila.carrillo@sfgov.org>; BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>; Givner, Jon (CAT) <Jon.Givner@sfcityatty.org>
Cc: Safai, Ahsha (BOS) <ahsha.safai@sfgov.org>; Walton, Shamann (BOS) <shamann.walton@sfgov.org>; Gee, Natalie (BOS) <natalie.gee@sfgov.org>
Subject: RE: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund

We are seeking the approval from Deputy City Attorney Jon Givner, for use of his electronic signature and approval as to form for the proposed Initiative Ordinance, by reply to this email. Thank you.

Jocelyn Wong
Legislative Clerk
San Francisco Board of Supervisors
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102
T: 415.554.7702 | F: 415.554.5163
jocelyn.wong@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org

(VIRTUAL APPOINTMENTS) To schedule a “virtual” meeting with me (on Microsoft Teams), please ask and I can answer your questions in real time.

Click [HERE](#) to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The [Legislative Research Center](#) provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: *Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.*

From: Carrillo, Lila (BOS) <lila.carrillo@sfgov.org>

Sent: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:26 PM

To: BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>

Cc: Safai, Ahsha (BOS) <ahsha.safai@sfgov.org>; Walton, Shamann (BOS) <shamann.walton@sfgov.org>; Gee, Natalie (BOS) <natalie.gee@sfgov.org>

Subject: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safaí - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund

Importance: High

Dear Clerk Staff,

Attached please find **Safaí - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund** for introduction at the June 18th Board of Supervisor's meeting.

I am copying Natalie Gee from Supervisor Walton's office to confirm co-sponsorship.

Kindly,
Lila

Lila Carrillo, Legislative Aide
Supervisor Ahsha Safai, District 11
San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Office: 415.554.6975

Working from unceded Ohlone Territory

From: [Gee, Natalie \(BOS\)](#)
To: [GIVNER, JON \(CAT\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#); [Carrillo, Lila \(BOS\)](#); [BOS Legislation, \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [PEARSON, ANNE \(CAT\)](#)
Subject: RE: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund
Date: Tuesday, June 18, 2024 8:43:44 AM

Confirming for Supervisor Walton. Thank you!

Natalie Gee 朱凱勤, Chief of Staff

Supervisor Shamann Walton, District 10

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Pl, San Francisco | Room 282

Direct: 415.554.7672 | **Office:** 415.554.7670

District 10 Community Events Calendar: <https://bit.ly/d10communityevents>

From: Givner, Jon (CAT) <Jon.Givner@sfcityatty.org>
Sent: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:32 PM
To: BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>; Carrillo, Lila (BOS) <lila.carrillo@sfgov.org>; BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>
Cc: Safai, Ahsha (BOS) <ahsha.safai@sfgov.org>; Walton, Shamann (BOS) <shamann.walton@sfgov.org>; Gee, Natalie (BOS) <natalie.gee@sfgov.org>; PEARSON, ANNE (CAT) <Anne.Pearson@sfcityatty.org>
Subject: RE: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund

I approve as to form.

Jon

Jon Givner (he/him)
Deputy City Attorney
Office of City Attorney David Chiu
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 234
San Francisco, CA 94102
phone: (415) 554-4694
www.sfcityattorney.org

The information in this email is confidential and may be protected by the attorney/client privilege and/or the attorney work product doctrine. If you are not the intended recipient of this email or received this email inadvertently, please notify the sender and delete it.

From: BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>
Sent: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:30 PM
To: Carrillo, Lila (BOS) <lila.carrillo@sfgov.org>; BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>; Givner, Jon (CAT) <Jon.Givner@sfcityatty.org>
Cc: Safai, Ahsha (BOS) <ahsha.safai@sfgov.org>; Walton, Shamann (BOS)

<shamann.walton@sfgov.org>; Gee, Natalie (BOS) <natalie.gee@sfgov.org>

Subject: RE: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safaí - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund

We are seeking the approval from Deputy City Attorney Jon Givner, for use of his electronic signature and approval as to form for the proposed Initiative Ordinance, by reply to this email. Thank you.

Jocelyn Wong

Legislative Clerk

San Francisco Board of Supervisors

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244

San Francisco, CA 94102

T: 415.554.7702 | F: 415.554.5163

jocelyn.wong@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org

(VIRTUAL APPOINTMENTS) To schedule a “virtual” meeting with me (on Microsoft Teams), please ask and I can answer your questions in real time.

Click [HERE](#) to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The [Legislative Research Center](#) provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: *Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.*

From: Carrillo, Lila (BOS) <lila.carrillo@sfgov.org>

Sent: Thursday, June 13, 2024 3:26 PM

To: BOS Legislation, (BOS) <bos.legislation@sfgov.org>

Cc: Safai, Ahsha (BOS) <ahsha.safai@sfgov.org>; Walton, Shamann (BOS) <shamann.walton@sfgov.org>; Gee, Natalie (BOS) <natalie.gee@sfgov.org>

Subject: FOR INTRODUCTION: Safaí - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund

Importance: High

Dear Clerk Staff,

Attached please find **Safai - Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund** for introduction at the June 18th Board of Supervisor's meeting.

I am copying Natalie Gee from Supervisor Walton's office to confirm co-sponsorship.

Kindly,
Lila

Lila Carrillo, Legislative Aide
Supervisor Ahsha Safai, District 11
San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Office: 415.554.6975

Working from unceded Ohlone Territory

[Initiative Ordinance - Administrative Code - First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund]

Motion ordering submitted to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, an Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff’s Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators.

MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby submits the following ordinance to the voters of the City and County of San Francisco, at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to establish a First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund for the purpose of paying outstanding student loans, and job-related educational and training expenses incurred while employed by the City, for employees who are sworn members of the Police Department, Fire Department, or Sheriff’s Department; paramedics; registered nurses; or 911 dispatchers, supervisors, or coordinators.

NOTE: **Unchanged Code text and uncodified text** are in plain font.
Additions to Codes are in *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.
Deletions to Codes are in *strikethrough italics Times New Roman font*.
Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Code subsections or parts of tables.

1 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

2
3 Section 1. Article XIII of Chapter 10 of the Administrative Code is hereby amended by
4 adding Section 10.100-72.5, to read as follows:

5 **SEC. 10.100-72.5. FIRST RESPONDER STUDENT LOAN FORGIVENESS FUND.**

6 (a) Establishment of Fund. The First Responder Student Loan Forgiveness Fund (the
7 “Fund”) is hereby established as a category four fund to receive any monies appropriated or donated
8 for the purpose of making student loan payments to or on behalf of Eligible Employees and reimbursing
9 Eligible Employees for the costs of job-related education and training they receive during their City
10 employment.

11 (b) Definitions. For the purpose of this Section 10.100-72.5, the following definitions shall
12 apply:

13 “Covered Position” shall mean a sworn member of the Police Department, Fire Department, or
14 Sheriff’s Department; paramedic; registered nurse; or 911 dispatcher, supervisor, or coordinator.

15 “Eligible Employee” shall mean a City employee who (1) was hired by the City on or after
16 January 1, 2025 in a Covered Position or who transitioned into a Covered Position on or after January
17 1, 2025, and (2) subsequently has worked full-time in a Covered Position for at least three consecutive
18 years.

19 **(c) Use and Administration of the Fund.**

20 (1) Subject to any required meet and confer processes or bargaining with employee
21 labor organizations, and after the Controller certifies that the Fund contains at least \$1,000,000, the
22 Department of Human Resources (the “Department”) may establish a program under which the City
23 may make payments to or on behalf of Eligible Employees to cover those employees’ outstanding
24 student loans or to reimburse those employees for the costs of job-related education and training they
25 receive during their City employment, up to a maximum of \$25,000 per Eligible Employee. The

1 Department shall adopt rules and procedures to govern the program, including but not limited to
2 additional eligibility criteria consistent with this Section 10.100-72.5 for Eligible Employees,
3 application processes, procedures for determining the amount of funds to pay to or on behalf of an
4 Eligible Employee, procedures for disbursing funds, and plans for informing Eligible Employees about
5 the program.

6 (2) After consultation with the Controller, the Department shall approve all
7 expenditures from the Fund, consistent with this Section 10.100-72.5 and the terms of any Memoranda
8 of Understanding between the City and employee labor organizations.

9 (d) Amendments. Notwithstanding the provisions of Charter Section 14.101, the Board of
10 Supervisors by ordinance may amend or repeal this Section 10.100-72.5.

11
12 APPROVED AS TO FORM:
13 DAVID CHIU, City Attorney
14

15 By: /s/
16 JON GIVNER
17 Deputy City Attorney

18 n:\legana\as2024\2400417\01765712.docx