

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184  
Fax No. (415) 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

# MEMORANDUM

## RULES COMMITTEE

### SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

TO: Supervisor Hillary Ronen, Chair  
Rules Committee

FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk *Victor Young*

DATE: July 22, 2024

SUBJECT: **COMMITTEE REPORT, BOARD MEETING**  
Tuesday, July 23, 2024

The following file should be presented as a **COMMITTEE REPORT** at the Board Meeting on Tuesday, July 23, 2024. This item was acted upon at the Rules Committee Meeting on Monday, July 22, 2024, at 10:00 a.m., by the votes indicated.

**Item No. 55                      File No. 240552**

Charter Amendment - Fire Department Service Retirement Pension]

Charter Amendment (Third Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

RECOMMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT

Vote: Supervisor Shamann Walton - Aye  
Supervisor Aaron Peskin - Aye  
Supervisor Ahsha Safai - Aye

c: Board of Supervisors  
Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board  
Alisa Somera, Legislative Deputy Director  
Anne Pearson, Deputy City Attorney

File No. 240552

Committee Item No. 1

Board Item No. \_\_\_\_\_

# COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

## AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Rules Committee

Date July 22, 2024

Board of Supervisors Meeting

Date \_\_\_\_\_

### Cmte Board

- Motion
- Resolution
- Ordinance
- Legislative Digest
- Budget and Legislative Analyst Report
- Youth Commission Report
- Introduction Form
- Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report
- Memorandum of Understanding (MOU)
- Grant Information Form
- Grant Budget
- Subcontract Budget
- Contract/Agreement
- Form 126 - Ethics Commission
- Award Letter
- Application
- Form 700
- Information/Vacancies (Boards/Commissions)
- Public Correspondence

### OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

- Charter Amendment
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_
- \_\_\_\_\_

Completed by: Victor Young

Date July 18, 2024

Completed by: \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

1 [Charter Amendment - Fire Department Service Retirement Pension]

2  
3 **Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters at an election to be held on November**  
4 **5, 2024, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age**  
5 **factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become**  
6 **members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor**  
7 **percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who**  
8 **have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach**  
9 **the highest age factor percentage.**

10  
11 Section 1. Findings.

12 (a) In November 2011, San Francisco voters approved Proposition C to reform the  
13 City and County of San Francisco's (City) retirement and health benefits systems. This reform  
14 was a response to the disastrous fiscal impacts of the 2008 Great Recession that significantly  
15 reduced the City's revenues and caused the retirement fund to drop from being fully funded to  
16 being only partially funded. This drop in funding status required the City to substantially  
17 increase its employer contributions, further exacerbating the City's budget deficit.

18 (b) Proposition C amended the Charter to increase pension contribution rates for  
19 employees hired on and after January 7, 2012. In addition, it raised the retirement ages for which  
20 members of the Fire Department hired on and after January 7, 2012 receive the highest  
21 percentage for each year of credited service for retirement benefit calculations and raised the age  
22 at which employees reach the highest percentage from age 55 to 58.

23 (c) In the more than 12 years since this pension reform, the financial outlook of the  
24 San Francisco Employees' Retirement System has improved significantly.

25 (d) Members of the Fire Department uniquely face both short- and long-term health

1 complications as a result of their occupation. The City relies on our firefighters to be the first  
2 responders to a plethora of dangerous circumstances, most notably active fires but also many  
3 other instances of trauma or tragedy. Beyond these immediate high-risk threats, the conditions  
4 that City firefighters endure have demonstrably increased their risk of adverse long-term health  
5 impacts. According to the San Francisco Firefighters Cancer Prevention Foundation, San  
6 Francisco’s female firefighters have a rate of breast cancer that is six times higher than the  
7 national average, and over the past 20 years, the Fire Department has lost more than 300  
8 firefighters to cancer. Furthermore, national research shows that firefighters experience higher  
9 rates of behavioral health issues than the general public. According to the International  
10 Association of Fire Fighters, 20% of firefighters and paramedics meet the criteria for post-  
11 traumatic stress at some point during their careers, while the National Fallen Firefighters  
12 Foundation reports that the suicide rate for firefighters is higher than the rate for the general  
13 public.

14 (e) Additionally, the Fire Department has few positions that are not directly in the  
15 field, meaning that members of the Fire Department are asked to enter active fires and other  
16 dangerous circumstances regardless of their age. In 2024, only approximately 180 out of 1800  
17 positions in the San Francisco Fire Department are not “in the field” or on frontline service  
18 delivery, and these jobs are dependent on promotions, not seniority of employee tenure. As a  
19 result, the risk of severe injury and health complications is further heightened for members of the  
20 Fire Department over age 55, as demonstrated by data from the Department of Human Resources  
21 that show a positive correlation between increased age, number of injuries, and workers’  
22 compensation claim costs.

23 (f) This Charter amendment aims to recognize the distinctive and brave work of the  
24 members of the Fire Department and to lessen the adverse health impacts firefighters experience.  
25 By allowing members of the Fire Department to retire with up to 90% of their final

1 compensation at age 55 while maintaining the increased contribution rates for employees  
2 imposed by Proposition C in 2011, the City simultaneously accomplishes these important goals.  
3 In doing so, the City ensures that our firefighters can enter retirement with financial security  
4 without facing an additional three years of potential health risks.

5 Section 2. The Board of Supervisors hereby submits to the qualified voters of the City  
6 and County, at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, a proposal to amend the Charter of  
7 the City and County by revising Sections A8.604, A8.604-1, and A8.604-2, and adding Section  
8 A8.604-17, to read as follows:

9 NOTE: **Unchanged Charter text and uncodified text** are in plain font.  
10 **Additions** are *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.  
11 **Deletions** are ~~*strike-through italics Times New Roman font*~~.  
12 **Asterisks (\* \* \* \*)** indicate the omission of unchanged Charter  
13 subsections.

14 **A8.604 MEMBERS OF THE FIRE DEPARTMENT ON AND AFTER JANUARY**  
15 **7, 2012**

16 Persons who become members of the fire department, as defined in Section A8.604-1,  
17 on and after January 7, 2012, shall be members of the Retirement System subject to the  
18 provisions of Sections A8.604 through A8.604-17~~6~~ in addition to such other applicable  
19 provisions of this Charter, including but not limited to Sections 12.100 and A8.500.

20 **A8.604-1 DEFINITIONS**

21 The following words and phrases as used in this Section, Section A8.604~~2~~, and Sections  
22 A8.604-2 through A8.604-17~~6~~, unless a different meaning is plainly required by the context,  
23 shall have the following meanings:

24 "Retirement allowance," "death allowance~~2~~," or "allowance," shall mean equal monthly  
25 payments, beginning to accrue upon the date of retirement, or upon the day following the date of  
death, as the case may be, and continuing for life unless a different term of payment is definitely  
provided by the context.

1 "Compensation," as distinguished from benefits under the Workers' Compensation laws  
2 of the State of California shall mean all remuneration whether in cash or by other allowances  
3 made by the City and County, for service qualifying for credit under this Section, but excluding  
4 remuneration for overtime and such other forms of compensation excluded by the Board of  
5 Supervisors pursuant to Section A8.500 of the Charter. Remuneration shall not mean new  
6 premiums or allowances first paid by the City and County after January 7, 2012, that exceed the  
7 rate of pay fixed for each classification for service qualifying for credit under this Section. For  
8 members with concurrent service in more than one position, "compensation" shall be limited to  
9 the first hours paid during any fiscal year equal to one full-time equivalent position.

10 "Compensation" for any fiscal year shall not include remuneration that exceeds 75% of the limits  
11 set forth in Internal Revenue Code Section 401(a)(17) and as amended from time to time.

12 Subject to the requirements that it be payable in cash, and that overtime and new  
13 premiums or allowances first paid by the City and County after January 7, 2012 are excluded,  
14 "compensation" for pension purposes may be defined in a collective bargaining agreement.

15 "Compensation earnable" shall mean the compensation which would have been earned  
16 had the member received compensation without interruption throughout the period under  
17 consideration and at the rates of remuneration attached at that time to the ranks or positions held  
18 by ~~him or her~~ the member during such period, it being assumed that during any absence, ~~he or~~  
19 ~~she~~ the member was in the rank or position held by ~~him or her~~ the member at the beginning of  
20 the absence, and that prior to becoming a member of the fire department, ~~he or she~~ the member  
21 was in the rank or position first held by ~~him or her~~ the member in such department.

22 "Benefit" shall include "allowance," "retirement allowance," "death allowance" and  
23 "death benefit."

24 "Final compensation" shall mean the average monthly compensation earned by a  
25 member during the higher of any three consecutive fiscal years of earnings or the thirty six

1 consecutive months of earnings immediately prior to retirement.

2 For the purpose of Sections A8.604 through A8.604-176, the terms "member of the fire  
3 department," "member of the department," or "member" shall mean any member of the fire  
4 department employed on and after January 7, 2012, who was or shall be subject to the Charter  
5 provisions governing entrance requirements of members of the uniformed force of said  
6 department and said terms shall further mean persons employed on and after January 7, 2012, at  
7 an age not greater than the maximum age then prescribed for entrance into employment in said  
8 uniformed force, to perform duties now performed under the titles of pilot of fireboats, or marine  
9 engineer of fireboats; provided, however, that said terms shall not include any person who has  
10 not satisfactorily completed such course of training as may be required by the fire department  
11 prior to assignment to active duty with said department.

12 "Qualified for service retirement," "qualification for service retirement," or "qualified as  
13 to age and service for retirement," as used in this Section and other Sections to which persons  
14 who are members under Section A8.604 are subject, shall mean completion of 25 years of  
15 service and attainment of age 50, said service to be computed under Section A8.604-10.

16 "Retirement System" or "system" shall mean San Francisco City and County  
17 Employees' Retirement System as created in Sections 12.100 and A8.500 of the Charter.

18 "Retirement Board" shall mean "Retirement Board" as created in Section 12.100 of the  
19 Charter.

20 "Charter" shall mean the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco.

21 \* \* \* \*

22 "Interest" shall mean interest at the rate adopted by the Retirement Board.

23 **A8.604-2 SERVICE RETIREMENT**

24 Any member of the fire department, who completes at least five years of service in the  
25 aggregate and attains the age of  ~~fifty~~ (50) years, said service to be computed under Section

1 A8.604-10, may retire for service at ~~his or her~~ the member's option. A member retired after  
 2 meeting the service and age requirements in the preceding sentence, shall receive a retirement  
 3 allowance equal to the percent of final compensation (as defined in Section A8.604-1) set forth  
 4 below opposite ~~his or her~~ the member's age at retirement, taken to the preceding completed  
 5 quarter year, for each year of service, as computed under Section A8.604-10:

<i><b>Age at Retirement</b></i>	<i><b>Percent for Each Year of Credited Service</b></i>
6 <i>50</i>	<i>2.200</i>
7 <i>50<sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.225</i>
8 <i>50<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub></i>	<i>2.250</i>
9 <i>50<sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.275</i>
10 <i>51</i>	<i>2.300</i>
11 <i>51<sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.325</i>
12 <i>51<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub></i>	<i>2.350</i>
13 <i>51<sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.375</i>
14 <i>52</i>	<i>2.400</i>
15 <i>52<sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.425</i>
16 <i>52<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub></i>	<i>2.450</i>
17 <i>52<sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.475</i>
18 <i>53</i>	<i>2.500</i>
19 <i>53<sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.525</i>
20 <i>53<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub></i>	<i>2.550</i>
21 <i>53<sup>3</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.575</i>
22 <i>54</i>	<i>2.600</i>
23 <i>54<sup>1</sup>/<sub>4</sub></i>	<i>2.625</i>
24 <i>54<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub></i>	<i>2.650</i>

1	54 <sup>3</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.675
2	55	2.700
3	55 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.725
4	55 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>2</sub>	2.750
5	55 <sup>3</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.775
6	56	2.800
7	56 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.825
8	56 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>2</sub>	2.850
9	56 <sup>3</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.875
10	57	2.900
11	57 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.925
12	57 <sup>1</sup> / <sub>2</sub>	2.950
13	57 <sup>3</sup> / <sub>4</sub>	2.975
14	58	3.0

16	<b><u>Age at Retirement</u></b>	<b><u>Percent for Each Year of Credited Service</u></b>
17	<u>50</u>	<u>2.400</u>
18	<u>50.25</u>	<u>2.430</u>
19	<u>50.5</u>	<u>2.460</u>
20	<u>50.75</u>	<u>2.490</u>
21	<u>51</u>	<u>2.520</u>
22	<u>51.25</u>	<u>2.550</u>
23	<u>51.5</u>	<u>2.580</u>
24	<u>51.75</u>	<u>2.610</u>

1	<u>52</u>	<u>2.640</u>
2	<u>52.25</u>	<u>2.670</u>
3	<u>52.5</u>	<u>2.700</u>
4	<u>52.75</u>	<u>2.730</u>
5	<u>53</u>	<u>2.760</u>
6	<u>53.25</u>	<u>2.790</u>
7	<u>53.5</u>	<u>2.820</u>
8	<u>53.75</u>	<u>2.850</u>
9	<u>54</u>	<u>2.880</u>
10	<u>54.25</u>	<u>2.910</u>
11	<u>54.5</u>	<u>2.940</u>
12	<u>54.75</u>	<u>2.970</u>
13	<u>54.75</u>	<u>2.970</u>
14	<u>55+</u>	<u>3.000</u>

15 In no event shall a member's initial retirement allowance exceed ~~90%~~*ninety percent* of  
16 ~~his or her~~ *the member's* average final compensation.

17 **A8.604-17 APPLICABILITY**

18 The amendment to Sections A8.604-1 and A8-604-2, effective January 1, 2025, shall not  
19 apply to any member of the Retirement System who separated from service, retired, or died  
20 before that date, or to that member's continuant.

21 APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
22 DAVID CHIU, City Attorney

23 By: /s/  
24 CECILIA MANGOBA  
25 Deputy City Attorney

n:\legana\as2024\2400432\01772739.docx

**LEGISLATIVE DIGEST**  
(Revised 7/15/2024)

[Charter Amendment – Fire Department Service Retirement Pension]

**Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters at an election to be held on November 5, 2024, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage.**

Existing Law

Persons who are members of the Fire Department and meet age and service requirements receive a service retirement allowance based on their age, final compensation, and years of service. Under Charter Section A8.604-2, persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 attain their highest age factor percentage when they reach age 58. In contrast, persons who became members of the Fire Department before January 7, 2012 attain their highest age factor percentage when they reach age 55. Similarly, persons who became members of the Fire Department before January 7, 2012 attain higher age factor percentages at earlier ages than those who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012.

Amendments to Current Law

This amendment would: 1) align the age factor percentage for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 with those who became members of the Fire Department before that date; and 2) lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage, consistent with persons who join the Fire Department before that date.

n:\legana\as2024\2400432\01772681.docx



---

June 17, 2024

Victor Young  
Assistant Clerk, Rules Committee  
Board of Supervisors  
City Hall, Room 244  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

**RE: File No. 240552 (ver1)**

**Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to shorten to one year the period to calculate “final compensation” for retirement benefits for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; calculate “final compensation” on the basis of average compensation earnable rather than compensation earned for persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after July 7, 2010; change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages; and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.**

Dear Mr. Young:

This letter is the cost and effect report required to be prepared by the San Francisco City and County Employees' Retirement System under Charter Section A8.500.

### **Effect of the Proposed Charter Amendment**

The proposed Charter Amendment will amend the two firefighter retirement benefit plans approved by the voters, and applicable to persons who became or become members of the Fire Department on and after July 1, 2010: Charter Section A8.601 et seq., applicable to members on and after July 1, 2010, and Charter Section A8.604 et seq., applicable to members on and after January 7, 2012.

Under existing law, firefighters receive a service retirement allowance that is a percentage of the two or three years of their highest final compensation depending on the retirement benefit plan. This service retirement allowance is determined by the following formula:

Total Years of Service Credit x Age Factor x Final Compensation = Benefit (in \$)

The Charter proposal changes the final compensation and age factor components of the benefit calculation. These changes have three primary components.

First, the proposal will both increase the factors on which the firefighters' retirement benefit in Charter Section A8.604 will be calculated and these firefighters will reach the maximum factors at an earlier age. For example, currently an A8.604 firefighter retiring at age 50 with 30 years of service will receive a 66% service retirement allowance. Under the Charter proposal, at age 50, the same firefighter would receive a 72% service retirement allowance. The maximum service retirement allowance remains at 90%. The proposal will also lower the age when members of the A8.604 firefighter plan reach the maximum factor of 3% from 58 to 55.

Second, final compensation will be calculated based on any one year in which a firefighter's average final compensation is the highest. Currently, final compensation is calculated based on the member's highest average two or three years' compensation, depending on the retirement benefit plan.

Third, "final compensation" will be based on compensation "earnable" rather than compensation actually earned. Currently, "final compensation" is calculated based on the compensation the member actually earns. Under the Charter proposal, when a firefighter has no actual earnings during the final compensation measurement period, the Retirement System will apply the remuneration attached to other firefighters' rate of pay in their rank or position to determine their monthly service retirement benefit.

### **Cost of the Proposed Charter Amendment**

As required under Charter Section A8.500, Cheiron, the SFERS consulting actuary, has conducted its analysis to estimate the cost and effect of the proposed legislation. Cheiron's analysis is summarized below. The full Cheiron report is attached. Please refer to this report to review Cheiron's assumptions and for further costing detail.

To estimate the cost, Cheiron based its analysis on the July 1, 2023 Actuarial Valuation Report. The report can be found at: <https://mysfers.org/sfers-actuarial-valuation-2023/>.

Should the voters approve the proposal, the normal cost for the impacted firefighter plans will increase by 3.5% of covered payroll. The increase to the normal cost rate is a permanent change that raises costs each year in the future as payroll increases. It represents the increased value in future benefits earned. The unfunded actuarial liabilities (UAL) are expected to increase by \$34.4 million. The increase in UAL represents the amount of money needed today to immediately fund the increased benefits that have already been earned by the firefighter group. However, the UAL will not be immediately funded but instead will be amortized over 15 years, i.e. paid over a 15 year period, in a method designed to keep costs approximately level with payroll. The initial year's payment will increase 3.25% each year until the 15<sup>th</sup> payment is made. There are no further

June 17, 2024

Page 3

payments to the UAL after year 15. In annual dollar terms, the normal cost and UAL payment together result in an estimated increase in employer contributions of \$10.2 million in FY 2026, increasing to \$21.2 million by FY 2040. In FY 2041, the UAL component declines to zero and the estimated normal cost increase is \$16.7 million.

Cheiron estimated the cost of the components of the proposal sequentially. Cheiron first costed the impact of the multiplier/age factor, then added the final averaging period, and finally layered on the earnable compensation component. Thus, the cost of each component is not completely independent of the other components. The breakdown for each component of the Charter proposal is below.

The changes to the multiplier and lowering the maximum retirement age are estimated to increase the normal cost for the impacted firefighter plans by 1.2% of covered payroll. In addition, the UAL is expected to increase by approximately \$13.1 million. Fiscal year 2025-26 costs are expected to be \$3.7 million higher and to increase each year until the UAL is fully amortized. At that time, the ongoing costs will be limited to the increased normal cost.

Adding on to the changes to the multiplier and lowering the maximum retirement age, the proposed changes to the final compensation averaging period, from two or three years to one year, are expected to increase the normal cost rate an additional 1.8% of covered payroll. The UAL will additionally increase by approximately \$19.6 million. Fiscal year 2025-26 costs are expected to be \$5.5 million higher and to increase each year until the UAL is fully amortized. At that time, the ongoing costs will be limited to the increased normal cost.

The proposal to change final compensation calculation from “earned” to “earnable” will have a significant impact only with respect to disability benefits. Cheiron costed the difference with respect to that benefit. The normal cost is anticipated to increase the normal cost rate by an additional 0.5% of covered payroll. The UAL will additionally increase by approximately \$1.7 million. Fiscal year 2025-26 costs are expected to be \$1 million higher and to increase each year until the UAL is fully amortized. At that time, the ongoing costs will be limited to the increased normal cost.

The Retirement System will appear at the Rules Committee hearing on this subject and address Committee member questions.

Very truly yours,



Alison Romano  
CEO & CIO  
San Francisco Employees' Retirement System

Attachment: Cheiron report dated June 2024

June 17, 2024

Page 4

cc: Supervisor Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors  
Supervisor Hilary Ronen, Chair Rules Committee  
Supervisor Shamann Walton, Rules Committee  
Supervisor Ahsha Safai, Rules Committee  
Angela Cavillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

**Via Electronic Mail**

June 17, 2024

Ms. Alison Romano  
 Chief Executive and Investment Officer  
 San Francisco City and County Employees’ Retirement System  
 1145 Market Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
 San Francisco, CA 94103

**Re: Proposed Charter Amendment – Fire Department Service Retirement Pension**

Dear Alison:

As requested, we have estimated the cost impact of the proposed Charter amendment that would improve benefits for members of the fire department covered under Charter sections A8.601 (Prop D) and A8.604 (Prop C). The proposed amendment would:

- Improve the multiplier for each year of service at each retirement age for Prop C members,
- Reduce the averaging period in the determination of final compensation, and
- Change the definition of compensation from “earned” to “earnable” compensation.

The table below summarizes the estimated cost for each component assuming the amendment is effective January 1, 2025, and is first reflected in contribution rates on July 1, 2025. The cost of each component is not independent of the other components. The table shows the costs assuming each component builds on the components from any columns further to the left.

<b>Estimated Increase Due to Proposed Charter Change</b>				
	<b>Multiplier / Retirement Age</b>	<b>Final Averaging Period</b>	<b>Earnable Compensation</b>	<b>Total</b>
Actuarial Liability	\$ 13.1	\$ 19.6	\$ 1.7	\$ 34.4
Normal Cost Rate	1.2%	1.8%	0.5%	3.5%
<b>FYE 2026 Employer Contribution Increase</b>				
Employer Normal Cost	\$ 2.4	\$ 3.6	\$ 0.9	\$ 6.9
UAL Payment	1.3	1.9	0.1	3.3
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 3.7</b>	<b>\$ 5.5</b>	<b>\$ 1.0</b>	<b>\$ 10.2</b>

*Dollar Amounts in Millions*

The increase to the firefighter normal cost rate is a permanent change that raises costs for each year in the future, increasing as a dollar amount as the affected payroll increases. Since Fire members hired prior to January 7, 2012 are currently assumed to be replaced when they retire or otherwise leave SFERS covered employment by members covered by Charter Section A8.604, the affected payroll is expected to grow more rapidly than overall payroll growth. The UAL payment,

however, is an annual payment that increases 3.25% each year for 15 years. After 15 years, there are no further payments. To illustrate these dynamics, the table below shows the expected increase in contributions due to the Charter amendment for select years in the future. These projections assume all assumptions used in the July 1, 2023 valuation are exactly met each year in the future.

<b>Estimated Employer Contribution Increase Sample Fiscal Years</b>			
<b>Fiscal Year Ending</b>	<b>Employer Normal Cost</b>	<b>UAL Payment</b>	<b>Total</b>
2026	\$ 6.9	\$ 3.3	\$ 10.2
2030	9.7	3.7	13.4
2035	12.9	4.4	17.3
2040	16.1	5.1	21.2
2041	16.7	0.0	16.7

*Dollar Amounts in Millions*

## **Basis for Analysis**

Our analysis uses the census data, assumptions, and methods from the July 1, 2023 actuarial valuation. Please refer to that report for a summary of the data, assumptions, and plan provisions applicable to Fire members under the various Charter sections. To value the proposed provisions, we applied the assumptions applicable to “Other than Prop C.”

Valuation results are projected to July 1, 2024 to determine the expected impact on the liability as of July 1, 2024 and contributions for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2026. While the changes are not effective until January 1, 2025, we anticipate reflecting the changes in the July 1, 2024 actuarial valuation so that the amendment is reflected in contribution rates beginning July 1, 2025.

There are some subtle differences between “earned” compensation and “earnable” compensation that could affect service retirement benefits for some members. However, the only significant impact of changing to “earnable” compensation is on disability benefits. We understand that for disabilities, “earned” compensation does not increase between the date of disability and the Qualified Service Retirement date while “earnable” compensation does increase. This difference is what has been valued in this analysis.

## Detailed Results

The table below summarizes the impact separately for Charter sections A8.601 and A8.604.

<b>Detailed Impact of Proposed Charter Change</b>				
	<b>Current</b>	<b>Multiplier / Retirement Age</b>	<b>Final Averaging Period</b>	<b>Earnable Compensation</b>
<b>7/1/2024 Actuarial Liability – Active Members</b>				
Prop D (A8.601)	\$ 41.3	\$ 41.3	\$ 42.5	\$ 42.5
Increase		0.0	1.2	0.0
Prop C (A8.604)	308.7	321.8	340.2	341.9
Increase		13.1	18.4	1.7
<b>Normal Cost Rate</b>				
Prop D (A8.601)	35.1%	35.1%	36.1%	36.5%
Increase		0.0%	1.0%	0.4%
Prop C (A8.604)	30.8%	32.1%	34.0%	34.4%
Increase		1.3%	1.9%	0.4%
<b>FYE 2026 Employer Contribution Increase</b>				
Prop D (A8.601)	N/A	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.2	\$ 0.0
Prop C (A8.604)	N/A	\$ 3.7	\$ 5.3	\$ 1.0

*Dollar Amounts in Millions*

We interpret the proposal to state that disabilities prior to January 1, 2025 will not be re-calculated using earnable compensation. However, if our interpretation is incorrect and current disabilities would be re-calculated using earnable compensation, it would add an additional \$3.9 million to the Actuarial Liability and \$0.4 million to the employer contribution. It would not affect the normal cost.

It should be noted that new hires enter under Charter section A8.604, so the increase in normal cost rate for that Charter section represents the ongoing permanent expected cost increase for the proposed amendment. The increase in normal cost rate for Charter section A8.601 will only last while current members under that Charter section remain actively employed, and the increase to the Actuarial Liability will be paid off over the 15-year amortization period.

This estimate and its contents have been prepared in accordance with generally recognized and accepted actuarial principles and practices and our understanding of the Code of Professional Conduct and applicable Actuarial Standards of Practice set out by the Actuarial Standards Board as well as applicable laws and regulations. Furthermore, as credentialed actuaries, we meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the opinion contained in this estimate. This estimate does not address any contractual or legal issues. We are not attorneys, and our firm does not provide any legal services or advice.

Ms. Alison Romano

June 17, 2024

Page 4

This estimate was prepared exclusively for the San Francisco City and County Employees' Retirement System for the purpose described herein. Other users of this estimate are not intended users as defined in the Actuarial Standards of Practice, and Cheiron assumes no duty or liability to any other user.

If you have any questions on this estimate, please let us know.

Sincerely,  
Cheiron, Inc.



William R. Hallmark, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA  
Consulting Actuary



Anne D. Harper, FSA, EA, MAAA  
Principal Consulting Actuary

Attachment

cc: Caryn Bortnick, Chief Operating Officer  
Janet Brazelton, Actuarial Services Coordinator  
Matt Wells, Cheiron

## Summary of Proposed Changes to Charter

Current Charter Section Provisions			
Benefit Provision	A8.601	A8.604	Proposed Provisions
<b>Final Compensation</b>	Average monthly compensation <b>earned</b> during the higher of any <b>two</b> consecutive fiscal years or the 24 months immediately prior to retirement	Average monthly compensation <b>earned</b> during the higher of any <b>three</b> consecutive fiscal years or the 36 months immediately prior to retirement	Highest average monthly compensation <b>earnable</b> during any <b>one year</b> of credited service
<b>Benefit Multiplier</b>			
<u>Age at Retirement</u>	<u>Percent for Each Year of Credited Service</u>		
50	2.40	2.20	2.40
51	2.52	2.30	2.52
52	2.64	2.40	2.64
53	2.76	2.50	2.76
54	2.88	2.60	2.88
55	3.00	2.70	3.00
56	3.00	2.80	3.00
57	3.00	2.90	3.00
58 or Older	3.00	3.00	3.00

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184  
Fax No. (415) 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Greg Wagner, City Controller, Office of the Controller

FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk, Rules Committee  
Board of Supervisors

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Victor Young".

DATE: July 16, 2024

SUBJECT: CHARTER AMENDMENT INTRODUCED  
November 5, 2024, Election

---

The Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee has received the following Charter Amendment for the November 5, 2024, Election. This matter is being **re-referred** to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.3.

File No. 240552 (ver3)

Charter Amendment (Third Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Please review and prepare a financial analysis of the proposed measure prior to the first Rules Committee hearing.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7723 or email: victor.young@sfgov.org. To submit documentation, please email or forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Natasha Mihal, Office of the Controller  
Janice Levy, Office of the Controller  
Greyson Spencer, Office of the Controller

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184  
Fax No. (415) 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

# MEMORANDUM

TO: Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources  
FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk, Rules Committee *Victor Young*  
Board of Supervisors  
DATE: July 16, 2024  
SUBJECT: LEGISLATION INTRODUCED – MEET AND CONFER DETERMINATION

The Board of Supervisors’ Rules Committee has received the following Charter Amendment. This matter is being **re-referred** to you as it may require the Department of Human Resources to fulfill “**Meet and Confer**” requirements. Please review, assess the impact and provide proper noticing as required and report back to on the status of the “Meet and Confer” requirement.

File No. 240552 (ver3)

Charter Amendment (Third Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7723 or email: victor.young@sfgov.org. To submit documentation, please email or forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

\*\*\*\*\*

RESPONSE FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES - Date: \_\_\_\_\_

- Meet and Confer requirement has been fulfilled.**
- Meet and Confer requirement not applicable.**
- Additional information attached.**

---

**Department of Human Resources**

c: Mawuli Tugbenyoh, Department of Human Resources  
Aliya Chisti, Department of Human Resources

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184  
Fax No. (415) 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Tom Paulino, Liaison to the Board of Supervisors, Mayor's Office  
Anne Pearson, Deputy City Attorney, Office of the City Attorney  
John Arntz, Director, Department of Elections  
Patrick Ford, Executive Director, Ethics Commission  
Alison Romano, CEO/CIO, Employees' Retirement System  
Chief Jeanine Nicholson, Fire Department

FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk, Rules Committee   
Board of Supervisors

DATE: July 16, 2024

SUBJECT: CHARTER AMENDMENT INTRODUCED  
November 5, 2024

---

The Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee has received the following Charter Amendment for the November 5, 2024, Election. This matter is being **re-referred** to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

File No. 240552 (ver3)

Charter Amendment (Third Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to change the age factor percentage for benefit calculations such that persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach a higher age factor percentage at earlier ages and lower from 58 to 55 the retirement age at which persons who have or will become members of the Fire Department on and after January 7, 2012 reach the highest age factor percentage; at an election to be held on November 5, 2024.

Please review and submit any reports or comments you wish to be included with the legislative file.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7723 or email: victor.young@sfgov.org. To submit documentation, please forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Michael Canning, Ethics Commission  
Andres Power, Mayor's Office  
Darlene Armanino, SFERS

Theresa Ludwig, Fire Dept.

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184  
Fax No. (415) 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

---

---

## MEMORANDUM

---

---

Date: July 16, 2024  
To: Planning Department / Commission  
From: Victor Young, Clerk of the Rules Committee *Victor Young*  
Subject: Board of Supervisors Legislation Referral - File No. 240552 Version 3  
**Charter Amendment - Fire Department Service Retirement Pension**

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Determination  
(*California Public Resources Code, Sections 21000 et seq.*)

Ordinance / Resolution

Ballot Measure

Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it would not result in a direct or indirect physical change in the environment.

7/17/2024

*Don Lewis*

Amendment to the Planning Code, including the following Findings:  
(*Planning Code, Section 302(b): 90 days for Planning Commission review*)

General Plan  Planning Code, Section 101.1  Planning Code, Section 302

Amendment to the Administrative Code, involving Land Use/Planning  
(*Board Rule 3.23: 30 days for possible Planning Department review*)

General Plan Referral for Non-Planning Code Amendments  
(*Charter, Section 4.105, and Administrative Code, Section 2A.53*)

(Required for legislation concerning the acquisition, vacation, sale, or change in use of City property; subdivision of land; construction, improvement, extension, widening, narrowing, removal, or relocation of public ways, transportation routes, ground, open space, buildings, or structures; plans for public housing and publicly-assisted private housing; redevelopment plans; development agreements; the annual capital expenditure plan and six-year capital improvement program; and any capital improvement project or long-term financing proposal such as general obligation or revenue bonds.)

Historic Preservation Commission

Landmark (*Planning Code, Section 1004.3*)

Cultural Districts (*Charter, Section 4.135 & Board Rule 3.23*)

Mills Act Contract (*Government Code, Section 50280*)

Designation for Significant/Contributory Buildings (*Planning Code, Article 11*)

Please send the Planning Department/Commission recommendation/determination to Victor Young at [Victor.Young@sfgov.org](mailto:Victor.Young@sfgov.org).



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

Ms. Angela Calvillo  
Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

July 18, 2024

RE: File 240552 – Charter Amendment to Reform the Fire Department Service Retirement Pension (THIRD DRAFT)

Dear Ms. Calvillo,

Should the proposed Charter amendment be approved by the voters, in my opinion, it would have a significant impact on the cost of government starting at \$3.7 million in fiscal year 2025-26 and increasing every year through fiscal year 2040-2041.

The proposed Charter amendment would align the retirement benefits calculations for those becoming firefighters after January 7, 2012 with those who became firefighters before that date. The amendment specifies that those hired before January 7, 2012 will qualify for higher percentages of their retirement benefits (age factors) at younger ages and that they will reach the highest percentage at age 55. This lowers the age of retirement at which firefighters would receive the highest potential pension from 58 to 55 for this cohort of firefighters. For context, of the firefighters hired after January 7, 2012, currently approximately 4% (approximately 50 firefighters) are older than 50 years of age.

The estimated cost in the first year is \$3.7 million, with costs increasing through year 16 for higher employer retirement contributions paid by the City. This cost does not include the potential need to hire more new firefighters as older firefighters are newly incentivized to retire earlier. For context, the current cost to hire and train a new firefighter is approximately \$115,000, including the costs for the academy, background and medical checks, personal protective equipment, and uniforms.

This Charter amendment amends voter-approved Charter amendments from June 2010 and November 2011 on pension reform.

Sincerely,

*Janice Levy* FOR  
Greg Wagner  
Controller

Note: This analysis reflects our understanding of the proposal as of the date shown. At times further information is provided to us which may result in revisions being made to this analysis before the final Controller's statement appears in the Voter Information Pamphlet.