



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Government Audit and Oversight Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Dean Preston, Connie Chan, Rafael Mandelman*

*Clerk: John Carroll (415) 554-4445*

---

Thursday, February 3, 2022

10:00 AM

**Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Dean Preston, Connie Chan, and Rafael Mandelman

*The Government Audit and Oversight Committee met in regular session through videoconferencing, and provided public comment through teleconferencing, on Thursday, February 3, 2022, with Chair Dean Preston presiding. Chair Preston called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.*

**Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*On March 17, 2020, the Board of Supervisors authorized their Board and Committee meetings to convene remotely (via Microsoft Teams) and will allow remote public comment via teleconference. Visit the SFGovTV website at ([www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)) to stream the live meetings, or to watch meetings on demand. Members of the public are encouraged to participate remotely via detailed instructions on participating via teleconference available at: <https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>.*

*Members of the public may participate by phone or may submit their comments by email to: [john.carroll@sfgov.org](mailto:john.carroll@sfgov.org); all comments received will be made a part of the official record. Regularly scheduled Government Audit and Oversight Committee Meetings begin at 10:00 a.m. on the first and third Thursdays of each month. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at <https://sfbos.org/committees>.*

**ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Preston and Member Mandelman were noted present. Vice Chair Chan was noted not present. A quorum was present.*

**AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## COMMUNICATIONS

*John Carroll, Government Audit and Oversight Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments for up to two minutes by dialing the provided telephone number. When connected, they will receive another prompt to dial \* 3 to be added to the queue to speak. Make sure to call from a quiet location, speak clearly and slowly, and turn down your television or radio. Written comments may be submitted through email ([john.carroll@sfgov.org](mailto:john.carroll@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

*Chair Preston recessed the meeting at 10:19 a.m., and reconvened the meeting at 10:31 a.m.*

*Vice Chair Chan was noted present at 10:44 a.m.*

*Member Mandelman was noted absent at 11:58 a.m., and for the remainder of the meeting.*

### **211062 [Hearing - Review of the Hiring Practices of Public Works]**

#### **Sponsor: Safai**

Hearing to report on hiring timeframes, vacancies, and ongoing staffing issues for the Operations Division of Public Works and how it affects their ability to respond to calls for service; and requesting Public Works, the Department of Human Resources, and Office of the City Administrator to report.

10/05/21; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

10/13/21; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Public Works, the Department of Human Resources, and the Office of the City Administrator for informational purposes.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Supervisor Ahsha Safai (Board of Supervisors); Carla Short, Interim Director, and Bruce Robertson (Public Works); Chanda Ikeda (Office of the City Administrator); Theresa Foglio-Ramirez (LiUNA! Laborer's Local 261); Mawuli Tugbenyoh and Anna Biasbas (Department of Human Resources); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Shawn Smith; Francisco da Costa; Speaker; David Pilpel; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Chair Preston moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Chan

Absent: 1 - Mandelman

**201125 [Follow-Up Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - A Recycling Reality Check: What Actually Happens to Things We Put in Our Blue Recycling Bins]**

Hearing on the 2019-2020 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "A Recycling Reality Check: What Actually Happens to Things We Put in Our Blue Recycling Bins?." (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

10/01/20; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

10/07/20; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor and the Department of the Environment for informational purposes.

11/30/20; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Mayor's Office submitted a consolidated response to the Civil Grand Jury Report for the following departments: Office of the Mayor, Department of the Environment.

12/03/20; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Jaime Guandique, Foreperson, Jonathan Gohstand, and Phyllis Deets (2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury); Charles Sheehan and Cara Gurney (Department of the Environment); Noelle Duong and Maurice Quillen (Recology); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. David Pilpel; Speaker; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Edward Wright (Office of Supervisor Gordon Mar, Board of Supervisors); Cara Gurney (Department of the Environment); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Supervisor Preston moved that a response be PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION, responding to the Civil Grand Jury's request to provide a status update on the Board of Supervisors' response to Recommendation No. R1, R2, and R3 contained in the 2019-2020 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "A Recycling Reality Check: What Actually Happens to Things We Put in Our Blue Recycling Bins." The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Mandelman

Absent: 1 - Chan

Motion responding to the Civil Grand Jury's request to provide a status update on the Board of Supervisors' response to Recommendation No. R1, R2, and R3 contained in the 2019-2020 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "A Recycling Reality Check: What Actually Happens to Things We Put in Our Blue Recycling Bins." (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

**Chair Preston moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Preston, Mandelman

Absent: 1 - Chan

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Government Audit and Oversight Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:59 a.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*