AIRPORT COMMISSION

RESOLUTION NO. 23-0103

RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AIRPORT TO SEEK BOARD OF SUPERVISORS' APPROVAL OF AIRPORT SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY POLICIES AND ANNUAL SURVEILLANCE REPORT PURSUANT TO CHAPTER 19B OF THE SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE GOING FORWARD

- WHEREAS, based on the City's Surveillance Technology Ordinance, San Francisco Administrative Code Chapter 19B (Ordinance or Chapter 19B), adopted by the Board of Supervisors (Board) in 2019, the Airport must obtain Board approval for its Surveillance Technology Policies and Annual Surveillance Report (Policies); and
- WHEREAS, Chapter 19B, which has been in effect since July 2019, regulates City departments' acquisition and use of Surveillance Technology, as defined in the Ordinance, and requires that departments adopt Board-approved Policies for each item of Surveillance Technology they currently use or plan to acquire; and
- WHEREAS, until recently, the City's Committee on Information Technology (COIT) took the responsibility of obtaining that approval for all City departments, including the Airport, but recently revised procedures now require departments, rather than COIT, to seek such approval from the Board; and
- WHEREAS, as a result, Staff requests authorization for the Airport to seek Board approval for these Policies going forward; now, therefore, be it
- RESOLVED, that this Commission authorizes the Airport to seek approval for the Airport Surveillance Technology Policies and its Annual Surveillance Report from the Board of Supervisors pursuant to Chapter 19B of the San Francisco Administrative Code going forward.

I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Airport Commission

at its meeting of APR 1 8 2023

fur Gecretary



San Francisco International Airport

23-0103

APR 1 8 2023

MEMORANDUM

April 18, 2023

TO:

AIRPORT COMMISSION

Hon. Malcolm Yeung, President

Hon. Everett A. Hewlett, Jr.

Hon. Jane Natoli Hon. Jose F. Almanza

FROM:

Airport Director

SUBJECT:

Authorization for the Airport to Seek Board of Supervisors' Approval of Airport

Surveillance Technology Policies and Annual Surveillance Report Pursuant to

Chapter 19B of the San Francisco Administrative Code Going Forward

DIRECTOR'S RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AIRPORT TO SEEK BOARD OF SUPERVISORS' APPROVAL OF AIRPORT SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY POLICIES AND ANNUAL SURVEILLANCE REPORT PURSUANT TO CHAPTER 19B OF THE SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE GOING FORWARD.

Executive Summary

In June of 2019, the San Francisco Board of Supervisors (Board) passed an amendment to the City's Administrative Code – Acquisition of Surveillance Technology ordinance to monitor, regulate and require reporting for City department's acquisition and use of Surveillance Technology, as defined in the ordinance, which is codified at Administrative Code Chapter 19B (Ordinance or Chapter 19B).

Under the Ordinance, City departments are required to obtain Board approval of Surveillance Technology Policies and an Annual Surveillance Report (Policies). Until recently, as described below, the City's Committee on Information Technology (COIT) took responsibility for obtaining that approval. But, recently revised procedures now require City departments, rather than COIT, to seek it. As a result, Staff requests that the Commission authorize the Airport to seek such approval by the Board going forward. The three policies that the Airport plans to submit to the Board in the near future are: Application Based Commercial Transport (ABCT), Electronic Toll Readers (ETR) and Gunshot Detection Solution (GDS) technologies.

THIS PRINT COVERS CALENDAR ITEM NO.



-2-

Background

Chapter 19B, which has been in effect since July 2019, regulates City departments' acquisition and use of Surveillance Technology, defined below, and requires that departments adopt Board-approved Policies for each item of Surveillance Technology they currently use or plan to acquire. The Ordinance's definition of Surveillance Technology is very broad as follows,

"Surveillance Technology" means any software, electronic device, system utilizing an electronic device, or similar device used, designed, or primarily intended to collect, retain, process, or share audio, electronic, visual, location, thermal, biometric, olfactory or similar information specifically associated with, or capable of being associated with, any individual or group.

"Surveillance Technology" includes but is not limited to the following: international mobile subscriber identity (IMSI) catchers and other cell site simulators; automatic license plate readers; electric toll readers; closed-circuit television cameras; gunshot detection hardware and services; video and audio monitoring and/or recording technology, such as surveillance cameras, wide-angle cameras, and wearable body cameras; mobile DNA capture technology; biometric software or technology, including facial, voice, iris, and gait-recognition software and databases; software designed to monitor social media services; x-ray vans; software designed to forecast criminal activity or criminality; radio-frequency I.D. (RFID) scanners; and tools, including software and hardware, used to gain unauthorized access to a computer, computer service, or computer network.

Admin Code §19B.1. Since the Ordinance became effective, COIT has taken responsibility for introducing all department Policies to the Board for approval, including the Airport. Beginning in August 2019, as required under the Ordinance, departments provided COIT with inventories of their existing Surveillance Technology. Soon after, departments began submitting to COIT Surveillance Impact Reports (SIRs), and draft policies generated using COIT's toolbox.

COIT and its Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board (PSAB) held public hearings to consider the policies and ultimately vote on whether to recommend them to the Board. To date, the Board has approved three Airport Polices for: (1) Airport Security Cameras (Pre-Security Closed-Circuit Television); (2) Third Party Security Cameras, and (3) Automated License Plate Readers. See attached summary of Policies.

Recently, COIT notified City departments that it will no longer be introducing individual department policies, nor their Annual Surveillance Reports to the Board on departments' behalf. Instead, departments will now have that responsibility. COIT will still provide a recommendation letter for the Board file, and present its recommendation on the department's Policy at the Board hearing. In addition, COIT will continue to handle the introduction of citywide Policies to the Board. As a result, Staff recommends that the Commission authorize the Airport to seek Board approval of the Policies going forward.

Members, Airport Commission

-3-

April 18, 2023

Recommendation

I recommend the Commission authorize the Airport to seek Board of Supervisors' approval of Airport Surveillance Technology Policies and its Annual Surveillance Report pursuant to Chapter 19B of the San Francisco Administrative Code going forward.

Ivar C. Satero Airport Director

Prepared by: Ray Ricardo

Acting Chief Information Officer

Attachment - Surveillance Technology Policies Summary

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST
BOS Approved Policies (STPs): Pre-Security Closed-	Airport owns and operates CCTV	1. Live Monitoring	For Residents:
Circuit Television (CCTV) Cameras	cameras which monitor presecurity checkpoint areas that are open and accessible to all members of the public. STATUS: POLICY APPROVED 7/27/21 – Board passed 8/4/21 – Mayor approved	 2. Recording of video and images in the event of an incident. 3. Reviewing camera footage. 4. Providing video footage/ images to law enforcement or other authorized persons following an incident or upon request, when footage is subject to disclosure pursuant to a Public Records Act Request. 	 Health: Protect Safety of Staff, patrons, and facilities while promoting an open and welcoming environment. Criminal Justice: Review video footage after a security incident; provide video evidence to law enforcement or the public upon request by formal process, order, or subpoena. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards: The Airport's use of CCTV is restricted to those identified Authorized Use Cases. The Airport retains CCTV footage for one year, consistent with State law. Video files are only released through subpoena, a public records act request, to assist law enforcement with an investigation and to assist Airport personnel in the investigation of claims. Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits: Financial Savings: Airport CCTV saves on salary cost for Airport staff and SFPD-AB patrol officers.

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST
License Plate Recognition System: Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR) – Ground Transportation Management System (GTMS)	Airport uses license plate recognition cameras on Airport roadways to monitor commercial ground transportation operators and for revenue collection. STATUS: POLICY APPROVED 7/27/21 – Board passed 8/4/21 – Mayor approved	1. To track the activity of permitted commercial ground transportation at the Airport. Also used as a secondary method for collecting trip fees in the event of an operator's transponder fails to read. 2. To support the Airport and local, state, federal, and regional public safety departments in the identification of vehicles that are the subject of investigation; and/or locating victims, witnesses, suspects, and other associated with a law enforcement investigation.	 Time Savings: Airport CCTV provides real-time feeds that run 24/7, thus eliminating lengthy physical surveillance of Airport facilities. Staff Security: Security cameras provide advance view of an incident to better prepare those responding to an incident. Data Quality: Security cameras operate 24/365 which maximizes the Airport's ability to capture video of incidents. Video can be used to verify the accuracy of written reports regarding the incident. For Residents: Environment: Traffic congestion studies — ALPR-GTMS can be used to conduct studies on traffic volumes and patterns, with the potential to mitigate environmental impacts of traffic congestion on residents. Criminal Justice: ALPR-GTMS can be used to support identification of vehicles as a part of law enforcement investigations. Public Safety: ALPR-GTMS can be used to locate stolen, wanted, and or other vehicles that are subjects of investigation, and can improve overall roadway safety for residents using Airport roadways.

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST
		purposes.	Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards: Commercial ground transportation operators acknowledge notice of GTMS Policies and Procedures, which include the Airport's use of ALPR and Electronic Toll Readers, by signing the Airport Permit. In compliance with California Civil Code 1798.90.5, the Airport shall notify the public of ALPR-GTMS surveillance technology operation by posting the ALPR-GTMS Privacy and Usage Policy on the FlySFO.com website. Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits: Time Savings: Without the ALPR-GTMS technology, the Airport would need to deploy a manually staffed ground transportation operation. Team members would have to conduct manual verification of registration via visual observation of permits and decals, and conduct traffic counts. The ALPR-GTMS technology removes the necessity of staffing for these purposes. Data Quality: The ALPR-GTMS technology is verified against the AVI technology to confirm all permitted vehicles' trips have been documented for tracking and fee assessment purposes

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST
Tenant ("Third-Party") Security Cameras	Airport Tenants own and operate security cameras in their physical locations within the Airport. STATUS: POLICY APPROVED 11/15/22 – Board passed 11/17/22 – Mayor approved	1. Reviewing camera footage in the event of an incident. 2. Approving Tenant's disclosure of digital recordings and other data from its security camera system.	 (in case the AVI malfunctions and fails to read the Airport transfixed transponder). Financial: The ALPR-GTMS technology enables the Airport to assess trip fees on permitted Commercial ground transportation operators. For example, in 2019, the Airport collected \$64.8M+ in trip fees from ground transportation operators. For Residents: Health: Protect Safety of staff, patrons, and facilities while promoting an open and welcoming environment. Criminal Justice: Review video footage after a security incident; provide video evidence to law enforcement or the public upon request by formal process, order or subpoena. Financial Savings: Equipment is owned and operated by a non-city entity. Staff Safety: Tenant/Contractor Security cameras help identify violations of Building Rules and Regulations, and City, State and Federal law and provide assurance that staff safety is emphasized and will be protected at their place of employment.

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST
			 Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards: Airport's use of recordings and data from third-party security cameras is restricted to the identified Authorized Use Cases. Tenant's disclosure of recordings and data from its own cameras is subject to the Airport Rules & Regulations and policies that restrict use of CCTV to the approved use in the Tenant Application. Tenants are required to report to the Airport any changes or modifications to video monitoring and/or recording device use prior to executing the changes or modifications. Tenants are required to obtain Airport's written authorization prior to the release of any video monitoring and/or recording device footage from Tenants cameras/devices. In appropriate cases, Airport may also request review and a determination of whether the footage may be disclosed from the Transportation Security Administration (TSA). Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits: Financial Savings: Tenants' Security Camera Systems will save on building or patrol officers.

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST
Technology (ST)		The Airport shall use the ST	
		only for the following authorized	
		purposes:	
			 Time Savings: Tenants' Security Camera Systems will run 24/365, thus decreasing or eliminating building or patrol officer supervision. Staff Safety: Tenant/Contractor Security cameras help identify violations of the Patron Code of Conduct and provide assurance that staff safety is emphasized and will be protected at their place of employment. Data Quality: Security cameras run 24/365, so full-time staffing is not required to subsequently review footage of security incidents. Data resolution can be set by level and is recommended to be set to high resolution.

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST
COIT Approved Policies (STPs) - Next Step: Seek BOS Approval			
Application Based Commercial Transport (ABCT)	The primary functions for the Application Based Commercial Transport (ABCT) technology are to use location data to help Airport personnel enforce operating agreements for Transportation Network Companies (TNCs), administer and regulate these programs, and for general transportation planning. • ABCT reconciles the monthly self- reported invoices from the TNC's (Transportation Network Companies) against its collected data to ensure the Airport is properly compensated for the correct amount of traffic and receives accurate payments each month.	1. To invoice Transportation Network Companies (TNCs) for trip fees based on their passenger pickups and drop-offs at the Airport and perform invoice reconciliation. 2. To monitor and enforce TNCs' compliance with the conditions of their operating permit and the Airport's Rules & Regulations (R&Rs). 3. To provide support for the issuance of citations for traffic violations by the SFPD Airport Bureau. 4. To support Public Safety by ensuring only authorized and approved drivers and vehicles are allowed to service passengers at SFO.	For Residents: Community Development: Equitable distribution of and access to transportation. Environment: Traffic patterns and congestion within SFO. Jobs: TNC companies and driver's; Ground Transportation Unit (GTU) resources. Public Safety: Reduces the risk of fraud and unethical business practices. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards: SFO strictly prohibits the use of location data to identify or track individual users or customers of the City's Airport transportation system.

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases -	Benefits of the ST
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST	
(ST)		only for the following	
		authorized purposes:	
			To avoid resident loss of trust, public notice regarding SFO's receipt and use of data regarding TNC drivers' activity at the Airport is provided on the SFOConnect web-site (sfoconnect.com).
			 To avoid discrimination and other potential civil rights impacts, data access is granted only to authorized users for authorized uses. To protect the individual identities, travel preferences, and trip patterns and behaviors of individuals, any data released to the public through Sunshine requests or Public Records do not contain personal identifying information. Collected data is stored on a secure network in a restricted, password-protected system that can only be accessed by authorized personnel for authorized uses.
			Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits: Financial Savings: Not having to hire additional staff to manually monitor and manage the TNC's activities.

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST	
(ST)		only for the following	
		authorized purposes:	
			Time Savings: Staff can reconcile monthly invoices quickly with the use of aggregated data, saving dozens of hours per month of accounting time.
			Data Quality: Human error is reduced; information is legible and can be easily sorted and summarized by computers; can be paired with analytical analysis; likely reduction in fraudulent handwritten records; increase in the number of records, since they are automatically created and sent.
			Enforcement of Non-Compliant Drivers: Improved enforcement for non-compliance: drivers exceeding curbside staging times, drop-off and pick-ups at non-designated areas can be subject to fines and/or citations by the Airport (GTU and SFPD-AB), based upon the contracts with the TNC's.
Electronic Toll Readers (ETR)	Use of FasTrak Toll Readers provides the ability to accept an alternate payment method that efficiently processes parking fees.	Process Parking Transactions. Investigation of Parking Transaction Disputes.	For Residents: Public Safety: More efficient payment systems for customers reduce traffic congestion and bottlenecks,

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST	
(ST)		only for the following	
		authorized purposes:	
	Parking efficiency minimizes traffic on SFO's roadways. More efficient payment systems for customers reduce traffic congestion and bottlenecks, decreasing the likelihood of collisions and improving customer safety. Provides a uniform methodology for SFO parking fee collection and more effectively quantifies parking demand, which supports future SFO planning.		decreasing the likelihood of collisions and improving customer safety. Convenience: Limits parking congestion through more efficient payment processes. Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards: The Airport strives to mitigate all potential civil rights impacts through responsible technology and data use policies and procedures, and intends to use electronic toll readers and their associated data exclusively for the aforementioned authorized use cases. All other uses, including surveillance of San Francisco residents or groups, are expressly prohibited. Access to personal information collected by the FasTrak Toll Readers is limited only to certain operations and technical employees for limited, approved purposes based on their specific work responsibilities.

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST	
(ST)		only for the following	
		authorized purposes:	
			Authorized personnel must submit a request to the Data Steward to access the limited dataset identified. Requesting personnel must specify the reason for their request. Privacy and security training is
			required for employees with access to Personally Identifiable Information (PII), upon hire or assignment to projects involving toll readers.
			A breach of the toll reader system is also not likely to compromise personal information, as all data collected by the toll readers is seamlessly transmitted to an Airport database. No data is retained on the toll reader itself.
		,	To further avoid breach and misuse of personal information collected by toll readers, storage of PII on databases is encrypted and protected by software, hardware and physical security measures to prevent unauthorized access.

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following	Benefits of the ST
(01)		authorized purposes:	
			Third parties with whom the Airport shares PII are also required to implement adequate security measures to maintain the confidentiality of such information.
			Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits:
			Financial Savings: Low maintenance and operating costs in addition to minimal training of personnel on the use of the technology.
			Time Savings: Parking fee collections are much more efficient.
			Staff Safety: Staff no longer need to sit in parking booths that are near fast moving vehicles.
			Data Quality: Provides a uniform methodology for SFO parking fee collection, and more effectively quantifies parking demand, which supports future SFO planning.
Gunshot Detection	The primary function for the Gunshot	Detect the sound of gun shots,	For Residents:
Solution (GDS)	Detection Solution (GDS) is a detection and response system designed to protect	aggressive voices, glass breaking, and unusual	Health: Protect safety of staff, patrons, and facilities while promoting
	lives in incidents involving an indoor active	disturbances (based upon	an open and welcoming environment.

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST	
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST		
(ST)		only for the following		
		authorized purposes:		
	shooter, aggressive behavior, glass breaking or unusual disturbances. • By automating the emergency notification process and removing the human element, first responders arrive on scene faster, equipped with the vital information needed to contain threats and mitigate casualties. The GDS provides immediate and accurate response information, including specific location and type of sound, for Airport Commission staff and law enforcement teams. • The gunshot detection system will use existing Wi-Fi access points owned and deployed by the Airport. • All analysis is conducted at the sensor (detector), with no real-time audio transmitted or recorded, ensuring privacy.	machine learned decibel level) and use of device sensors to locate the origin of the sounds. 2. Provide the date and time stamp, the type of gun used or sound detected and the geographical location (i.e., which sensor detected the sound) to law enforcement or other authorized persons in connection with the investigation of an incident, or to members of the public when the information is subject to disclosure pursuant to a Public Records Act request. 3. Upon a GDS alarm, 9-1-1 Dispatch and the Security Operations Center (SOC) can immediately view CCTV feeds of the location identified in the alarm to provide Airport First Responders situational awareness (i.e., location) of an incident.	Criminal Justice: SFPD-AB can be quickly alerted and respond, when needed, to the sound of gunshots, aggressive voices, glass shattering, or other high decibel level sound disturbances such as blasts, with improved geographic precision. In conjunction with the video images from the Airport's CCTV system, Law Enforcement can be provided situational awareness or information to assist in its investigation of an incident. Public Safety: Improved protection of the public and City assets by leveraging remote condition assessment technology, which improves overall situational awareness. The technology helps ensure the safety of the 49,000+ people who work at the Airport and the 58 million people who fly to and from SFO every year.	

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST	
(ST)		only for the following	
		authorized purposes:	
			Civil Rights Impacts and Safeguards:
			The Airport's use of the AmberBox solution is restricted to those identified Authorized Use Cases.
			Data is housed in servers located in secured areas that are only accessible by approved and badged employees. Cloud access to data is administered by Airport badged employees with access to cloud services that enable continuous monitoring of the Airport account activity.
			Fiscal Analysis of Costs and Benefits:
			Financial Savings: The gunshot detection solution (GDS), in conjunction with the Airport Security Camera Systems, will run 24/7, thus decreasing or eliminating the need for additional building or SFPD-AB patrol officer supervision and saving on salary expense.

Surveillance	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases –	Benefits of the ST
Technology		The Airport shall use the ST	
(ST)		only for the following	
		authorized purposes:	
			Time Savings: The gunshot detection solution's automated notification removes the human element of notification which allows first responders to arrive more promptly to the scene to de-escalate any potentially violent situations. Use of the solution provides instant alerts, so that real-time 24/7 CCTV feeds can be viewed, to provide pinpoint location accuracy, thus eliminating lengthy physical surveillance of Airport facilities. Staff Safety: The gunshot detection solution will provide immediate information about the location of potential threats to staff safety. The gunshot detection solution will alert Law Enforcement to the location of the incident. This will prompt them to view the camera feeds for an immediate view as the event is occurring, to better prepare those responding to the incident.

Surveillance Technology (ST)	ST Description	ST Authorized Use Cases – The Airport shall use the ST only for the following authorized purposes:	Benefits of the ST	
			<u>Data Quality</u> : The identification of ambient noise from GDS coupled with CCTV cameras use, provides Law Enforcement complete situational awareness.	

AIRPORT COMMISSION

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

RESOLUTION	NIO	
RESULUTION	IV()	

RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE AIRPORT TO SEEK BOARD OF
SUPERVISORS' APPROVAL OF AIRPORT SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY
POLICIES AND ANNUAL SURVEILLANCE REPORT PURSUANT TO CHAPTER 19B
OF THE SAN FRANCISCO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE GOING FORWARD

- WHEREAS, based on the City's Surveillance Technology Ordinance, San Francisco Administrative Code Chapter 19B (Ordinance or Chapter 19B), adopted by the Board of Supervisors (Board) in 2019, the Airport must obtain Board approval for its Surveillance Technology Policies and Annual Surveillance Report (Policies); and
- WHEREAS, Chapter 19B, which has been in effect since July 2019, regulates City departments' acquisition and use of Surveillance Technology, as defined in the Ordinance, and requires that departments adopt Board-approved Policies for each item of Surveillance Technology they currently use or plan to acquire; and
- WHEREAS, until recently, the City's Committee on Information Technology (COIT) took the responsibility of obtaining that approval for all City departments, including the Airport, but recently revised procedures now require departments, rather than COIT, to seek such approval from the Board; and
- WHEREAS, as a result, Staff requests authorization for the Airport to seek Board approval for these Policies going forward; now, therefore, be it
- RESOLVED, that this Commission authorizes the Airport to seek approval for the Airport Surveillance Technology Policies and its Annual Surveillance Report from the Board of Supervisors pursuant to Chapter 19B of the San Francisco Administrative Code going forward.

I hereby certify	that the foregoing	resolution was	adopted by	the Airport	Commission
at its meeting of_					